To enhance the integration of ILKP within the SOD.

We assume the coherence and consistency of chapters will be dealt with in the next draft and haven’t provided specific comments on this.

4.6.1.1. ECA in general

1st chapter. The involvement of indigenous and local people and ILK in scientific assessments and international organizations represents a political statement, and contributes to the recognition of indigenous people especially, as legitimate actors in decision making, in the context of natural resource management for example. However, incorporation of ILK is not only a political statement, but also represents a valuable source of knowledge. It is by taking seriously the value of knowledge that incorporation of indigenous and local people can represent a step towards a more equitable knowledge system. Published scientific literature represents a source of access to ILK. In this review, examples will be given of studies where ILK related to biodiversity and environmental change has been recorded. It can be factual qualitative arguments are overall strengthened. We also strongly encourage the development of an appendix that lists all the acronyms and key terms (including their definitions) used in the ECA assessment and communicate these lists with the leaders of the other regional assessments to ensure that jointly, all 4 regional assessments can provide a solid basis for the global assessment (IPBES deliverable 2c) by using the same terms and definitions. We very...
There should be examples/chapter to clarify how the biogeochemical cycle (carbon, nitrogen, phosphorus, sulfur, calcium, and rock water etc.) through both biotic (biogeochemical) and abiotic (atmospheric/hydrospheric, weather, and climatic) processes in the broader context to ecosystems, which may affect certain species. Land degradation and restoration should be assessed in the light of Global Changes, Global Warming, Global Sea Level Rise, and Global Ocean. Land degradation and restoration should be assessed into two categories which operate at different scales – the biological – physical, near-term and long-term (long-term). Land revegetation processes, soil nutrients, plant and vegetation restoration, and land management should be addressed.

This chapter has not developed significantly due to not more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments from external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.

The chapter has not developed significantly due to more through assessment and relevant insightful comments form external as well as internal reviewers. The driven change to biodiversity and ecosystem services is assessed in chapter 4, in this chapter we focus on options for governance. Although the chapter has developed significantly between the FSO and the SCF we are aware of that there still will be room for improvements and gaps to be filled. We will be look into the worst of the process.
The executive summary is well structured and very plausible. One point, however, is particularly worth mentioning. The order of points given and thus their relative importance is reasonable except that in my view the section on biodiversity conservation in the Western Balkans region is not given enough emphasis. More specific references and findings on ECA included in the executive summary.

Thank you for the useful references. The chapter has been made more targeted and concrete in the review process.

Andrew Stott, UK
IPBES National Focal Point

The review of MEAs and international organisations is rather superficial, descriptive and based on a relatively small number of academic papers. Many statements appear unsubstantiated or used selectively. It does not take account of the very large literature on the assessment of effectiveness of MEAs and international organisations which these bodies themselves have produced for consideration of the funding mechanisms. Sections on rights-based approaches seem to have more prominence than other approaches? The Chapter also seems detached from the other Chapters in the assessment and there may be significant duplication or contradiction in the sector specific review.

The chapter has been made more targeted and concrete in the review process.

Douglas Nakamura

ADD information on potential policy impacts re: legal recognition of sacred sites, e.g.

- Sezdbek and Aibek 2016 (Kyrgyzstan): “Although sacred sites informally play a prominent role in biocultural conservation in Kyrgyzstan, they are not recognized legally. Legal recognition of sacred sites (that takes into account and elaborate more on CBD NBSAPs/national biodiversity strategies (e.g. Germany, France, Albania, Sweden, …)

Thank you for the useful references. It will be addressed in the final draft.

Douglas Nakamura

ADJ information on potential policy impacts re: legal recognition of sacred sites, e.g.

- Kis et al 2016 (Hungary): “Herders may provide significant assistance in tackling a number of emerging problems. Highlights included the eventual amendment of national (i.e. Hungarian) and European Union legislation to provide income and job creation in the region.

Thank you for the useful references. It will be addressed in the final draft.

Douglas Nakamura

The chapter needs a rather serious overhaul in terms of structure and content. In terms of structure, I would suggest: 6.1 Introduction – 6.2 Legitimacy of Policy Instruments (current 6.4 goes in here) – 6.3 Introductions to International Governance and EU Governance (current 6.6 goes in here since it is international/eu governance that are designed to deal with transboundary issues) – 6.4 Biodiversity Governance (published then rework here. The idea is that there should be less sections and more integrated approaches can hardly be overstressed. Although “mainstreaming biodiv policy” is given as a first point, for me, a cross-sectoral, cross ministry, integration of biodiversity related aspects into sector specific reviews?

Thank you for the valuable comments. The chapter has been made more targeted and concrete in the review process. This will be reflected in a more concrete and developed key messages.

Mark Sheppard

The executive summary is very useful and easy to understand. It provides a summary of the key findings and the main messages of the chapter. It is a valuable tool for both the general public and policymakers who want to understand the main outcomes of the assessment.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Eugene Macko

The chapter is quite technical and detailed. There is a need for more concise language and for a better balance between technical and non-technical sections. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for the valuable comments. The executive summary has been rearranged to take your suggestions into account.

Douglas Nakamura

The executive summary is very useful and easy to understand. It provides a summary of the key findings and the main messages of the chapter. It is a valuable tool for both the general public and policymakers who want to understand the main outcomes of the assessment.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Marie Baacke

The chapter is very well structured and easy to read. However, there is a need for more examples from the region to illustrate the points made. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Elke Müller

The chapter needs revision to better reflect the concerns and recommendations mentioned in the comments. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comments. The chapter has been made more targeted and concrete in the review process.

Christoph Aicher

The chapter is very detailed and technical. There is a need for more concise language and for a better balance between technical and non-technical sections. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Andrew Stott

The chapter is very detailed and technical. There is a need for more concise language and for a better balance between technical and non-technical sections. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Laurel Wilkerson

The chapter is very detailed and technical. There is a need for more concise language and for a better balance between technical and non-technical sections. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Andrew Stott

The chapter is very detailed and technical. There is a need for more concise language and for a better balance between technical and non-technical sections. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Andrew Stott

The chapter is very detailed and technical. There is a need for more concise language and for a better balance between technical and non-technical sections. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Laurel Wilkerson

The chapter is very detailed and technical. There is a need for more concise language and for a better balance between technical and non-technical sections. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Elke Müller

The chapter needs revision to better reflect the concerns and recommendations mentioned in the comments. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comments. The chapter has been made more targeted and concrete in the review process.

Andrew Stott

The chapter is very detailed and technical. There is a need for more concise language and for a better balance between technical and non-technical sections. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comment. We have restructured the whole chapter, which is to a large extent following your suggestions.

Laurel Wilkerson

The chapter needs revision to better reflect the concerns and recommendations mentioned in the comments. The key findings and their implications should be highlighted more clearly.

Thank you for your comments. The chapter has been made more targeted and concrete in the review process.
Add a key message on the difficulty to transfer one policy tool from one country or region to another due to different socio-economic contexts (see row 13). It could be along the line of “There is one nice fit if all way for governance and management schemes but policies towards the biodiversity are designed and adapted to different socio-economically diverse contexts”.

The identification and analysis of relationships among multiple levels of socio-ecological systems and different spatial and temporal scales is therefore a core challenge to achieve this goal. It needs to recognize the holistic approach of socio-ecological systems and their associated benefits through the identification and implementation of an integrated approach across different socio-ecological, policy and sectoral boundaries. Coordination needs to be improved among international institutions and across decision-making levels, taking due account of regional, national and sub-national requirements, scientifically as well as local communities’ and indigenous peoples’ knowledge, as well as different socioeconomic contexts and related value systems.

This has been taken into account during the revision process and can be found in section 6.

