

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Cameron Colebatch	General					The documents are good summaries, but what are the implications of the documents? What are the authors seeking policy makers to do with them? Suggest that (at the least) a dot point summary of the 'Recommendations and policy options' be provided at the beginning of each chapter to make this more prominent. If appropriate, it may also be worth preparing a 'summary for policy makers' (SPM) for each document as well.	Thank you for the suggestion. An Executive Summary has been added to the chapter during the revision, and a separate SPM has been made.
Li Qingfeng	General					1, The Report in overall is too academia, too detailed in scientific exploration and descriptions. In consideration of the principal aim "to facilitate the implementation of the National ... and the "Inter-governmental" nature of the organization, the Report has to be more "publicly explicit", rather than "scientifically complicated". If the Report is to be read by the policy makers, and to draw attentions from the public, the content is to be simplified and the volume greatly reduced, one third is more than enough.	We have tried to make it more accessible. Still we have to make sure that we follow proper scientific language not to compromise the quality. This is particularly important for the methodology.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	General					In some tropical countries in Asia the area designated to sustainable forestry ("forest reserves") exceeds the area under protection. Thus, the implementation of sustainable forest management systems in natural forests by applying FSC standards is essential for effective biodiversity conservation. In reference to conservation of nature it is of particular importance that these forest reserves are at least partly located in lowland areas where otherwise land has been already converted at large extent. The current assessment does not elaborate on this issue. Maybe you could include it in your further work.	Thank you. The text has been revised, but taking into account the limitation of volume. All SFM should be used as a framework in which there are well developed criteria and indicators some of which are BES relevant.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB & Uta von Witsch	General					Other knowledge-forms such as indigenous and local knowledge are well included throughout the assessment. Maybe you could additionally include a specific sub-section (e.g. in chapter 1) on the current status and use of indigenous and lokal knowledge in the Asia Pacific region (e.g. to what extent does it contribute to the academic knowledge base?; perhaps include some case studies, if available).	Thank you. We have included literature produced by ILK holders and experts (including NTFPs and interactions of knowledge systems).
Stefan Hotes	General					The way the IPBES conceptual framework is referenced in the text should be more stringent, and the IPBES guide on Assessments as well as the other IPBES deliverables including guides should be integrated more clearly. In electronic versions of the assessment, hyperlinks to these resources could be included.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Thomas Brooks (IUCN)	General					Congratulations to the authors for all their hard work in producing this FOD.	Thank you
Uta von Witsch	General					Please provide a degree of confidence for the main findings throughout the assessment as laid down in the 'Guide on the production and integration of assessments from and across all scales (IPBES deliverable 2a)' (see IPBES/4/INF/9, p. 60, Figure 4.1).	Explanation of confidence terms is provided.
Uta von Witsch	General					A list of abbreviations and a glossary should be included for the whole assessment.	Thank you. This has been updated.
Uta von Witsch & Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	General					We highly appreciate the case studies provided and the regional examples chosen for the assessment. They loosen up the text, and make it more colorful and better comprehensible. Please ensure, though, that they are distributed evenly between all sub-regions throughout the assessment in order to better reflect the different sub-regions and their expertise. Some sub-regions (and/ or countries) seem a little under-represented at this stage. This especially holds true for the West Asian sub-region as well as some tropical countries with a particular high biodiversity such as the Philippines, Papua-New Guinea and countries in the subtropical and temperate zone of the Asia Pacific region like Iran and Mongolia.	We have attempted to ensure that the case studies we offer in Boxes are dispersed. But data gap is a major concern across the assessment.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Uta von Witsch & Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB & Stefan Hotes	General					Congratulations and thanks to all who contributed to this first draft version which can serve as a valuable baseline study. Aspects such as SDGs and the Aichi targets, which are of importance also for the global assessment, are explicitly addressed. We therefore believe that this reg. assessment will also be highly useful for the global assessment. Furthermore, the text is well balanced (not biased) and not policy prescriptive (indications are made in the comments below should this not be the case). These aspects are very much welcomed.	All chapter teams have tried to build on the global implications and links in their respective chapters where relevant.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	General					An executive summary at the beginning of the assessment as well as short abstracts/ introductions at the beginning of each chapter would be welcomed. This would, to our opinion, improve the readability of the assessment and also the harmonization between chapters (see also next comment on this aspect). The same applies to the conclusions (especially the key findings and the policy options) which - where already included in the assessment - are very helpful and highly appreciated. Furthermore, it would be welcomed if all main findings within the abovementioned sections could be linked explicitly to the different respective sections of the assessment which they are referring to.	An abstract is not provisioned in the scoping document of the assessment, only executive summary and key messages are to be included.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	General					It might be a good idea for the different chapter-teams to interact more closely. This could help to harmonize the chapters, to keep up the common thread, and to avoid redundancies and unnecessary repetitions.	Agreed.
