

Comment form for 1st Review Phase of the Deliverable 2b) Regional and subregional assessments of biodiversity and ecosystem services for Africa, Chapter 6 'Options for governance, institutional arrangements and private and public decision making across scales and sectors'

Review Editor: Coleen Vogel
Institute: University of Witwatersrand
Address: 1 Jan Smuts Avenue, Braamfontein, Johannesburg, 2000
Email address: Coleen.Vogel@wits.ac.za

Review Editor: Lapologang Magole
Institute: University of Botswana
Address: 4775 Notwane Rd, Gaborone, Botswana
Email address: lmagole@orc.ub.bw

Reviewers:

Abdelfattah Badr (AB)
Alioune Seydi (AS)
Andriamahazo Michelle (AM)
Diane Douglas (DD)
German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)

Gianluca Ragusa (GR)
Nakashima - ILK expert (N)
Ram Pandit (RP)
Susan Ringrose (SR)
Willemen (W)

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
1	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	0	General			Specify "different" throughout the text.	This has been done throughout where appropriate, or the term "different" has been deleted
2	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	0	General			Out off the America Assessment (Chapter 6, p. 27), Box 6.2 "Global, regional and sub-regional market-oriented entities and agreements that address sustainable development and /or BES" may be used as a guideline / template for the Africa Assessment.	check this with America assessment and use / adapt where relevant
3	Ram Pandit (RP)	1	1	27	880	I find that the sub-sections have their own introductory paragraph in the chapter. They seem to be ok in terms of providing the signpost for the reader. But in terms of the logical structure, would it be better to provide a roadmap of the content in the introductory section, so that the reader becomes aware of what is coming which will also save some space and words otherwise occupied by introduction within sub-sections.	There is discussion underway across ch6s for all the regional assessments as to whether we should use a common framework diagram at the start or not. Until a decision is reached on that, we prefer to keep our current structure. We provide signposting for each section as indicated by the reviewer, with a general overview in the 1.1 setting out what the chapter is about as a whole.
4	Willemen (W)	1	2			The across "sectors" element is still missing from this chapter (apart from the title)	Where relevant and appropriate cross-sector elements will be addressed.
5	German IPBES Coordination office and	2	43	ff		Very good summary; this may be a reference model for other chapters.	no action taken though the abstract needs replacing with an executive summary eventually.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
	national scientists (IPBES)						
6	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	2	43			Goals and targets of conventions should be cited at least once in the chapter and not only named by numbers.	This needs consistency throughout the assessment and is not something we can modify unilaterally- I have checked with chapter 1 and Emma and Jo where this should come in and we can amend accordingly. Either way, the abstract will be replaced with an executive summary so this comment will need to be addressed in whatever location the targets are listed in the end. Note, they are mentioned in exactly this way in the scoping text.
7	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	2	45			The abstract may be improved by rephrasing the text	Abstract replaced by executive summary
8	Ram Pandit (RP)	2	46	2	69	The abstract reads well. It describes the approach taken in the chapter but doesn't specifically mention the key messages coming out the of the chapter. I wonder if these messages need to be highlighted in the abstract itself. By reading the abstract one may expect to get some findings of the analysis done in the chapter.	Abstract replaced by executive summary
9	Willemen (W)	2	46	2	70	Abstract is still written in future tense, change to present or past	Abstract replaced by executive summary

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
10	Willemen (W)	2	46	2	70	Replace the Abstract with an Executive Summary. Keep the structure of the chapter in mind here (structure is lacking in the current abstract)	Abstract replaced by executive summary
11	Willemen (W)	2	46			Specify that this refers to the "IPBES" Conceptual Framework	Added IPBES before conceptual framework in former abstract that remains (but in track change deleted form)
12	Willemen (W)	2	53			The current chapter does not consider different temporal scales (yet?)	This will be done in relation to the policies and different countries' progress. Link also to scenarios and drivers chapters.
13	Willemen (W)	2	59			"rights of Mother Earth". Unclear and fuzzy phrasing, so rephrase. Also, "earth rights" are not addressed in the current chapter	The scoping text says that rights of mother earth should be considered "as appropriate". In the context of Africa we prefer to draw on the ILK and local beliefs/values which do not use this terminology, so the omission is deliberate in relation to the emphasis in the literature
14	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	2				The abstract is very helpful. Please try to include all relevant issues on background, methodology and key findings.	Abstract replaced by executive summary
15	German IPBES Coordination office and	2				The abstract should be written in past tense since the paper is completed.	Abstract replaced by executive summary

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
	national scientists (IPBES)						
16	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	2				The abstract should contain some key findings; e. g. policy instruments must be environmentally effective, economically efficient, and socially equitable in their impacts (from L. 338)	Abstract replaced by executive summary
17	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	3	71	ff		Very good introduction, highlighting the specific African institutional background and putting in a nutshell key transformation processes and institutional change patterns.	Thank you
18	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	3	72	3	76	Reference is given to Chapter 1. However, Chapter 1 seems not to address this issue.	reference to chapter 1 has been removed
19	Ram Pandit (RP)	3	72	3	76	Do we need this text describing Chapter 1. The remainder of the section 6.1 reads well and imbeds Chapter 1 where appropriate. Starting with chapter 1 gives a sense to the reader that there will be such text from other chapters as well. I think this section can be deleted or you may need to provide a brief introduction of other chapters as well in order to link these chapters with chapter 6.	redrafted intro paragraph

