

Comment form for 2nd Review Phase of the Deliverable 2b) Regional and subregional assessments of biodiversity and ecosystem services for Africa, Chapter 6 'Options for governance and institutional arrangements across scales and sectors'

Review Editor: Coleen Vogel
Institute: University of Witwatersrand
Address: 1 Jan Smuts Avenue, Braamfontein, Johannesburg, 2000
Email address: Coleen.Vogel@wits.ac.za

Review Editor: Lapologang Magole
Institute: University of Botswana
Address: 4775 Notwane Rd, Gaborone, Botswana
Email address: lmagole@orc.ub.bw

Reviewers:

CSIR BES
Diane Douglas (DD)
Edson Gandiwa (EG)
Elise Belle (EB)
George Atisa (GA)
Ignela Sahondra Randriantsizafy (ISR)
Marie Bonnin (MB)
Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)
Neil Burgess (NB)

Rael Loon (RL)
Ramsar Secretariat (RS)
South Africa (SA)
Susan Ringrose (SR)
The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)
Thomas Brooks (TB)
Tim Hirsch (TH)
Voahangy Raharimalala (VR)

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
1	CSIR BES	2	20		61	Informed by the analysis in previous chapters [we can say this in the intro], chapter 6 will reflect the Conceptual Framework boxes and fluxes on “Institutions and governance and other indirect drivers” [we can say this in the intro with reference to the CF in chapter 1]. It will examine different policy ideas [I believe this is covered in section 6.4 and 6.7 of the current text] and possible options for decision makers at the regional and subregional levels [so far I do not see much at the subregional level] in response to the scenario set out in previous chapters, in particular chapter 5 [current section 6.3. But section numbering should be updated]. Explorations of options will be policy relevant, but not policy prescriptive, as outlined in the principles of the Platform. Options explored will include different policy instruments [section 6.4], market tools [???], conservation and management practices and international and regional agreements [section 6.5??. Can we really refer to all the policy instruments used in the implementation of all biodiversity-related agreements at the global, regional and subregional levels? Is it the idea here?]. The chapter will look at	WE have double checked this in chapter plenary and have taken into account these comments in the relevant sections. Please note that sections have been moved around a lot.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>options at different hierarchical spatial [is it household/site/village/city, biome/landscape, national, sub-regional and regional? If yes, did we consider these scales in the discussions? Not systematically. Should we?] and temporal [we have already short and medium terms 2020, 2030, 2050 and 2063 and long term 2100. Did we consider this in the policy/governance options? Without having the same considerations in chapter 3 and 4 when describing future dynamics!] scales, from the international level to local and indigenous communities and households. It will explore options for policy mixes [how can we translate this?] and alignments in polycentric governance systems, assess the effectiveness of such options [I hope this is implied in sections 6.5.and 6.6] and consider who would gain or bear their cost [6.5.7 and (???) 6.7]. The chapter will analyse future challenges for sustainable use and conservation in key sectors [which sectors did we select? Agriculture and food production? Fisheries? Forestry? Water? Energy? Mining? Tourism? Etc. How can we make this analysis? Is this analysis part of 6.5.1 Options for mainstreaming BES] in</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>each region and assess options for integrating biodiversity, ecosystem function and ecosystem services into poverty reduction strategies and national accounting and, where appropriate, the recognition of the rights of Mother Earth [section 6.5]. The analyses will include incentives, subsidies harmful to biodiversity, positive incentives for the conservation and sustainable use of biodiversity, ecosystem function and ecosystem services [in section 6.4??], as well as measures taken to achieve sustainable production and consumption of biodiversity, ecosystem function and ecosystem services and rights-based approaches to address biodiversity conservation [sections 6.4 and 6.5]. The chapter will also identify the enabling environments and limitations for policy uptake and lessons learned, including solutions and methods for ensuring success and capacity-building needs [section 6.6]. It will address issues related to Goals A [YES: Address the underlying causes of biodiversity loss by mainstreaming biodiversity across government and society] and E [YES: Enhance implementation through participatory</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						planning, knowledge management and capacity building] of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity and the relevant Aichi Targets (in particular Aichi Targets 1, 2, 3,4, 17,18, 19 and 20) as well as target 16. [The IPBES outline has asked for so many things. Let us check what we included in the chapter and what we were not able to include]	
2	Elise Belle (EB)	3	66	3	67	"the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity [...] Union Agenda will be shaped"	This typo has been corrected
3	The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	3	77	3	89	The enumeration of county affiliations to treaties is unequal, possibly because it uses different country list as a basis. All African UN members are Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity (similarly to UNFCCC and UNCCD). The text seems to suggest a difference. Western Sahara - unlike South Sudan - is not a recognized political entity in this context. The text in line 84 also seems to suggest that the CBD is the treaty for biodiversity conservation, while there are eight recognized biodiversity-related conventions including World Heritage and CITES listed earlier in the text. On the other hand, the mandate of the CBD is beyond biodiversity conservation and also seeks to achieve sustainable use and fair and equitable sharing of	These numbers will be checked against the websites of the treaty secretariats; we have removed the word "most" so it just reads "African countries" and will say that "most African countries are signatories to CITIES". Text in line 84 will be amended such that biodiversity conservation is moved earlier in the paragraph and is mentioned in relation to the 8 biodiversity conventions, noting that the CBD also extends beyond biodiversity as indicated by the reviewer.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						benefits from genetic resources (see table 6.1 on p.9).	
4	South Africa (SA)	3	79	3	79	Just make sure, but I think southern Morocco is not a signatory of the UNCCD. Therefore NOT all countries in Africa	Morocco is a signatory to the UNCCD which one would assume applies to the whole country without the south having any difference status, and indeed Morocco hosts the UNCCD regional coordination unit for Africa. As such, no action taken on this.
5	Ramsar Secretariat (RS)	3	82	3	82	There are currently 385 Ramsar sites (Wetlands of International Importance)	This has been corrected to note 386 Ramsar sites as per the Ramsar website
6	Voahangy Raharimalala (VR)	3	82	3	86	I suggest to put information on CBD first before information on CITES	This has been done. CBD should probably be moved to the start of the paragraph so it comes before UNFCCC and UNCCD as well.
7	Elise Belle (EB)	5	149	5	149	"limits and barriers can make some options". What kind of limits and barriers?	This is no longer in key messages as these have changed substantially
8	CSIR BES	6	181	6	183	Where are these 2 objectives?	Edited to refer to challenges instead of objectives
9	Elise Belle (EB)	6	184	6	185	"biodiversity and ecosystem services as a key asset [...] and equitably accessed in order to"	equitably accessed has been included
10	CSIR BES	6	186	6	188	Supposedly in section 1.3.8 but I am not sure they provide the details you want ('starkly demonstrated')	We have removed "starkly" and will cross check with the final version of chapter 1 or