This comment relates to the notion of related institutional arrangements that appear relevant in relation to the executive summary and is: in my opinion, missing in the text. I could be stressed better. I agree that legal and regulatory instruments are the backbone of conservation policies, setting boundaries to permitted behavior, creating a legally certain action space in which autonomous individual behaviors can be translated more directly through contracts and budgets and without interfering too much. But the ten of easily understandable actions and effects are quite crucial in order to safeguard certain natural resources and means of livelihood, but I could not find a subchapter about legal and regulatory instruments in chapter 6. I think that they do not appear in the text. They appear often (see e.g. section 6.2, table 2) but do not conclude their final status in sectoral chapter 6.4.4, conclusion 6.4.9. Although the subchapter of subchapter 6.4.4 and 6.4.9 in conclusion 6.4.4.2. “Sustainable consumption and production” in Table 6.4.4.6 and 6.4.4.7, where I think it is rather prominent even in the section 6.4.4.2 but it remains on a general level and does not yet point back directly to synthesis from different sector chapters 6.4.2. I would have expected the conclusion of the executive summary and decision-making levels to be better supported by the text (e.g. in subchapter 6.4.3), but with a better link (see the tables 6.4.4.6 and 6.4.9.4.6.1.2) This may satisfy the oversight elsewhere but remains hidden, i.e. there is a synthesis across the many points with the text that really supports the text and summary conclusion. What could help to draw such overall conclusion / suggestion to a relevant table? I mean that there are several instruments that is missing such the information mitigation and not yet least monitoring and some national experience with different improvement of it.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

Can you explain the concept of “balance of nature”? Is it rather narrowly focussed on ‘conservation’, governance needs to address all elements of the IPBES conceptual framework. Key messages end. / The sentence has been rephrased.

Strategy setting above the sectors level is needed. Alternative: efficiency and equity of relevant arrangements need to be carefully evaluated and monitored. This comment regards the nature of the key and very important recommendation suggesting a more integrated biodiversity policy mix approach and the support of the conclusion from within chapter 6.4. For me, this is one of the most important recommendations that can be drawn from reading the chapters and my experience (if there are only sectoral (potentially too weak) sectoral policies, maintaining is certainly important but integrating different sectors perspective and requirements into an overarching and strategic biodiversity policy that explains agencies andminimum trade-offs is relatively innovative and in my view quite promising recommendation. The recommendation (how strongly it is articulated) should be supported well by the text which it is not already. The element of such a support are already there, but the syntheses chapter 6.4.3 is still lacking strong links back to examples from sectoral, transdisciplinary and international biodiversity conservation policies (there is barely just one from the forestry sector (the 2016 FAO), there are some references from the text that could serve to build up strong integrations (like Figure 6.4.8 ‘Processes of coordination in planning’, Box 6.4.2 Policy support tools to integrate across sectors (could be extended beyond IUCN and EA, e.g. mitigation frameworks, 6.4.9.4.1.3 Policy, 6.4.9.4.1.3 Designing integration and policy packages, (see 6.4.1.1.4.1). As a further source could also serve the literature on integrated coastal zone management, integrated water resources management, water-food-energy nexus, and, e.g. ‘Efforts... W. J. Hanley, 2005) Environmental policy integration towards an analytical framework (Environmental Politics, 12(2), 1-22)

The difficulties to transfer policies across regions, nations and sectors needs to be acknowledged. This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

The difficulties to transfer policy across regions, nations and sectors needs to be acknowledged. This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is also quite an important core concept that could be added to the paragraph: “Policy and decision-making levels need to be acknowledged and reflected upon to ensure the implementation of policies at different levels and sectors”.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.

This is further elaborated on in section 6.4.3.4.
The term "generate" comes from the original publication Diaz et al 2015, therefore we prefer to keep it.

Chapter 6

Are the underlying causes of nature degradation and destruction really addressed by focusing on primary economic sectors? What about subsistence farming, sustainable forest management, ecological fishing etc.? Are not other specific forms of land use and water management the problem (large scale, mechanized etc.)?

Chapter 6

Regional Assessment Report on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services for Europe and Central Asia

IPBES National Focal Point

Germany

Andrew Stott, UK

Petr Petrik

Louise Willemen

Andrew Stott, UK

IPBES National Focal Point

Ram Pandit

Germany

Germany

Andrew Stott, UK

Germany

Regional Assessment Report on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services for Europe and Central Asia

Andrew Stott, UK

Germany

Andrew Stott, UK

Germany

Chapter 6

Opportunities for different actors could be formulated in a clearer way in Section 6.4 such as "Governments could do this; businesses could do this; NGOs could do this". All subsections of 6.4 could have a summary table such as Table 6.3, which could be complemented by a column indicating which type of stakeholder is in the best position to use the various instruments listed.

Chapter 6

The introduction section has been developed well. I think the auditors for such a comprehensive introduction. I would think that if some elaboration is made on key achievements of UNEA and aspirations of SDG’s would be more informative.

Thank you for the comment, the sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

The concepts are defined and further elaborated in subsections 4.2, 5.1, 5.3 and 6.3.

Chapter 6

The introductory section has been developed well. I think the auditors for such a comprehensive introduction. I would think that if some elaboration is made on key achievements of UNEA and aspirations of SDG’s would be more informative.

Chapter 6

The sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

To access and monitor SDG’s we need open access data and set up proper indicators. The very relevant initiative recognizing the need to develop, integrate and deploy information for monitoring and assessment of ecosystem services, open access databases, and mutual indicators for data exchange and analysis is the European Platform for Biodiversity Research (www.epbres.org). There are many recommendations in science-policy interface made by UNEA which would be the whole picture once the UNEA report is finalized. There is no mention about such initiatives in the UNEA report. Please ensure coherence and ensure the UNEA specific information is clearly visible.

Chapter 6

The sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

The concept will be defined in the final draft. Yet, before providing definitions in our chapter, we need to carefully check, how previous EEA-chapters have referred to the concept, and whether such definitions has be included in the Glossary than is being developed.

Chapter 6

The introductory section has been developed well. I think the auditors for such a comprehensive introduction. I would think that if some elaboration is made on key achievements of UNEA and aspirations of SDG’s would be more informative.

Chapter 6

Thank you for the comment, the sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

Thank you for the comment, the sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

Thank you for the comment, the sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

Thank you for the comment, the sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

Thank you for the comment, the sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

Thank you for the comment, the sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

The sentence has been changed to "Addressing biodiversity loss and ecosystem degradation..."

Chapter 6

The term "generate" comes from the original publication Diaz et al 2015, therefore we prefer to keep it.

Chapter 6

The sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

The sentence has been rephrased.

Chapter 6

The example could be found in Section 6.4 of this chapter.
We corrected the sentence and referred to the original source for this statement.

The EU’s ‘subsidiarity principle’ is set out in Article 5(3) of the Treaty on European Union. It states that the EU “shall act only if and in so far as the objectives of the proposed action cannot be sufficiently achieved by the Member States, either at central level or at regional and/or local level, or cannot, by reason of the scale or effects of the proposed action, be achieved at cross-level”. This may be worth mentioning when discussing at what governance level action is best taken.

The comment is relating to the arrows in the previous FOD version of the figure. We revised it now.

"...the Natura 2000 network, led to an increase in the /.../ condition of protected areas."?

Table 6.1: governance modes... shows inconsistencies. What about: Government policy (centralized) and Government policy (decentralized) in first row of table. The categories of the last row are also inconsistent. Are top-down governance modes the same as government policy (centralized)?

The CAP may have made some contributions to improve biodiversity in the EU, but it has also had some significant negative effects. There needs to be explanation of how the CAP combines hierarchical with decentralised governance and public-private partnerships. A detailed overview of how the CAP functions is needed in the Report given how often it is referred to, although I am not sure where the best place to do it. The details of the failure in payments that are referenced in line 248-82 need fleshing out as to why they are relevant here.

The CAP has not yet been included in the text. The text needs to explain the governance modes by type of example of the European Union. It has not been split into two paragraphs, and the second one also points to examples from Eastern European and Central Asia. However, the actual assessment and more details will be provided in selected sections of the chapter.

The CAP may have made some contributions to improve biodiversity in the EU, but it has also had some significant negative effects. There needs to be explanation of how the CAP combines hierarchical with decentralised governance and public-private partnerships. A detailed overview of how the CAP functions is needed in the Report given how often it is referred to, although I am not sure where the best place to do it. The details of the failure in payments that are referenced in line 248-82 need fleshing out as to why they are relevant here.

Note that the Natura 2000 network is not yet complete. Note also that the Birds and Habitats Directives allow the EU to meet its obligations under international law (in particular the Bern Convention), does this mean “effective EU regulation”? Does the reference have now also been specified.

Does this mean “effective EU regulation”?

"The main underlying reason behind biodiversity loss and ecosystem degradation is due to various institutional failures.” This seems to be a very bold statement, and it is not substantiated with evidence in the following paragraphs. It ignores the role of the socio-economic and political factors (market failures, capitalisation, sustained growth), which it does mention here, and seems to now no more of a root cause than institutional failure itself.