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
20	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	3	72			The first sentences referring to chapter one may be deleted	redrafted into paragraph
21	Willemen (W)	3	73			"...challenges" sounds broad. ..."sustainable development challenges"?	sustainable development added
22	Willemen (W)	3	75	3	76	Unclear phrase	Amended
23	Willemen (W)	3	79			.." continent's transformation". Be more specific here, no unclear. (lots of transformations going on)	This sentence has been edited in line with the wording used in the key messages around transformation.
24	Willemen (W)	3	95			"history and evolution". Add "of human and natural processes".	to be added [also clarify on conflict being linked to resources]
25	Nakashima - ILK expert (N)	3	97	3	109	paragraph on insufficient recognition of belief systems, land tenure systems and rights to use the resources in conservation measures... ADD refs - Cormier-Salem et al. 2010 (Senegal and Guinea Bissau): (p412) "The frequent failures of environmental policies and the conflicting claims on coastal resources show the limits of strict protection and the need to share benefits derived from biodiversity conservation beyond park boundaries (IUCN, 2005). Hence, studies conducted in West Africa question the effectiveness of Marine Protected Areas (MPAs) – national parks as well as biosphere reserves. Although they	These refs have been added as appropriate

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>might be ecologically efficient, most often they are not economically viable, or socially acceptable (Boncoeur et al., 2002; Cormier-Salem, 2006)."</p> <p>- Dalle et al. 2005 (Ethiopia): (p15) "These pastoralists have developed resource management strategies which result from centuries of practical tests. However, development interventions did not consider such knowledge because the pastoral production system was considered as backward and a factor for land degradation (Scoones 1995). Contrary to the expectations of the government and development projects, the interventions contributed negatively to development, resulting in rangeland deterioration, low animal products and poverty." (p16) "This study argues that one of the major causes for rangeland degradation and threat to the livelihood of Borana pastoralists was neglecting and/or undermining pastoralists IEK, which was comparable to scientific knowledge (this study and Oba and Kotile 2001). Both types of knowledge</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>are complementary and have to be integrated and used together for a better life of the pastoral society, thereby ensuring the sustainable healthy ecosystem."</p> <p>- Dixon 2008 (Ethiopia): (p351) " In examining the relatively few cases of serious wetland degradation characterized by ecohydrological succession to a dryland environment, previous research pointed to several potential causal factors. First, where local NGOs or government departments were particularly active in dictating drainage and cultivation regimes, local knowledge, management practices and institutional arrangements were effectively overridden, and the benefits of wetland agriculture under such scenarios were found to be short-lived (Wood, 1996). Second, inappropriate practices such as the excavation of deep drainage channels or allowing cattle unlimited access to wetlands have continued in some areas despite recognition from farmers themselves that these practices are destructive. In these instances, it was suggested that the</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						lack of cooperation and communication among farmers, often from different kebele [[a neighbourhood cooperative system and the smallest unit of government]], prevented the formation of institutional arrangements to govern equitable and sustainable wetland use."	
26	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	3	101	3	103	land tenure reference to Chapter 1. But Chapter 1 seems not to consider that.	removed ref to chapter 1 and added new references
27	Ram Pandit (RP)	3	109	3	109	The decision making context Africa (private or otherwise) may also need to be described in the similar fashion as you have done for the governance and institutional arrangement in this section.	Query comment and line reference - we cannot follow the sequence here. Chapter 6 is about governance options not decision making per se. While we have requested a title change, we are leaving any actions until after the title is clear
28	Willemen (W)	3	110			Sub-section title refers to multi-level policy context. Currently only international policy context are presented in this section. Explain why or add other level policies.	Reviewer is incorrect. However, we will add clarity by inserting a line showing structure (see previously abstract) and make explicit reference to all governance levels (add multilevel). Note that national not explicitly included except through case studies due to volume

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
							of national policies and legislation. Add national policy reviews as options.
29	Willemen (W)	3	112			Introduction/explain the term polycentric	References have been added and 2 extra explanatory sentences have been included for upfront clarification before the substance is discussed later on in the chapter.
30	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	3	72-76			The first paragraph of chapter six may be moved and integrated to the abstract	Abstract replaced by executive summary
31	Willemen (W)	4	115			Explain why the Aichi target are used here (link to IPBES)	"progress towards the Aichi targets, including the relevance of these within movement towards the SDGs"
32	Willemen (W)	4	119			Unclear difference between "degrading" and eroding". Use the IPBES definition/thinking here.	Degrading is damaging and eroding is complete loss. Degrading can rehabilitate; check with land degradation restoration assessment.
33	Willemen (W)	4	123			Specify the selection of MEA (e.g. why not World Heritage Convention)	recheck and expand MEAs considered
34	Ram Pandit (RP)	4	125	5	126	Do we need full form of these conventions? In the first column. I struggled to describe CMS?, hence this comment.	Agreed we will define the full form of these conventions on first use. Need to check across chapters re style
35	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	4	125			Table 6.1: The link between CBD and biodiversity and ecosystem services is missing	This will be done