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
							assess appropriateness of the cross reference.
11	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	6	190	6	190	identify this new paragraph with a space before beginning the paragraph.	We will maintain consistency in spacing between paragraphs according to the final layout to be edited by the TSU
12	CSIR BES	6	196	6	198	Should we use NCP?	We have used NCP where appropriate but prefer to keep BES
13	CSIR BES	7	217	7	217	this Figure is good, easy to read and understand. would have preferred not to have it in the introduction but in the core of the chapter. However, the paragraph coming under the Figure justifies having it here. But please let us think about it again. Despite the fact the figure is clear, you should add some text to the caption to explain the Figure.	This figure is in discussion with the graphic designer so that it is merged with a later figure but which still shows the structure of the chapter
14	Elise Belle (EB)	7	217	7	217	Figure not cited in the text.	This has been addressed just before the new version of Figure 6.1 is presented
15	South Africa (SA)	7	217	7	217	"Conceptual framework" of what?	We have added explanation to clarify that this is the structure of the chapter, not a conceptual framework. A new figure is being drawn.
16	CSIR BES	7	221	7	224	Afer this paragraph, it is useful to introduce the structure of the chapter e.g., by referring to the main headings	Paragraph expanded and signposts included

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
17	CSIR BES	7	232	7	235	Better to give an idea “such as” and provide exact references to sections	This will be done at the end once all chapters are completed to avoid confusion
18	CSIR BES	7	232	7	235	Is it nature protection?	This has been done. It now reads: Maintaining and improving Africa’s rich biodiversity and ecological infrastructure is essential to address the cross-cutting challenges identified in previous chapters, enabling nature’s endurance, humans to live well in balance with nature, and the sustainable use of biodiversity and ecosystem services
19	CSIR BES	8	238	8	240	This Table should just be a list. A table with the other columns should be an appendix. However, if you want to have a list with columns, I would suggest you have in the column some of the things needed as per the chapter outline i.e. in the chapter we need to explore “possible options for decision makers at the regional and subregional levels in response to the scenarios”; “Options explored will include [...] international and regional agreements”. Thus for each agreement listed, we can have a description of its relevance to scenarios. The question is whether to stick to the	Each convention requires a short explanation as to what it is about as well as its relevance to BES. This is difficult to do in text and so we will keep the table. However we have decided to move the Aichi target table into the appendix so that there is not a long set of tables following each other which should make for easier reading.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						convention texts or to take into account the various decisions, programmes, guidelines and approaches adopted by governments under the conventions. How detailed should we be? But that will be quite useful for those involved in the implementation of the agreements and sustainable development goals and Agenda 2063.	
20	Elise Belle (EB)	8	245	8	245	Which three CBD objectives?	They are already listed
21	The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	9	251	9	251	CBD panel, list of BD and ES, second line: "many of which" is grammatically/logically incorrect. Fifth line "poses" should read "pose" (plural). Line 11 "It is commendable that 54 African countries are parties to the CBD." These are all African countries that are internationally recognized. Line 12: "Although 51 of the 54 African countries have developed National Biodiversity Strategic and Action Plans (NBSAPs), some of which are under revision, in revised or completed forms, a few countries are still at inception of first drafts".	These changes have been made as suggested by the reviewer
22	CSIR BES	9	251	12	252	Useful to extend to MEA in general and include regional agreements and subregional agreements such as Abidjan Convention	The table is already long and is about international environmental agreements not about subregional agreements. Subregional considerations

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
							come in another section. Reference to the Abidjan convention comes in Table 6.3.
23	Elise Belle (EB)	9	251	12	253	<p>CBD: "there is a need"</p> <p>UNFCCC: Delete 'Climate change exerts more pressure to biodiversity loss'</p> <p>UNCCD: "management and the restoration of degraded ecosystems"</p> <p>CITED: Delete link</p> <p>IPTGRFA: "traded crops (e.g., millet,"</p> <p>WHC: "Africa is home to 47 natural and mixed World Heritage sites. However, several of these sites are listed on the World Heritage in Danger List. They are indeed threatened by"; "with the World Heritage Committee, which also compiles the List of World Heritage in Danger."</p>	<p>CBD, UNFCCC, UNCCD revisions have been made as per the reviewer suggestion; link to CITES list has been shortened; WHC sites - we think the reviewer is incorrect in terms of numbers here as there are 37 African countries that host WHC sites with 135 sites in total. As such these are the numbers we have used. Other revisions have been made as per the reviewer suggestions.</p>
24	CSIR BES	9	251			Please add the Protocols (Biosafety and Nagoya)	Protocols are at a different level to the agreements but Nagoya and Cartagena have been added under the section on CBD
25	Ramsar Secretariat (RS)	10	N/A (see MEAs tables)	10	N/A (see MEAs tables)	We suggest the following text and figure illustrating the number (and area) of Ramsar Sites in Africa (see separate file attached) : "There are currently 385 Ramsar sites (Wetlands of International Importance) covering more than 995 900 Km2 in Africa in which sites' locations uses and potentials are	In order to maintain a balance between conventions, we cannot include figures etc. however we have included a reference for further reading of this material.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>documented and monitored (see figure in separate attachment).</p> <p>Many of these, such as the Niger Inner Delta Ramsar Site (Mali), the Kilombero Valley Ramsar Site (Tanzania), the Okavango Delta System Ramsar Site (Botswana) and the Zambezi floodplains Ramsar Site (Zambia) are driven by flood pulse ecosystem services which provide the primary sources of nutrition, irrigation water, and wildlife habitat in the region.</p> <p>Figure (see in separate attachment). The area of Ramsar Sites, wetlands protected under the Ramsar Convention as internationally important by sub region in Africa Source: https://rsis Ramsar.org/ris-search/?f[0]=regionCountry_en_ss%3AAfrica</p> <p>Despite many drivers of wetlands loss and degradation including unsustainable agriculture, water pollution, extractive industries, development infrastructure, unplanned urbanization, African governments and conservation agencies are increasing efforts to implement the wetlands wise use principles. In Africa, the governments' political will and the commitment of development partners (bilateral and multilateral partners, and</p>	

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						conservation agencies) are conducive to the implementation of the Ramsar Convention on Wetlands at local, national and sub-regional scales."	
26	CSIR BES	12	252	12	252	We can also see how to add UNFF, FAO strategies and programmes and guidelines, ITTO/ITTA etc	Following discussion with Res we have not added these because they are so many different strategies and programmes. Here we focus on a specific set of agreements.
27	South Africa (SA)	13	254	13	254	Table 6.2: Africa's progress towards the Aichi targets. See Target 9 - South Africa (SA) is mentioned twice	This has been done.
28	Elise Belle (EB)	13	254	17	255	Target 5: "improvements in reducing habitat loss can be noted" Target 6: "most African countries are focusing"; maybe say a bit more about the subsidized fleets and the regions affected. Target 11: You could also add that, in terms of coverage only, 22 African countries and territories have over 17% of their land covered by PAs (including the Reunion Island), and 4 have over 10% of their marine extent covered by PAs (including Mayotte, and noting that for South Africa (SA), this is mainly thanks to the very large Prince Edward Island MPA). Reference: UNEP-WCMC and IUCN (2017). Protected Planet. Cambridge, UK: UNEP-WCMC and IUCN.	These corrections have been made. No updated data from GEF available other than a 2015 business report