We have included examples to explain this concept. In this section we mention OMC as an example of modes of governance. In this section we do not cite the original sources (esp. Lange et al. 2013), the sentence was not precise. It has been amended and Yamin 2001 cited.

The CAP may have made some contributions to improve biodiversity in the EU, but it has also had some significant negative effects. There needs to be explanation of how the CAP combines hierarchical with decentralised governance and public-private partnerships. A detailed overview of how the CAP functions is needed in the Report given how often it is referred to, although I am not sure where the best place to do it. The details of the failure in payments that are referenced in line 248-82 need fleshing out as to why they are relevant here.

Note that the Natura 2000 network is not yet complete. Note also that the Birds and Habitats Directives allow the EU to meet its obligations under international law (in particular the Bern Convention).

The CAP may have made some contributions to improve biodiversity in the EU, but it has also had some significant negative effects. There needs to be explanation of how the CAP combines hierarchical with decentralised governance and public-private partnerships. A detailed overview of how the CAP functions is needed in the Report given how often it is referred to, although I am not sure where the best place to do it. The details of the failure in payments that are referenced in line 248-82 need fleshing out as to why they are relevant here.

Note that the Natura 2000 network is not yet complete. Note also that the Birds and Habitats Directives allow the EU to meet its obligations under international law (in particular the Bern Convention).

Note that the Natura 2000 network is not yet complete. Note also that the Birds and Habitats Directives allow the EU to meet its obligations under international law (in particular the Bern Convention).

Note that the Natura 2000 network is not yet complete. Note also that the Birds and Habitats Directives allow the EU to meet its obligations under international law (in particular the Bern Convention).
It is just an example.

we added education and science as further sectors to consider

Chapter 6

We welcome very much Figure 6.2 and the approach outlines here. However the box at the top with governance modes remains unclear- how is this linked to the other boxes? The outline of this chapter follows this approach.

Chapter 6

We will add more explanatory text for the different components of the figure.

These type of trade-offs will be assessed later on in the chapter.

As well as there being an issue over acceptance of governance frameworks, there is also an issue over effectiveness. Policy approach A may be more amenable to a larger number of stakeholders, but Policy approach B may

It would be useful if the chapter could present how to conduct a policy mix analysis (tools available, case study of a policy mix analysis undertaken in a country

This will be elaborated on in some parts of the chapter in the final draft (probably 6.3 and 6.4).

Andrew Strait, UK QE National Focal Point

Andrew Strait, UK QE National Focal Point

This is an important observation but it does not appear to be backed up by any evidence. What evidence is there that such conflicting policies are inefficient or ineffectual?

Andrew Strait, UK QE National Focal Point

Andrew Strait, UK QE National Focal Point

Andrew Strait, UK QE National Focal Point

Andrew Strait, UK QE National Focal Point

Andrew Strait, UK QE National Focal Point

Andrew Strait, UK QE National Focal Point

Andrew Strait, UK QE National Focal Point

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.

Supporting evidence / references needed.
We believe this is highly relevant since this deal explicitly addresses governance structures.

Chapter 6

We agree the text has been rearranged.

Chapter 6

The adoption of newer MEAs is treated here as a negative - but the key problem for international environmental law (IEL) is its implementation, rather than the setting of new standards and targets. As such, focus moving from listing new MEAs online could serve as a good thing, it is clear that some have transformed into improving compliance and enforcement.

Chapter 6

This is displayed in other parts of the assessment.

Chapter 6

The adoption of newer MEAs in the last decade can also be said that the strategy is already quite good.

Chapter 6

This section has been rewritten. Since the red list is treated elsewhere it is included as an example of the importance of.

Chapter 6

The IUCN is not really an NGO, but a "membership Union uniquely composed of both government and civil society organisations. It provides public, private and non-governmental organisations with the knowledge and tools committees and so on.

Chapter 6

We agree but, due to limited space available, we are focusing more on representative examples of IGOs and their role of these organisations are acknowledged.

Chapter 6

The whole section has been rewritten to better balance the display of different organisations and their role.

Chapter 6

The whole section has now been restrucuted and rewritten. The different types of organisations at the various stages has then been explicated accordingly to the suggestions.

Chapter 6

Worth mentioning that although IUCN is an NGO, it also has Govts as members. Doesn’t really engage with their role as international legal actors, but rather what they do ‘on the ground’. NGOs have been key in the development of IEL. The sources cited above (Yamin/Spiro) may be of use, and it may also serve as a subject for regional organisations.

Chapter 6

These subchapters look at international organisations such as UN, yet there are many bilateral organisations such as the Royal Bird Society or the Frankfurt Zoological Society, Succow Foundation and others who are very active in promoting biodiversity in the ECA region, despite the ILO’s International Fund for the Protection of the Environment. NGO’s do not mention these and other prominent organisations should be included.

Chapter 6

A policy instrument.

Chapter 6

This section has been rewritten. Since the red list is treated elsewhere it is included as an example of the importance of.

Chapter 6

We agree that the whole section has been rearranged to better correspond the Framework presented in section 6.2.

Chapter 6

It would make more sense to begin by providing an overview of the substantive provisions of MEAs in force in the ECA region. Then looking at how these are monitored and enforced (including the role of international organizations).

Chapter 6

We have inserted tables including the most important biodiversity related conventions, objectives at the local, national and international levels as briefly as possible.

Chapter 6

The sentences have now been changed in accordance with the suggestion.

Chapter 6

We agree that this would be very relevant. However, it was difficult to find data to get an overview of how these countries are included and whether it is safe from the overall risk of ICA, so far we have focused on a more general overview of the risk of ICA in the ECA region, but will continue the analysis of individual countries.

Chapter 6

We agree that this be included. Yes, the second section on EU has been added.

Chapter 6

We agree but, due to limited space available, we are focusing more on representative examples of NGOs and their role in international environmental governance.

Chapter 6

We agree. The text has now been rearranged.

Chapter 6

We agree that the text has been rearranged/revised to highlight the role of NGOs and better distinguish between different levels of organisations.

Chapter 6

We agree that the text has been rearranged.

Chapter 6

We agree the text has been clarified.

Chapter 6

We agree the text has been clarified.

Chapter 6

We agree the text has been clarified.

Chapter 6

We agree but, due to limited space available, we are focusing more on representative examples of NGOs and their role in governance.

Chapter 6

We agree but, due to limited space available, we are focusing more on representative examples of NGOs and their role in governance.

Chapter 6

We agree but, due to limited space available, we are focusing more on representative examples of NGOs and their role in governance.

Chapter 6

We agree but, due to limited space available, we are focusing more on representative examples of NGOs and their role in governance.

Chapter 6

We agree that the text has been rearranged.

Chapter 6

We agree that the text has been rearranged.
There are no Parties to SBSTTA (maybe Parties to the CBD which send delegations to SBSTTA)

The global treaty system

You agree. It is changed.

This is the first time I have heard that the CBD is a failure. Yes, the 2010 targets were missed, but this does not mean the entire project is a failure. For comparison, consider that people still commit murder despite their being a

Is it not rather: Effectiveness and weaknesses of the global treaty system?

The treaty-MAKING-system does not match with the continuation of the phrase: OR the set of mechanisms by which countries through agreements promote sustainable development.

These are different aspects. In the following paragraph there is no mention about the MAKING-system. The existing system is set in weaknesses rather touched illustrated by some examples. Please reconsider sentence

These are different aspects. In the following paragraph there is no mention about the MAKING-system. The existing system is set in weaknesses rather touched illustrated by some examples. Please reconsider sentence

Agreed. It is changed.

9

Suggest that the section on treaties global and regional treaties come before organisations, as matter between goals have precedence. The Arctic Council is not a treaty organization.

Agreed that treaties have precedence, however it is a task that sets up and design these treaties. That's why we described the points in this fashion.

Is it not rather: Effectiveness and weaknesses of the global treaty system?

It doesn't make sense to say that it is related to "problem-related" if we don't even know what EL is yet. It would be better to first introduce the basic concepts and frameworks (i.e. terms of overall treaty objectives, high level, non-binding, monitoring and enforcement; legal instruments, binding, non-binding, monitoring and enforcement; legal instruments, binding, non-binding, monitoring and enforcement; etc. CBD, UN, UNCED, etc. very different). The technological and legal assistance and support discussed the problems with it.

This is changed in restructuring and adding text as general features.