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
36	Andriamahazo Michelle (AM)	4	125	5	126	Table 6.1: Links between key MEAs, biodiversity and ecosystem services. MEA Focus and overview Links to biodiversity. Replace IPTGR by ITPGRFA (The International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture)	see above - to be addressed
37	Willemen (W)	4	125			Table 1: Consider a similar structure to describe each MEA; full name, year, # African signatories, objectives, actions	Information for each agreement will be harmonized
38	Willemen (W)	6	127	6	139	Add some words on the successes and failures, and the role of IPBES in MEA. Have a look at the FOD of the ECA Chapter 6, section 6.3.2.	We will look at the ECA section and add words where relevant
39	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	6	140	6	140	AU and NEPAD initiatives should be also taken into account here (e.g. NEPAD initiative for the Resilience and Restoration of African Landscapes), also role of World Bank, AfDB etc.	AU and NEPAD initiatives will be included here as appropriate because they are policy and governance structures. World Bank and AfDB implement policy so will not be included.
40	Willemen (W)	6	142			Suggestion to add " lakes"	Lakes added
41	Gianluca Ragusa (GR)	6	156	6	158	They have forgotten at least the CEAC and IOC (Incian Ocen Commission) without considering regional fisheries bodies and organisations (for fisheries and aquaculture of course)	We discuss regional economic bodies here. However, the point is taken that we need to identify fisheries expertise as a CA??
42	Willemen (W)	6	159			Genebank example: Strange to have a man-made solution here (would be like talking about dams in the ecosystem services water regulation)	We disagree. All other solutions are man-made solutions. This example is retained due to its relevance to governance in restoration systems.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
43	Willemen (W)	7	174			NBSAP: give full name here, first use	We have left this as it is because it should be mentioned in earlier chapters and defined there. Emailed chapter 1 to check
44	Willemen (W)	7	176	7	177	Refer to these as " international agreements" rather than "global initiatives"	Amended as suggested
45	Willemen (W)	7	182			"have advanced BES". Unclear phrasing and specific.	We have changed advanced into address
46	Willemen (W)	7	187			Remove "achievable". (we don't know yet)	This has been removed
47	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	7	197			The number of African countries needs to be added. "XX"	This has been done
48	Ram Pandit (RP)	7	197	7	200	XX needs to be changed into numbers.	This has been done
49	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	7	217			A paragraph about the key findings of Table 6.2 would be helpful.	Some sentences have been added
50	Gianluca Ragusa (GR)	7	Box 6.1:	7	Box 6.1:	They have forgotten regional fisheries bodies and organisations (for fisheries and aquaculture of course)	see earlier response (42) where fisheries expertise needs to be identified
51	Ram Pandit (RP)	8	218	8	219	Progress on Target 1: Is there some information available to indicate the level of awareness reached. Perhaps it is difficult to generalise across the region, if some national statistics are	This table provides a synthesis at regional level. Only if a review paper exists with existing research will it be included here as we cannot undertake new research.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						available that would provide some guidance. For example, number of environmental NGOs in Tanzania? Or similar indicator may be useful.	
52	Alioune Seydi (AS)	8	218	8	219	The use of natural capital accounting must be tempered somewhat because few of African countries are using this kind of biodiversity mainstreaming. This remains a great challenge for most African countries.	see section on natural capital accounting where this is considered in more depth
53	Alioune Seydi (AS)	8	218	8	219	As incentive opportunity, it would be good to speak of payment for ecosystem services in general with specific examples. In the context of developing countries which emerge many projects heavily impacting the natural capital, ecological offset like bio-banking also appears as a real opportunity.	See section on payment for ecosystem services which discusses this in more detail. Check bio-banking is included there.
54	Alioune Seydi (AS)	8	218	8	219	About the availability of data on the status and trend of ecosystem services, some data may exist but sparsely. Africa needs an exchange platform for synergy of the various efforts.	This is considered under the section under resource challenges.
55	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	8	218			The source of Table 6.2 is missing the author	State of biodiversity in Africa - we will identify the author
56	Willemen (W)	8	218			Table 6.2: Target 14 is a key target for IPBES, make this link more explicit and	Importance of target 14 should be highlighted in the summary paragraph about the table

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						extent the target description and process.	
57	Willemen (W)	8	218			Table 6.2. Add a verb to all targets.	This will be crosschecked with actual wording in CBD
58	Alioune Seydi (AS)	9	218	9	219	One thing is to produce a biodiversity Strategies and Action Plans but another is to exploit it as a reference document. Most of these materials often end in drawers. It is important to stress their popularization and the means of their dissemination to a wide audience.	To be considered in section on knowledge exchange and stakeholder engagement as this is a synthesis table
59	Alioune Seydi (AS)	9	218	9	219	With obvious cultural decline in Africa particularly linked to urbanization, many local knowledge including those relating to the conservation of natural resources are being lost. It will therefore think to their safeguard.	Aspects relating to culture and ILK are integrated throughout the chapter. This point will be considered and integrated as appropriate
60	Willemen (W)	10	220			Section 6.3.: add an assessment/ need for combined use of instruments.	This will be done to ensure instruments are not just treated separately
61	Nakashima - ILK expert (N)	10	220			ADD participation as a way to guarantee the efficiency of conservation measures Campbell 2005 (Ghana): (p10) "in addition to a fear of supernatural forces shared by the vast majority (92 per cent), participation was also recognised as an important factor for local cooperation with conservation	this will be done

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>policy. This view was substantiated by the success of a government supported woodlot-planting project involving four 50 m2 plots of <i>Cassia simea</i> L. financed by the United Nations Food and Agricultural Organisation, which was observed during the field survey in 1996 in the Oshiyie-Kokrobite area. The participation of respected local stakeholders – in this case local fish-smokers – and local awareness of the need for tree planting (all interviewed believed that tree losses reduced rainfall and agreed that several species should have been planted) ensured greater success than would otherwise have been possible. There were very few violators of these stands (there was evidence of a few branches cut, though none would admit to such activity)."</p>	
62	Nakashima - ILK expert (N)	10	220			<p>section 6.3. "Governance options and actions in response to indirect drivers and future scenarios". IN GENERAL: ADD options to integrate local and indigenous communities to policies, decision making, and highlight how this is beneficial for conservation :</p>	this will be done