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	General					All regional assessments should follow the same definitions and (e.g.) classifications of ecosystem services. These aspects are important for the comparability of the results, especially since they all provide input for the IPBES global assessment (see also next comment on this aspect). Please ensure this is the case by cross checking with the other reg. assessments. Furthermore, sections on classifications and terminology of biomes and ecosystems should make better use of the more stringent ones already compiled for applied purposes e.g. in the case of wetlands (Ramsar Convention).	Co-chairs and CLAs have tried to ensure this during the internal review of drafts of all chapters
Uta von Witsch & Stefan Hotes	General					Sections addressing general aspects that are of (the same) importance to all reg. assessments like e.g. "What is a value system" (section 2.2.1, p. 11, lines 425-436), "The concept of living in harmony with nature ..." (section 2.2.1.2, p. 11, lines 438-459) and "Factors affecting the change in value systems" (section 2.2.2.1, p. 13, line 557 to p. 15, line 628) - should be identical for all reg. assessments. This will ensure a common basis and is important for the comparability of the results. Please ensure this is the case by cross checking with the other reg. assessments. These general (and global) sections could furthermore be kept as short as necessary for their understanding within the reg. assessment. They seem a little over-emphasized at this stage. All in all, the assessment might focus more on the Asia-Pacific region.	Co-chairs and CLAs have tried to ensure this during the internal reviews, and also by incorporating into chapter 1 some introductory text which was standardised across all regional assessments.
Wang Changyong	General					Suggestion: discuss how to further collect data and information from most of Asia Pacific countries. For instance, increasing contributing authors, using questionnaire to collect key data (eg status and trend) at national level	Agreed to the first part (collaboration), difficult to engage new CLA or LA in the middle of the process and also send survey questionnaire.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 1	0				Defining Asia Pacific Region, does it follows UN systems or others? Require a clear reference and information. Mode of assessment as a means of analyzing Asia Pacific region should be described.	Thank you. We follow the scoping document of this assessment.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	0				This needs a fair bit of refinement. There is a lot of repetition and the writing needs to be much clearer. The challenges are described but not well enunciated. The chapter could do with some reorganization and also there needs to be a reference check since some references do not appear.	Thank you. The text has been revised.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	0				Congratulations to the authors of the First Order Draft, IPBES Regional Assessment for Asia and the Pacific. The subject is complex and dynamic both and the scope given for the IPBES regional assessments is a wide one which encompasses the heritage of communities, religious and faith groundings, contemporary economics, the behaviour of modern society, apart from the domains that the IPBES is accumulating expertise in, which have to do with the biological and natural material spheres our societies inhabit and how we treat them. It is a difficult task and the writing team has done well to present a first order draft that is readable and which promises to be authoritative.	Thank you for the compliments.