This is the first time I have heard that the CBD is a failure. Yes, the 2010 targets were missed, but this does not mean the entire project is a failure. For comparison, consider that people still commit murder despite their being a

The whole section has been rewritten in accordance with the literature that better acknowledges the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

There are many reasons why progress has been insufficient and these have been thoroughly reviewed in GBO-4 and in subsequent reviews by CBD SBSTTA. All this evidence should be reviewed at cited, not just academic papers.

The whole section has been rewritten in accordance with the literature that better acknowledges the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Both statements of failure would need to be backed up by significantly more evidence than a couple of papers, and would need to explain in what ways they have failed

The whole section has been rewritten in accordance with the literature that better acknowledges the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

We agree. Good comment. We have inserted this in the text.

The whole section has been rewritten in accordance with the literature that better acknowledges the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

The reason why multiple treaties lead to 'failure' is not explained

The whole section has been rewritten in accordance with the literature that better acknowledges the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

It is not possible to come to these three main questions of biodiversity by species, by region, by globally. Kobler refers to 3 criteria - why the reference to Kobler? Perhaps more importantly, give the geographic scope of the Report, the CBD Convention on the Conservation of European Wildlife and Natural Habitats (LST 196) must be discussed in some detail. It is considered a mechanism for the regional implementation of the Convention on Biological diversity.

This is now covered in a table in particular the covered in the CBD region which is quite impressive compared to other regions.

The whole section has been rewritten in accordance with the literature that better acknowledges the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

The whole section has been rewritten to in accordance with the literature better acknowledge the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

The width of the treaty obligations stems from the need for subsidiarity and to ensure broad state participation. The treaty text must be vague - the details are to be worked out through Aichi Targets and national legislation.

The whole section has been rewritten in accordance with the literature that better acknowledges the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

The whole section has been rewritten in accordance with the literature that better acknowledges the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point

Andrew Stott, UK National Focal Point
The whole section has been rewritten and restructured more on the role of international law such as: [593]

- DieWhole section has been rewritten and restructured more on the role of international law such as: [593]

- The solutions mentioned (584-586) are problematic. The ecosystem/mother earth approach is an approach reflecting the complexity, focusing on explicit objectives runs the risk of simplifying the problem, IPBES wants to

- [593]

- We agree, have further elaborated the text on ILKP, however this needs further assessment which we will do in the next stage.

- The whole section has been rewritten in accordance with the literature better acknowledge the strengths and weaknesses of the CBD.

- Thank you for the suggestions, we have now rearranged the whole section to better reflect the underpinnings of your suggestions.

- [593]
Please ensure link to the discussion on direct and indirect drivers when talking about pressures.

These two subchapters will need ILK expertise.


Nevada National Park has promoted actions for restoring old high-mountain acequias and compiling the experiential knowledge related to water management (Espı´n et al. 2010). In addition, in the Sierra Nevada National Park of Spain the Public Administration has cooperated with local farmers to preserve traditional practices and knowledge related to water management (Iniesta-Arandia et al. 2014).

This would be really helpful. Please highlight those 'lessons learned' about the urgency of the problems. This is not the same as the claim in the report.

The cited source states that “there are severe implementation gaps in many global environmental policies relating to the PB issues, where problematic trends are not being halted or reversed despite international consensus and national commitments.” This is now only on public sector policies. Consider including business/private sector (e.g. line with your Chapter Title). Check work by WRI, http://www.wri.org/publication/corporate-ecosystem-services-review).

This is a defined structure for carrying out sector analysis has been agreed in Zadar and will be taken forward next year and as part of the sector analysis per sector analysis has been proposed to authors.

The text on individual ES has been removed and included in a table.

A sweeping statement for which only one reference is given. This has been changed and more references added (See answer to comment above).

Lessons learned will be highlighted at the end of each sector analysed in the relative sub-sections in the present report. This is not the same as the claim in the report.}

Chapter 6

Opportunities-Assessment-Web.pdf). Also for section 6.4.3.5.8.4.4.2.3 Constraints and opportunities under economic and financial instruments and social and cultural instruments.

The text has been re-organised and now the analysis of economic instruments is made explicit in sub-section 6.5.2.3 Constraints and opportunities under economic and financial instruments and social and cultural instruments.

Some of the suggested references ILKP and others have been included in the text of the SOD see section 6.5.2.3 Constraints and opportunities under economic and financial instruments and social and cultural instruments.

The text has been changed as follows… -- ‘Agnoletti, in the last 45-60 years, these governance systems have shown more failures than successes in halting biodiversity loss, habitat destruction and degradation, reducing pollutions and climate change’ (http://www.unecc-austria.org/UNCCD2005, ICAE, 2010, Steffen et al., 2015).

The text on individual ES has been removed and included in a table.

A defined structure for carrying out sector analysis has been agreed in Zadar and will be taken forward next year as part of the sector analysis per sector analysis has been proposed to authors.

We are still looking for expertise in the missing sector.

We are still looking for expertise in the missing sector.

The text on individual ES has been removed and included in a table.

Section 6.4 is too long and a digressive message. The four misleading questions per sector are clear and give a nice structure. However, the length of certain sub-sections or lines might be a risk. Consider working with tables and only keeping the summary in the main text. Section 6.4 is also very strongly dominated by Espı´n et al. Given multifaceted scope - sustainability (national EA) and sector policies should be considered as non-exhaustive (especially) and try to enter a PBs argument, these countries and. My comments to this section are very general, (added value in a table).

A sweeping statement for which only one reference is given. The text has been changed as follows… – ‘Agnoletti, in the last 45-60 years, these governance systems have shown more failures than successes in halting biodiversity loss, habitat destruction and degradation, reducing pollutions and climate change’ (http://www.unecc-austria.org/UNCCD2005, ICAE, 2010, Steffen et al., 2015).

A sweeping statement for which only one reference is given. The text has been changed and more references added (See answer to comment above).

We are still looking for expertise in the missing sector.

We are still looking for expertise in the missing sector.
More information on this controversial discussion and the role of biodiv within the greening component of the CAP would be highly useful.

The text has been restructured and the WHO and Nitrate Directives are taken into consideration as an example of how to link the territorial dimension to the implementation of regulatory instruments to the CAP. The definition of High Nature Value Farmland has been inserted in the text in a note at the bottom of the chapter.

A very limited perspective on pollination, High Nature Value farmland and organic agriculture. Pollination is crucial to all forms of agriculture (although not all crops), and both High Nature Value farmland and organic agriculture are significant in other respects. Reference to the IPBES assessment on this subject is recommended.

The data on nitrogen and phosphorus surpluses are now included in the table as references to water quality. These data refer to agricultural soil (see also footnote), so it is possible to see this information also in relation to the implementation of CAP policy instruments and other directives addressing the problem of reducing nitrogen and phosphorus.

The definition of High Nature Value farmland has been inserted in the text in order to make it easier for the reader to understand the concept. The data in the table are now included in the footnotes as a reference to water quality. The data refer to agricultural soil (see also footnote), so it is possible to see this information also in relation to the implementation of CAP policy instruments and other directives addressing the problem of reducing nitrogen and phosphorus.

The text has been restructured and the data is now included in the footnotes as a reference to water quality. The data refer to agricultural soil (see also footnote), so it is possible to see this information also in relation to the implementation of CAP policy instruments and other directives addressing the problem of reducing nitrogen and phosphorus.

The data on nitrogen and phosphorus surpluses are now included in the table as references to water quality. These data refer to agricultural soil (see also footnotes), so it is possible to see this information also in relation to the implementation of CAP policy instruments and other directives addressing the problem of reducing nitrogen and phosphorus.

The text has been restructured and the WHO and Nitrate Directives are taken into consideration as an example of how to link the territorial dimension to the implementation of regulatory instruments to the CAP. The definition of High Nature Value Farmland has been inserted in the text in a note at the bottom of the chapter.

A very limited perspective on pollination, High Nature Value farmland and organic agriculture. Pollination is crucial to all forms of agriculture (although not all crops), and both High Nature Value farmland and organic agriculture are significant in other respects. Reference to the IPBES assessment on this subject is recommended.

The data on nitrogen and phosphorus surpluses are now included in the table as references to water quality. These data refer to agricultural soil (see also footnotes), so it is possible to see this information also in relation to the implementation of CAP policy instruments and other directives addressing the problem of reducing nitrogen and phosphorus.
The heritage section could also include safeguarding traditional agricultural breeds and genes (fauna and flora).