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						Available at: www.protectedplanet.net . You could also mention Indigenous and Community Conserved Areas (ICCAs) as a mean to achieve the target. See http://www.iccaregistry.org/ . Target 16: "and for at least 9 COMIFAC" Target 18: "Endangered or Extinct" Target 20: Old GEF data from 2013, please update.	
29	Thomas Brooks (TB)	15	254	15	254	For row on Aichi Target 11, add text after "The unavailability of data makes it difficult to identify and develop protected areas because many countries cannot afford to undertake comprehensive and detailed research (Abdulla et al. 2009)" reading something like "although comprehensive data are now available for Africa and its subregions and countries on protected area coverage of key biodiversity areas" (see https://www.nature.com/articles/sdata20167).	This has been done
30	Thomas Brooks (TB)	16	254	16	254	For row on Aichi Target 12, add text after "There is a challenge of limited information to assess progress of Africa towards the target" reading something like "although comprehensive data on extinction risk are now available for Africa and its subregions and countries through the IUCN Red List" (see	This text has been added in line with the reviewer's suggestion

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						https://www.nature.com/articles/sdata20167).	
31	Tim Hirsch (TH)	17	254 (in table, Target 19)	17	254 (in table, Target 19)	<p>This is a superficial and incomplete interpretation of the indicator for Target 19 in terms of its message for Africa. It is true that approximately half of the records relating to African species occurrences are published from institutions outside the region, but this in itself represents a very significant data mobilization effort on the part of African institutions. To date, the mobilization in terms of volume of data has been dominated by South Africa (SA), but increasingly other countries such as Benin and Madagascar have increased data publication by orders of magnitude through engagement with GBIF. This effort can be expected to widen to other countries in the next two years as more datasets are published from sub-Saharan African countries through the Biodiversity Information for Development (BID) programme (see www.gbif.org/bid). Of course it is true that major gaps remain in the data available for biodiversity in Africa, but the current summary does a disservice to the efforts being made to address them. GBIF Secretariat would be very pleased to provide narrative text and</p>	Pertinent aspects of this feedback have been integrated into the text to make the interpretation more complete and to better reflect the African achievement

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						additional graphs to enable a more nuanced treatment of this indicator in the final draft of the Africa assessment, as well as for the other regional assessments.	
32	Elise Belle (EB)	18	260	18	260	Define BES acronym here as it is the first time it is used.	Check with EMMA AND JO as to whether we should be using this and if all acronyms need to be defined on first use in every chapter or just the first time.
33	Thomas Brooks (TB)	18	270	18	272	Aichi Targets 5-13, and 15, seem to be missing from Fig 6.2. Add in the appropriate places?	We have a new figure now that will include all Aichi targets
34	Elise Belle (EB)	19	282	19	282	"continental scale is Agenda 2063"	This has been corrected
35	CSIR BES	19	285	19	287	Lake Chad?	Lake Chad Basin has been added
36	CSIR BES	19	300	20		This list can be longer. We may need to set a year as starting point I did not read the content of this table	We have included more examples from different regions
37	Elise Belle (EB)	19	302	20	303	Delete first column of table. First line is 'Global'. Provide more information on the AU Framework on Environment "Protection of the transboundary terrestrial"	These changes have been made
38	Ignela Sahondra Randriant sizafy (ISR)	19	302	20	303	Table 6.3: Africa's regional and sub-regional agreements. -1 - When the table hold on several pages, make the header line visible for each page, in order to facilitate reading	TSU will format

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
39	Voahangy Raharimalala (VR)	20	302	20	303	I suggest to to add the Indian Ocean Commission (Island Biodiversity)	IOC included
40	Elise Belle (EB)	21	304	21	304	Box 6.1: Complete BirdLife International reference. "The Volta Basin Authority" The objective of the GGWSSI has evolved and goes far beyond just reforestation. See http://www.greatgreenwallinitiative.org . Box 6.3: "and agreements are also important"	This has been amended to provide a more accurate description of GGWSSI with references and a replacement ref for the Volta Basin. The Birdlife reference has been removed.
41	The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	21	306	21	308	This formulation is too casual, implying that NBSAPs have a formal status in relation to UNFCCC and UNCCD. It would be better to say that they serve, alongside NAPs and NAPAs (and INDCs etc.) to align policies to achieve desirable outcomes for BD, CC and desertification within the broader context of sustainable development.	This has been done
42	CSIR BES	21	Box 6.1			Make sure Box content corresponds to the Box heading I did not read everything There is a map of the 64 transboundary water systems. Pls let me know if you need it. I shall look for it.	Checked the boxes and added heading captions. Transboundary river system for added
43	CSIR BES	21	Box 6.3			Chapter 1 should use this box 'Box 6.3 The SADC Plant Genetic Resource Centre 'and build on it for a section on genetic resources	This has been discussed with chapter 1 who felt it is more appropriate to keep it where it is in ch6.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
44	CSIR BES	22	308	22	312	Please count and let us avoid 'about'	This has been checked and removed about
45	The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	22	310	22	311	NBSAPs "under revision, in revised or completed forms". This is not the best categorization, although I am aware that we (SCBD) are using these. The most suitable categories would be: 1. NBSAP pre-dating 2010 with no information on revision/updating 2. NBSAP under preparation or revision (i.e. taking into account guidance from 2010, whether or not an earlier NBSAP exists) 3. post-2010 NBSAP completed (and adopted as a policy instrument) 4. No information.	Using the CBD report we have updated the text accordingly up to July 2017
46	The Biodiversity Indicators Partnership (BIP)	22	312	22	314	The statement is not accurate as it stands: "By the end of 2015, 28 African countries had submitted to the CBD their NBSAPs prepared or revised in light of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity, with most containing national targets for the period 2010-2020." For information: By May 2017, 16 more African countries had submitted their revised NBSAPs to the CBD Secretariat. Mauritius, Sierra Leone are expected to submit their revised NBSAPs in early July 2017. 8 African countries are still revising their NBSAPs (Angola, Central African Republic, Gabon, Kenya, Lesotho, Libya, South Sudan and Tunisia). I would recommend not to over-emphasize the	This has been updated with the latest numbers relating to completion

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						date of completion as many different factors can result in such a process taking longer than envisaged. Key is the process leading to the NBSAP to be participatory and aligned with other plans and programmes and policies and for it to have political status.	
47	CSIR BES	22	323	22	324	It is necessary to cover UNCCD NAP and land degradation neutrality and UNFCCC NAP and INDC and the 2oC commitment in the same way you covered CBD. NB: when referring to the UNFCCC objective, it is important to highlight/include the sentence where reference is made to ecosystem. That is part of the elements calling for synergy in the implementation of the Rio Conventions: "The ultimate objective of this Convention and any related legal instruments that the Conference of the Parties may adopt is to achieve, in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Convention, stabilization of greenhouse gas concentrations in the atmosphere at a level that would prevent dangerous anthropogenic interference with the climate system. Such a level should be achieved within a time-frame sufficient to allow ecosystems to adapt naturally to climate change, to ensure that food production is not threatened and to	This has been added

