

Comments from 2nd Review Phase of Chapter6. Deliverable 2b. Americas Assessment on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services.

Review Editor: Patricia Balvanera

Affiliation: UNAM - Instituto de Investigaciones en Ecosistemas y Sustentabilidad

Address: Antigua Carretera a Pátzcuaro No.8701, Col. Ex Hacienda de San José de la Huerta, C.P. 58190, Morelia, Michoacán, México

Email address: pbalvanera@cieco.unam.mx

Review Editor: Rodolfo Dirzo

Affiliation: Department of Biological Sciences, Stanford University

Address: 385 Serra Mall, Stanford University, Stanford, California 94305

Email address: rdirzo@stanford.edu

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Tom Christensen	0	0	0	0	As above. Surprisingly little mentioning of the Arctic. Reviewer can be helpfull include relevant topics, including topics from Greenlæand	Agreed. We have now included new references to the Arctic on Table 6.1, Box 6.3, lines 810, 1757 and 1788.
Ana Luisa Santiago Pérez	0	0	0	0	It is necessary to address in the text the lack of institutional capacities tp follow-up in practice.	No action taken. We have addressed this issue in several occasions in the SOD and now in the final version. Please see, for instance, lines 266, 321, 1049, 1612, 1705, 1710, 1884, and Table 6.5.
Ana Luisa Santiago Pérez	0	0	0	0	It is important to highlight community forestry in Mexico (as an example of good or best practices). There is a need to screen for similar paractices in other american countries.	No action taken. Participatory governance and community management area addressed extensively in 6.3.1 of the Final Draft. Table 6.1 depicts a whole list of such practices in the region, including many in Mexico.
Ana Luisa Santiago Pérez	0	0	0	0	Take into account mechanisms of inter-municipal governance for the management of watersheds and river basins such as JIRA (http://www.jira.org.mx) and JISOC (http://www.jisoc.com)	No action taken. Examples of integrated watershed management, including PES, are found all across the Final Draft (e.g., Table 6.1, and lines 617-622, 933-938, 973, 984-985, 1304-1306.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Ana Luisa Santiago Pérez	0	0	0	0	It is more than relevant to mention that there is a National Strategy on Biodiversity of Mexico 2016-2030 which is aligned to the International Agenda, particularly the Aichi Targets and SDGs (http://www.biodiversidad.gob.mx/pais/pdf/ENBIOMEX_baja.pdf).	No action taken. Our option, due to space limitations, was to report on how the region is doing collectively as regards the Aichi targets. Fig. 6.3 and respective text.
Ana Luisa Santiago Pérez	0	0	0	0	Discuss sectoral planning vs. space planning.	No action taken. We did not fully understand this comment. However, we have a whole section on sectoral policies (6.2). On spatial planning we have explicit mentions in lines 1493, 1658, and Table 6.5, and the topic is implicit in many other parts of the text.
Antonio Díaz de León	0	0	0	0	The Marine realm is underrepresented in Chapter 6. An improved chapter 6 must address this gap.	No action taken. The Chapter has an extensive cover of marine and coastal. Examples: Lines 213, 564-582, 686-696, 727-749, 753, 831-835, 840-843, 910-912, 1109-1119, 1162-1169, 1478-1482, Tables 6.1 and 6.5, Boxes 6.2 and 6.3. The reviewer here is actually one of the CLAs of the Chapter.
Antonio Díaz de León	0	0	0	0	It is necessary to include territorial instruments such as ecological management (http://www.semarnat.gob.mx/temas/ordenamiento-ecologico , http://dgeiawf.semarnat.gob.mx:8080/ibi_apps/WFServlet?IBIF_ex=D4_R_ORDECOL00_01&IBIC_user=dgeia_mce&IBIC_pass=dgeia_mce) and environmental management units (http://dgeiawf.semarnat.gob.mx:8080/ibi_apps/WFServlet?IBIF_ex=D3_R_BIODIV04_02&IBIC_user=dgeia_mce&IBIC_pass=dgeia_mce).	No action taken. We did not receive any contribution from our authors on this topic. The reviewer here is actually one of the CLAs of the Chapter.
Consensus	0	0	0	0	The general conclusions of chapter 6 do not coincide with the executive summary.	No action taken. This recommendation is actually quite surprising: the reviewers probably did not pay enough attention. I have cross-checked again for inconsistencies and found none.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
David Loreto	0	0	0	0	This and other chapters should compile recommendations that can be included as a reference at the SPM. There is a need to have a chapter or place that summarize, conclude and makes recommendations (non prescriptive fashion) to policy makers	No action taken. The authors find it hard to understand the concept of "non-prescriptive recommendations". Moreover, the Chapter has an Executive Summary with the main findings that inform the SPM. Table 6.5, which is new and appears for the first time in this final draft and on the SPM, also provides and informative summary.
Elba Escobar	0	0	0	0	Analyze the environmental and social impacts of different fisheries on BES such as: artisanal and traditional fishing; fishing in lakes; fishing for endemic species.	No action taken. The Chapter discusses fisheries on Tables 6.1, 6.5, and on lines 504-505, 840-843, 1036, 1162-1169, 1456-1458. We received no further contribution from authors on this topic and we felt that we lacked further space to discuss this in the level of detail demanded by the reviewer.
Elba Escobar	0	0	0	0	Take into account science and technology advancement in acuaculture as an opportunity for women and elderly people for species restoration at the brink of extinction	No action taken. Unfortunately we found no publications on this topic.
Miguel Equihua	0	0	0	0	There is no mention in key findings of the impact of population expansion and migration on biodiversity . There is no mention of the process of deforestation, pollution and invasive species and the effects of these processes in Latin America.	No action taken. Migration and population expansion did not appear as relevant for BES in the region in the review effort produced here. Deforestation, pollution and IAS are not mentioned explicitly in the executive summary, but we do make several references to land use change (which includes deforestation), to unsustainable practices (which includes pollution),
Numa Ponpillo Pavón Hernández	0	0	0	0	It is necessary to include the concept "Socioecosystems"	Partly accepted. We chose to use the terminology "socio-ecological systems" and "coupled human-natural systems" (see lines 196, 530, 819, 1111, 1476, 1766 of the SOD). Now we have added the definition of socio-ecological systems in our Glossary.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Sophie Avila Foucat	0	0	0	0	The chapter requires a good and/or better description of the command and control instruments (standards, taxes, subsidies, among others).	Agreed. We have restructured 6.4 dividing it in Regulatory mechanisms and Incentive mechanisms. There is extensive discussion on incentive and disincentives in 6.4 and elsewhere in the Chapter.
Sophie Avila Foucat	0	0	0	0	The chapter needs an evaluation of the social mechanisms that build governance. Developing a Box 6.1 in the text on this social mechanisms would be certainly useful.	No action taken. Topic 6.3 and Figure 6.2 cover that extensively.
Sophie Avila Foucat	0	0	0	0	It is necessary to incorporate an analysis on tolerance to law or legal non-compliance in the region.	No action taken. The assessment is based on literature search and did not aim to produce new analysis. We found no such type of analysis in the literature searched.
Sophie Avila Foucat	0	0	0	0	An evaluation of the environmental policy instruments presentes is required.	No action taken. Every single policy instrument described in section 6.3 has pros and cons, as assessed by peer-reviewed papers, and this is informed and discussed all across the SOD from lines 614-1293. Efficiency, extent, context - all that is given (whenever evaluated by literature) in the text.
Sophie Avila Foucat	0	0	0	0	Examples of successful cross-cutting policies are needed.	No action taken. Not sure what is meant by "cross-cutting policies". If reviewer means policies that take place across most of the region, we aimed to do so in 6.5 (as of line 1515)
Sophie Avila Foucat	0	0	0	0	Describe in a Box, the evolution of PES in some countries to analyze the experiences.	No action taken. PES is one of the topics mostly covered in the text (SOD lines 913-972). Lines 924-939 of the SOD provide a synthetic analysis of reasons for success and eventual failure of such mechanisms. We do not think a new table or box is needed for that.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Sophie Avila Foucat	0	0	0	0	The case studies are disconnected from the text. It would be better to to interleave them in the text	No action taken. Changes in structure were finally made after the FOD was produced. We totally disagree with the opinion of the reviewer. The topics selected as relevant they are cross-cutting, relevant to most countries in the region, and address aspects covered in the chapter that include policy cycle, governance issues, participatory mechanisms, conflicts, etc. Cross-reference to the section 6.5 is made throughout the text (e.g., lines 103, 109, 120, 130, 145, 348, 623 of the SOD).
Sophie Avila Foucat	0	0	0	0	Highlight community ecotourism and UMA (territorial management for the improvement of people). http://dgeiawf.semarnat.gob.mx:8080/ibi_apps/WFServlet?BIF_ex=D3_R_BIODIV04_02&IBIC_user=dgeia_mce&IBIC_pas=s=dgeia_mce , http://www.biodiversidad.gob.mx/usos/UMAs.html)	No action taken. The issue has been dealt with in lines 1447-1455 of the SOD and cited several peer reviewed papers.
Sophie Avila Foucat / Ena Edith Mata Zayas / Adriana Flores / Jessica Bravo Cadena / Wolke Tobón	0	0	0	0	Consider the effects and impacts on BES of International Free Trade Agreements (As NAFTA and others) and its environmental appendix	No action taken. We have mentioned NAFTA and other free trade agreements in Box 6.2 (see lines 1190-1195 of the SOD). We found no peer reviewed analysis on the BES impact of free trade agreements. However, we have discuss the impact of trade as a whole and the emergence of the "biodiversity footprint hotspots" (lines 339-360, 1105-1112 of the SOD)
Vicente Ugalde	0	0	0	0	There should be a conceptual positioning of governance for the region of the Americas. Options for governance analysis are missing and lacking within the text of this chapter (Title of Chapter 6 and specific mandate). We have to incorporate it seeking for those virtuous options -if existing- or examples of difficulties of the current governance scheme.	Agreed. We have restructured the Chapter sections to turn this clearer. In particular, we have summarized such options with enabling conditions and bottlenecks in Table 6.5