The sentence has been eliminated.

Not sure what this statement means, and it is also rather out of date.

The text has been revised and included in box 6.5.2 in section 6.5.2.3 Constraints and opportunities, as a sub-section.

This statement has been rephrased to reflect this.

It is incorrect to suggest that Natura 2000 is under CAP. They are separate EU policies. Natura 2000 probably needs reviewing and discussing on an early stage in this chapter.

The text has been revised and included from 6.5.2 in section 6.5.2.3 Constraints and opportunities, under economic and financial instruments as follows: Unfortunately, in the 2007-2013 period in EU-27, Natura 2000 payments and Nature 2000 payments linked to Directive 2000/60/EC (WFD) have resulted respectively 0.1% and 0.5% of the AEMs expenditures for Natura 2000 in the environment (European Commission, 2013) and consequently in under funding of Natura 2000 areas (Vonk et al., 2011; Halos et al., 2014).

Table 6.3 I like the idea behind the Table but I have difficulties with the interpretation. What does the "Outcome" column represent? A historical trend analysis, a BAU prediction, the impact of the mentioned policy instruments?

Suggesting evidence / reference needed.

This chapter will need expert opinion.

The text has been revised as follows: "Unfortunately, in the 2007-2013 period in EU-27, Natura 2000 payments and Nature 2000 payments linked to Directive 2000/60/EC (WFD) have resulted respectively 0.1% and 0.5% of the AEMs expenditures for Natura 2000 in the environment (European Commission, 2013) and consequently in under funding of Natura 2000 areas (Vonk et al., 2011; Halos et al., 2014)."

A thorough assessment is now given in section 6.5.2.3 Constraints and opportunities under economic and financial instruments, as follows: Unfortunately, in the 2007-2013 period in EU-27, Natura 2000 payments and Nature 2000 payments linked to Directive 2000/60/EC (WFD) have resulted respectively 0.1% and 0.5% of the AEMs expenditures for Natura 2000 in the environment (European Commission, 2013) and consequently in under funding of Natura 2000 areas (Vonk et al., 2011; Halos et al., 2014)."

Not clear how this figure relates to the text. I would have thought that these trends would have been presented in earlier chapters of the Assessment?

This is a really interesting table that would be useful for each sector assessed in 6.4, not only the agricultural sector. As this is still work in progress, I expect there will be more instruments other than regulatory in the future.

It would be useful to refer to the measures identified in Table 6.4.1 and Table 6.4.2.1 (Chapter 6) of the IPBES pollination assessment and look at the governance mode for their implementation.

The text has been revised and included in the SOD with examples of economic, financial and social instruments.

Six policy instruments have been included in section 6.5.2.3 Constraints and opportunities under economic and financial instruments. (Czech, A., A., and Kepa, P. (2014). The Evaluation of the environmental effectiveness of the tourism component as a development tool in rural tourism. Tourism Management. 2014, 40, 1-13. doi:10.1016/j.tourman.2013.08.009) - (Russo, G., and Marchenay 2006). "Rural tourism is a private sector activity driven by profitability, and tends to develop in areas where the economic constraints are minimum and the opportunities are maximum. Rural tourism can contribute to maintaining biodiversity in general and genetic resources in particular. There are good fields of study for understanding how the combination of natural factors and human factors can influence biological and cultural diversity." (Poulsen et al. 2011) - The Natura 2000 financing handbook (available at http://ec.europa.eu/environment/nature/natura2000/financing/docs/Natura2000financingHandbook_part1.pdf)

According to Oneill et al. (2008) or Donaldson et al. (2007) or to thematic indicative studies (summary of the Natura 2000 measures) in the different sectors, it has been shown that the Natura 2000 measures contribute to maintaining biodiversity in general and genetic resources in particular. These are good fields of study for understanding how the combination of natural factors and human factors can influence biological and cultural diversity.

A thorough assessment is now given in section 6.5.2.3 Constraints and opportunities under economic and financial instruments, as follows: Unfortunately, in the 2007-2013 period in EU-27, Natura 2000 payments and Nature 2000 payments linked to Directive 2000/60/EC (WFD) have resulted respectively 0.1% and 0.5% of the AEMs expenditures for Natura 2000 in the environment (European Commission, 2013) and consequently in under funding of Natura 2000 areas (Vonk et al., 2011; Halos et al., 2014)."

This statement has been rephrased to reflect this.

Rural tourism is a private sector activity driven by profitability, and tends to develop in areas where the economic constraints are minimum and the opportunities are maximum. Rural tourism can contribute to maintaining biodiversity in general and genetic resources in particular. These are good fields of study for understanding how the combination of natural factors and human factors can influence biological and cultural diversity. (Oneill et al. 2008; Donaldson et al. 2007; thematic indicative studies (summary of the Natura 2000 measures) in the different sectors, it has been shown that the Natura 2000 measures contribute to maintaining biodiversity in general and genetic resources in particular. These are good fields of study for understanding how the combination of natural factors and human factors can influence biological and cultural diversity. (Oneill et al. 2008) - Poulsen et al. (2011).

Supporting evidence / reference needed.

The text has been revised and included in the SOD and revised (see annotation above).

The reference to the the tables of chapter 6 of the IPBES pollination assessment has been included in this chapter. This is not just covering agricultural land.

A thorough assessment is now given in section 6.5.2.3 Constraints and opportunities under economic and financial instruments, as follows: Unfortunately, in the 2007-2013 period in EU-27, Natura 2000 payments and Nature 2000 payments linked to Directive 2000/60/EC (WFD) have resulted respectively 0.1% and 0.5% of the AEMs expenditures for Natura 2000 in the environment (European Commission, 2013) and consequently in under funding of Natura 2000 areas (Vonk et al., 2011; Halos et al., 2014)."

This section has been eliminated from the SOD.

This section has been re-phrased to reflect this.

Not sure what this statement means, and it is also rather out of date.

This section has been re-phrased to reflect this.

The heritage section could also include safeguarding traditional agricultural breeds and genes (fauna and flora).

The sentence has been eliminated.

The heritage section could also include safeguarding traditional agricultural breeds and genes (fauna and flora).

The sentence has been eliminated.

Not sure what this statement means, and it is also rather out of date.

The heritage section could also include safeguarding traditional agricultural breeds and genes (fauna and flora).

The sentence has been eliminated.
Chapter 6

Russia, Caucasus and Central Asia are missing although they have large areas with forests; should be added

Thank you for the suggested literature we have included the UNECE 2015 in the text.

Thank you for the suggestion, we will address these in the final text.

There is a bias of information/assessment of the European (Western) side

You may want to look at UNECE main report on forests 2015, also GIZ analyses ("forestry sector analyses Tajikistan 2010") and others to fill the current gaps

We now include more information and references on Eastern Europe and Central Asia

The distinction between soft and hard international law is a well-established and entirely commonplace one. Soft law has been crucial in the development of international environmental law, international human rights law, international bioethics law, and international economics law. For example, the Rio and Stockholm Declarations are soft law. For an introduction to soft law in IEL, see Birnie, Boyle and Redgwell, International Law and the Environment (OUP 2009) 34-37.

The whole sub-chapter is rather a sectoral discussion on developments in the forestry sector than an examination of what the new IPBES perspective means/could mean to forest ecosystems and their use.

The categories mentioned are not consistent

The link between the scarcity of information and the fact that decisions are increasingly taken by governments is not clear: wouldn’t government-driven measures be easier to track? Maybe develop a little on this issue or...

Trial and error – or adaptive management – is not necessarily inefficient. If this point is retained, supporting evidence is needed.

Is private level a meaningful category? Levels usually refer to space-relevant entities

The fragmentation is considered as a major problem; yet the fragmentation is framed as a mix of hard-soft-self-disciplining authoritative means. Is this really a fragmentation? Integration is considered as necessary, however, rhetoric. What is the link between management plan and biodiversity conservation, when in traditional plans the maximization of timber production is the main issue?

benefit from land use rights. Their valuation of the land is much more holistic and sustainable, offering an ethic of land use that respects the diversity and the functioning of ecosystems in the long run.

You might add: benefit sharing between tourism and low-input farming (e.g., by conservation programmes funded via a tourism tax)

We now explain in more detail, why the described mix can be characterized as fragmentation and which implications this has for assessing and managing forest ecosystems.