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>- Dalle et al. 2005 (Ethiopia): (p1) "The results confirmed that the IEK [indigenous environmental knowledge] of these pastoralists could still provide the basis for sustainable resource utilization and rangeland rehabilitation. However, the young generation in the area had not only limited knowledge but also showed less interest to learn and apply the traditional resource management strategies. Therefore, there is high need to perpetuate, document and use this IEK for sustainable development."</p> <p>- Golden 2014 (Madagascar): (p266) "In other areas of Madagascar, conservation has been suggested in weakening traditional local environmental governance (Jones et al. 2008). Understanding the depth of meaning and the spiritual relevance of the forest to local people should facilitate environmental managers in understanding both the parallel goals and certain waves of resistance to current conservation practice. It is thus possible that, by embracing local forest governance strategies rooted in Malagasy spiritualism, conservation</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>managers may enhance support systems for devolved resource management and counteract the potential negative effects of commercialization and globalization on resource exploitation. However, conservation managers must also recognize that they cannot pick and choose which aspects of local culture to use and ignore based on characteristics that will further their own goals (Keller 2008)."</p> <p>- Rushemuka et al. 2014 (Rwanda): (p147) "Farmers in Rwanda, like many other farmers worldwide, have a profound and detailed knowledge of their soils and, in their low input system, exploit any soil difference (Habarurema and Steiner, 1997; Steiner, 1998). Steiner (1998) strongly recommended the building of new soil-related technologies on the FSK [[Farmers' Soil Knowledge]] and to use the farmers' soil nomenclature for communication between scientists and farmers to assure soil-specific interventions and allow farmers' judgmental fertilizer use." (p152) "In such planning environment, the farmers' soil names can be combined</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						with hierarchical scientific classification systems to allow researchers to better understand the biophysical and socio-economic context that have framed the farmers' current practices and coping strategies as a pre-condition to successfully introduce new interventions (Cools et al.,2003; Krasilnikov and Tabor, 2003; Payton et al., 2003; Barrera-Bassols et al., 2006b)." (p158) "This study shows that the farmers' land units and soil names complemented with soil chemical properties are key factors for understanding the rationality of farmers' practices. The latter is a good starting point for planning sound interventions and their efficient implementation. The farmers' soil terms are also user-friendly communication channels to enable adoption of soil-specific technologies."	
63	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	10	222	10	228	Reference is given to Chapter 1 and 4. But these chapters do not describe this adequately.	Reference removed for now and can be added back in later if it does appear in the final version of chapter 1
64	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	10	227			Rephrase the highlighted sentence; the chapters do not have findings but report existing information	Changed to "Drawing on chapters 4 and 5".

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
65	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	10	229			Genuinely economic instruments, such as incentives or disincentives via payments, taxes, etc. seems not considered adequately.	see section 6.3.3 on economic and financial instruments where this is considered
66	Willemen (W)	10	230	10	235	The structure and message of section 6.3. Is very unclear. Reading those lines I expected an assessment of these instruments but instead the section talks about scenarios, and only legal and economic instruments. Social and right based are missing.	Sub-headings introduced here to make chapter structure clearer as social and rights based aspects come later on. Needs framing to be clarified from the outset. Augment Table 6.3 with extra column adding critiques of different instruments.
67	Alioune Seydi (AS)	10	230	10	230	At this level, it would be interesting to distinctly point out the economic instruments that now offer strong potential for natural capital management and a means of biodiversity mainstreaming.	See section 6.3.3. On economic and financial instruments. Clarify this comes later here. Augment Table 6.3 with extra column adding critiques of different instruments.
68	Willemen (W)	10	240	11	266	Consider making a separate sub-section on adaptive polycentric system elsewhere. This text here does not fit the section structure on drivers & scenarios. Also explain these concepts better, including concrete actions/strategies, and base all on an assessment of the current documentation & knowledge	The section may indeed need to be placed elsewhere- for now the concepts have been clarified and some concrete examples provided. Unfortunately there are few specific examples from Africa with regards to ecosystem services as far as the author is aware (I stand to be corrected) so broader examples have been included.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
69	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	10	244	10	246	The description of the inter-connectivity was not described adequately.	This is no longer relevant as the text box has been removed and the text now says "multi-scale connected nature of..."
70	Willemen (W)	10	254		255	Unclear link to adaptive polycentric governance.	See response to comment 69
71	Ram Pandit (RP)	10	262	10	262	A few examples of polycentric governance systems would help here.	See response to comment 69
72	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	11	268			The box to the left is not numbered	We have removed the box as it is a key message. We have integrated the text there where we think it fits better
73	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	11	275	11	275	Can the African GEO 6 report be referenced as source in previous chapters?	This is a comment to be dealt with by previous chapters. Jo has raised this as a useful reference to cite and chapter 5 is also using it. As such, we are confident it will be referenced in earlier chapters as well as chapter 6.
74	Willemen (W)	11	276			Explain: GEO6	Should be included in chapter 5 as Fred has indicated there will be consideration of GEO6 in terms of scenarios. As such, we do not explain GEO6 here.
75	Ram Pandit (RP)	11	281	11	282	This last sentence seems incomplete, "...other scenarios include..."?	We are awaiting information from chapter 5 so we can work out the best way forward