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Virginia Meléndez	0	0	0	0	Highlight the Voluntary Areas for Conservation.	Partly agreed. Not totally sure about what the reviewer means, but we assume these are include in the concept of OECMs, which are dealt with at lines 816-826
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	4	78	4	78	Use examples by region rather than countries, add examples of mesoamerica	Partly agreed. The Exec Summary has a few examples of countries and mentions mostly regional and sub-regional patterns. We have now replaced "North America" by "US and Canada". Mexico and Mesoamerica as a whole are included in LAC everytime we mention it. This also shows up in the Glossary now.
Lilian Painter	4	79	4	88	Moreover there are oftern contradictions between Land Use Policies, energy and infrastructure sectors and conservation policies and indigenous rights policies	Agreed. This has been extensively dealt with all across the Chapter.
David Loreto	4	79	5	145	There is a lack of structure to integrate key messages and to use a public policy language (e.g. issues, whether there are data (global and regional) and recommendations).	Agreed. We attempted to adjust the language here. However, we were not supposed to provide explicit recommendations.
Diana Lope-Alzina	4	79	5	145	Traditional agriculture is not taken into account in the context of BES.	No action taken. Not sure what the reviewer wishes.
United States Government	4	82	4	82	"attend to" may not be the best term in this context; consider another term, perhaps "address" or "ameliorate?"	Agreed. Thank you. Replaced by "address".
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	4	85	4	88	This sentence is to general. We recommend to include "for most countries in LAC" instead LAC as a whole.	Agreed. Thank you. Language incorporated.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Diego Pacheco	4	89	4	97	Also, it is important to include the Joint Mitigation and Adaptation for the Integral and Sustainable Management of Forests in Bolivia, as an alternative to results-based payments, which are those experiences applied in Ecuador and Brazil. In this paragraph is important to mention that there are alternative schemes to payment for ecosystem services. In this context, is very important to refer to rights-base approaches policies enhancing the management of systems of life, such as the recognition of the rights of Mother Earth in Bolivia.	Agreed. We have now included a whole new section on Rights-Based approaches (6.4.3) and on the Rights of the Mother Earth (6.4.3.2).
Lilian Painter	4	89	4	97	Indigenous territorial management in the Amazon has been as effective as protected areas and the success of PA's and IITT in halting deforestation has been documented regionally http://sinia.minam.gob.pe/mapas/amazonia-2015-areas-protegidas-territorios-indigenas-deforestacion-2000	Partly agreed, but already contemplated. Here we refer to protected areas as inclusive of ICCAs. In the text we indicate that several papers suggest that protected areas with people inside are more effective, and other papers suggest the opposite.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	4	89	4	97	Include Environmental Services Pay (ESP) of Costa Rica Government	Agreed. We now use Fonafifo as one example from Costa Rica.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	4	89	4	97	Co management in the Cahuita National Park in Costa Rica, and participation of organizations and society in the councils responsible for the administration of the conservation area system	Partly agreed, we are using the Costa Rican example of Fonafifo.
Daniel P Faith		90		91	this idea that "implementation, even when effective locally, do not add up to overall effectiveness at national or regional scales (inconclusive)." is an important one and can be further supported in case studies showing that a fundamental issue is the cross-scale nature of trade-offs involving biodiversity – local win-wins do not guarantee good biodiversity conservation outcomes at the regional/national scale (Faith 2014 reference)	No action taken. We are not citing references in the executive summary.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	4	92	4	93	(e.g., Socio-Bosque in Ecuador, Bolsa Verde in Brazil, Payment for Environmental Services in Costa Rica, Canon for Water Use Concept in Costa Rica	Partly agreed, we are now using the Costa Rican example of Fonafifo.
Liette Vasseur	4	94			surprising that Hawaii is not mentioned since it is where the largest MPA is found	Partly agreed, we now refer to U.S., to include Hawaii and California, without mentioning the states, to be equivalent to what we did to the other countries in this sentence.
United States Government	4	95	4	95	For clarification, consider including both state and country identifications when referencing an area (e.g. California, U.S.). This could be especially useful when regions and countries share the same name.	Agreed, done.
Diego Pacheco	4	98	4	103	What does imply adaptive capacity in this context? Become poorer?	Agreed. We have rephrased the sentence for clarity.
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	4	100	4	100	One of the biggest impacts that we are analyzing in Colombia is coming from mining sector. There is a lot of literature (i.e V National Report of Colombia to the CBD, annual reports of the state of BD in Colombia done by the National Audit Office, the Ministry of Environment or even the Humboldt Institute) showing how mining sector is crucial when we talk about net loss of BES	No action taken. Here we aimed to provide a general statement for the region, and agriculture and climate change are the drivers that appear as most unanimous. We refer to sectoral impacts and mining in specific in lines 369, 1068, 1157, 1309-1315
United States Government	4	118	4	120	Treating participation as a façade can be a problem, and having this statement as the only further explanation of the finding stands out as more of a political statement; please revise.	Agreed. Sentence rephrased.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Diego Pacheco	5	121	5	126	It is also important to mention that in some countries indigenous peoples rights have been approved, including the ILO 160 Covenant and the United Nations Declaration of the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, such as in Bolivia. In this case, it has been recognized the self-governance and own authorities of indigenous peoples, including the political autonomy of indigenous territories. Also, for indigenous peoples territories is important to mention that they have developed by centuries their own rules and norms for the management of their natural resources, including formal and informal rules.	Partly agreed. We do mention that in the text, but not in the Executive Summary due to space limitations.
Gabriela Civeira	5	121	121		indigenous is not correct i think you should use native american. This should be corrected in the whole manuscript	No action taken. This is the accepted IPBES language.
Diana Lope-Alzina	5	121	5	126	As related to the comment above, the ILKP is here mentioned and addressed in section 6.2.2. with some good examples.	No action taken.
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	5	127	5	127	What the experts are trying to mean with "policy evaluation"? How do you measure that? Through indicators of effectiveness? We already have our core of it en Colombia, very well established. Also there is a systematic procedure to present results every year regarding implementation of policy on BES. The government makes a very close follow up. Nevertheless, a national or regional policy evaluation can means a lot of things, not only public policies but also private ones, the implementation by NGOs of priorities guided by NBSAPs, etc. Would be great if you can go deep inside of this concept	No action taken. The IPBES document on Policy describes the policy cycle, where evaluation is the final step. We assume that it is not necessary to repeat the description of the policy cycle in this Chapter.
Elda Tancredi	5	128	5	128	Regionalization is different from Chapter 1 (IPBES Unit of Analysis). NA, MA, SA, CAR. In this chapter Latinamerican and Caribbean (LAC) is mentioned.	No action taken. Many (if not most) publications reviewed here make reference to Latin America and Caribbean. This is now explained in the Glossary

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Krista Locs	5	131	5	139	There should be recognition that the Sixth National Reports to the CBD, due in 2018, will be used to report on progress towards the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020 and the Aichi Biodiversity Targets.	No action taken. In this executive summary we synthesize information reviewed and assessed in the Chapter.
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	5	131	5	131	In the case of Colombia either the National Policy on Biodiversity an Ecosystem Services and the National Programme of Climate Change fully integrates the SDGs and the Aichi Targets. Now, that is different on how to report on that. Maybe the problem is the broken bridge between what is written in the policy and what do you want to share with the public in the reports...	No action taken. Our option in the Executive Summary was to make broad statements applicable to most countries and avoid details of country by country.
Sandra Solís	5	131	5	139	Include Mexico's evaluation of the contributions to implement the Aichi Targets at the subnational level as an example (http://dgcii.conabio.gob.mx/phpscripts/evaluacion_nacional).	No action taken. Our option in the Executive Summary was to make broad statements applicable to most countries and avoid details of country by country.
Elise Belle	5	134	5	134	"has been reported, in relation to coverage, for Aichi Target 11"	Agreed. Incorporated
United States Government	5	140	5	141	"combination between" is confusing in this context. Does it refer to a goal of harmony between a healthy environment and human well-being rather than a balancing act, as if they are always in competition? Please clarify. Further, the qualifier of "reported" threats may not be necessary; if there is supporting data, consider deletion.	Agreed. Language revised
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	6	148	6	148	Start with an introduction like the other chapters e.g. Governance and policy	No action taken. "6.1.1 Americas in context" is the Introduction we imagined to the Chapter

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
MAYDS- Argentina	6	151	6	151	Se sugiere reemplazar el término "political regimes" por "government system" o similar. Esto se debe a que, si bien régimen político es un concepto aceptado para indicar el modelo de organización del poder constitucional que adopta un Estado en función de la relación existente entre los distintos poderes, el término "regime" en el idioma inglés es aplicado a las formas de gobierno autoritarias o no democráticas según Oxford English Dictionary.	Partly agreed. We now use "political systems"
MAYDS- Argentina	6	154	6	156	Si bien la Figura 6.1 utiliza el EPI como índice ambiental (Hsu et al 2016), no queda claro por qué no se utiliza la información provista por el trabajo de Martins et al., 2006, donde utilizan el Índice de Sustentabilidad Ambiental (ESI). En este trabajo se puede observar con mayor claridad que, aunque existe cierta correlación entre desarrollo humano y gobernanza ambiental, no siempre países con elevado desarrollo humano presentan altos índices de sustentabilidad ambiental (como es el caso de Estados Unidos, que conforme al ESI queda por debajo de muchos países de América Central y del Sur), acompañando por lo expuesto en la línea 162 respecto a las emisiones de gases de efecto invernadero.	No action taken. Thank you for this suggestion. We considered this option, but we figured there were two problems: 1) unfortunately the new hybrid index proposed by Martins et al. (2006) has not been used by other audiences; 2) by using epi and hdi we could gather up-to-date information, whereas Martins et al. is more than 10 years old.
Liette Vasseur	6	162		164	I am having difficulty with Figure 1 and this statement: how can USA and even Canada therefore can have a very high environmental performance. I question this judgement.	No action taken. This is precisely the point of the figure. It shows the ambiguity between environmental indicators and development indicators. We also discuss this figure in lines 244-246, 523-525 and 1887 of the final draft.
Liette Vasseur	6	173			"in the region": I do not agree that it is only in the region. A large part of the produce and goods are not consumed there but in other countries.	No action taken. We have simply used the paper by Visconti et al (2015), who makes this statement. Comments 60 and 61 (next) consider this a good use of this reference.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	6	173	6	173	Good use of Visconti et al. (2015)	No action taken. Thanks
Thomas Brooks	6	173	6	173	Good use of Visconti et al. (2015)	No action taken. Thanks
Elise Belle	7	175	7	175	"across four different scenarios"	Agreed. Correction made.
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	7	175	7	175	Figure 6.1 Add names of the countries	No action taken. This list was already given in the SOD and is maintained in the final draft. Lines 190-197.
Adriana C. Flores-Díaz	7	187	7	187	In Figure 6.1 you say that correlation is significant. Please indicate the numbers.	Agreed, done.
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	6	190	6	190	We are having also this high impacts of climate change in two of the most strategic ecosystems in Colombia: wetlands and Paramos. (i.e. : Rodríguez-Eraso N., Pabón-Caicedo J.D., Bernal-Suárez N.R. y Martínez-Collantes J. 2010. Cambio climático y su relación con el uso del suelo en los Andes colombianos. Instituto de Investigación de Recursos Biológicos Alexander von Humboldt, Universidad Nacional de Colombia y Departamento Administrativo de Ciencia, Tecnología e Innovación. Bogotá, D. C., Colombia. 80 p; http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.11761/9888 ; etc.	No action taken. In this section, we are making reference to one specific paper (Seddon et al. 2016) that did a global comparison on climate sensitivity and found high values for the ecosystems we listed in lines 212-214 of the final draft.
United States Government	7	192	7	195	The idea of "planetary boundaries" is not fully recognized or accepted please make this clear in this sentence.	Partly agreed. There are many aspects in our text that are not "fully recognized or accepted", including climate change, that some countries do not seem to recognize. However, given that this terminology is rather abundant in scientific literature, we felt we should mention it. For further clarification, we include a full description of planetary boundaries in the Glossary. We have also followed the reviewer comment 67 (next) and added the sentence and the reference to indicate that this is not fully accepted.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Thomas Brooks	7	195	7	195	Add something like "although this is contested (Brook et al. 2013)". See Brook et al. (2013 TREE) Does the terrestrial biosphere have planetary tipping points?	Agreed, thanks.
Diego Pacheco	7	196	8	206	I do not agree that payment for ecosystem services is included as one characteristic of governance arrangement. It is not appropriate to highlight this as one of the main important schemes of environmental governance in the region, even as more important than the decentralization of natural resources or titling of indigenous territories. Also, I do not agree that PES are very successful in the region, since there are many problems in its implementation particularly regarding forests (there are several problems in Ecuador and Brazil). Also, as examples could be introduced rights-based approaches, such as the recognition of the rights of Mother Earth.	Partly agreed. We made no value judgement here. We only said - as it has been widely documented in the literature - that PES is more common in the region than elsewhere on the planet. However, we agree with the suggestion of the reviewer to include rights-based approaches in our arguments. We now dedicate a full section to those at 6.4.2
Adriana C. Flores-Díaz	7	198	7	199	PES are not welcome in many indigenous communities in the Americas, as in Ecuador and Mexico (Rarámuri region). This is a case of Costa Rica, where PES scheme is unsustainable. Please bring a critical view on these pays, which are very criticized from many social actors across America. https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10745-017-9924-3	Partly agreed. We discuss pros and cons of PES in the region, as detected by several published papers, in lines 960-968.
Gab/Sbio/MMA	7	201	7	202	According to the publication "OECD Environmental Performance Review - Brazil 2015", the information that "Brazil alone was responsible for 70% of new 202 land protection on the planet between 2003 and 2008" comes from a different source: Jenkins, C.N. e L. Joppa (2009). "Expansion of the Global Terrestrial Protected Area System", Biological Conservation, Vol. 142, Nº. 10, pp. 2166-2174.	Agreed. We changed the reference cited.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	7	203	7	206	For a new approach on conservation incentives, where private sector with environmental sector works together, look at http://www.banco2.com/ It is a new and very innovative approach.	No action taken. We hope to have covered this topic in 6.4.2.1
Liette Vasseur	8	213			highest urban proportion: in what is this automatically bad? I would argue that you want to have intensification to reduce pressures on natural ecosystems. The problem is really the large industrial agricultural system.	No action taken. We made no value judgement in this respect in the text. It is a fact that the Americas have the largest urban population
Anna Yusa (Health Canada)	8	220			In addition to the description of principles followed in the chapter to select main policies and their respective components of interest, details on the evidence base and the methods behind the synthesis in the chapter may be helpful.	No action taken. 6.1.2 describes premises, principles and rationale of the Chapter. We did not describe our method for literature search and synthesis, but we resorted to the usual assessment tools.
Diego Pacheco	8	220			A new paragraph is needed regarding the analysis of self-governance of indigenous peoples and local communities, particularly in the context of the management of common pool resources (water irrigation, forest management, as the most important). Also policies promoting the constitution of indigenous territories as autonomous units of governance (for example, in Bolivia).	Agreed, thanks. This is now covered to a large extent in topics 6.3.1, 6.3.2, 6.3.5
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	8	220	8	220	Governance and policy can be the introduction, before of Americas in context	No action taken. Thanks for the suggestion. We felt that, as a regional chapter, it would be preferable - especially for outside readers - to start with a snapshot of the region.
Diego Pacheco	8	221	8	244	A general discussion is needed about the sustainable development paradigm. In Bolivia, the paradigm is the one of the Living-Well in balance and harmony with Mother Earth. This issue needs to be introduced in this analysis. The conceptual framework is related to good quality of life, which encompasses well-being and living-well, therefore in line 228 is inappropriate to refer only to well-being.	Partly agreed. We found it preferable to keep the text in this section as it is, but we make reference to the distinct world visions (buen vivir, SD, degrowth)