We now mention that forest area is increasing in nearly all ECA countries due to afforestation and Turkey. Experts on agriculture in ECA have been contacted

We now provide examples from two different contexts: the Russian Federation and the People’s Republic of China.

The link between the scarcity of information and the fact that decisions are increasingly taken by governments is not clear: wouldn’t government-driven measures be easier to track? Maybe develop a little on this issue or....

We now include the following about: As a criterion to get the decision making closer to the implementation level, the UNECC (2016) identifies four variables most important for achieving sustainable forest management (see criteria in world forests program)

We now include this comment and the respective reference

We now provide a new paragraph for the category "Useful..."

We now provide additional examples for all categories (category maintenance) and scales (international, EU, national, regional, local) and discuss how these can be used to assess the quality of governance in ECA (see also...)

Financing stems from the EU but national authorities (e.g., Russia) decide how to use the money. This process is not always transparent. The link between management plan and biodiversity conservation is not always clear: the EU funding provided by the EU, but the national governments decide where and how to spend it.

We have now partly rephrased this paragraph to clarify the meaning. However, there was no space available to insert a new table for illustration.

We now mention that there are no national authorities that are well informed about the situation and that the politics of the forest sector is not clear. This process is not always transparent. The link between management plan and biodiversity conservation is not always clear: the EU funding provided by the EU, but the national governments decide where and how to spend it.

We now provide additional examples for all categories (category maintenance) and scales (international, EU, national, regional, local) and discuss how these can be used to assess the quality of governance in ECA (see also...)

In paragraph 6.4.3 the text "...and Turkey”. experts on agriculture in EECA have been contacted...

We now provide examples from two different contexts: the Russian Federation and the People’s Republic of China.

We now mention that forest area is increasing in nearly all ECA countries due to afforestation and Turkey. Experts on agriculture in ECA have been contacted

We now explain in more detail, why the described mix can be characterized as fragmentation and which implications this has for assessing and managing forest ecosystems.

We now mention that forest area is increasing in nearly all ECA countries due to afforestation and Turkey. Experts on agriculture in ECA have been contacted

Indeed, we aimed at describing and discussing the constraints and opportunities of governance and policy instruments in the forestry sector: implications for a possible mainstreaming of IPBES into this sector are dealt with in sub chapter 7.
These MANPs have now been published, and the Commission has produced a summary: [http://ec.europa.eu/fisheries/cfp/aquaculture/multiannual-national-plans/index_en.htm](http://ec.europa.eu/fisheries/cfp/aquaculture/multiannual-national-plans/index_en.htm)...

"Natura 2000 network”? - > Is the Natura 2000 network meant here?

"What are the three elements of forest policy (Borrass et al., 2015)."

Marine protected areas (MPAs) and networks seem to be missing in this section. Suggested publications:


The discussion on CFP has been moved upward of that on RMGs; however we still stick to the section at the highest possible level referring to CFP, RMGs and FAO.

We now highlight the fact that "A more recent report by the Central Asian and Caucasus Regional Fisheries and Aquaculture Commission (2016) highlighted a number of constraints in implementing the code of conduct for responsible fisheries in the Central Asian and Caucasus region. The main constraints highlighted were related to inadequate scientific research, statistics and access to information, insufficient budgetary resources and institutional weaknesses, and to insufficient fisheries monitoring, control and surveillance and lack of capacity in fisheries."

"what about the constraints of CMCA (Central Asian and Caucasus Regional Fisheries and Aquaculture Commission) in Central Asian and Eastern European policies?"

"This is correct but here we are trying to tease out the weaknesses of the strategy. We have reflected this section in note 13 to strategic framework for sustainable development of European Aquaculture 2015 and in another context"...
The assessment could generally be more detailed with regard to energy under consideration of existing policies and strategies. As one example, decarbonisation of the energy sector is not mentioned. Renewable energy is also not what about the economic subsidies regarding energy in Eastern Europe/Central Asia (this is contra-productive to energy-efficiency approaches; energy supply in rural areas vs cities is of concern looking at the growing cities; this paragraph was totally removed.

This aspect is not integrated in section 6.6.2.2. We now mention it in lines 1217-1223.

This paragraph covers sectors beyond energy and mining. It could maybe be moved to the introduction or summary of the whole section 6.4.

We agree that spatial planning is not a sector such as the others, and that we should rather emphasize its integration functions. It was therefore decided to move this section to subchapter 6.6.2.2 on Marine spatial planning.

This section is very theoretical; there is literature available on land reforms and different land use policies for Eastern Europe and Central Asia. Moreover, we specifically looked for publications related to Trevisani or IAMO. Thank you for mentioning that there is literature available. We have conducted a systematic search with various combinations of keywords relating to spatial planning with terms relating to the different countries and regions included in Eastern Europe and Central Asia. However, we specifically looked for publications related to Trevisani or IAMO. This is an example that spatial planning not only has an economic dimension, but also has an important role in terms of social and environmental aspects. The text has been moved to section 6.6.2.2 on Marine spatial planning.

This topic is very theoretical. There is literature available on land reforms and different land use policies for Eastern Europe and Central Asia (see Trevisani, IAMO, etc.) which could give some more examples on spatial planning. Thank you for mentioning that there is literature available. We have conducted a systematic search with various combinations of keywords relating to spatial planning with terms relating to the different countries and regions included in Eastern Europe and Central Asia. However, we specifically looked for publications related to Trevisani or IAMO. This is an example that spatial planning not only has an economic dimension, but also has an important role in terms of social and environmental aspects. The text has been moved to section 6.6.2.2 on Marine spatial planning.

This paragraph has been integrated into section 6.6.2.2 for the SOD. Spatial planning start: this section has been moved to section 6.4.2.2 for the SOD.

The urban aspect could be developed further here, as cities represent urbanisation trends and emerging trends in ecosystem approach to the planning of the city. Protection models for formal and informal management systems in urban, civil engagement for urban green space management in cities, or a shift in focus in Rotterdam from technological food migration strategies to risk-based and adaptation strategies (see Schwanenberg, M., Heinrichs, T., Dupont T, 2014). Opportunities for increasing resilience and sustainability of Urban-Social-Ecological Systems: Insights from the WWF and the Cities Blackout Projects. AMSA Special Issue, 45-63-64.

Regional Assessment Report on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services for Europe and Central Asia

1141
1257

The urban aspect could be developed further here, as cities represent urbanisation trends and emerging trends in ecosystem approach to the planning of the city. Protection models for formal and informal management systems in urban, civil engagement for urban green space management in cities, or a shift in focus in Rotterdam from technological food migration strategies to risk-based and adaptation strategies (see Schwanenberg, M., Heinrichs, T., Dupont T, 2014). Opportunities for increasing resilience and sustainability of Urban-Social-Ecological Systems: Insights from the WWF and the Cities Blackout Projects. AMSA Special Issue, 45-63-64.

Regional Assessment Report on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services for Europe and Central Asia

1141
1257

The urban aspect could be developed further here, as cities represent urbanisation trends and emerging trends in ecosystem approach to the planning of the city. Protection models for formal and informal management systems in urban, civil engagement for urban green space management in cities, or a shift in focus in Rotterdam from technological food migration strategies to risk-based and adaptation strategies (see Schwanenberg, M., Heinrichs, T., Dupont T, 2014). Opportunities for increasing resilience and sustainability of Urban-Social-Ecological Systems: Insights from the WWF and the Cities Blackout Projects. AMSA Special Issue, 45-63-64.

Regional Assessment Report on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services for Europe and Central Asia

1141
1257

The urban aspect could be developed further here, as cities represent urbanisation trends and emerging trends in ecosystem approach to the planning of the city. Protection models for formal and informal management systems in urban, civil engagement for urban green space management in cities, or a shift in focus in Rotterdam from technological food migration strategies to risk-based and adaptation strategies (see Schwanenberg, M., Heinrichs, T., Dupont T, 2014). Opportunities for increasing resilience and sustainability of Urban-Social-Ecological Systems: Insights from the WWF and the Cities Blackout Projects. AMSA Special Issue, 45-63-64.

Regional Assessment Report on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services for Europe and Central Asia

1141
1257

The urban aspect could be developed further here, as cities represent urbanisation trends and emerging trends in ecosystem approach to the planning of the city. Protection models for formal and informal management systems in urban, civil engagement for urban green space management in cities, or a shift in focus in Rotterdam from technological food migration strategies to risk-based and adaptation strategies (see Schwanenberg, M., Heinrichs, T., Dupont T, 2014). Opportunities for increasing resilience and sustainability of Urban-Social-Ecological Systems: Insights from the WWF and the Cities Blackout Projects. AMSA Special Issue, 45-63-64.