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
76	Willemen (W)	11	282			Text missing.	We are awaiting information from chapter 5 so we can work out the best way forward
77	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	11	290			Is the term "natural capital" adequate?	The title of the GEO6 report is: 'Valuing Africa's Natural Capital' and so this is the term referred to in the report. Ensure natural capital is in glossary.
78	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	11	298			Move the box 6.2 to the left of the page	This will be done during final formatting. We haven't moved it now because the second order draft will change the layout.
79	Nakashima - ILK expert (N)	12	45			<p>section 6.3.3. on economic and financial instruments: ADD: Systems of Geographical Indications can be a way to promote conservation of biodiversity and local varieties, as well as local practices and know-how: - Cormier-Salem et al. 2010 (Senegal and Guinea Bissau): (p409): "In response to the difficult problem of resolving both biodiversity erosion and local poverty, notably in the less developed countries of the south, market-based incentives have been invoked by more and more international agencies (World Bank, International Monetary Fund, FAO, etc.) and national governments as</p>	to be inserted and added in (NB note quotes are copied and pasted no need to be rewritten)

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>potential policy tools that may be able to improve environmental incomes (Jasanoff, 2004). Among these incentives, local specialities enhancement schemes are being increasingly implemented around the world (Muchnik et al., 2008). The success of these schemes is associated with diverse strategies (Barjolle and Sylvander, 2003): legal – the fight against a product name’s usurpation and counterfeiting and the protection of intellectual property rights; commercial – product promotion and livelihood improvement; and patrimonial – conservation of the various levels of biodiversity (genes, animal species and vegetal varieties, ecosystems and landscapes, traditions and know-how)." (p411): "In countries with high biodiversity, the promotion of products through labels is increasingly common. Labels aim to inform consumers about product qualities: environment-friendly production (ecolabel), respect for workers’ social rights (fair trade), origin of production or gustatory quality. These labels can be protected by intellectual property rights such as</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>geographical indications or collective trademarks to prevent use of the label by producers outside of the label's framework." (p412): "Public policies show a growing interest in this labelling, which has a double purpose: to find sustainable alternatives to overfishing, to improve local livelihoods and to give new impetus to rural territories that suffer from drought and global warming, rural exodus and agricultural crises (retreat of mangrove management, salinization and acidification of soils, rice cultivation retreat, landscape degradation, etc.) (Cormier-Salem, 1999)."</p> <p>- Roussel & Verdeaux 2007 (Ethiopia): (p131) "The GI [geographical indications] system, which has been applied in Europe for the past century, appears in many ways to be a viable method for protecting and enhancing the value of local products, know-how, and diversity of biological features (Berard and Marchenay 1994). Even if such a tool is to be used cautiously and needs to be adapted when transferred out of European contexts, there is currently a strong</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						demand for it from the global South." (p132) "With the exception of South African wines, such GI systems do not exist in Africa. For this reason the steps taken recently by the Addis Ababa Environmental Protection Authority are innovative. Working with French partners, this authority has begun elaborating a project to set up a legal and institutional mechanism in Ethiopia for the recognition and protection of geographic indications and marks of quality."	
80	Willemen (W)	12	310			Yet, at least some key policy take away for these (primary) sectors	This will be done as this section is further developed
81	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	12	310			Box 6.3. The term "radically alternative futures" is unclear.	LP to check - referring to radical methodological process not radical policy
82	Ram Pandit (RP)	12	310	12	312	The first sentence seems to be a note for the author?	yes, it is.
83	Ram Pandit (RP)	12	314	12	332	This text may need a better integration with the discussion on scenarios which is the focus of the sub-section.	streamline in relation to scenarios chapter and focus only on implications for decision making
84	Willemen (W)	12	333			This section need more references to key elements of legal instruments. As these are typically arranged on national level, draw upon examples.	Legal person has gone AWOL. Need to find replacement. REs strongly recommend support needed from additional LA with legal expertise

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						Explain the four stages of the policy cycle.	
85	Ram Pandit (RP)	12	333	12	344	This sub-section seems to be just a place holder at the moment.	It is. Legal person has gone AWOL. Need to find replacement. REs strongly recommend support needed from additional LA with legal expertise
86	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	12	333	12	344	Sub-chapter is not completed.	Legal person has gone AWOL. Need to find replacement. REs strongly recommend support needed from additional LA with legal expertise
87	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	12	333	ff		This section seems still incomplete and will be filled with substance; actually it is an empty shell which can be left out at this stage of completion	Legal person has gone AWOL. Need to find replacement. REs strongly recommend support needed from additional LA with legal expertise
88	Ram Pandit (RP)	12	346	12	360	Proper citations would help to strengthen the points made here.	References to be added throughout including balanced critique
89	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	12	346	12	348	For this judgement, a verification is needed.	The sentence has been written in different way now to say that costs of biodiversity loss not always internalised and costs and benefits not always considered. This has been supported by a reference.
90	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	13	372			The specification of the alien plants would be appreciated.	This has been done

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
91	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	13	373	14	374	Verification is needed here.	References have been added here
92	Ram Pandit (RP)	13	376	13	383	Proper citations would help to strengthen the points made here.	Agreed and will be added
93	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	14	384	ff		The authors should try to use a summarizing paragraph for the major findings of the Table.	Agree and table needs to be completed
94	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	14	384			Some examples in Table 6.3 for economic incentives and financial instruments are yet to be written	Agree and table needs to be completed
95	Alioune Seydi (AS)	14	384	14	384	As an illustrative application of payment for ecosystem services in Africa, it will be good to include at this level the Naivasha lake payment of ecosystem services example	To be checked for relevance as integrated as appropriate
96	Willemen (W)	15	284			SAGCOT example: add that WWF and IUCN are collaborating with the SAGCOT Centre to ensure a minimal biodiversity and ecosystem services impact (as there is controversy on if SAGCOT is about "green growth", eg impact on water availability)	Research and evaluation of this is needed. Consider whether this is a good example or not as it is nationally focused and controversial
97	Alioune Seydi (AS)	15	384	15	384	About tradable permits: it is important to emphasize the negative aspects of this mechanism of farm-out. Indeed in	Points taken and will be considered and integrated as appropriate. Include extra column that puts