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Elizabeth Hess	8	239	8	239	It appears that N. America is now just Canada and USA (see table 1.5 comment)	No action taken. We followed ipbes guidelines regarding sub-regions
Diego Pacheco	9	245			The conceptual framework is very restrictive. According to Ostrom Elinor, governance modes are related to public, private and collective action (beyond the issue of centralization and decentralization). This classificatino includes formal and informal rules for natural resource governance. Decentralization vs centralization is one mode of public governance. Therefore, these are institutional arrangements and not social actors. This is inaccurate. Regarding policicy instruments could be better to use the clasificacion of the catalogue of policy tools and instruments of the IPBES.	No action taken. Our impression (and hope) is that the disagreement of the reviewer is probably semantic only.
Diana Lope-Alzina	9	245	9	253	In Table 6.2 it is necessary to include more examples of shared man with local communities, fisheries y forestry. Mexico has many examples. -Boege, Eckart. 2008. El Patrimonio Biocultural de los Pueblos Indígenas de México: Hacia la conservación in situ de la biodiversidad y agrodiversidad en los territorios indígenas. INAH-CDI, México. Available in: http://www.cdi.gob.mx/biodiversidad/biodiversidad_0_preliminares_1-31_eckart_boege.pdf (verified 17.07.17)	No action taken. The Table (now 6.1) has already two pages and we trust that it is detailed enough.
Rosa María Chávez Dagostino	9	245	9	253	In Table 6.2 the community-based instruments in the Americas that are mentioned include: fisheries, hunting, water. However it is necessary to mention other community participatory processes that are very important in the Americas, such as tourism (rural, ecotourism).	No action taken. The Table (now 6.1) has already two pages and tourism is already present there.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Jan Börner	9	254	53	1785	A major argument in the SPM is that development and environmental policies should be "better coupled". However, this chapter is almost exclusively dedicated to environmental policies, although re-designing development policies including biodiversity safeguards (only superficially covered in Chapter 4) could be a much more cost-effective strategy to address biodiversity and NCP loss in some cases. Chapter 6 should include a table summarizing the most promising environmental policies (see previous comments) and the most relevant development policies with potential to be "better coupled" to address the major negative trends in NCP. The table should include major implementation barriers (including costs "of action", see for example: Seymour, F. and Busch, J. (2016), Why Forests? why Now?: The Science, Economics, and Politics of Tropical Forests and Climate Change, Brookings Institution Press. ; Fogliano de Souza Cunha, F.A., Börner, J., Wunder, S., Nunes Cosenza, A.C., Lucena, A.. 2016. The implementation costs of forest conservation policies in Brazil. Ecological Economics, 130: 209-220.). This table, or a summary thereof, would also be well placed in the SPM	Agreed. We have a new table (6.5) that has been incorporated to the Chapter and also to the SPM.
Elise Belle	10	272	10	272	"interventions, and at present remain more theoretical"	Agreed. Incorporated
MAYDS- Argentina	10	274	10	276	Las plantaciones de coca no son necesariamente plantaciones de droga. La coca es un cultivo ancestral de pueblos andinos de países como Bolivia y Perú que se ha utilizado con diversos fines. Se debe diferenciar claramente entre cultivos lícitos e ilícitos, teniendo en cuenta debidamente a los usos tradicionales lícitos.	No action taken. We did not say they are necessarily for drug purposes. The paper we cite clearly mention illicit use and we did likewise.
Elise Belle		276		277	"In addition, these authors use examples from Mexico, Honduras and Guatemala"	Agreed. Unnecessary text deleted

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Diego Pacheco	10	279	10	281	I disagree using only as an example REDD since there are other arrangements such as joint mitigation and adaptation approaches (JMA), also adopted by the UNFCCC. REDD is related to commodification of nature and JMA has been approved as an alternative to results-based payments and linked to a right-based approach. Therefore, both approaches should be addressed.	No action taken. The paragraph is on potential trade-offs and problems. JMA is all positive, if we understand correctly the reviewer's viewpoint.
Elise Belle		281		282	Delete 'the "+" refers to [...] for instance)'. '	Agreed. We transferred the definition of the acronym to the Glossary and made suggested changes to the text.
Daniel P Faith		283		283	Faith (2104) reference warns of a "REDDminus" outcome where local management may benefit both carbon and biodiversity but at the regional scale biodiversity suffers	Agreed. Citation incorporated
Elise Belle		283		283	"climate change and additional benefits related to biodiversity"	Agreed. Incorporated
Adriana C. Flores-Díaz	10	286	10	287	Governance needs transversality and concurrency of government levels. National Commission of Water in Mexico (CNA) permits water extraction inside territories of indigenous peoples, where there are local rules. In this case, a federal agency is disrespectful with local governance and lacks agreements. https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-642-05432-7_27	No action taken. The Chapter has plenty of references to conflicts, including those involving indigenous rights. Lines 293-297, 367-380,411-416, 595-598, 602-609. Due to our space limitations, we took no action here.
MAYDS- Argentina	10	289	10	290	La corrupción es un problema global y debe analizarse en igual sentido para todas las evaluaciones regionales.	No action taken. This is understood.
MAYDS- Argentina	10	304	10	304	Así como se destaca el rol de las ONG en la realización de iniciativas efectivas, sería importante que también se destacara la importancia del rol de las comunidades indígenas y locales, pequeños productores, entre otros, que son en definitiva los actores que pueden garantizar la implementación de las políticas en el tiempo.	No action taken. The Chapter has many examples and actually entire sections dedicated to local and indigenous communities.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	10	305	10	308	For Colombia please analyze the case of the Sentence T445 of 2016 http://www.corteconstitucional.gov.co/relatoria/2016/t-445-16.htm ...extremely interesting but also challenging. How private sector is going to deal with it? How to avoid decision making based just on opinions without real bases?. This is a long journey!	No action taken. Due to space limitations, we avoided including more examples than the ones already given.
Liette Vasseur	10	305			private sector are influenced by government-led policies but ALSO private sector INFLUENCE government-led policies	Agreed. We added "and vice-versa" at the end of the sentence.
Liette Vasseur	11	330			not only Central America but also the Caribbean islands due to lack of space (e.g. Aruba and St Barthelemy)	No action taken. The reference we cite mentions only Central America.
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	11	332	11	336	This paragraph has no connection with the previous one	No action taken. In fact it has: both paragraphs refer to key development sectors in the region: energy and agriculture.
Elise Belle	11	333	11	333	What do you mean by 'water for hydros'?	Agreed. We replaced hydros with hydropower
United States Government	11	333	11	333	Suggest spelling out "hydros" as "hydropower" or "hydroelectric development," whichever is more appropriate.	Agreed. We replaced hydros with hydropower
Vicente Ugalde	11	340	11	341	Another example of external factor making pressure on farm, landscape or agri-food system should be urban expansion related to foreign investment in local real estate speculation. Real estate speculation with local capital could be another internal factor.	No action taken. This is probably correct, but we found no references to back it up.
Liette Vasseur	11	343			with the recent announcement to remove 50,000 ha of Amazonian protected land for agriculture expansion... this is not true anymore. Can you find another example?	No action taken. We found no reference to back up the statement of the reviewer.
United States Government	12	358	12	360	Final sentence in paragraph needs clarification - the meaning is not clear.	Agreed. Sentence rephrased. Lines 363-366.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Krista Locs	12	361	12	361	Section 6.2.2 Cross-scale and cross-level interactions. This section should include information on the commitment of federal, provincial and territorial governments in Canada to work collaboratively towards achieving the objectives of the Convention on Biological Diversity, through the Canadian Biodiversity Strategy, Biodiversity Outcomes Framework, and the 2020 Biodiversity Goals and Targets for Canada. It should also note that implementation of these goals and targets will rely on meaningful, full and effective participation of Indigenous peoples, including First Nations, Inuit and Métis peoples. In this respect, while Indigenous traditional knowledge and customary use of biological resources are specifically highlighted under targets 12 and 15, the traditional knowledge, innovations and practices of Indigenous communities are relevant for implementing all of Canada's biodiversity goals and targets, as is protecting and encouraging customary use of biological resources compatible with their conservation and sustainable use. Ref - http://www.biodivcanada.ca/default.asp?lang=En&n=9B5793F6-1	Partly agreed. We made reference to participation of First Nations in lines 409-412 of the SOD, which is now present lines 602-605 of the final draft. We have now added a sentence about the commitment of the country to account for ILK in all biodiversity goals and targets.
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	12	370	12	381	A nude photography about the multiscale problem in Colombia, can be reflected in Sentence T 622 of 2016, where the Constitutional Court presents Atrato River as subject of rights to protect communities rights to have a good health and environment. The decision is funded in the incapacity shown by the different actors at local, sub regional and national levels to act as they have to do in their capacity of authorities. Very interesting and constructive! I really invite you to read it. http://www.corteconstitucional.gov.co/relatoria/2016/T-622-16.htm	No action taken. We now have a whole section on rights-based approaches that covers this type of examples.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Philip M. Fearnside	12	374	12	375	For deforestation in protected areas see: Nogueira E.M., A.M. Yanai, S.S. Vasconcelos. P.M.L.A. Graça & P.M. Fearnside. 2017. Carbon stocks and losses to deforestation in protected areas in Brazilian Amazonia. Regional Environmental Change doi: 10.1007/s10113-017-1198-1 [open access]	No action taken. The references we cite at this point are inclusive of other ecosystems of the Americas
Philip M. Fearnside	12	379	12	381	For indirect impacts of soy on deforestation see: Fearnside, P.M. 2001. Soybean cultivation as a threat to the environment in Brazil. Environmental Conservation 28(1): 23-38. doi: 10.1017/S0376892901000030 Arima, E.Y., P. Richards, R. Walker, and M.M. Caldas. 2011. Statistical confirmation of indirect land use change in the Brazilian Amazon. Environmental Research Letters 6:024010. [doi: 10.1088/1748-9326/6/2/024010]. Fearnside, P.M. 2017. Deforestation of the Brazilian Amazon. In: H. Shugart (ed.) Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Environmental Science. Oxford University Press, New York, USA. (In press)	No action taken. The references we cite at this point are more specific to the point we want to make on leakage.
Diana Lope-Alzina	13	391	14	443	Include examples of biodiversity hotspots that coincide with territories belonging to indigenous communities (eg, centers of origin and crop diversification)	No action taken. We did not find this information and we were not supposed to produce new science or analyses for this report.
Diana Lope-Alzina	13	391	14	443	Include examples of centers of origin and diversification of agrobiodiversity in the Americas. For example beans and maize for Mexico and potato and quinoa for the Andes, among others. CONABIO. 2009. Centros de origen. In: Biodiversidad Mexicana. Comisión Nacional para el Conocimiento y Uso de la Biodiversidad, México. Available in: http://www.biodiversidad.gob.mx/genes/centrosOrigen/centrosOrig.html (verified 17.07.17)	Partly agree. The examples mentioned for the Andes have already been cited (lines 614-616). The example of Mexico is given in lines 1605-1624.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Diana Lope-Alzina	13	391	14	443	This belongs to section 6.2.2. ILKP still needs to be further understood as an entry point to address how biodiversity is currently managed and appropriated across the Americas. As it has been found across research, more often than not, biodiversity spots are located within territories belonging to indigenous peoples.	Partly agree. Lines 776-788 highlight this importance.
United States Government	13	394	13	394	What is "ethnies"? Should it be ethnicities?	Agreed. Correction made.
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	13	405	14	443	Very interesting analysis done by Astrid Ulloa regarding the integration of ILK into environmental practices in Colombia: http://www.ram-wan.net/restrepo/inv-antrop/ulloa.pdf	No action taken. Thanks. Colombia has been mentioned with examples 34 times in this report and we must try to balance out with examples from other countries, and also consider space limitations
United States Government	13	412	13	412	"Conflicts eventually occur" misimplies that it is an issue for the future; consider revising to indicate that there are already examples of conflicts (if that is indeed the case).	Agreed. Replaced eventually by occasionally
Liette Vasseur	14	433		440	I am surprised that you do not talk about the main issue in Ecuador (as it is the same in the Chimborazo (and I had included this as an example in our paper on ecosystem governance (Vasseur et al. 2017. Ambio)) that most plant species are eucalyptus and these trees are destroying the subsistence agriculture of rural people as they spread clonally).	Partly agreed. We do not expand on this topic, but we now include a reference to the paper suggested by the reviewer
Adriana C. Flores-Díaz	14	433	14	437	REDD + is a very criticized program, because of it lacks consideration about local people. Please give an honest view on that, since it has not been received as well as politicians expected. https://www.duo.uio.no/handle/10852/40356 , https://search.proquest.com/openview/66e9280e99fef5f6389d84929f8c2443/1?pq-origsite=gscholar&cbl=1806338	No action taken. The reviewer's argument is precisely what we said in the text.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Philip M. Fearnside	14	435	14	443	For information on controversies over REDD see: Fearnside, P.M. 2012. Brazil's Amazon forest in mitigating global warming: Unresolved controversies. <i>Climate Policy</i> 12(1): 70-81. doi: 10.1080/14693062.2011.581571	No action taken. Thanks. We feel the topic has been sufficiently covered.
Philip M. Fearnside	14	435	14	443	The main questions regarding carbon benefits from REDD relate to the realism of baselines and the treatment of leakage and permanence. See: Vitel, C.S.M.N., G.C. Carrero, M.C. Cenamo, M. Leroy, P.M.L.A. Graça & P.M. Fearnside. 2013. Land-use change modeling in a Brazilian indigenous reserve: Construction a reference scenario for the Suruí REDD project. <i>Human Ecology</i> 41(6): 807-826. doi: 10.1007/s10745-013-9613-9 Yanai, A.M.; P.M. Fearnside, P.M.L.A. Graça & E.M. Nogueira. 2012. Avoided deforestation in Brazilian Amazonia: Simulating the effect of the Juma Sustainable Development Reserve. <i>Forest Ecology and Management</i> 282: 78-91. doi: 10.1016/j.foreco.2012.06.029 Fearnside, P.M. 2009. Carbon benefits from Amazonian forest reserves: Leakage accounting and the value of time. <i>Mitigation and Adaptation Strategies for Global Change</i> 14(6): 557-567. doi: 10.1007/s11027-009-9174-9 Fearnside, P.M. 2012. The theoretical battlefield: Accounting for the climate benefits of maintaining Brazil's Amazon forest. <i>Carbon Management</i> 3(2): 145-148. doi: 10.4155/CMT.12.9	Agreed. We added a sentence here making reference to Vitel et al. (2013).
Elise Belle		445		445	First define what 'boundary objects' means.	No action taken. Definition is already given in the Glossary (lines 2901-4 of the SOD), which is why the term is underlined.
Elise Belle	14	448	14	448	"while some individual MPAs are the"	Agreed. "Some" has been added to the sentence.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Elise Belle		453		453	Multilateral agreements?	No action taken. We actually mean multilaterals, such as UN agencies and others.
Elise Belle		455		462	I would delete or shorten this section, including the long citation.	No action taken. Thanks for the suggestion. In the first review, one external reviewer asked for additional examples of boundary objects, which is why we expanded here. We feel this facilitates understanding of this concept.
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	14	466	15	469	It is simplistic to say that governments are reluctant to regulate so nonstate actors are the ones who really act in the ground. It is important to go deep to see if the priorities determined by governments are the same that the ones that have NGOs, and if both priorities really encompass the problems and solutions that communities really need. In general projects coming from government or non state actors are very positive in the territories meanwhile they exist. But when a project is finalized, the government or the NGO goes to another place and the community at the end is not prepared for a self sustainability/development. There is a huge problem of communication. There is a lot of money to do things at local level, but every actor goes depending their own agenda. A clear picture with specific targets is needed.	Partly agreed. It is not ALWAYS that this is so, which is why we decided to add "occasional" in line 387. The point raised by the reviewer is a very relevant one.
Vicente Ugalde	15	499	15	499	"Participatory governance, Is not a little bit ingenious conception? The good examples about it, Are sufficient to generalize the collective behaviors in Latin American countries?"	No action taken. Participatory governance is a concept used across the literature and adopted by IPBES. We did not generalize for the continent, we pointed cases where it does not work and, in the executive summary, we say that the statement is established but incomplete.
Sandra Solís	15	508	15	508	Include as an example: Governance for the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity. (e.g. climate governance and governance for the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity).	Partly agreed. Since Table 6.1 provides so many examples, we found it preferable to delete "climate governance"