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						enable economic development to proceed in a sustainable manner."	
48	Elise Belle (EB)	22	326	22	326	"can also help to integrate across geographical scales"	Wording has been changed to can also help to integrate across scales from the local to the international
49	CSIR BES	22	327	22	329	Again, not sure we pointed this out clearly in the previous chapters.	Removed "assessed in earlier sections"
50	CSIR BES	22	327	22	329	I am not sure we can see that clearly. We could have pointed out this in the intro to the chapter and provide clear references to sections in the previous chapters	Addressed through restructuring
51	CSIR BES	22	342	22	345	Sentence is too long. Please break	Sentence broken into 3
52	CSIR BES	22	348	22	350	Good to start with what policentric governance is. However, you should use a better definition and apply to Africa; say why this is suitable for Africa. See heading "Polycentric governance for Africa"	Dealt with in restructuring and addition of relevant references
53	Elise Belle (EB)	23	357	23	357	"We reference"	this has been changed
54	Elise Belle (EB)	24	420	24	420	Box 6.4: "water resources needs to take place"; "overarching national strategy."; "more focused on"; "growing that the less formal" Under title 6.3.2: "uncertainty in ecological systems and in the context of climate change"	This box has been replaced with marine area management in Guinea
55	Elise Belle (EB)	25	431	25	431	All figures are now referenced in the text	New figure will be referenced in text

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
56	CSIR BES	26	442	26	449	If this is what chapter 5 found, it will be good to replace Deliverable 3c with Chapter 5 and read: 'The important role that scenarios play in the decision-making process was highlighted in chapter 5'. The following text could be: 'As indicated in Chapter 5, most regional scenarios developed for Africa are 'exploratory scenarios'. {Please add concrete examples}. No [if true] [regional] scenario exercises that explicitly deal with testing policies- either through a target-seeking, policy-screening or retrospective policy evaluation process. This is a gap that needs to be addressed. [also say something about the other types]' NB: this text is better for chapter 5	Reference to chapter 5 has been included and it was decided that due to the explicit link to policy that this figure will remain in chapter 6. The types of scenarios have been clarified
57	CSIR BES	26	443	26	443	This sentence should be part of the caption	new figure will have correct caption
58	CSIR BES	27	455	27	455	Should we say: 'regional and global development goals'?	Section has been changed and this no longer fits
59	CSIR BES	27	459	27	460	See above my comment on this. We need to include UNCCD and UNFCCC targets	UNCCD does not have targets under the Convention itself, only SDG 15.3 on Land Degradation Neutrality. However, in the Paris agreement on climate change the UNFCCC target is considered.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
60	CSIR BES	27	459	27	460	Thus this section 6.3.3. should have the following subsections: 1. Linkage between the AU Agenda 2063 aspirations, the SDGs and the Aichi Biodiversity Targets. 2. Responses and actions that can be taken to increase the likelihood of reaching these targets under each of the 5 scenario archetypes (a). PR, (b). MF (c). etc. 3. Specific policy instruments associated with the scenario archetypes (a).PR, (b). MF (c). etc.	Explicit references made to chapter 5 where appropriate. Reference to policy instrument made in new table
61	CSIR BES	27	460	27	463	The table with linkages between Ag 2063, SDG and AT could be presented here with comments/explanations under the table. See Ag 2063 and SDG at http://www.un.org/en/africa/osaa/pdf/events/20160420/linkagesagenda2063sdg.pdf	Table has been reformulated
62	CSIR BES	27	467	27	501	Need to agree with chapter 5 what term to use. Good to stick to the terms to avoid confusion or indicate , not in the heading but in the text, the equivalent terms	Aligned with Chapter 5
63	Elise Belle (EB)	27	469	27	469	Complete brackets: '(e.g.)'	Completed with examples
64	CSIR BES	27	488	27	490	Not too clear. The main point here is to have in chapter 5 a detailed description of each archetype, what it implies/requires to be defined or considered as a given archetype. The next step in chapter 5 was to see how	Archetype discussion moved to chapter 5 and this chapter focuses on the policy responses to the findings from chapter 5.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						the scenario developed for/in Africa were classified under each archetype with some of the specific features for Africa. It could be useful/efficient if chapters 5 and 6 could work together on these tasks .	
65	Elise Belle (EB)	28	495	28	295	"promoting the sustainable exploitation"	The scenario refers to exploitation that is not sustainable
66	CSIR BES	28	506	28	509	Why is this a necessary condition or consequence in a MF scenario?	This is outlined in more detail in chapter 5
67	CSIR BES	28	508	28	509	Should we consider this even when we know that Africa and most countries in Africa have strategies and policies to address climate change?	This is outlined in more detail in chapter 5
68	CSIR BES	28	520	28	522	It looks like policy reform is an answer to the weaknesses of MF scenario and other scenarios	Policy reform is a scenario and so cannot be a response to the other scenarios. However, a change in policies is discussed under each of the scenario archetypes
69	CSIR BES	28	526	28	528	Why do we consider this when we know that at the regional level, population will continue to grow fast? AT the national level, there will certainly be some differences with some countries having fast growing population and (to be checked) others slow growth. The full logic behind the discussion is not clear	The use of scenarios is to think about plausible futures, not based on modelling trends- the basis of the scenarios are discussed in chapter 5.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
70	CSIR BES	28	545	28	548	as well as subregional organizations such as COMIFAC etc. and international organizations such as CGIAR centres	References to these organisations have been included
71	Elise Belle (EB)	29	555	29	555	Reference of WWF report?	Included
72	Elise Belle (EB)	30	590	42	591	Table not cited in the text. Need to add a title. Why is the table almost empty? I think it could be deleted from the report. If kept, delete column after scenarios, fill column on case studies (and all other empty cells) and check all abbreviations and the punctuation throughout the table. You could add PARCC (Protected Areas Resilient to Climate Change) as a case study under '10. Vulnerable ecosystems and climate change': http://parcc.protectedplanet.net .	Table has been reformulated
73	Ignela Sahondra Randriant sizafy (ISR)	30	590	42	591	Table 6.4: - 1 - Add a title's table. - 2 - When the table hold on several pages, make the header line visible for each page, in order to facilitate reading	TSU will format
74	CSIR BES	43	592	43	608	Are these 2 paragraphs the introduction in the next section?	They are not. They refer directly to legal and regulatory instruments as indicated in the section heading. No action needed
75	Elise Belle (EB)	43	593	43	593	There is no "correct" policy pathway that is better than other' is a strong	This has been changed

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						statement. Perhaps replace with 'there is no ideal policy pathway'.	
76	CSIR BES	43	609	44	682	Provide more info in the heading e.g. policy instrument for what? I thought we were going to consider at this stage 'different policy ideas and possible options for decision makers at the regional and subregional level in response to the scenarios', and 'at different hierarchical spatial and temporal scales, from the international level to local and indigenous communities and households' bearing in mind that the possible options should be for 'for policy mixes and alignments in polycentric governance systems' and should 'include different policy instruments, market tools, conservation and management practices and international and regional agreement.' Thus this section should be linked to the scenario archetypes. What I see here is just a general discussion of policy instruments.	This will be addressed in the restructuring of the chapter as instruments won't be related directly to scenario archetypes
77	Marie Bonnin (MB)	43		43		there is little legal references to new law or strategy in this chapter. It could be add. A lot of states have adopted new laws on protected areas and there is no references to these texts.	References are being added