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						some countries where the farm-out areas are adjacent to protected areas, permits are issued without any scientific basic on the wildlife population. Wildlife counts are not correctly performed or even non-existent. The fauna of these protected areas is greatly threatened by the farm-out.	forward examples and critiques of each mechanism. Contact author of this comment to provide relevant papers
98	Alioune Seydi (AS)	15	384	15	384	About offsetting schemes: despite the fact that the African banking system is quite heavy and chilly, development of biodiversity offsets tools seems very important. Africa host large projects with the implementation of many infrastructures (road, highway, dam, bridge, and so.) which greatly impact the natural capital without real offsetting mechanism.	Points taken and will be included as the table is reviewed and further elaborated. Additional references will be sought.
99	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	16	388			Table 6.3 needs to be completed.	Agreed
100	Willemen (W)	16	391	16	394	This is not yet included in the section. Consider providing examples of international and national planning approaches in relation to BES. Work with a more clear structure (it is very hard to find your key message)	Examples will be added as appropriate and this section will be restructured

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
101	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	16	409	ff		Little information on planning instruments at lower levels such as on land use planning, spatial planning, regional planning etc. Is given here.	Examples will be added as appropriate and this section will be restructured
102	Willemen (W)	16	409			SEA: provide full name	this has been done
103	Ram Pandit (RP)	16	410	16	414	Proper citations would help to strengthen the points made here. Also, is there a scope to discuss private vs. public decision making related to planning within this sub-section?	We are focusing on process rather than public vs private decision making. Citations will be added
104	Alioune Seydi (AS)	16	415	16	415	Today, a major challenge for developing countries in the field of sustainable development is the integration of the value of biodiversity and ecosystem services in development planning in general and in decision-making in particular both at global, local and individual level. We must therefore insist on tools that concretely enable such integration of the value of biodiversity and ecosystem services in decision making.	Information on mainstreaming across sectors will be added here
105	Willemen (W)	16	415			This is now only on public sector policies. Consider including a paragraph on option for business/private sector (in line with your Chapter title). Check work by WRI, (http://www.wri.org/publication/corpo	We will look at the references provided and integrate as appropriate

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						rate-ecosystem-services-review). WBCSD http://www.wbcsd.org/Pages/EDocument/EDocumentDetails.aspx?ID=14923&NoSearchContextKey=true , LPFN http://ecoagriculture.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/African-Business-Engagement-Needs-and-Opportunities-Assessment-Web.pdf)	
106	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	17	425	ff		The list with all the dots is not very clear. Wouldn't it be better to summarize the key messages in a flow text?	These are notes and need further development
107	Willemen (W)	17	425	17	453	To be finished	This will be done
108	Ram Pandit (RP)	17	426	17	455	Elaboration is needed for these bullet points with proper citations. Incomplete table!	This will be done
109	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	17	454			Table 6.4 needs to be completed.	This will be done
110	Willemen (W)	17	454			Consider providing governance options by policy-relevant categories in this table (eg public/private, or, intermediate/final) instead by ecosystem services classification (make less sense)	** to be discussed further - check with other chapters and with all LAs

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
111	Willemen (W)	17	457			Or crowd sourcing. Other examples include: cell phone use for monitoring (and other eg https://www.ceh.ac.uk/news-and-media/blogs/unlocking-africas-potential-citizen-science)	to be done
112	Willemen (W)	18	473			Unclear why CBNRM and co-management are the only two "political" factors. Explain this choice. Include "political willingness"	We have inserted political will in this section. It is also mentioned later on.
113	Nakashima - ILK expert (N)	18	481			section 6.4.1.1. "Community based management" (REMARK: overlaps with chapter 1) ADD references dealing with how CBNRM can address local and indigenous communities issues, help involving them in decision making, but also drawbacks or flaws in the implementation of these measures... FOR EXAMPLE: Phutege & Chanda 2004: the authors present the case of a protected area where community based management was implemented. They recall how, after being deprived from their rights on the land, local inhabitants are being recognized as holders of a valuable knowledge that can be useful in the management of natural resources. They present examples of how this	These will be added

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						knowledge has been integrated in the management plans for the area.	
114	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	18	489	21	565	The missing references should be added.	This has been done
115	Gianluca Ragusa (GR)	19	510	19	510	Co-management and stakeholder participation as well as decentralisation, despite not always fully in place, is widely accepted in the fisheries governance at regional and national as well local level in the most part of African countries	We have mentioned fisheries now
116	Ram Pandit (RP)	19	514	19	516	Relevant citations and some elaboration would help.	This has been done
117	Ram Pandit (RP)	20	564	20	570	Interesting examples of traditional norms/systems. Citations would help.	This section has been expanded but still requires input and citations from experts with relevant knowledge in this area. CA input is needed.
118	Willemen (W)	20	583			This section is about "Approaches", not conditions. Why here and not as policy instrument?	This has been recast to focus on approaches
119	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	21	624	ff		Would change the three dots into a phrase as the chapter starts rather abruptly .	These have been removed