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Sandra Solís	15	508	15	511	<p>Include the Mexican State biodiversity strategies initiative as an example of subnational participation and planning for biodiversity conservation and sustainable use (http://www.biodiversidad.gob.mx/region/EEB/EEB.html9). Mexico is an example for state governance through the development of biodiversity studies (http://www.biodiversidad.gob.mx/region/EEB/estudios.html) and strategies (http://www.biodiversidad.gob.mx/region/EEB/estrategias.html) at state level for the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity, from local participation to biodiversity decision-making.</p> <p>To date, 14 State Studies (with a participation of more than 2500 experts) and 9 State Strategies have been published. http://www.biodiversidad.gob.mx/pais/pdf/CapNatMex/VolIV/IV02_CruzAngon.pdf</p>	No action taken. Due to space limitations, we avoided including more examples than the ones already given (in this case, see Table 6.1)
Diego Pacheco	16	512			<p>it is important to include here the historical self-governance of IPLC, and also the formal recognition of indigenous territories and of the self-governance of IPLC in their indigenous territories, following the ILO 169 Covenant and the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples</p>	Partly agreed. This is mostly dealt with within 6.3.5
Philip M. Fearnside	16	517	16	517	<p>This statement attributing a large effect to the soy moratorium is contradicted by the papers cited at line 379, page 12. Most of the decrease in deforestation after 2004 is explained by factors other than governance. See: Fearnside, P.M. 2017. Deforestation of the Brazilian Amazon. In: H. Shugart (ed.) Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Environmental Science. Oxford University Press, New York, USA. (In press)</p>	Agreed. The moratorium effect was on deforestation caused by soybean production and not deforestation as a whole. This has been rephrased.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Daniel P Faith		546		547	"Biggs et al. (2012) present a set of general principles for building resilience into social-ecological systems, which are discussed specifically in terms of enhancing the resilience of ecosystem services" may be useful to ask how this needs to be extended to capture global NCP as in NCP18 (see e.g. Faith 2014 discussions)	No action taken. Thanks for the suggestion, but at this point we are much limited for space and we feel cases and examples should be priority over theoretical discussion.
Daniel P Faith		561		561	typically such management is at the locality scale....we want more cross-scale.... Faith (2011) Diversityreference looks at resilience in terms of region's capacity to balance different needs of society	No action taken. Thanks for the suggestion. In this section we focus more on local scale and discuss cross-scale on the new item 6.3.4
Elise Belle	17	580	17	582	Provide reference instead of web link.	No action taken. Sorry, no reference available.
Krista Locs	17	583	17	583	Section 6.3 Policy instruments, support tools and methodologies related to BES should include mention of the newly published Ecosystem Services Toolkit in Canada. This is a technical guide to ecosystem services assessment and analysis that offers practical, step-by-step guidance for governments at all levels, as well as for consultants and researchers. The approach is fully interdisciplinary, integrating biophysical sciences, social sciences, economics, and traditional and practitioner knowledge. It provides guidance on how to consider and incorporate ecosystem services analysis in a variety of different policy contexts such as spatial planning, environmental assessment, and wildlife management, among others. It contains numerous innovative tools and resources designed to enhance users' understanding of ecosystem services and to support analysis and decision-making. Canadian examples are featured throughout the guide. Available at: http://www.biodivcanada.ca/default.asp?lang=En&n=B443A05E-1	No action taken. There is a wide range of tools across the region and to mention one used at national level would mean a need to use many others and our space constraints do not allow that.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Royal Gardner	17	587	17	588	Is dividing policy instruments into control mechanisms and incentive mechanisms consistent with the LDR assessment? (It may be, but if not, it would be helpful to have consistency across the IPBES assessments.)	Agreed. It is consistent. We have changed terminology to regulatory (rather than command and control) and inserted a section on rights-based approaches to be consistent with IPBES guidance.
Elise Belle	18	597	18	613	Box 6.1: I would delete 'this family includes' throughout.	Agreed. Deleted throughout
Elda Tancredi	18	600	18	600	ICCAs have not reference here, but in line 617. It has to be included in the box	Agreed. Incorporated, thanks.
Liette Vasseur	18	610			with electronic media now, I would add webinar.	Agreed. Incorporated.
Royal Gardner	18	614	18	614	The term "Command and Control" does not seem apt to describe PAs and ecosystem restoration. See the OECD definition: "Command—and—control policy refers to environmental policy that relies on regulation (permission, prohibition, standard setting and enforcement) as opposed to financial incentives, that is, economic instruments of cost internalisation." https://stats.oecd.org/glossary/detail.asp?ID=383 In addition, the term "Command and Control" has very negative connotations to many US policymakers. See eg, Driesen (1998) http://scholarlycommons.law.wlu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1501&context=wlulr&sei-redir=1&referer=https%3A%2F%2Fscholar.google.com%2Fscholar%3Fhl%3Den%26q%3Dnegative%2Bconnotation%2Bof%2Bcommand%2Band%2Bcontrol%26btnG%3D%26as_sdt%3D1%252C10%26as_sdt%3D#search=%22negative%20connotation%20command%20control%22 --- STRONGLY RECOMMEND YOU USE ANOTHER TERM	Agreed. We replace "command and control" by "regulatory" all across the Chapter. In lines 644-649, we now explain that there is significant overlap between distinct groups of instruments. For instance, as the reviewer argues, PAs and restoration can be regulatory, but they can also be voluntary or incentivized.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Jan Börner	18	615	22	778	The section almost exclusively focusses on "Protected Areas" as command-and-control policy. However, forest laws and their implementation strategies (especially in Brazil, but also in North America) have recently been shown to be at least as important in protecting forests and related biodiversity, see: Assunção, J., Gandour, C. and Rocha, R. (2015), "Deforestation slowdown in the Brazilian Amazon. prices or policies?", Environment and Development Economics, Vol. 20 No. 06, pp. 697–722. ; Börner, J. , Baylis, K., Corbera, E., Ezzine-de-Blas, D., Ferraro, P.J., Honey-Rosés, J., Lapeyre, R., Persson, U.M., Wunder, S.. 2016. Emerging Evidence on the Effectiveness of Tropical Forest Conservation. PLOS ONE , 11(11): e0159152. ; Cisneros, E., S. L. Zhou and J. Börner. 2015. Naming and Shaming for Conservation: Evidence from the Brazilian Amazon.. PLOS ONE, 10(9): e0136402.	Agreed. We replace "command and control" by "regulatory" all across the Chapter. In lines 644-646, we now explain that there is significant overlap between distinct groups of instruments. For instance, as the reviewer argues, PAs and restoration can be regulatory, but they can also be voluntary or incentivized.
Elise Belle		620		620	"ecosystem Red Lists and"	Agreed. Thanks
Elise Belle	18	624	19	625	"In the Americas, by 2005, the proportion of protected area coverage following IUCN definition was already higher than the global"	Agreed. Thanks
Liette Vasseur	18	624	19	628	You may want to update and revise this. Canada in 2014 was only at 11% and do not forget that IUCN at Parks Congress in Australia in 2014 push for 17%.	Agreed. The text has been revised according to the reviewer comment below (138). See new text in lines 688-696.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Elise Belle		627		628	I would delete this sentence and replace it with recent statistics from 2017: Caribbean: 17.5% (41,247 km2) terrestrial, 5.7% (195,940 km2) marine Mesoamerica: 17.5% (435,223 km2), 2.0% (105,441 km2) marine North America: 11.3% (2,197,497 km2), 25.0% (3,574,951 km2) marine South America: 24.0% (4,283,070 km2), 5.9% (746,598 km2) marine Reference: UNEP-WCMC and IUCN (2017). Protected Planet. Cambridge, UK: UNEP-WCMC and IUCN. Available at: www.protectedplanet.net .	Agreed and incorporated. Thanks
Gab/Sbio/MMA	19	627	19	627	We consider 2005 outdated. We suggest to cite more up-to-date data. Brazil has currently 30,94% of its area protected (taking into account Indigenous Territories and Quilombolas Territories. The information is available at: MMA (2017) Estratégia e Plano de Ação Nacionais para a Biodiversidade - EPANB. pp. 61.	Agreed. We deleted the 2005 reference and inserted the numbers given by UNEP-WCMC and IUCN (2017). We deleted the exclusive mention to Brazil and used instead numbers for sub-regions.
Elise Belle		629		630	“(2) to provide direct and indirect socio-economic development benefits.”	Agreed and incorporated. Thanks
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	19	635	19	660	Apart from protected areas, maybe experts would want to include other schemes for protection, such as protected rivers (i.e. http://www.humboldt.org.co/images/pdf/notibita/informe-2016-bit-a-fr-07.pdf), although I am not sure to classify this other schemes as command-and-control mechanisms.	No action taken. I read the document and found it difficult to understand whether it is effectively a protected area or a joint program for conservation of a watershed. In doubt, although the case is very interesting and potentially innovative, our preference was not to cite it.
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	19	635	19	636	e.g. In Mexico: http://www.biodiversidad.gob.mx/pais/pdf/CapNatMex/Vol%2011/1109_Areas%20naturales%20protegidas%20y%20desarrollo%20social%20en%20Mex.pdf and examples for other sections	No action taken. Thanks. Given our limitation for space, in this paragraph our option was to cite meta-analysis that include many countries in the region, including Mexico, to be synthetic.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Thomas Brooks	19	639	19	647	There is much other evidence of protected area impact and benefit in the Americas. Some key references include Andam et al. (2008 PNAS http://www.pnas.org/content/105/42/16089) on impacts and Ferraro & Hanauer (2014 PNAS http://www.pnas.org/content/111/11/4332.full) on benefits. It would be useful to draw from these here.	No action taken. Thanks. Given our limitation for space, in this paragraph our option was to cite meta-analysis that include many countries in the region. Both papers draw exclusively on one country (Costa Rica), which is why we chose not to further discuss them.
Brenda McAfee	19	651	19	655	While there were funding challenges with the previous government the current government has made significant contributions to Parks in the last two years budget 2016 and 2017 so recent major budget cuts would no longer be appropriate. http://www.budget.gc.ca/2017/docs/plan/chap-02-en.html and https://www.pc.gc.ca/en/agence-agency/infrastructure	Agreed. Thanks. Canada was deleted from the sentence.
Elise Belle	20	671	20	671	Median value in the Americas?	Agreed. It is actually global. Information added.
Daniel P Faith		679		679	this is useful reference to SCP	No action taken. Thanks.
Elise Belle		687		687	"as much area as protected areas under a traditional management system do"	Partly agreed. We avoided using the term "traditional" here, and instead we used "non-ICCA".
MAYDS- Argentina	20	691	20	691	Bibliografía sugerida: Land tenure and biological communities in dry Chaco forests of northern Argentina. S. Marinaro*, H.R. Grau, L. Macchi, P.V. Zelaya (2014). Este trabajo muestra cómo comunidades wichi Wichí conservan la biodiversidad en mayor proporción que áreas protegidas.	Agreed and cited. Thanks.
Liette Vasseur	20	693			Reserves: are we talking about indigenous reserves or reserve (conservation) areas. This is very confusing.	Agreed. The semantics on this topic is confusing indeed. To be clearer, we are now using protected areas with people inside and without people inside.
Elise Belle		694		694	"showed that traditional protected areas"	Partly agreed. We avoided using the term "traditional" here. See above (149).
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	19	730	19	735	One very interesting initiative is Triple A Corridor or Camino de las Anacondas, an initiative of Gaia Amazonas Foundation (www.gaiaamazonas.org), that involves at least 5 to 8 countries in South America	No action taken. Thank you for highlighting this initiative. However, while checking in the web, it appears that this is still in project phase.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Elise Belle	21	732	21	733	What about the situation now?	No action taken. Sorry, we did not find updated information
Patricia S. Vazquez	21	745	21	747	Between Argentina and Brazil there are binational basins where changes in land use changes seriously affect biodiversity and therefore ecosystem services, this varies from one country to the other, and there is a need for a joint interaction of the countries with respect to The policies for the achievement of environmental management and territorial management of Cuencas, an example of deforestation of the Paranaense forest can be seen in: Zulaica, L., Vazquez, P. and Celemin, JP 2015. Análisis comparativo en la cuenca binacional del río San Antonio (Argentina-Brasil) entre 2001 y 2011. Raega - O Espaço Geográfico em Análise. Vol. 34. p.167-192. y tambien en: Vazquez P. y Zulaica L. 2017. Transformaciones Agroforestales y pérdida de servicios ecosistémicos en una Cuenca Binacional de la Selva Paranaense. Convención Internacional Agroforestal. Cuba. La Habana. 12 al 16 de junio.	No action taken. This case add little to the corridor discussion: it shows different levels o deforestation in a watershed between two bordering countries. The authors did not measure leakage, or negative effects on ecosystem services from one country to its neighbour. It does not discuss corridors either. This pattern of one country deforesting more than its neighbour is seen all across the region. It would be nice to have examples and measurements of impacts, but these papers do not give us that information.
Elise Belle		749		749	Delete the bracket or cite the whole target. Indeed, target 11 is not only about protected area coverage, but also their connectivity and having an effective and equitable management.	Agreed. Parenthesis deleted.
The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	22	752	22	756	Useful discussion of key biodiversity areas, but add reference to the primary data source, www.keybiodiversityareas.org	Agreed. Citation incorporated
Thomas Brooks	22	752	22	756	Useful discussion of key biodiversity areas, but add reference to the primary data source, www.keybiodiversityareas.org	Agreed. Citation incorporated