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
78	Ignela Sahondra Randriant sizafy (ISR)	44	642	44	643	This is a particular risk under business as usual and XX scenarios. - 1 - Replace XX by his real value.	This text has been removed in the revised version
79	Elise Belle (EB)	44	643	44	643	Fill in 'and XX scenarios'	This text has been removed in the revised version
80	Elise Belle (EB)	45	683	45	683	"profitable to do so in the short term."	This has been amended
81	Elise Belle (EB)	46	712	46	712	"to avoid negatively affecting biodiversity"	this has been done
82	Elise Belle (EB)	47	751	47	752	"welfare of the populations. Increased [...] improve governance."	this has been done
83	Elise Belle (EB)	48	796	48	796	"through education, politics, information"	this has been done
84	Elise Belle (EB)	49	838	55	839	Table not cited in the text. Last column still needs to be completed. Voluntary payments: "These are voluntary payments"; "is Ethiopian Airlines annual investment in a significant" Elimination of perverse incentives: "the richest segment of the population whereas the poor solely depend on biomass" Conservation easements: "cultivation, and other actions which affect biodiversity." Resource use fees: "globally. Individuals are granted the right to hunt"; "been implemented by many"	These changes have been done

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>Tradable permits: There is some repetition between this section and the previous one on Resource use fees. Consider merging the two.</p> <p>Offsetting schemes: "such objectives is the AfDB Operational"; "placed to play and active role"; "Types of biodiversity offsets"; "and conservation, the challenge is in key"; "as well as equitable"; "In Madagascar, Rio Tinto has been investing in biodiversity offsets at several forest sites covering"</p> <p>Trade and foreign investments: Delete last bracket</p>	
85	Ignela Sahondra Randriant sizafy (ISR)	49	838	55	839	Table 6.5: Examples of economic incentives and financial instruments 838 and their application in Africa. - 1 - When the table hold on several pages, make the header line visible for each page, in order to facilitate reading	TSU to format
86	South Africa (SA)	50		50		In table 6.5 under "Elimination of perverse incentives" in 2nd column, the sentence "impact monitoring is hardly started" does not read right.	This has been rephrased
87	Thomas Brooks (TB)	54	838	54	838	A useful additional citation for the first row on this page could be Temple et al. (2012) Forecasting the path towards a net positive impact on biodiversity for Rio Tinto QMM (https://portals.iucn.org/library/node/10206)	Having assessed the reference, it is not suitable for the context

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
88	Elise Belle (EB)	56	840	56	840	Box 6.12 not referenced in the text. Of the 'total land' acquired? "are leading to the disappearance"; "per hectare of a given land"; "breakdown of traditional land use utilization"; "Ethiopia, 90,000 households were relocated" Second paragraph, first sentence: end of sentence missing. "species that are found in the forest"; "Tanzania has resulted in water pollution"; "to assist small-holders"; "(EPA, 2010) should be encouraged"; "the Roundtable on Sustainable Palm [...] and Roundtable on Sustainable Soy"	box is now referenced in the text and has been thoroughly edited
89	Elise Belle (EB)	57	872	57	872	"Conflicts can arise due to [...] power and authority. This can be opposed by some groups"	we have checked the text and it reads suitably
90	Elise Belle (EB)	58	906	58	906	Name: 't Afar'?	corrected
91	Elise Belle (EB)	59	925	59	925	Reference not in reference list.	added to reference list
92	Elise Belle (EB)	60	986	60	987	Delete 'For example, 'Fadys' [...] Malagasy culture' and only leave "natural resource use (see the example of Madagascar in Box 6.13) to avoid repetition of the box.	Deleted accordingly
93	Rael Loon (RL)	61	1007			"Some' countries have embedded biodiversity conservation..."	Included

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
94	Rael Loon (RL)	61	1010			Redford et al (2015) Mainstreaming biodiversity conservation for the 21st Century.	Added reference
95	Elise Belle (EB)	61	1023	61	1023	"the SDGs, Aichi targets"	Amended
96	Rael Loon (RL)	61	1025		1032	cf: Poverty and Conservation Learning Group/ IIED	Included
97	Ignela Sahondra Randriant sizafy (ISR)	62	1034	62	1037	Figure 6.7: Integration of PRSPs of selected countries, scored from 0-3. Using a scale where 0 means that biodiversity is not reflected and 3 means its importance is strongly reflected (source: Roe 2010). UNEP-WCMC (2016), P.26. - 1 - Legend inside the figure is unreadable	This needs to be discussed with the graphic designer and the source file obtained from WCMC
98	Elise Belle (EB)	62	1038	62	1038	"the first time the costs"; "of the study, Malawi's Growth"	Edited
99	Elise Belle (EB)	63	1043	63	1044	"benefits biodiversity, but also other sectors because"	edited
100	Rael Loon (RL)	63	1067		1068	Another relevant reference here is "Driver et al (2011) National Biodiversity Assessment: An assessment of South Africa (SA)'s biodiversity and ecosystems. South Africa (SA)n National Biodiversity Institute and Department of Environmental Affairs, Pretoria.	Included
101	Rael Loon (RL)	63	1067		1068	As above priority actions can be grouped into three major categories: (1) Reducing loss and degradation of natural habitat in priority areas; (2) Protecting critical	This has been noted and integrated into the text

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						ecosystems and (3) Restoring and enhancing ecological infrastructure.	
102	Elise Belle (EB)	64	1074	64	1074	"Conference on the Environment (AMCEN) launched the"	the' included
103	Elise Belle (EB)	65	1114	65	1114	"It is indeed important to identify key"	Corrected
104	Rael Loon (RL)	65	1124			King, N., Biggs, H., & Loon, R. (2007) Seeking common ground: How natural and social scientists might jointly create an overlapping worldview for sustainable livelihoods: A South Africa (SA)n perspective. Conservation & Society V5(1): 88-114	included
105	Elise Belle (EB)	66	1135	66	1135	Box 6.20: You could condense the box by summarising the first two paragraphs and deleting entirely the last paragraph which is not very relevant. "community members, direct almost all parts"; "they send rangeland scouts" "men of the village, are sent to different"; "Tafere, 2004). The 'Dagu' is an effective and reputable"; "discuss what to do on the basis of"	edited
106	Elise Belle (EB)	67	1154	67	1154	"Financial assessments are used to determine"	edited
107	Elise Belle (EB)	68	1199	68	1199	Figure title is missing. A short explanation would be good too.	New figure being created
108	Ignela Sahondra Randriant	68	1199	68	1199	Figure 6.9: - 1 - Add title for this figure; not referenced in text.	New figure being created