Regional Assessment Report on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services for Europe and Central Asia
Morais Macedo

Chapter 6
42 1488 42 1488


Agnieszka Holcbruń

Chapter 6
42 1488 42 1488

1460 45 1570

A good point indeed. This has been added within the second-last paragraph of 6.6.2.2.

Alex Wolff

Chapter 6
42 1498 42 1498

Wasn’t “multi-instrumentality” referred to as “policy mix” earlier?

Agnieszka Holcbruń

Chapter 6
42 1488 42 1488

Multi-instrumentality has been changed into “policy mix” as suggested.

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

Thank you for the valuable comment. It will be addressed in the final draft.

Karen B. West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

Some of the resulting opportunities (fourth and fifth-last paragraph in 6.6.2.2) are highlighted. This approach and the examples suggested have been added at lines 1541-1545.

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Agnieszka Holcbruń

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Doug Nahokablie

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf

Charm West

Chapter 6
42 1515 42 1515

This is already done by some businesses with the support of governments. See for example the methodological guide for transportation business to inform customers on CO2 emissions (in French) produced by the Ministry of Environment: http://www.developpement-durable.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/Guide_Information_CO2-2.pdf
Are you sure that low population density makes this aspect less relevant in Central Asia as compared to Europe? Please expand your discussions on the role of income distribution, because people in rural Central Asia may...
We thank the reviewer for this and it has been added in to section 6.3.5.3 now.

This sentence now reads “The political commitment of the governments of countries bordering regional seas to cooperative management is a fundamental requirement for success of any agreements aimed at the implementation of environmental protection measures.”

True, we have toned down the reference to Europe in this section although the EU still provides some of the key examples of successful transboundary cooperation (e.g. the North Sea). This new Article 10 specifically refers to the Regional seas Conventions. "Member States shall take into account the continuing application of relevant existing environmental laws (e.g. on nature, community or international interest) of the same waters, ensuring that these targets are mutually compatible and that relevant transboundary impacts and transboundary features are also taken into account," is the revised version.

Corrections included:

- Sentence is rewritten as "Hanley et al. (2015a) point out that the integration of ecosystem service valuation into marine policy formation remains challenging due to the fact that these ecosystems tend to be large and often cross multiple national jurisdictions and transboundary areas."

- "A lovely phrase but the sentence probably should be reworded."

- "You are right, but many member states behave this way. A critique of Regulation 1143/2014 should include the discussion of the implementation of the precautionary principle, the polluter pays principle and the ecosystem approach, as well as the need for further operationalisation of these principles (…) in the context of the current political climate."

- "This critical sentence remains (…) but I believe that it is more important than ever to include a detailed discussion of the impact of the relevant regional instruments, their implementation and consistent application by all organizations and countries involved."

- Sentence is rewritten as "OSPAR here is focus on the use of the ecosystem approach to management of the North-East Atlantic and implementing the principles of OSPAR on the basis of the ecosystem approach to management of human activities in the North-East Atlantic marine environment and in implementing the OSPAR Action Plan."

- "The MsFD should be defined as management aimed at maintaining or restoring the composition, structure, function, and delivery of natural and modified ecological boundaries at a scale at which they can be managed individually or at least as an integrated whole."

- "This idea has been covered in chapter 4. Perhaps directly start this section with the policy governance aspects?"

- "This is certainly not the case in the region, which has a very narrow scope of application and where the principal driving forces, such as the globalisation of the economy, are not well understood."

- "There are some cases where the action Plan is not as effective as expected, for example in the Wadden Sea, where the main driving force is the global market."

- "A consistent terminology in other species…", etc.

- "This critical sentence remains (…) but I believe that it is more important than ever to include a detailed discussion of the impact of the relevant regional instruments, their implementation and consistent application by all organizations and countries involved."

- "The scope of the Regulation 1143/2014 is ‘evaluation on the issues for would effectively prevent, minimise or mitigate the adverse impact of those species in a cost efficient manner’. Therefore invasive species already widespread and with economic impact...”
This is ambiguous for me: do I suggest that use of herbicides and insecticides to eradicate IAS should be banned, based on best practice exchange, or do I suggest that the use of herbicides and insecticides to eradicate IAS is...
The limitations as well as what it is and how it works is now explained in the first paragraph of 6.6.2.1.

We now explain the issue of substitutability in more detail in the 4th paragraph of 6.6.2.1. Is it really the case that this is the only way to address intergenerational equity?

The issue of substitutability is a really important one here that cannot afford to be buried in this paragraph. A fundamental assumption of ecological accounting and valuing multiple ES by one metric (e.g., €) is that they are substitutable. Failing to take into account that some services are strongly substitutable is not helpful.

Thank you for the suggestion. We have developed these aspects in section 6.3 and 6.6. and will continue to assess the role of policy instruments for different purposes, among others integrating across sectors in next round.

In line with the waste management hierarchy, this should be rewritten/rearranged to ‘reducing waste, re-use, recycle’, and it would make sense to add ‘responsible disposal of unavoidable waste’. Poor waste management (consumption and production) why we would like to keep it as it is. However the final decision will be taken after the next round.

The previous paragraph summarizes the critiques on economic valuations; however it does not suggest any movement. This paragraph is about the integration of economic value of ecosystems into accounting.

Soil degradation and use of pesticides as aspects of natural capital: Soil degradation is a process that affects the value of natural capital. Use of pesticides is human activity that affects the value of services that natural capital can provide (may increase provisioning services in the short term, but decrease this in the long term).

We revised the sentence accordingly as follows: “While Hamilton & Norkait (2016) criticise ANS for being a measure ‘too broad to be operational’, the World Bank’s calculations do not incorporate benefits of maintaining areas of natural capital (such as soil degradation and their effect on biological productivity and ecosystem services).”

As suggested, we now spell out ANS in the second paragraph of 6.6.2.1. We have also added a graph to display the ANS of ECA region with respect to the world line; however it should be checked whether a similar type of graph or table exists in the previous chapters.

As suggested, we now spell out ANS when used for the first time! It would also be useful if you could extract the World Bank data on ANS for the countries of the ECA region and present a synthesis of these.

The ANS concept implies a reduction of natural capital stocks, but this is not how it works. Hence, the World Bank calculations do not reflect these natural capital stocks.

We revised the sentence accordingly as follows: “Moreover, the World Bank’s approach to accounting for natural capital stocks reflects this.”

Although agreeing with the criticism of environmental accounts being restrictive, not being able to measure several aspects does not imply that there are no economic values applied to any aspects. The SEEA still falls short of providing actual Total Economic Value.

We revised the sentence accordingly as follows: “Moreover, the SEEA still falls short of providing actual Total Economic Value.”

We make a note of these complications in the text as follows: “Although recognizing that green accounting provides important information, the critique relates to practical drawbacks, such as lacking data, and the variability of methods to determine and represent services for metals and minerals, as well as conceptual complications, such as the issue of placing a monetary value to natural capital, and defining capital consumption in regards to (human, social and institutional) capital.”

We make a note of these complications in the text as follows: “Moreover, the SEEA still falls short of providing actual Total Economic Value.”

We make a note of these complications in the text as follows: “Moreover, the SEEA still falls short of providing actual Total Economic Value.”

The strategies for reducing the impacts of consumption and production presented in this chapter all seem to fall within the current paradigm of “sustainable growth” (considered an oxymoron by many, e.g., Daly, 1996). It is however argued that this approach is too narrow (consumption and production) why we would like to keep it as it is. However the final decision will be taken after the next round.

See Aichi Target 2. I thought the previous para had just suggested that we need to move away from economic valuations.

The previous paragraph emphasizes the critical nature on economic valuations; however it does not suggest any movement. This paragraph is about the integration of economic value of ecosystems into accounting and reporting systems.

The previous paragraph emphasizes the critical nature on economic valuations; however it does not suggest any movement. This paragraph is about the integration of economic value of ecosystems into accounting and reporting systems.

The strategies for reducing the impacts of consumption and production presented in this chapter all seem to fall within the current paradigm of “sustainable growth” (considered an oxymoron by many, e.g., Daly, 1996). It is however argued that this approach is too narrow (consumption and production) why we would like to keep it as it is. However the final decision will be taken after the next round.