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
120	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	21	624	ff		Acknowledgments about the professional requirements of staff for BES support at different admin levels may be quoted here.	This has been addressed
121	Willemen (W)	21	624			Section title: I would change the order to "Capacity, tools and resources" (make in line with the bullet points below)	bullet points are redundant so the order in the section now matches the title
122	Nakashima - ILK expert (N)	21	625			<p>section 6.4.4. "Tools, capacity and resources":</p> <p>ADD Indigenous and local knowledge as a resource for such assessments.</p> <p>Examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ayeni et al. 2016 (Nigeria) (p46): "This study shows a high consistency between indigenous people's perception of LCC [Land cover changes], remotely sensed LC products, climate and surface water situations. Therefore, local experts' knowledge as part of indigenous people's perception could be used as a participatory approach involving the communities in assessing the impact of environmental change on an important service of forest ecosystems such as fresh water provision." - Gaspare et al. 2015 (Tanzania): (p97) 	these will be added as appropriate

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>"Comparing TEK and CSK [conventional scientific knowledge] reveals much about what grouper species are utilized, and where and when they are caught. This information is of considerable value to fisheries managers and policy makers. For example, most of the resource-use patterns and effort exerted revealed in the qualitative data collected about groupers in Mafia is consistent with that reported by Fischer et al. (1984). However, information on specific grouper species caught using 'nets' (as defined in this study) is lacking. In this case, fishers' TEK is the only available source of information to complement conventional science data." (p100)</p> <p>"Our results indicate that TEK generated some information that confirms scientific data, elicited knowledge that was new to both TEK and CSK, and highlighted some differences between TEK and CSK (e.g. spawning behavior). These discrepancies can be attributed to a number of factors, including observational differences at spatial and temporal scales, as well as methodological differences (e.g.</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>sample size) in gathering data that can generate knowledge of relevance to fisheries management. We therefore conclude that TEK and CSK complement one another, and should be used together, but in full recognition of their limitations."</p> <p>- Le Fur et al. 2011 (Guinea): (p1466)</p> <p>"Based on the results of this study, for example, LEK [[Local Ecological Knowledge]] could complement scientific studies (seabed description), be used as a source of new scientific investigation (bonga reproductive cycle), be considered as the only source of information (nursery location), could substitute for scientific surveys provided that the level of validity is identical (fish diets), or constitute a satisfactory proxy (trophic web)." (p1466) "In developing countries lacking data and resources, such as the republic of Guinea, several authors have highlighted the practical relevance of LEK for obtaining knowledge (Johannes 1998; Silvano and Begossi 2010), particularly in the context of operational EAF [[ecosystem approach to fisheries]] , in which the cost of obtaining</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						knowledge is an important argument (Cury et al. 2005; Garcia and Cochrane 2005). LEK could help to provide answers to questions relating to the identification of sensitive areas in terms of ecosystem productivity (Aswani and Hamilton 2004; Aswani and Lauer 2006), for which diverse knowledge along the entire coast must be obtained."	
123	Willemen (W)	21	631	21	633	Add examples of the role of Science & Education on BES matter here. Eg education system for interdisciplinary research, National research grants on BES topics. Work with examples if you can't do all of the African continent.	This has been done including incorporation of examples
124	Willemen (W)	22	634	22	36	Obviously. Please be more specific (source of resources, opportunities & limitations)	References will be added and this will be more specific
125	Willemen (W)	22	653			Refer to to the IPBES Catalogue	We are unclear which IPBES catalogue is being referred to. We will, as appropriate, link to relevant IPBES materials.
126	Ram Pandit (RP)	22	668	22	670	This could be linked to the policy cycle that is discussed in IPBES documents. I think that has 3-stages? Thoughts for consideration?	The IPBES conceptual framework has been mentioned here now
127	German IPBES Coordination office and	23	680	23	684	This report may be important for previous chapters.	Information on this report has already been shared with earlier chapters

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
	national scientists (IPBES)						
128	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	23	685			Move the box 6.2 to the left of the page	This will be moved in the final formatting and has not been done now as the formatting will change.
129	Willemen (W)	24	736			Specify that the problem setting should result in objective(s)	This has been addressed
130	German IPBES Coordination office and national scientists (IPBES)	24	737	ff		This chapter is still at a preliminary stage and needs some revision on the political economy of policy drafting in an African context.	This will be done - needs to be in conjunction with chapter 1 and 3. Consider starting point.
131	Willemen (W)	24	737	24	745	Either extent of join these sections.	This section needs to be developed. Maybe need CA to help here
132	Willemen (W)	24	738			Specify tools and approaches to evaluated policy alternatives (MCA)	Different integrated measures will be included here
133	Ram Pandit (RP)	24	741	24	745	How decisions pertinent to BES are made at private and public levels? Both private and public decision making contexts and processes need to be explore within this this sub-section, I suppose. It needs to be elaborated. Same is the case with earlier sub-section on policy formulation (line 737-740).	This has been given late to Barau to elaborate as he offered to help. Stringer also made a start on it
134	Willemen (W)	24	744	24	745	Explain how (based on your assessment)	This has been elaborated a little but still needs more work. A request to LAs has been made.
135	Willemen (W)	24	746	24	762	Unclear paragraph; explain what "implementation" entails, then give	This will be elaborated. This whole section needs review

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						approaches to do this. Very few tools are really "implementation" focused.	
136	Ram Pandit (RP)	24	794	24	796	Have these requirements been adopted or not? The assessment of that aspects would be not only useful but required here.	This will be elaborated. This whole section needs review
137	Nakashima - ILK expert (N)	25	769			section 6.4.5.4. "Policy monitoring and evaluation": comment: "need to include methodologies to integrate different kinds of knowledge including ILK".	Unclear what needs to be changed here. This comment will be addressed when the section is written
138	Willemen (W)	25	771			What are these bullet points?	These are notes that need further development. LAs have been requested to step up.
139	Willemen (W)	25	794	25	803	This is not about M&E. Move to correct section	These are notes that need further development. LAs have been requested to step up.
140	Ram Pandit (RP)	25	807	26	839	The text here emphasise on what is needed, but doesn't tell much about how these have been applied as indicated in the literature. I think some reflection on the state of these requirements in an African context is needed.	Agreed - this will be considered as too general at present
141	Willemen (W)	25	814	25	815	Unclear why authors refer the "adjusting NDP", that is not the objective of an SEEA.	Adjusted NDP is not an objective of SEEA and the paragraph was written in relation to natural capital valuation as a whole and not in relation to SEEA only. Double counting is a typical problem that