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
	sizafy (ISR)						
109	Elise Belle (EB)	69	1202	69	1203	"both locally relevant and scientifically accurate"	edited
110	Elise Belle (EB)	70	1251	70	1251	"Policy making is increasingly reliant on"	edited
111	Tim Hirsch (TH)	70	1251	70	1256	When discussing protocols on data-sharing, it is important to mention the voluntary guidance to improve the accessibility of biodiversity-related data and information appended to CBD decision CBD/COP/DEC/XIII/31. This includes key steps including digitization of collections, use of common standards, enhancing capacity in biodiversity informatics, and collaboration through networks such as GBIF, as a means of increasing availability of data and filling knowledge gaps	Added in text
112	Elise Belle (EB)	71	1295		1295	"development patterns, a careful policy making"	edited
113	George Atisa (GA)	72	1331	1336		Policy Monitoring and Evaluation - Not much has been said about evaluation here and would like to share some details/contribution. Current and future conservation programs need an inbuilt evaluation mechanism. These would involve evaluation at the start and in the middle of implementing a program through what is known as process evaluation. Process evaluation helps to	More references, including the recommended one have been added in relation to mainstreaming BES

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>identify inputs and specify activities required to implement the program successfully. It also involves goals identification as well as goal change. Goals have to be expressed in clear and concise language. Another evaluation design is - outcome evaluation. This is where one gets to know if the approaches undertaken by the program are working, if there is need to build on the current approaches or make changes to the way implementation is done. When making an evaluation, it is critical to consider context. This involves getting adequate details about the community, the organization and resources beforehand. These details that include history of the issue at hand, how the entire program is viewed by the community and a documentation of the relationships between individual entities, groups and politics. citation 1. Newcomer K.E., Hatry H.P., Wholey J.S. (2015). Handbook of Practical Program Evaluation. 4th edition. Jossey Bass.</p>	
114	Elise Belle (EB)	72	1334		1334	"This could for instance be achieved"	edited
115	Rael Loon (RL)	72	1342		1354	incomplete	This will be drafted beforehand then agreed upon at the TAM in plenary

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
116	Ignela Sahondra Randriant sizafy (ISR)	72	1343	72	1354	A global heritage with local benefits / Conserving Africa's unique biodiversity / Ensuring and transferring the benefits to her people / Use of indigenous knowledge to conserve biodiversity and ecosystem services / Leapfrogging BES policies and incentive mechanisms / Lessons learnt from a global assessment of incentive mechanisms / Adaptation and potential for use in the African context / Replicating the best practices and lessons learnt / The extent of impact of BES in securing Africa's future / Matching ecosystem service potential and Africa's needs / Potential impact of policy tools on the SDGs / Building partnerships to coordinate efforts / - 1 - What are these sentences ?	These are notes and will be integrated into the final conclusion paragraphs as appropriate
117	Elise Belle (EB)	73	1372	84	1947	Many references are missing, including some cited in the text.	This will be checked and corrected as needed
118	Neil Burgess (NB)	6.2.2	page 19	line 287-289		I was a bit confused when reading here about transboundary protected areas. That seems to be in the wrong section to my view at least. This section should be about SADC, EAC, ECOWAS, COMIFAC and so on I would have thought	This section considers both transboundary and subregional groupings. This has been checked and reordered to give a more logical structure
119	Neil Burgess (NB)	6.3.1 Polycentric governance for Africa				This seems quite theoretical. Can be embellished with some African examples of where these things are in operation outside South Africa (SA) to give an idea	We have added additional examples from other areas to avoid bias towards South Africa (SA)n examples

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						of how it might apply in the context of East, Central, West or North Africa	
120	Neil Burgess (NB)	6.4.2 Economic and financial instruments	Box 6.5:			PFm and JFM I would have put under the community conservation section personally	This has been addressed
121	Neil Burgess (NB)	6.4.2 Economic and financial instruments				Nothing much in here on Water PES schemes. Or REDD+ pilot projects. Which I was expecting.	These have been added
122	Neil Burgess (NB)	6.4.4 Social and cultural instruments				The 2009 review by r Dilys Roe and colleagues is good. But there are also recent papers on CBFM and PFM in Tanzania (Blomley and Iddi, Jens Friis Lund, Martin Nielsen, Nicole Gross-Camp etc) and also in Namibia by Naidoo. And some syntheses of these by Maliasili and other groups	these have been added
123	Neil Burgess (NB)	6.4.5 Co-management and partnerships				See work by Lauren Persha on Tanzania Joint Forest Management	work has been added
124	Neil Burgess (NB)	Box 6.1				Same comment as above as am not sure that transboundary management systems are in the right place here	See response above. No further action needed
125	CSIR BES	figure 6.4				I like this figure. I think we [also] need in Chapter 5 because it shows well the link of scenarios to human well-being.	This has been addressed in the SPM ch5/6 diagram and will be discussed with the designer to

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						However, I think it is important to add Aichi Targets 1 to 4 (underlying causes of biodiversity loss to which we need to add population growth, conflicts, industrialisation etc.) and targets 8 (pollution) and 9 (IAS), which are cross-cutting and can fit under Nature protection, Living well and Sustainable use. Also to be added, the targets under Aichi Goal E targets 17 to 20 relating to enabling environment. It will also be great if the row of Policy goals we can add land degradation neutrality under UNCCD and 2oC commitment under UNFCCC; and goals from AU Agenda 2063	see if a modified version can be inserted into ch6.
126	CSIR BES	figure 6.5				Please reference this figure in text	it has been referenced
127	CSIR BES	figure 6.5				This figure should be moved to chapter 5. Very useful there to present the different types of scenarios. I do not think they were so well presented in chapter 5. So this figure will fill the gaps. In chapter 5, they may add some concrete examples from Africa if available. Please can you draw their attention?	Having discussed with Chapter 5, it has been agreed that we will keep this figure as it's most relevant to policy.
128	Neil Burgess (NB)	Figure 6.5: Roles played by different				Is this best placed in this chapter or in Chapter 5?	it has been agreed with chapter 5 that this is best placed in this chapter

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
		types of scenarios					
129	Neil Burgess (NB)	Figure 6.9:				Needs a legend and source	This has been noted above. No additional action taken in response here
130	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	6.1 Introduction – check how much Chapter 1 covers these terms.	This will be done at the end once all chapters are completed to avoid confusion
131	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	Do you need to describe the scenarios, or could you just cross refer back to Chapter 5? Box 6.7 doesn't pull over properly at present.	This section has been rewritten
132	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	Pages 13-15 – as always, this table is fascinating. just wondering, practically – how could it be incorporated graphically within page limits (page limits in terms of margins)	We will leave the table as is and need to discuss this with those who are doing the formatting. No immediate action
133	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	Section 6.2.2 – How can we bring this figure in? If you put it higher up in the chapter, could it also serve as a bridge from Chapter 5? Then, if it's higher up in the Chapter, could it also help structure the rest of the chapter – e.g. subsections refer back to it where relevant?	Figures have been merged and moved around a lot so this has been addressed in that process
134	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	Section 6.6 – Conclusion: Can you link back to the infographic, and reiterate the key finding here?	This section has been moved earlier and we now reiterate the key points as suggested by the reviewer
135	Edson Gandiwa (EG)	General	General	General	General	General, attend to boxes and also figures, some don't have captions. Some	This is being addressed in response to comments from