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Stuart Butchart	22	756			KBAs are based not on "globally threatened endemic species" but threatened and restricted-range species and ecosystems, ecological integrity, biological processes, and irreplaceability. See www.keybiodiversityareas.org	Agreed. Incorporated
The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	22	756	22	756	Change "globally threatened endemic species" to "threatened biodiversity, restricted-range biodiversity, ecological integrity, biological processes, and irreplaceability, across genetic, species, and ecosystem levels (IUCN 2016)". The reference is IUCN (2016) A Global Standard for the Identification of Key Biodiversity Areas (https://portals.iucn.org/library/node/46259)	Agreed. Incorporated
Thomas Brooks	22	756	22	756	Change "globally threatened endemic species" to "threatened biodiversity, restricted-range biodiversity, ecological integrity, biological processes, and irreplaceability, across genetic, species, and ecosystem levels (IUCN 2016)". The reference is IUCN (2016) A Global Standard for the Identification of Key Biodiversity Areas (https://portals.iucn.org/library/node/46259)	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle	22	757	22	757	"the IUCN Red List of threatened species is an important"	Agreed. New phrasing
Elise Belle		757		759	Delete unnecessary sentence about the Red List.	Agreed. New phrasing
The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	22	757	22	759	Useful discussion of the Red List, but add citation to the data on which this sentence is based, www.iucnredlist.org .	Agreed. Incorporated
Thomas Brooks	22	757	22	759	Useful discussion of the Red List, but add citation to the data on which this sentence is based, www.iucnredlist.org .	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle		760		760	"national lists and the global IUCN Red List."	Agreed. Incorporated
The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	22	760	22	760	A key citation for the use of the Red List is Rodrigues et al. (2006) The value of the IUCN Red List for conservation. Trends in Ecology and Evolution 21: 71–76. DOI: 10.1016/j.tree.2005.10.010 .	Agreed. Incorporated

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Thomas Brooks	22	760	22	760	A key citation for the use of the Red List is Rodrigues et al. (2006) The value of the IUCN Red List for conservation. Trends in Ecology and Evolution 21: 71–76. DOI: 10.1016/j.tree.2005.10.010.	Agreed. Incorporated.
Elise Belle		762		763	"the global IUCN Red List has a longer list of Endangered species than in the national Red Lists."	Agreed. Incorporated
Daniel P Faith		766		768	but programs like EDGE do link red list and phylogeny /PD and the pie diagrams provided in this review do this in a way that is relevant to NCP18	Agreed. Incorporated in lines 838-839.
The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	22	766	22	766	Change to read "However, application of..." The Red List itself is specifically a system for measuring extinction risk; it is not intended to capture functional or phylogenetic diversity.	Agreed. Incorporated
Thomas Brooks	22	766	22	766	Change to read "However, application of..." The Red List itself is specifically a system for measuring extinction risk; it is not intended to capture functional or phylogenetic diversity.	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle		767		768	"(Hidasi-Neto et al., 2013). Mace et al. (2008) provide a detailed analysis and a description of"	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle		772		772	"CITES Appendices of species that are commercially exploited"	Agreed. Incorporated
Thomas Brooks	22	773	22	778	Useful discussion of the Red List of Ecosystems	Agreed. Thanks
Sophie Avila Foucat	22	779	25	888	Restoration and invasive species are not policy instruments.	No action taken. Although they are not policy instruments per se, countries have instruments to promote restoration and control of IAS