Stefan Hotes	Chapter 1	0				You might want to include some more detailed information on the natural environment, the social, economic and political situation across the region covered by the Asia Pacific assessment.	Thank you. The text has been revised, but taking into account the limitation of volume.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	0				The chapter - and therefore the assessment, since this chapter is setting the scene for the assessment - addresses the relevant aspects which were agreed upon at IPBES-3 (see IPBES/3/6/Add.1). The text needs to be streamlined, though, since it is not easily readable yet, and it contains many repetitions. The structure of the chapter (and the order of sub-chapters) is not fully comprehensible. Furthermore, page references should be made for Boxes, Tables etc. since these are often not placed close to the text mentioning them.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	0				All regional IPBES assessments will provide important input for the global IPBES assessment, and this reg. assessment addresses very important aspects in this context (see also general comment in line 2). This is very much welcomed by Germany. The global assessment will include 'inland waters', though. These are not mentioned and addressed continuously throughout the regional assessment, though. In order to include all the relevant input needed (also) for the global IPBES assessment, 'inland waters' should be included and addressed continuously in this regional assessment for Asia-Pacific.	We have a table about rivers in Section 1.1.1. We also mention inland water systems in the ecosystem classification used in the study (Section 1.3.3)
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	0				Use the IPBES CF and common write-up in referring to the CF boxes and fluxes	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	0				there are many contents in Chpt1 so need to further delete and combine with each other. Additionally. Text of the Chpt is too long.	Thank you. The text has been extensively revised and consolidated.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	0				Note:The methodology described here is consistent with the assessment operation in other chpt.	Thank you. The text has been checked.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	0				it is necessary to how to, as appropriate, deal with the similarity and difference in the assessment methodology used in other Chpts?	Thank you. The text has been checked.
Pifu CONG	Chapter 1	2	32	2	50	"1.1.3 Approach and Methodology of the Assessment" and "1.4.2 Methodology of the Assessment" both introduce the methodology. It is suggested that the latter should be incorporated into the former.	Thank you. The subsections have been revised.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 1	2	54	2	54	Chapter organization and content description should be placed at the beginning of the chapter in order to inform reader about the mapping of the report.	Disagree, we have put as the separate section since it is logically flowing better
Li Qingfeng	Chapter 1	3	71	3	114	To be condensed, with only the most important topics.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	3	77	3	77	abbreviate if rappers for the first time. I seen before APRA not APR.	It has been requested to reduce the use of acronyms as much as possible in order to be understood by a wide audience.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	3	81	3	81	Instead of CBD, there should be Convention on Biological Diversity as a full form of CBD for the first time	Thank you. The text has been revised.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	3	81	3	84	The aspects listed for the biodiversity-area are very relevant and welcomed. Nevertheless, it might be helpful not to provide a "closed" list. Otherwise, discussions might evolve on which additional aspects should be included. It might be rephrased as: "(1) biodiversity <b>(amongst others/ e.g.): ...;</b> "	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	3	83	3	83	along with agricultural and cultural biodiversity, there might be other form of biodiversity such as forest biodiversity and so on.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	3	85	3	86	Full form of UNFCCC is United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, not UN Framework on Combating Climate Change	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	3	91	3	91	It would be better to mention the full form of WWF and IUCN for the first time	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	3	95	4	114	use same style at the end of bullet points	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	3	96	3	101	We have "guiding principles and values" that are derived from the IPBES framework and "different knowledge systems" with a view to finding ways these two outlooks can communicate with each other, without ILK/TK losing its particular relevance especially to those who contributed it, perhaps needs to be said clearly.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	4	113	4	113	How about adding BES after the assessment, so that it would read like IPBES regional assessment on BES	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	4	116	4	116	There should not be both full form or abbreviation of AsiaPacific Regional Assessment (APRA), may be APRA is Okay as its full form is already mentioned before.	It has been requested to reduce the use of acronyms as much as possible in order to be understood by a wide audience.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	4	116	4	152	Paragraph is too long and with too many messages crowding the key messages.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	4	118	4	118	need list of these 66 countries alphabetically at the end of chapter	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	4	118	4	118	Same in BES, as in previous comment	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	4	119	4	119	It would be better if we could provide the name of 5 geographical regions	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	4	130	4	130	better to name so they may stop the bad practices	Disagree, we remain at sub-regional level, intention is to highlight the issue