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						sections need attention for completeness, e.g., references.	other reviewers and we will of course do a final check
136	Voahangy Raharimalala (VR)	General	General	General	General	I suggest to diversify examples for more countries	additional national examples have been added to improve the range of countries
137	Neil Burgess (NB)	p.57	line 856-876			Quite old references. There are a lot of papers post 2010 that go into CBNRM (forests and wildlife) in detail in Tanzania, Kenya and Namibia at least	New recent references have been added: 1. Pailler et al (2015) PLoS ONE . 2. Ripple et al (2016) Royal Society – Open Science, 3. Snively, S. W. (2012). Probate & Property. 4. And new text added from 854 - 857.
138	Neil Burgess (NB)	p.69	1219			See paper by Finn Danielsen in Bioscience that has community monitoring synthesis for miombo woodlands that includes Tanzania. https://academic.oup.com/bioscience/article/64/3/236/224874/A-Multicountry-Assessment-of-Tropical-Resource	This has been reviewed and added
139	Neil Burgess (NB)	p3-5				At the same time as the above point being really positive - there are some well-known governance challenges in many African countries around wildlife trade, control over land and other resources and the general application of existing law. This is of course very sensitive - but it would seem important to say something	This has been addressed with extra text and references

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
140	Neil Burgess (NB)	p3-5				These are all fair enough but I would have said that Africa has an almost unique position globally in terms of biodiversity governance systems that work together with communities. Eastern and Southern Africa have the best developed community wildlife and forestry systems on earth in my view.	This has been addressed with extra text and references
141	CSIR BES	Table 6.4				What are you planning to have in this column of case studies?	Table has been reformulated
142	Neil Burgess (NB)	Table 6.4:				Quite incomplete and long. Drop?	Table has been reformulated
143	Neil Burgess (NB)	Table 6.5:				For water PES schemes see paper by Lopa et al in Oryx that is about Tanzania but has decent review. There are also reviews on implementation of REDD+ pilot projects. For example by Blomley in Tanzania.	These have been added
144	Elise Belle (EB)		82		82	"hosts 47 natural and mixed World Heritage sites and over". Exclusively cultural sites are not relevant to this report.	cultural sites are relevant due to inclusion of ILK
145	Elise Belle (EB)		85		85	"Strategies and Action Plans"	edited
146	Elise Belle (EB)		87		87	"regular updates of national biodiversity"	edited
147	Elise Belle (EB)		199		199	"This has been partly due to"	edited
148	Elise Belle (EB)		212		212	Systematic or 'integrated' governance?	edited to include systems based

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
149	Susan Ringrose (SR)		254			In comparing genetic diversity between Africa and other parts of the world - best to refer to specific regions - e.g. SE Asia	This aspect is no longer in there as we have edited the document and restructured it significantly
150	Elise Belle (EB)		264		264	"contribute to human well-being"	Examined and prefer to keep as is
151	Elise Belle (EB)		287		287	"ecosystems such as lakes, rivers and" (wildlife reserves are not ecosystems)	Change made, word deleted.
152	Susan Ringrose (SR)		299			Comment needed on KAZA's success (or otherwise) in the Okavango-Zambezi area. Maybe best not just to concentrate on success stories - there are many problems with a number of regional groupings which are being glossed over here.	These are just existing tranfrontier projects and not an assessment of their successes
153	Elise Belle (EB)		305		305	"6.2.3 National Biodiversity Strategies and Action Plans (NBSAPs)"	corrected
154	Elise Belle (EB)		306		306	"Strategies and Action Plans"	corrected
155	Susan Ringrose (SR)		309			It's one thing to have 'Action Plans' and totally another to effect enforcement/implementation. There are numerous examples where Governments are deluged in environmental (BES) red tape which (however positive and important) is close to impossible to implement	this has been included earlier in the document
156	Elise Belle (EB)		362		362	"non-hierarchical and flexible in their organisation."	corrected

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
157	Susan Ringrose (SR)		450			Wouldn't the relative levels of corruption influence how/whether these policy issues were in fact played out (at a practical level? Check UN Corruption Index. Same comment would apply to Table 6.2	corruption is important, but it would detract from the overall argument to bring it up here- especially without references
158	Elise Belle (EB)		486		486	Is slow population growth a realistic scenario for Africa?	The role of the scenarios is to present alternative futures which may or may not be likely in the future. They help to provide a range of different archetypes. As such no action taken on this one.
159	Elise Belle (EB)		494		495	"climate variability and change"	corrected
160	Elise Belle (EB)		525		527	Delete ' - link to case study on IPBES in Africa?' or complete	corrected
161	Elise Belle (EB)		527		527	Again, perhaps say a few words about how likely slow population growth is in Africa.	As above, this is left as it is because it is in-built in the scenarios which are used in ch 5.
162	Elise Belle (EB)		542		542	"droughts or conflicts"	corrected
163	Elise Belle (EB)		545		546	"strengthen sustainable development [...] (e.g. NEPAD/AU)"	words added
164	Elise Belle (EB)		601		601	"legislation, land ownership"	word added
165	Elise Belle (EB)		611		612	"but is also important at the national and local level."	done
166	Elise Belle (EB)		618		618	"establish realistic protection objectives"	done

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
167	Elise Belle (EB)		623		623	"compatible with the sustainable exploitation of natural resources and compliance"	corrected
168	Elise Belle (EB)		626		626	"and ecosystem services protection:"	corrected
169	Elise Belle (EB)		630		630	"damaging to threatened"	this has been done
170	Elise Belle (EB)		649		649	What do you define as bio-capacity?	This has been added
171	Elise Belle (EB)		666		666	"produce and consume, and that the costs are"	This sentence is not there any more
172	Elise Belle (EB)		671		671	"manage, use and trade it"	word added
173	Elise Belle (EB)		702		702	Box 6.7: "Eritrea, energy taxes and"	Examined and prefer to keep as is
174	Elise Belle (EB)		711		711	Box 6.8 not referenced in text; "resources are highly significant"; "key markets and political instability"; "Some of the charges are related"	Examined and prefer to keep as is
175	Elise Belle (EB)		728		728	"indirect incentives that include"	corrected
176	Elise Belle (EB)		732		732	Box 6.10 not referenced in text; "and Kenya) engage"; "protected area buffer zones"	change made, word added
177	Elise Belle (EB)		745		745	"them, either as a standalone activity or relative to"	edits done
178	Elise Belle (EB)		746		746	Box 6.11 not referenced in text. Define what these systems are. "for biodiversity conservation"; (e.g., the World Bank [...] FAO); "needs of Africa"	This has been corrected

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
179	Elise Belle (EB)		756		756	Which part of the country?	Quotas licences and permits are applied nationally so this comment applies nationally. No action taken.
180	Elise Belle (EB)		761		761	"and which limit the quantities"	examine and prefer to keep as is
181	Elise Belle (EB)		765		765	"Multinational companies."	done
182	Elise Belle (EB)		781		781	"ecosystem services, while at the same time providing employment."	done
183	Elise Belle (EB)		784		787	Perhaps explain a bit more why these initiatives have failed.	This is explained in the next paragraph and so no need for an addition
184	Elise Belle (EB)		816		816	"equitably from biodiversity conservation, e.g., the collection of"	This sentence has been removed in the restructuring
185	Elise Belle (EB)		888		888	Say more about that (Hirola in Kenya)	This has been added
186	Elise Belle (EB)		914		914	"and by reinforcing elite capture"	More information on elite capture has been added
187	Elise Belle (EB)		915		915	"Indeed, the involvement of local communities"	change made, word fixed
188	Elise Belle (EB)		918		918	Delete 'However they can be susceptible to elite capture' as this is repeated later on.	corrected
189	Elise Belle (EB)		950		950	Institutional levels?	added
190	Elise Belle (EB)		966		967	Say more about what happened there.	The text is now enriched further with more explanations of why the PPP case example work well and ILK inputs have been made.