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Philip M. Fearnside	22	780	22	801	<p>In discussing forest restoration, it needs to be made clear that for areas like Amazonia, where substantial areas of mature forest still exist, the priority is to avoid loss of more old-growth forest, not to restore degraded areas. Restoration has much less biodiversity benefit per unit of money spent than does avoiding further deforestation, and funds are always limited. See: Fearnside, P.M. 2003. Conservation policy in Brazilian Amazonia: Understanding the dilemmas. <i>World Development</i> 31(5): 757-779. doi: 10.1016/S0305-750X(03)00011-1</p> <p>Fearnside, P.M. 2015. Pesquisa sobre conservação na Amazônia brasileira e a sua contribuição para a manutenção da biodiversidade e uso sustentável das florestas tropicais. pp. 21-49. In: I.C.G. Vieira, M.A.G. Jardim & E.J.P. da Rocha (eds.) <i>Amazônia em Tempo: Estudos Climáticos e Socioambientais</i>. Universidade Federal do Pará, Museu Paraense Emílio Goeldi & Embrapa Amazônia Oriental, Belém, Pará. 462 pp.</p>	Agreed. Incorporated in lines 903-905.
Jeffrey T. Morissette	24	834	25	888	<p>This section reads like a random series of thoughts strung together. Perhaps there is an opportunity to make some key messages for the region that does more to synthesize all the information contained in the previous chapters. It is hard to find anything new here. It also doesn't reference the regional coordinating mechanisms or guidance documents. Perhaps this section could be revisited with a strategic focus on regional patterns, trends, info resources, and coordinating mechanisms.</p>	Partly agreed. We transformed this section in a box (6.2), and included a few more info on regional and multinational mechanisms.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Elizabeth Hess	24	850	24	856	The IAS organizations/ initiatives shown that are specific to N. America include countries (i.e., Mexico) beyond simply Canada and USA as defined in this assessment to be N. America along with Greenland only (see Table 1.5 comment). See websites for NAPPO. NASIN, etc. for list of countries involved in each.	Agreed. We now explain in the new box (6.2) that in this case we include Mexico as North America. We also include refs to NAPPO and NAISN
Sofia Treviño Heres	24	850	24	856	Even when for the purpose of this regional assessment Mexico is being considered as Mesoamerica, it is important to clarify that the examples provided on mechanisms of collaboration between countries in North America (NAPPO, NAFC's working group on Forest Insects, disease and invasive plants, and NAISN) are trilateral efforts conducted by the Governments of Mexico, US and Canada.	Agreed. Clarification incorporated. Box 6.2
MAYDS- Argentina	24	859	24	861	La afirmación de que no existen a la fecha políticas transnacionales para el control y erradicación de especies exóticas invasoras no es correcta. La Argentina y Chile han firmado un Acuerdo Binacional sobre la Restauración de los Ecosistemas Australes afectados por el castor americano (Resolución 157/2010)	Agreed. We have deleted "are not transnational"
Royal Gardner	26	890	29	1033	Again, it would be useful to discuss the US Swampbuster program and the removal of perverse incentives and subsidies to drain wetlands. It's a key policy option that seems to be missing.	Agreed. Reference to that is now made in lines 976-978.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Jan Börner	26	924	27	939	This paragraph could link more strongly to the recent systematic reviews and impact evaluation literature including plenty of work with focus on the Americas: Börner, J., Baylis, K., Corbera, E., Ezzine-de-Blas, D., Ferraro, P., Honey-Rosés, J., Lapeyre, R., Persson, M., Wunder, S. (2016): Emerging evidence on the effectiveness of tropical forest conservation. PLOS ONE, 11(11): e0159152 ; Börner, J., K. Baylis, E. Corbera, D. Ezzine-de-Blas, J. Honey-Rosés, U. M. Persson and S. Wunder. 2017. The Effectiveness of Payments for Environmental Services. World Development, 96: 359–374.	Agreed. Sentence and one reference added at the end of the paragraph (now, lines 956-959).
Jan Börner	27	940	27	948	Here and in other sections on policy feasibility it would be worth citing literature that explains, why conservation policies are often unsuccessfully implemented or not even fully adopted: Nolte, C., Le Waroux, Y.P. de, Munger, J., Reis, T.N.P. and Lambin, E.F. (2017), “Conditions influencing the adoption of effective anti-deforestation policies in South America’s commodity frontiers”, Global Environmental Change, Vol. 43, pp. 1–14. ; Rosa da Conceição, H., Börner, J., Wunder, S.. 2015. Why were upscaled incentive programs for forest conservation adopted? Comparing policy choices in Brazil, Ecuador, and Peru. Ecosystem Services, 16: 243-252.	No action taken. Although these are very interesting paper, we believe they refer less to this specific paragraph and some of the points they cover have been covered in other parts of this assessment.
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	27	940	27	940	Add examples	No action taken. The four references cited in this paragraph provide various examples. Our goal here was to synthetically list setbacks, based on these papers.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	27	955	27	955	Maybe if authors wants also to include Colombia's experience in PSA scheme, you can use literature such this: http://www.cifor.org/pes/publications/pdf_files/colombia_experience.pdf Also you can see how we are modelling PSA for the new context in our country (post conflict) http://es.presidencia.gov.co/normativa/normativa/DECRETO%20870%20DEL%2025%20DE%20MAYO%20DE%202017.pdf	No action taken. Thank you. It was not possible to download the Cifor paper. We have chosen to give preference to cite peer-reviewed publications. We use examples from Colombia in the following paragraph.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	27	959	27	959	Fonafifo has provided incentives for farms that protect forests, or implement forest plantations or agroforestry systems. The environmental services recognized by the forest law are: stream water..... etc.	Partly agreed. We made some changes to the original sentence, but we try to stick to what is informed by the cited reference.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	27	961	27	961	PES is 3.5% of national tax.....	No action taken. Thanks. Our preference, however, is to remain strict to the information published.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	27	962	27	962	(Montagnini and Finey, 2011), in addition to the fee for water use and the contributions made by private companies or institutions for PSA financing or for the purchase of environmental services such as carbon credits. By 2016, Costa Rica has signed more than 14,000 contracts with organizations and with individual owners	No action taken. We need to have all information in the report backed up by references. Preferably, peer-reviewed ones.
Adriana C. Flores-Díaz & Lucía Almeida-Leñero	6.8. Boxes, Tables and Figures	987			To include the box "El monitoreo comunitario como una herramienta de gobernanza ambiental", as an example of community-based water monitoring experiences in Mexico.	No action taken. We already have exceeded the space we had. Table 6.1 provides plenty of information for all across the region about this topic. Thus, a specific table for one case is not the kind of priority we chose for this assessment.
Liette Vasseur	29	1008		1009	this is the third time the soy case is mentioned. I am sure that there are other examples that could be used.	No action taken. It is indeed one of the best effective examples of all three topics where we cite it. Two positive examples: participation of non-governmental actors, and market-base mechanisms. One negative example: leakage.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Margarita N. Lavidés	30	1050	30	1050		No action taken. Content of the recommendation is missing
Royal Gardner	30	1053	30	1082	Why would policymakers care about the distribution of biodiversity offset studies? You seem to be losing focus about who the primary audience is. The disparity (and focus on wetlands) can be explained by the fact that biodiversity offset programs generally require a well-developed regulatory program (eg, permit system with offset requirements, monitoring, and enforcement).	Partly agreed. In lines 1085-1089 we now address biodiversity offset studies as a potential road to better understand also human losses that derive from biodiversity loss. This is partly why policy-makers should care. We did not attempt to address reason behind disparities because we found no explanations in the literature that can be generalized enough.
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	30	1062	30	1062	I am not sure if "the near absence of published papers or case studies on biodiversity offsets by LAC 1063 authors is a clear gap", or maybe that the publications are only in Spanish and does not appear in indexed publications....Some examples about interesting articles coming from researches about compensation in Colombia are, amongst others: http://fundepublico.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/05/Capitulo-1.pdf ; http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.11761/9719 ; http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.11761/9852 ; http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.11761/9848	No action taken. Colombia is the third country in the region with more publication in the topic, so it does not add much to what is said in the text to cite further grey literature. Moreover, we are distinguishing compensation (which is often compliance) from offset (which is voluntary and beyond compensation). So, indeed, there is a gap on such types of studies in the region.
Elda Tancredi	31	1091	31	1091	"However, such efforts have received some criticism" clarify which are they	Agreed. Clarification incorporated. Lines 1126-1134.
Margarita N. Lavidés	31	1093	32	1123	In 6.3.2.3 Eco certification and other mechanisms related to markets and trade and in Table 6.1, a discussion and description of marine counterparts e.g. Marine Stewardship Council, similar to the discussed and described eco certifications of terrestrial environments, should be included.	Agreed. Thanks for this important suggestion. We have added a whole new paragraph (lines 1162-1169) on MSC, with pros and cons.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	31	1105	31	1119	Another very important product of Colombia at international markets apart from coffee are flowers. They also have an eco-labelling created by the National Flowers Sector. You can find more information at http://www.florverde.org/	No action taken. Given the large amount of peer-reviewed references we have cited, we have chosen to avoid grey literature or simply internet citations, except in cases they were absolutely essential to add content.
Brenda McAfee	31	1112	31	1114	In addition to food production, production of food and other natural resources are covered by eco-certification schemes e.g. certified timber, non-tomber forest products, sustainable mining initiative	Agreed. Additions of text and references in lines 1147, 1154-1161.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Diego Pacheco	31	1120			<p>There is a missing section which is related to type of policies: 6.4 Right-based approaches policies. There is the need to introduce analysis about rights-based oriented policies, such as the recognition of the rights of Mother Earth (Bolivia) and the rights of nature (in Ecuador). Also, the instruments related to those policies, such as the "Complementary Agreements with Mother Earth" in Bolivia for the management of systems of life, promoting better governance of natural resources, territorial planning, and the achievement of common goals at the local level for eradication of poverty, sustainable development systems and conservation of ecosystem functions. For example, I would introduce the following text:</p> <p>The new Political Constitution of the State of the Plurinational State of Bolivia, approved in 2009, recognizes that Bolivia must be directed to the Living-Well (Suma Qamaña in Aymara, Sumaj Kawsay in Quechua and Teko kavi in Guaraní) as a way to achieve a good quality of life of peoples and nature, living in harmony and complementarity. Also, the Legislative Assembly of the Plurinational State of Bolivia approved the Law No. 071 of Mother Earth Rights in December 2010 and the Law No. 300 Framework Law of the Mother Earth and Integral Development for Living Well in September 2012.</p> <p>These Laws integrates two central aspects of the Bolivian worldview such as the Living-Well in balance and harmony with Mother Earth, where living-well means living in balance and harmony with oneself, with other human beings and with nature. Living-Well represents the culture of life where</p>	Partly agreed. Thank you. We have created a new section on rights-based approaches (6.4.3) and a sub-section specifically to the Rights of the Mother Earth (6.4.3.2). However, we did not use the whole text suggested so as to have available space in these items for text and information related to other countries as well.
Elda Tancredi	32	1120	31	1120	Table 6. 1. some cells are incomplete	Agreed. Thank you. This Table (now 6.2) has now been completed.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Elise Belle	32	1122	32	1123	I think it would be better to name the countries directly in the table.	No action taken. Thank you for this suggestion. We took this option of using numbers for formatting purposes (the table would end up being far too big if we used all the names of the countries).
Elise Belle		1124		1124	Table 6.1: Acronym 'Cert ID.'?; fill missing cells; rename last column 'References/web links'.	Agreed. Thank you. This Table (now 6.2) has now been completed.
United States Government	33	1136	33	1136	"shall" implies the outcome is predetermined; consider another phrase, perhaps "has the potential to strengthen" or "has been shown in some cases?"	Agreed. Language revised and suggestion incorporated
Elda Tancredi	33	1139	33	1139	some examples listed in the box are not sub-regional agreements: WTO (international), Antartictic Trety (international). They are related especifically to international and regional trade of goods and services and not just related to development and sustainability	Agreed. We changed the title of old Box 6.2 (now 6.3).
Elda Tancredi	33	1143	33	1143	Box 6.2 Title must be modify. They are not development and sustainability agreements but primarily multilateral global and regional trade agreements; IIRSA is on infrastructure (roads, rails, ports) improvement; Antarctic Treaty is a geopolitical one related to sovereignty claimed by the states	Agreed. We changed the title of old Box 6.2 (now 6.3).
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	33	1143	33	1204	Include CAFTA in Box 2	No action taken. Thanks for the suggestion. Although we also consider the topic very relevant, we believe we gave it significant coverage within our constraints for number of pages. Participatory processes and community management are discussed, with examples, in lines 427-451, 750-788, 1827-1837, 1854-1858, in addition to our 2-page Table 6.1
Elizabeth Hess	34	1190	34	1195	NAFTA includes Mexico as per line 1192, but is contradictory to rest of assessment that doesn't include Mexico in N. America. Need to clarify this somewhere in report as is not the norm	Agreed. All across the text, whenever necessary, we clarified when we were referring to the geopolitical North America (with Mexico) or to the IPBES North America (without Mexico)