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	4	146	4	146	how about adding Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities as a major beneficiaries?	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	4	147	4	147	Full Form of MDGs and SDGs	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	5	161	5	161	There should be consistency on using the term Ecosystem services or Ecosystem goods and services throughout the report	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	5	162	5	162	full stop at the end of ) and then space	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	5	164	5	164	Full Form ASEAN	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	5	165	5	165	Few examples of Himalayan countries	Yes, replaced Himalayan country by trans boundary cooperation in biodiversity conservation.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	5	168	5	168	(name et al., year). use this format in all documents. use full stop and then comma after et al., when closed in brackets. like line 157 reference.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	5	170	5	171	Either NBSAP or its full form, donot require both	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Cameron Colebatch	Chapter 1	5	170	5	172	The regional assessment in itself will not make progress towards Aichi Targets - suggest revising the aim to be clear this document looks to assess progress and facilitate and inform implementation.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	5	170	5	172	the assessment is focused on regional level, why is its aim to facilitate implementation of NBSAP at national level?	To link to the Aichi biodiversity target.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	5	180	5	180	put full stop after Fig., use uniform style in other chapters it is written in full of Figure	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Li Qingfeng	Chapter 1	5	180	5	181	not so clear in terms of the content and the drawings.	Thank you. The text has been revised.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	5	183	5	184	APRA would be sufficient, I assume	It has been requested to reduce the use of acronyms as much as possible in order to be understood by a wide audience.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	5	183	5	184	It is not clear what is meant by this note (see also page 33, lines 1290-1291). Please explain.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	6	186	6	196	I always appreciate full justification look better. please apply in whole document.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	6	186	6	196	This repeats a fair bit of the introduction. Should make more use of do ppoints.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	6	187	6	187	What does it mean by indigenous literature review?	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	6	191	6	191	Data deficient or deficit regions?	Deficient is correct
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	6	194	6	195	....likely to find the APRA results useful to provide with.....in an effort of addressing local.....	Thank you. Results replaced by findings.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	6	199	6	205	Here key aim and Overall aim are also mentioned and why are different from that in pp170-172.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	6	200	6	200	Full form of APR	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	6	202	6	203	the overall aim' change to 'the aim'. The overall aim could be larger than the assessment.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	6	205	6	205	Multilateral Environmental Agreement, instead of Mullitateral environment agreement, probably donot require both full form and their abbreviation	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	6	218	6	230	Seems a repeat of para above which itself repeats the first page of dot points from line 64. Then beginning Line 231 repeats the same thing again.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	6	229	6	231	APR or APRA differntiatte	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	6	230	6	230	add 'How to addressbiodiversity conservation issues and challenges'	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	6	232	7	237	Sentence starting with " methodologically and ending with conventions" is too long, consider breaking into two clear and concise sentences	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	6	233	6	233	add scientific as well before peer-reviewed, also do we need to use both grey and scientific while writing grey literature?	It depends, but the point has been taken into account.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	6	234	6	234	Experienced learning or experimental learning	Experienced learning or practice.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	7	239	7	239	How about replacing the term geographical with spatial?	Geographical is correct.