The strategies for reducing the impacts of consumption and production presented in this chapter all seem to fall within the current paradigm of “sustainable growth” (considered an oxymoron by many, e.g., Daly, 1996). It is however argued that this approach is too narrow (consumption and production) why we would like to keep it as it is. However the final decision will be taken after the next round.

The strategies for reducing the impacts of consumption and production presented in this chapter all seem to fall within the current paradigm of “sustainable growth” (considered an oxymoron by many, e.g., Daly, 1996). It is however argued that this approach is too narrow (consumption and production) why we would like to keep it as it is. However the final decision will be taken after the next round.

The strategies for reducing the impacts of consumption and production presented in this chapter all seem to fall within the current paradigm of “sustainable growth” (considered an oxymoron by many, e.g., Daly, 1996). It is however argued that this approach is too narrow (consumption and production) why we would like to keep it as it is. However the final decision will be taken after the next round.
Agrotec 2006: (p2) "The conservation of landscape resources originating from traditional practices linked to the management of wood pastures, chestnut orchards, pastured woods, various forms of coppice, as well as hedges, tree lines and managements of single trees (e.g. pollarding, hedgerow). In the conservation of forest resources, we are still short. These measures are less partly consistent with those of the working group on biodiversity, which also emphasises the need to reduce its forest loss on pastures and afforestation. However, the scope for restoration of forest diversity is limited due to the legislation forbidding, or strongly limiting, the possibility of converting woodland to former pasture or field conditions. Silva Reggiana & Espace 2012: (p12) "By the scale of the European Union, agro-environmental subsidies for extensive livestock production in mountain areas, such as in the Valles Occidentales, are currently a mainstay of farmers' income, with most of the subsidies coming from these payments rather than sales of livestock products, under current economic conditions; these subsidies are essential to the continuity of agriculture in such areas, and thus to the continued application of TDA. Subsidies that target extensive livestock production encourage and support the use of traditional breeds and the TDA embedded within the project. Moreover, independent economists believe that these payments also make their livelihoods more secure. However, livestock subsidies can reduce production costs and increase the value of their livestock products, the future of the industry is heavily dependant on the policies of public policymakers. Relating the economics of production, income, requires greater economic cooperation locally. Germany 1998: (p89) "The legal and regulatory instruments are not always the fastest and most direct response... There are many up and downs to go through as part of the legislative process at the national level. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. We have added Science & Technological instrument on BES matters to the list of policy instruments. Eg to develop an education system for interdisciplinary research, include ES topics in National research grants. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. Validating that ex post participation is an economic tool for policy planning and technology. However, we are very optimistic that the principles of participation are not yet fully acknowledged. We have added Science & Technological instrument on BES matters to the list of policy instruments. Eg to develop an education system for interdisciplinary research, include ES topics in National research grants. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. This should be in the key messages of the executive summary. Germany 1998: (p89) "The legal and regulatory instruments are not always the fastest and most direct response... There are many up and downs to go through as part of the legislative process at the national level. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'. We refer to the scientific analysis on the importance and importance of landscape diversity and that it might reduce credibility of the science. We now mention this in the second paragraph of 'price-based mechanisms'.
Doughnut Nakiebogho Chapter 6 73 2749

Agnes Hallosserie Chapter 6 73 2749

This should be in the key messages of the executive summary.

Agnes Hallosserie Chapter 6 73 2749

We checked and adapted the sentence.

Allan Watt Chapter 6 73 2653

We checked if the sentence about "conflicts often occur" is a fact or a statement. A MAUN comment about "conflicts often occur," e.g. (Rev. 1, Vals 2016) (Haggard). "Traditional peoples are not a source of conflict, but in many cases they provide opportunities to learn about a potentially more sustainable use of natural resources..."

Agnes Hallosserie Chapter 6 73 2733

It would be useful to have here figures of the importance of the market for certified products within the ECA region. Is there a high demand from consumers? Does the offer of certified products meet this demand?

Agnes Hallosserie Chapter 6 73 2733

It could be mentioned here that there is an incentive for private stakeholders to be ahead of the law's regulatory environment in setting standards before they are required to do so by the law. Indeed, it is more likely that if the private sector anticipates the law, it will also align itself on the existing practices. If the private sector doesn't anticipate this, there is a risk that the law will be more demanding compared to what it would have been based on existing voluntary practices. See for example, (p. 4; K. W. Haase, 2004) "Beyond" Agroecology: Approaches to Environmental Regulation: A Survey. in "Ecological and Environmental Policy", ed. M. Cranea and S. N. Nickle, Aldershot, UK: Edward Elgar, pp.339-390

Agnes Hallosserie 73 2710 74

This paragraph is still general and there: could you make it more concrete and more specific to the ECA region with one or two examples?

Allan Watt Chapter 6 73 2643 75

Regional Assessment Report on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services for Europe and Central Asia

Agnes Hallosserie 73 2643 76

There is no information available on ecological thresholds and tipping points has been included now in the text (see section 6.5.2)

Agnes Hallosserie Chapter 6 73 2707 77

The criticism is about the orientations and modalities of modern selection, aimed to plant productivity only and carried on in agronomic stations with soils artificialised by intrants, and also about the properties of the resulting varieties, too homogeneous and inadapted to the diversity of local conditions of organic agriculture.

Allan Watt Chapter 6 73 2548

...as small streams in fields, dry stone walls, small bushes, free standing trees and rocks, and buffer zones when spreading dung to protect streams, moors and forest edge habitats."

Doughnut Nakiebogho Chapter 6 73 2762

This paragraph is a bit generic and theoretic: could you make it more concrete and more specific to the ECA region with one or two examples?

Glasenapp & Thornton 2011 (Switzerland): (p776-777) "The state (Bund) and canton (Graubünden) have significant influence on the management of the land, as they offer financial incentives for the ecological services of the land, which the farmers did view as burdensome. Furthermore, in Vals only a small number of farmers, schools, farmers' unions, and conservation organizations, among others, agreed on the participation of the local experts and were helpful, also looking at transboundary policy issues...

Glasenapp & Thornton 2011 (Switzerland): (p776-777) "The state (Bund) and canton (Graubünden) have significant influence on the management of the land, as they offer financial incentives for the ecological services of the land, which the farmers did view as burdensome. Furthermore, in Vals only a small number of farmers, schools, farmers' unions, and conservation organizations, among others, agreed on the participation of the local experts and were helpful, also looking at transboundary policy issues...

Doughnut Nakiebogho 73 2548 74

It would be useful to have here figures of the importance of the market for certified products within the ECA region. Is there a high demand from consumers? Does the offer of certified products meet this demand?

Agnes Hallosserie Chapter 6 73 2707 77

We now mention this aspect and the reference to the text at the end of the paragraph on certification.

Agnes Hallosserie Chapter 6 73 2707 77

We now mention this aspect and the reference to the text at the end of the paragraph on certification.

Allan Watt 73 2653 75

We now clear that forestry is the only sector with major certification activities within the ECA region and that it differenly differs widely among ECA countries providing some examples.

Agnes Hallosserie Chapter 6 73 2707 77

We now mention this aspect and the reference to the text at the end of the paragraph on certification.

Allan Watt Chapter 6 73 2653 75

We now clear that forestry is the only sector with major certification activities within the ECA region and that it differenly differs widely among ECA countries providing some examples.
Some idea of what these “great opportunities” should be mentioned.

Presumably this section will be updated. When updated, it would be useful to include mention of the knowledge gaps and uncertainties as perceived by others; currently there are no references in this section.

Maybe “challenges” should be part of the headline. One challenge is for the environmental and nature conservation community is also critical self reflection in relation to how to contribute to policy integration in relation to BES. How do we frame and represent the BES challenges today and how does this promote integration of BES in sectors outside the environmental and conservation sphere. The BES approach is one part of this - but what more?

The challenge of enforcing international law, and even more international environmental law, could be briefly discussed here. There is actually in the EU some successful enforcement e.g. through fines to countries that do not comply environmental directions. See: http://ec.europa.eu/environment/legal/law/pres_ac.htm

That would be progress in “social innovation”. It can be stated as that, e.g. “… consumer-oriented policies have to be developed that encourage social innovation with pro-active engagement of citizens in more sustainable consumption practices.” Furthermore, what please are “nudging strategies”? Thank you for the suggestion we have included the sentence in the section and will in the next round better explain nudging-related strategies.