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Elise Belle	36	1237	36	1238	"Table 6.2. Examples of participatory [...] management areas: public policies"	Agreed. Correction made.
Gab/Sbio/MMA	36	1237	36	1238	Table 6.2. There are other examples of participatory processes in Brazil with fisheries than the one cited by riverine communities in Amazonia. Another important one is the participatory management on Coastal and Marine Protected Areas. A publication describing many of those cases is available here: http://www.icmbio.gov.br/portal/images/stories/quem-e-quem/livro_iniciativas_de_inclusao_produtivas_uc.pdf	No action taken. This Table (now 6.1) is already two pages long and has examples from all across the region, including many from Mexico. Moreover, we have a full section on participatory processes and community management shows up all across the Chapter. It is also present in the Executive Summary and Conclusion of this chapter, and also the SPM. We think the message is clear enough.
Adriana C. Flores-Díaz	36	1237	36	1237	Please add to Table 6.2 the Global Water Watch Mexico experience on community-based water monitoring, including macroinvertebrates in several basin of the country. See: www.mexico.globalwaterwatch.org	No action taken. This Table (now 6.1) is already two pages long and has examples from all across the region, including many from Brazil. Moreover, we have a full section on participatory processes and community management shows up all across the Chapter. It is also present in the Executive Summary and Conclusion of this chapter, and also the SPM. We think the message is clear enough.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Sofia Treviño Heres	36	1237	37	1239	<p>More information should be provided regarding participatory processes on Forest Management. Case studies and success stories in community-based management should not be limited to a list of references, but rather showcase detailed examples and analyze possible shared elements of success to be considered by policy makers.</p> <p>Particular examples of success stories in community forestry in Mexico may be found in:</p> <p>http://www.conafor.gob.mx/web/temas-forestales/silvicultura-comunitaria/</p> <p>http://www.ccmss.org.mx/descargas/Guia_Practica_Forestal_de_Silvicultura_Comunitaria.pdf</p> <p>Video https://youtu.be/j74RELOw1Tk (Spanish)</p> <p>https://youtu.be/Dlil_RLaGsQ (English).</p> <p>Examples:</p> <p>-Consejo Civil Mexicano de Silvicultura Sustentable http://www.ccmss.org.mx/la-silvicultura-comunitaria-pilar-desarrollo-forestal-cumplimiento-metas-climaticas-mexico-experto/</p> <p>Relevant documents:</p> <p>http://www.ccmss.org.mx/categorias/manejo-forestal-comunitario/</p> <p>-Programa de gestión comunitaria del territorio (PAGET) en la Cuenca de Amanalco - Valle de Bravo, Estado de México http://amanalco.ccmss.org.mx/</p> <p>-Ixtlan de Juárez - Oaxaca http://www.unsij.edu.mx/investigacion/proyecto_manejo_forestal.pdf</p> <p>-San Juan Nuevo - Michoacán</p>	No action taken. Thanks, but unfortunately we do not have additional space for that. The table is already 2 pages long, there are many examples of Mexico there, we have a full section on participatory processes and community management shows up all across the Chapter. It is also present in the Executive Summary and Conclusion of this chapter, and also the SPM. We think the message is clear enough.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	37	1238	37	1239	Include: Costa Rica in Citizen Monitoring by using.....	No action taken. Sorry not to include all these detailed information about Costa Rica. We need references to cite and at this point in the process we are short in time to go look for references to back up the statements this reviewer is making. The table is less about who is doing what but more about examples of types of actions.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	36	1238	36	1238	Private PAs officially recognized.....Costa Rica: Co-Management with participation of community (Cahuita National Park); involvement and participation of indigenous territories (hydroelectric projects, REDD+ Estrategy); involvement of local communities on management of protected areas; participation of local representation in national, regional and local committees for administration of protected areas.	No action taken. Sorry not to include all these detailed information about Costa Rica. We need references to cite and at this point in the process we are short in time to go look for references to back up the statements this reviewer is making. The table is less about who is doing what but more about examples of types of actions.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	36	1238	36	1238	Fisheries....Participation of representation of social sectors in executive board.	No action taken. Sorry not to include all these detailed information about Costa Rica. We need references to cite and at this point in the process we are short in time to go look for references to back up the statements this reviewer is making. The table is less about who is doing what but more about examples of types of actions.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	37	1238	37	1238	Forestry...In Costa Rica, participation of private and social sector in executive board of National Forest Financial Fund.	No action taken. Sorry not to include all these detailed information about Costa Rica. We need references to cite and at this point in the process we are short in time to go look for references to back up the statements this reviewer is making. The table is less about who is doing what but more about examples of types of actions.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	38	1249	38	1257	In 2014, the situation of INBio in Costa Rica changed and all the collections were delivered to the government of Costa Rica and INBio Pak was closed.	Agreed. This is now mentioned and referenced in the text (lines 1262-1264)

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	38	1253	38	1257	Deleted all paragraph	Agreed. Done. Repetition.
Philip M. Fearnside	38	1276	38	1286	In discussing bioprospecting, in addition to the social justice issues mentioned, it needs to be made clear that the potential of this value is highly limited as a basis for maintaining large areas of tropical forest. See: Fearnside, P.M. 1999. Biodiversity as an environmental service in Brazil's Amazonian forests: Risks, value and conservation. Environmental Conservation 26(4): 305-321. doi:10.1017/S0376892999000429	Agreed. Inserted (lines 1286-1291)
Elise Belle	38	1282	39	1285	Reference?	Agreed. Added (lines 1252-1254)
Elise Belle		1285		1285	"more money allocated to the protected areas system."	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle		1286		1286	"in infrastructure for scientific"	Agreed. Correction made.
Elise Belle	39	1296	39	1296	I think the USA are signatories to the CBD. They have signed it, but not ratified it.	Agreed. Correction made.
Leticia Couto Garca	46	1300	47		It would be interesting to include on the first column of Table 6.11 "Agroforestry systems"	No action taken. There was no Table 6.11 in the SOD and in line 1300 there is no table. For the 4 tables we have in the Chapter, there is none where we see the column suggested fitting.
Elise Belle		1301		1301	"reported under Aichi Target 11 (Protected Areas) in terms of coverage and"	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle	40	1312	40	1313	"Aichi Targets for 24 countries in Latin America and the Caribbean, showing the percentage of countries at different stages of achievement."	Agreed. Incorporated
David Loreto	42	1341	42	1343	As already mentioned, there are several difficulties in establishing its practical application, So it should be clarified that this type of resilience is understood Since it has to do more with resistance than with resilience as such.	No action taken. Not sure if we understood the reviewer's point. In this paragraph we are describing what countries committed to, and the word "resistance" is not mentioned in such commitments. We now have "resilience" present in the Glossary and indicated here. Hope it helps with clarity.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
David Loreto	42	1341	42	1343	As already mentioned, there are several difficulties in establishing its practical application, So it should be clarified that this type of resilience is understood Since it has to do more with resistance than with resilience as such.	No action taken. Not sure if we understood the reviewer's point. In this paragraph we are describing what countries committed to, and the word "resistance" is not mentioned in such commitments. We now have "resilience" present in the Glossary and indicate
Krista Locs	42	1344	42	1344	Section 6.4.3 Sustainable Development Goals. Suggest noting in this section that Canada's Federal Sustainable Development Strategy is the principle mechanism for implementing the SDGs. Reference: https://www.canada.ca/en/services/environment/conservation/sustainability/federal-sustainable-development-strategy.html	No action taken. Due to space limitations, our option was to make broad statements about region and sub-region. We have given one country-level example on how SDG relates to BES.
Elise Belle	42	1351	42	1351	"the increase in the number and coverage in protected areas)"	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle	43	1375	43	1376	Reference?	Agreed. It is now given
Margarita N. Lavidés	43	1384	43	1394	The last two sentences in Line 1384 to 1388 is similar to sentences in Line 1391 to 1394.	Agreed. Repetition deleted.
Elise Belle	44	1395	44	1395	Reference?	Agreed. It is now given
Elise Belle		1408		1408	Name of the networks?	Agreed. Text has been entirely deleted.
Elise Belle		1410		1410	"specific like World Heritage,"	Agreed. Text has been entirely deleted.
Elda Tancredi	45	1413	45	1413	ACTO (Amazonian Cooperation Treaty Organization) is the only example. It can be mentioned as a box; or other examples may be included in this paragraph	Agreed. It now appears in the Box 6.3
Anna Yusa (Health Canada)	45	1421			Please describe the methods used to examine the four topics selected for case studies. The output of case 3 is unclear.	Agreed. Explanation is now given in lines 1502-1509. Case 3 has been partly rewritten for clarity.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Philip M. Fearnside	45	1429	45	1455	In discussing ecotourism, in addition to the positive aspects that are mentioned, it should be mentioned that ecotourism is being used as the excuse for opening the most damaging planned highway in Amazonia: the BR-319 highway planned to link Brazil's "arc of deforestation" in southern Amazonia to Manaus in central Amazonia. See: Fearnside, P.M. 2015. Highway construction as a force in destruction of the Amazon forest. pp. 414-424 In: R. van der Ree, D.J. Smith & C. Grilo (eds.) Handbook of Road Ecology. John Wiley & Sons Publishers, Oxford, UK. 552 pp.	No action taken. We believe the text in the section is already well balanced as regards pros and cons of ecotourism.
Elise Belle	45	1431	45	1431	Travel every year to the Americas?	Agreed. We added "around the world" for clarity.
E. Arguedas y C. Roldán	46	1458	46	1458	In Costa Rica the ecotourism to protected areas represents 8% of GDP.	No action taken. I found grey literature from 2007 giving this number and I could not find anything more recent. The choice was to keep text as it was.
Elise Belle	46	1464	46	1464	"the Canadian policies focus on leisure and"	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle		1466		1466	"in the Canadian system and it promotes local [...] these authors argue that conservation"	Agreed. Incorporated
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	46	1486	46	1486	Add Problems in Canada, USA, Argentina and Brazil	Partly agreed. We expanded 1588-1606 our reference citation to show the controversy around the issue, regulatory shortfalls across the region and the lack of consensus. We did not find peer-reviewed papers with the examples of problems the reviewer mentions. However, in paragraph 1607-1624 we refer to the issue related to the centers of crop diversity across the region.
United States Government	46	1495	47	1496	This citation is dated; consider revising with an updated source. For example, the National Academies of Sciences, Engineering and Medicine released a 2016 study reviewing the science on GM crops that would be more appropriate.	Partly agreed. We expanded in lines 1588-1606 our reference citation to show the controversy around the issue, regulatory shortfalls across the region, the lack of consensus, but also the viewpoint of the reviewer.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Gab/Sbio/MMA	47	1498	47	1498	According to the Conselho de Informações sobre Biotecnologia (CIB, in Portuguese), in 2015, Brazil reached the 2nd place in the world's GM area. Source: http://cib.org.br/brasil-lidera-crescimento-mundial-da-adocao-de-transgenicos/	Partly agreed. Given our preference for peer-reviewed publications on such a sensitive issue, our option was to simply delete "in that order" to avoid entering the discussion of magnitude that is actually not useful to the Chapter argument.
United States Government	47	1499	47	1500	This sentence is misleading. Consider: "Out of these four countries, only Brazil has chosen to use the CBD's Cartagena Biosafety Protocol in establishing its biosafety system (see Table 6.3). However, all four countries have functioning biosafety systems that use science-based risk assessment to evaluate GM crops."	Agreed. Incorporated
Luis Ubaldo Castruita Esparza	47	1501	47	1507	There is a need to reinforce the arguments for Mexico to continue to be a center of origin and genetic diversity linked to ancestral and traditional identity and knowledge by indigenous groups and peasants	Agreed. We make reference to this importance both for Mexico and for the other centres of diversity across the region.
United States Government	47	1501	47	1516	Please include additional citations/publications to more accurately present information on GM crops. For example, it is not appropriate to justify that GM and non-GM crops cannot coexist simply because the author of the cited publication is "skeptical." Additionally, when speaking on threats to genetic diversity, the current language does not reference the global collections of maize genetic varieties that are actively maintained to serve as a genetic reference over time.	Partly agreed. New citations included, a lot of it about genetic erosion in centres of crop diversity. We changed the word "skeptical". We found no references about global collections of maize genetic varieties, but then again they are probably of not much use to local farmers.
Anna Yusa (Health Canada)	47	1517			Could this section take a broader view of "ecosystem-based adaptation to climate change"? For example, to include initiatives that incorporate ecosystem components to reduce exposure to extreme heat in urban settings; this is an active area.	Partly agreed. We have substantially changed this section and we now provide some more urban examples, although not specifically on heating
United States Government	47	1517	47	1526	Recommend including examples of Eco-DDR.	Agreed. Lines 1675-1679