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
191	Elise Belle (EB)		992		992	Box 6.13: "can make certain behaviours 'taboo' or forbidden, and are a"; "However, fadys can also threaten"; "should therefore be avoided. There can be a danger"; all species names should be in italics	Corrections made
192	Elise Belle (EB)		993		996	In which country/ies?	Informal institutions are widespread across Africa and indeed the world, so too many to list here. No action taken.
193	Elise Belle (EB)		1030		1030	"into their poverty reduction strategies"	corrected
194	Elise Belle (EB)		1047		1047	Box 6.15: "in the DSCE to mainstream" What are the key components of PSFE?	This has been done
195	Elise Belle (EB)		1060		1060	You could give some examples.	there is an example in the box that follows
196	Elise Belle (EB)		1067		1067	Box 6.16 not referenced in text.	Box numbers have all changed and all are now referenced in the text
197	Elise Belle (EB)		1073		1073	"for sustainable resource management"	corrected
198	Elise Belle (EB)		1082		1082	Box 6.17 not referenced in text. "ecological needs for the mining companies"	Box numbers have all changed and all are now referenced in the text
199	Elise Belle (EB)		1084		1084	Box 6.18 not referenced in text. "and fisheries, village leaders" "partnered with a marine conservation NGO (Blue Ventures) to develop"	Box numbers have all changed and all are now referenced in the text
200	Elise Belle (EB)		1090		1090	Box 6.19 not referenced in text. "Botswana has detailed accounts for 2010-11 and 2011-12 of the supply and"	Box numbers have all changed and all are now referenced in the text

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						"natural resources that can contribute to"	
201	Elise Belle (EB)		1130		1131	"technical capacity is also important"	corrected
202	Elise Belle (EB)		1138		1138	What are 'these'? Atlases? Studies? "done at the local, national, sub-regional and regional levels."	Examples have been added
203	Elise Belle (EB)		1140		1140	Say more about Biota Africa	has been defined further
204	Elise Belle (EB)		1142		1145	Say more about the tools. Give examples.	Additional text has been added
205	Elise Belle (EB)		1149		1149	Which 'new financing mechanisms'?	new financial examples have been added
206	Elise Belle (EB)		1151		1151	"governance of BES requires"	corrected
207	Elise Belle (EB)		1157		1157	"(BIOFIN), a GEF funded project to assess their"	corrected
208	Elise Belle (EB)		1166		1167	"mobilisation focal point responsible for"	corrected
209	Elise Belle (EB)		1174		1174	"For instance, local knowledge [...] in determining land use, land use change, and in the classification of land use types"	corrected
210	Elise Belle (EB)		1176		1176	"more effective than scientific"	corrected
211	Elise Belle (EB)		1178		1180	"knowledge systems, e.g. [...] 2010), and valuation of [...] 2015). The discrepancies can be the result of both differences in the"	corrected
212	Elise Belle (EB)		1186		1186	I would put 'hybridization' in inverted comas.	corrected

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
213	Elise Belle (EB)		1204		1206	"However, some examples of inclusive or integrated knowledge systems include the use of cyber-trackers for"	corrected
214	Susan Ringrose (SR)		1206			Kalahari bushmen	corrected
215	Elise Belle (EB)		1210		1212	"2011); the Nganyi project in Kenya [...]; and the production of" If possible provide another reference for the Nganyi project.	all boxes are now referred to in the text
216	Elise Belle (EB)		1214		1214	"In Nigeria, Ayeni et al. (2016) showed"	corrected
217	Elise Belle (EB)		1219		1220	"In Tanzania, Gaspare et al. (2015) compared TEK and CSK [...] regarding the type of grouper species utilized, and when"	corrected
218	Elise Belle (EB)		1226		1232	Delete '(p100) "Our results indicate [...] of their limitations."' or synthesize.	this has been done
219	Elise Belle (EB)		1233		1233	"In Guinea, Le Fur et al. (2011) showed that LEK"	corrected
220	Elise Belle (EB)		1245		1245	"These studies link back to the capacity"	corrected
221	Elise Belle (EB)		1258		1259	"on data sharing, the tools developed under the CBD are used to assist"	corrected
222	Elise Belle (EB)		1269		1269	"five steps in policy making"	corrected
223	Elise Belle (EB)		1275		1275	Say more about the DPSIR framework.	Added more references and explanations on the concept and its application
224	Elise Belle (EB)		1283		1283	"evolving frameworks of ideas"	corrected

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
225	Elise Belle (EB)		1285		1285	"an increasingly important role in"	corrected
226	Elise Belle (EB)		1287		1288	"These also complement decision support frameworks"	corrected
227	Elise Belle (EB)		1310		1310	Box 6.21 not referenced in text.	corrected
228	Elise Belle (EB)		1311		1311	"the Implementation and Effectiveness"	done, corrected
229	Elise Belle (EB)		1322		1323	"for implementation is done through"	corrected
230	Elise Belle (EB)		1327		1327	"African region with assigned roles"	corrected
231	Elise Belle (EB)		1328		1328	"From the Action Plan, Africa Flagship projects"	corrected
232	Elise Belle (EB)		1332		1332	"Tools have been developed to monitor"	corrected
233	Elise Belle (EB)		1343		1354	Notes only. Unfinished section.	We are currently writing the conclusion
234	Elise Belle (EB)		1356		1356	"The success of protection biodiversity and"	conclusion rewritten
235	Elise Belle (EB)		1363		1363	"financial level, countries must put in place"	conclusion rewritten
236	Susan Ringrose (SR)		429 onwards			Scenario explanations same as in Ch 5 - avoid duplication	We have rewritten to avoid duplication with ch5
237	Diane Douglas (DD)					Good ideas, but I've found many African countries where I have worked have excellent policies and laws in place to protect the environment and enhance human well-being; but due to complex and varied corruption at various levels of	reference to corruption has been included under policy implementation discussion

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						government it is difficult for these laws to be effective. Combating corruption is critical to the success of various programs.	
238	Neil Burgess (NB)					Overall this good in parts - but has quite a lot of emphasis on intergovernmental to national levels, and rather little on local governance and management systems. The local ones still hold sway over large amounts of Africa north of Zimbabwe.	We have added examples especially from north and west Africa
239	Ramsar Secretariat (RS)					The Ramsar Convention on Wetlands: We are also attaching a suggested figure with up to date information on Ramsar Sites in Africa [On a word document]	Noted above in our response and will add if appropriate
240	Susan Ringrose (SR)					Good chapter with considerable level of detail - but hard to read despite good use being made of tables etc. Good coverage of complex issues	We still need to do a final English edit but will consider readability when doing this