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
							would occur if benefits of ecological capital are introduced into national accounting. To make things clearer, lines 814 and 815 have been replaced with a new paragraph.
142	Willemen (W)	26	821			Mentioning the SEEA also includes accounting of ecosystem services in biophysical measures	The SEEA indeed includes the accounting of ecosystem services in biophysical measures. The paragraph included now was in the zero order draft but had been left out in subsequent drafts. I have re-introduced it.
143	Willemen (W)	26	823	26	826	What are these?	these are notes and will be deleted once the section is finalised
144	Alioune Seydi (AS)	26	832	26	836	It would be wise, at this level, to talk of the potential and limits of the proposed new indicators to go beyond GDP: Adjusted Net Savings and Inclusive Wealth.	this will be considered and updated in the rewrite of this section
145	Willemen (W)	26	840			Good idea to include some case studies. Structure them according to the key concepts discussed in this Chapter (describing relevant instruments, governance structure, enabling conditions etc)	this will be considered and updated in the rewrite of this section
146	Willemen (W)	27	870			conserve Biodiversity and ecosystem services	this will be considered and updated in the rewrite of this section. For now we have added it into the notes so we don't forget

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
147	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	27	878			The box in this page is not numbered	It has been deleted as it is the key message
148	Abdelfattah Badr (AB)	28	881			The references include many incomplete information examples AfDB and WWF, 2012 is not complete	This will be addressed
149	Willemen (W)	Overall				This chapter contains some interesting first findings (eg the tables). This chapter can (must) be improved by making the structure more explicit and therefore logical. This will (and should) improve the key message of each section, which is in many instances unclear at the moment. Consider providing an overview figure in which the different sections are presented visually, and showing their linkages and contribution to the role of good BES governance.	Structure and messages need to be clarified. We think that creating the executive summary will help with this
150	Susan Ringrose (SR)		46		70	Abstract - this is an outline of chapter contents rather than a summary of findings	This will be replaced once we have a complete chapter with information from chapter 5 on scenarios
151	Susan Ringrose (SR)		74			Should say 'intended' to reduce inequality and poverty	This has been addressed
152	Susan Ringrose (SR)		80		81	Many of these issues revolve around the 'tragedy of the commons' - check web references	This has been done
153	Susan Ringrose (SR)		99		100	Who exactly, failed to recognise the belief on tenure systems of 'Africans'?	This has been addressed

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
154	Susan Ringrose (SR)		100		101	Not just globalisation but the country's own centralised governments, upon gaining independence	This has been addressed
155	Susan Ringrose (SR)		125			Table 6.1: Would be useful to indicate which African countries have ratified these agreements - and what progress has been made towards their implementation	Valuable point but we cannot do new research into progress. We will consider indicating how many countries have ratified.
156	Susan Ringrose (SR)		144		145	Important to indicate the trans-boundary organisations here e.g. Okacom for the Okavango river and delta (involving Angola, Namibia and Botswana) which operate in concert with, but outside of, SADC.	This has been added
157	Susan Ringrose (SR)		240		255	NB In most countries full inter-ministerial co-operation on multi-facetted environmental issues is rarely attained - so that while trans-boundary activity takes place this tends to be a very slow process.	This has been noted
158	Susan Ringrose (SR)		282			Sentence incomplete	See response to comment 69
159	Susan Ringrose (SR)		384			Table 6.3 As indicated there is considerable controversy on hunting permits versus hunting bans within which the the ecological considerations are far ranging. Botswana banned hunting a few years ago and now has a herd of about 230	A paragraph including the example provided by the reviewer has been included.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						000 elephants who are likely impacting the various ecosystems in different ways. However in banning hunting, this has had an impact on hundreds of people who lost their livelihoods as few feasible alternatives were available	
160	Susan Ringrose (SR)		417		423	The Sahel is very resilient and has largely recovered (in many ways) from previous droughts (see earlier chapters of this report)	This has been reviewed and revised as appropriate in the editing of this section
161	Susan Ringrose (SR)		666			NB the level of implementation varies widely over a range of African countries	This has been noted
162	Susan Ringrose (SR)		702		712	As indicated, the assessments require good background data on a range of issues - and such databases vary widely from country to country. Much more rigorous baseline data gathering is needed which can hopefully involve the training/collaboration of local scientists	This has been considered under capacity building
163	Susan Ringrose (SR)		747		751	This is fundamental to IPBES going forward	No action needed. We agree
164	Susan Ringrose (SR)		200 onwards			Is it possible to separate out the countries which have Actions Plans (but which are inactive) from those which have taken concrete steps towards NBSAP implementation?	We now say that 51 African countries have NBSAPs (revised, under revision or completed). Libyan Arab Jamahiriya, Somalia

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
							and South Sudan have the first NBSAPs under development.
165	Diane Douglas (DD)					Good treatment of issues. No recommendations for revision.	Thank you
166	Andriamahazo Michelle (AM)					I have no much comments because chapter 6 is linked and considers responses to the scenarios set out in previous chapters 4 and 5	Thank you