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
United States Government	48	1575	48	1578	Please clarify. For example, the sentence could read: "Irrespective of the model used, the fact is that policy makers make insufficient use of the scientific knowledge available, and researchers typically do not produce enough directly usable knowledge."	Agreed. Incorporated
The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	49	1596	49	1616	A useful case study of Red Listing Brazilian plant species - retain.	Agreed. Thanks
Thomas Brooks	49	1596	49	1616	A useful case study of Red Listing Brazilian plant species - retain.	Agreed. Thanks
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	49	1596	49	1596	Add for Mesoamerica	No action taken. The line and page number given are probably wrong. This suggestion does not apply to this paragraph.
United States Government	49	1606	49	1606	Suggest substituting "point occurred during" instead of "was the fact that."	Agreed. Incorporated
Gab/Sbio/MMA	49	1609	49	1609	The Brazilian Official List of Threatened Plant Species starts published in 2009 had 472 threatened species (not 417). And the 2013 Updated Brazilian List has 2,113 species (not 2,118). Sources: http://www.mma.gov.br/informma/item/5076-lista-oficial-traz-472-especies-da-flora-brasileira-ameacadas-de-extincao and http://www.mma.gov.br/biodiversidade/especies-ameacadas-de-extincao/atualizacao-das-listas-de-especies-ameacadas	Agreed. Official source cited.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Leticia Couto Garca	57	1613	57		<p>It would be interesting to include a sentence : "Another regulatory measure to illustrate is the environmental bonds, which is a deposit-refund systems used for securing environmental restitution in cases of harmful environmental practices that causes high impacts (Gerard 2000, Boyd 2002). This policy instrument can incentivize land users, industries, and companies to improve monitoring and management systems, and could be based on the potential loss of the environmental services and relative risk of possible damages (Garcia et al. 2017). "</p> <p>references: Boyd, J. 2002. Financial responsibility for environmental obligations: Are bonding and assurance rules fulfilling their promises? Research in Law and Economics 20:417–486. Gerard, D. 2000. The law and economics of reclamation bonds. Resources Policy 26:189–197. Garcia, L.C.; Ribeiro, D.B.; Roque, F.O.; Ochoa-Quintero, J.M., Laurance, W.F. 2016. Brazil's worst mining disaster: Corporations must be compelled to pay the actual environmental costs. Ecological Applications 27:5–9.</p>	Agreed. Text and refs inserted. See lines 1177-1181.
United States Government	49	1617	49	1628	The tone of this paragraph is unbalanced and reads more like a political statement; please revise.	Agreed, thanks. We have totally rewritten the paragraph with another tone.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Royal Gardner	50	1637	52	1725	Will the "policy outlook" include any discussion about the environmental policies by the Trump administration? It could fall under the "Decentralized Solutions" scenario, as the USA's actions and proposals are to reduce federal involvement in biodiversity protection and instead allow the states to take the lead. At the same time, however, funding support to the states will be reduced, and the likely outcome is not having a different layer of government take responsibility, but deregulation on a significant scale. I assume that this may be too politically sensitive for the assessment. But if that's the case, what is the point of including a section on "policy outlook"?	Partly agreed. It is not about the sensitivity (GMOs are probably more sensitive and are included), it is about the need for peer-reviewed references. We, however, changed our structure and deleted the previous "Policy Outlook" section and replaced by a section on urgent issues and emerging solutions.
Virginia Meléndez Ramírez	50	1666	50	1667	Add Mesoamerica, Mexico megadiverse	Agreed. Done

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Harald Pauli	51	1686	51	1687	<p>suggest to include after ...'Coordinated monitoring programs are emerging in the region to obtain data on biodiversity and ecosystem services. Most of them are arising at the national scale.' (or elsewhere in this paragraph): 'An internationally coordinated monitoring program (GLORIA; www.gloria.ac.at) is already in place for high mountain biodiversity in the context of climate change, which includes site-based networks in both North America (Millar and Fagre 2007) and South America (Questa et al. 2012, 2016). The installation of the basic GLORIA permanent plot settings for vascular plants also stimulated further monitoring approaches on both continents, such as on different animal groups or on socio-economic aspects in the studie regions (Pauli et al. 2015).'</p> <p>Refs.:</p> <p>Millar C, Fagre D 2007. Monitoring Alpine Plants for Climate Change: The North American GLORIA Project. Cirmount, Mountain Views 1/1: 12-15.</p> <p>Cuesta F, Muriel P, Beck S, Meneses RI, Halloy S, Salgado S, Ortiz E, Becerra MT (eds.) 2012. Biodiversidad y cambio climático en los Andes Tropicales - Conformación de una red de investigación para monitorear sus impactos y delinear acciones de adaptación. CONDESAN, Red GLORIA Andes. Lima, Quito, 180 pp.</p> <p>Cuesta, F., Muriel, P., Llambí, L. D., Halloy, S., Aguirre, N., Beck, S., Carilla, J., Meneses, R. I., Cuello, S., Grau, A., Gámez, L. E., Irazábal, J., Jácome, J., Jaramillo, R., Ramírez, L., Samaniego N, Suárez-Duque D, Thompson N, Tunavachi</p>	Agreed and fully incorporated.
United States Government	51	1711	51	1711	"resume" is unclear in this context. Does it mean to summarize and interpret? Please clarify.	Agreed. New phrasing (lines 1802-1804)

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
juan comerma	52	1726	52	1726	Could have more succesful examples from LAC like subsidies for soil conservation in the Andes. Governemet programas for watershed proteccion and management for water production and soil conservation	No action taken. We have provided some of the examples mentioned by the reviewer across the text. Here, in the Conclusion section, we aimed to be more synthetic in emphasizing key messages.
Vicente Ugalde	52	1727	52	1743	it is right to conclude that policies are conceived, designed and implemented separately; nevertheless, is really possible to conceive differently the policy mesures in a (and by a) sectorially organized bureaucracy?	No action taken. We agree with the reviewer that this is part of the problem,
Vicente Ugalde	52	1727	52	1743	It's true that participatory deliberative processes could contribute to problem-solving situations and could support successful governance, but, is the participation enough to avoid the conflicts, obstruction and fail in all kind of projects? some scholars suggest that the proliferation and sophistication of participatory mecanisme in policy decision making proccess don't assure to avoid the conflicts. Do we have to think in anothers options?	Agreed. There is na important discussion on Newig et al. (2017) about this, which we now cite in the text (lines 447-449).
Elise Belle	52	1735	52	1735	"this respect is often more local than national"	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle		1749		1749	"development planning and this should be done sooner"	Agreed. Incorporated
Vicente Ugalde	52	1754	52	1764	Policies evaluation could be extremelly useful in caribbean and latin american countries; nobody doubts about the goodness of monigoring systems, nevertheless, they are extremelly expensive. How to generalize the use of technologies in evaluation systems?How about Citizens science and monitoring? (Citizen BES Observatories)	Agreed. We expanded on that a bit and make reference to citizen science and monitoring here (lines 1794-1799) and also with examples in Table 6.1.
Elise Belle		1759		1760	"For instance, although evidence of leakage and spillover effects begin to emerge, in many levels"	Agreed. Incorporated
Elise Belle	53	1771	53	1771	"global commitments (e.g. SDGs, Aichi Targets and NDCs)"	Agreed. Incorporated, except the "s", because the acronyms already contain the plural form

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
United States Government	53	1780	53	1781	"combination between" is confusing in this context. Does it refer to a goal of harmony between a healthy environment and human well-being rather than a balancing act, as if they are always in competition? Please clarify. Further, the qualifier of "reported" threats may not be necessary; if there is supporting data, consider deletion.	Agreed. Paragraph was deleted.
Ana Maria Hernandez-Salgar	53	1785	53	1785	I think that is imperative also to remark as conclusion that there is a tremendous gap on communications skills and strategies, to create awareness in society about BES. People of common talks about climate change...¿why? Because there are a lot of wonderful campaigns, media coverage, understandable messages that touch feelings. We are not creating a good environment to fell society in love with BES efforts and research. If we are not able to demonstrate that BES is important for a person, of course it is going to be reflected in the lack of capacity to impact in local, <u>subregional or national policies.</u>	No action taken. Although we do believe that communication is na important issue, as highlighted by the reviewer, we did not come across publications that actually measure and demonstrate that. In 6.6.4, however, we dedicated the whole section to discuss one particular layer of communication, which is that between science and policy.
Leticia Couto Garca	61	1786	61		after "2015)", include: " as well as encourage farmer participation in restoration process."	No action taken. Sorry. We were not totally sure about where this text is located. Our guess was that the reviewer meant line 786 and not 1786. If 786, the paper by Barrel et al. (2015) makes no reference to encouraging farmers. In the absence of references for that, we decided not to mention it.
Leticia Couto Garca	65	1960	65		continue the sentense: "increasing the likelihood of restoration success."	No action taken. Sorry. We do not know where exactly the reviewer would like us to add this sentence. Page number and line are reference list.
Leticia Couto Garca	70	2138	70		It would be interesting to include: "What are the metrics used to measure restoration success?"	No action taken. Sorry. We do not know where exactly the reviewer would like us to add this sentence. Page number and line are reference list.

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
David Loreto	87	2967	87	2969	On the definition to reconsider what established by Holling in 1973, as well as the approaches with which it is currently sought to operationalize the concept, and that there is a broad debate to carry out the theoretical and methodological link between resilience and sustainability.	Agreed. Thanks. Please see now lines 3410-3418
David Loreto	87	2967	87	2969	On the definition to reconsider what established by Holling in 1973, as well as the approaches with which it is currently sought to operationalize the concept, and that there is a broad debate to carry out the theoretical and methodological link between resilience and sustainability.	Agreed. Thanks. Please see now lines 3410-3418
Leticia Couto Garca	54	1506-1507	54		It can be said that the depopulation and land abandonment in disadvantaged rural areas have been specially important for passive restoration result on na increase of secondary vegetation cover	No action taken. This recommendation does not seem to fit in our Chapter and the page and line numbers do not match the topic.
Brenda McAfee	34	Box.6.2 1190		1190	It would be worthwhile to mention here or elsewhere in the chapter that the Commission for Environmental Cooperation was established in concert with the trade agreement to foster conservation and to monitor and report on the impact of trade on the North American environment	Agreed. Text added in the box.
Leticia Couto Garca	12	table 6.1	12		It would be interesting to include "environmental bonds" in the line of " Legal and regulatory instruments	Partly agreed. Table 6.1 is on certification schemes and bonds do not fully apply to that. We have added reference to this instrument on the text though (lines 1193-1197).
Brenda McAfee	37	Table 6.2	37	Table 6.2	Biodiversity and natural resource monitoring is taking place across canada not only in the Arctic www.naturewatch.ca	Agreed. (Arctic) deleted. (old 6.2 is now 6.1)+I268

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Diego Pacheco	General				<p>General comments: there is the need to be consistent with the acronym of NCP (nature contributions to people), and therefore the BES must be removed from the text.</p> <p>There is a confusion about institutional arrangements for governance, which are public, private and collective action. These need to be highlighted at the same level and in a proper way (see Elinor Ostrom work).</p> <p>The decentralization of natural resources if neglected as the main issue regarding governance of NCP, and also the issue of recognition of self-governance of IPLC.</p> <p>Right-based approaches are not included in the analysis, such as the recognition and expansion of the rights of Mother Earth and the rights of peoples.</p>	Partly agreed. The term NCP emerged after SOD was finished. Authors did not feel comfortable with this change, especially because at this point not many people outside IPBES community fully understand the meaning. NCP will be used in the SPM. We do not agree with what the reviewer calls "confusion". We covered self-governance and rights-based approaches in details in this new version.
Elda Tancredi	General				in all this chapter, NCP is not considered but BES. A clarification note has to be included at the beginning.	No action taken. The term NCP emerged after SOD was finished. Authors did not feel comfortable with this change, especially because at this point not many people outside IPBES community fully understand the meaning. NCP will be used in the SPM
Gabriela Civeira	9		10		types of policies are not very clear.	Partly agreed. We have restructured sections 6.2, 6.3 and 6.4 to improve clarity
Gabriela Civeira	14		17		i think this subject mixed governance and policies and should be more clear.	Partly agreed. We have restructured sections 6.2, 6.3 and 6.4 to improve clarity
Gabriela Civeira	18		22		i think other sites provide ecosystem services beside protected areas and they should be included.	No action taken. Ecosystem services have been mentioned for varios sites (restored sites, corridors, OECMs, etc), not protected areas only.
Gabriela Civeira	47		48		provide more examples on case 3	Agreed. We have rewritten this section to include more examples. Lines 1627-1688.
Liette Vasseur					I am surprised that you didn't include informaiton about biosphere reserves and conservation easement in section 6.3.2	Agreed. New paragraph on the topic (lin+1245es 1049-1054)

Reviewer Name	From Page	From Line	Till Page	Till Line	Comment	Author Annotations
Liette Vasseur					NAFTA: It would be better to explain that in fact environmental issues are related to the NAAEC (North America Agreement on Environmental Cooperation)	Agreed. Information inserted in Box 6.3, lines 1395-1403.
Margarita N. Lavidés					While this Chapter is very well written, with good scholarship-very relevant and updated and very coherent, the balance between terrestrial and marine is still not attained. While it is true that many examples of the topics can be found in terrestrial systems in Americas, but topics such as MPAs in Americas, e.g. MPA networks in USA, are not sufficiently discussed, where appropriate.	No action taken. Thanks. We hope to have achieved a better balance now. The Chapter now addresses marine and coastal at lines 216, 564-582, 721-743, 818-833, 898-900, 1079-1089, 1427-1430, Tables 6.1 and 6.5, Boxes 6.2 and 6.3.
Marlín Pérez Suárez					The chapter covers all the objectives and/or goals outlined	Agreed. Thanks
Héctor Tuy	87				I would recommend to include the definition of "socio-ecological system" (Berkes)	Agreed. Incorporated