Li Qingfeng	Chapter 1	7	241	17	573	some repetition with contents of other chapters. It is suggested to remove this section from this Chapter.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	7	246	7	246	The Asia Pacific Region (APR)	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	7	246	7	264	there are '5 sub-regions' in line 246 and figure1.2, but '6 sub-regions in table1.1'	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	7	255	7	255	3500 kilometers	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	7	263	7	264	In Table 1.1 the sub-regions within the geographical focus of the Asia-Pacific assessment are listed; there are six sub-regions in the table. The text (page 7, lines 246-249), which refers to Table 1.1, mentions five sub-regions. It might be helpful to refer to the same sub-regions in the text and in the table. Furthermore, in chapter 2 (see e.g page 2, lines 30 and 59 and page 5, line 189) one sub-region is called 'North-East Asia' (like in the scoping document); in chapter 1 this subregion is named 'North Asia'. Please streamline throughout the assessment.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 1	7	263	8	270	Sub regions in Asia Pacific Region. Source of groupings - Iran is included in South Asia,	Yes, this is in line with the regional grouping in the scoping document of the assessment.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	7	264	7	264	South Asia (9) Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Bhutan, India, Iran (Islamic Republic of), Maldives, Nepal, Pakistan and Sri Lanka	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	7	264	7	264	Central Asia (8)	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	7	264	7	264	(State of what	Palestine

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	8	272	8	273	I'm not sure if I'm off the the point here, but these aren't the only areas that contain biodiversity. There seems an inordinate focus on these areas but there is no review of land use and ecosystems across the APR generally. There is no analysis of the planetary boundary concept and the APR. The biodiversity aspect of the assessment seems underplayed.	Partially agreed. We have tried to address this issue. Planetary boundary is out of scope of this assessment.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 1	8	272	12	396	While analysis of biodiversity at hotspots/ecoregion/ecosystem level is made, there should be analysis at species and genetic diversity.	Thank you. This is an aspect covered by chapter 3.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	8	272	12	397	This part is too detailed	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	8	277	8	277	(Meyer et al., 2015) use single format	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	8	278	8	278	only part governments department or a few officers can get.	Thank you. We consider it better to remain at general level.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	8	281	8	283	maps showing alpha diversity ... have been published only for plants, mammals, birds, reptiles, and amphibians. If "published only" what has been omitted which the IPBES would have liked to use?	Data do not exist on additional species; we will use the updated map.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	8	281	8	295	As a generality the sentences are too long and bury important messages. Take for instance the first two sentences in this para.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	8	286	8	287	In text citation/Reference looks too long , instead it should be Myers et al 2000	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	8	286	8	289	use last name of first author then add et al., in the whole text please.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 1	8	288	9	301	Biodiversity Hotspots has been updated to total of 36 as of 2015. Thus some basic data, information shall be updated.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	9	289	9	290	suggesting to delete GBH based 2 criteria because it is too academic.	Disagree, report should be academic but will check and revise if non-academic criteria exist
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	9	299	9	301	Best check this. The article does not talk about ecosystem services. It might be a long bow to correlate 35% of all species in four vertebrate groups directly to ecosystem services.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	9	311	9	311	can we use wikipedia as a reliable sources, better to find peer reviewed sources	Thank you. The text has been deleted.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	9	314	9	314	number and percent missing for temperate forest in table	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	10	318	10	318	Need a reference for this statement.	Thank you. The text has been omitted as per general reduction in length
Pifu CONG	Chapter 1	10	318	10	319	In Chp.1 P10 [318], the importance of birds is mentioned as " Birds are considered important indicator species of the health of BES worldwide. Of the 4308 IBAs listed on the IBAs website, 1571 (36.5%) are found in the AP region." But there is no special important description of birds in the context. So it is advised to focus on the description of the indicator of birds.	This sentence about importance of birds has been omitted as per general reduction in length
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	10	318	10	324	in line 318 to 320, it is mentioned there are more than 12,000 IBAs, but in line 322 and 323 and Table 5, it is mentioned that there are just 4308 IBAs listed in the Birdlife International IBAs website. I think there needs to be consistency or further clarification on it	Yes, 4308 is the right number.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	10	339	10	339	Chou et al instead of long list in intext citation	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	10	342	10	344	Please provide an example of a "conservation action where it is most needed and could have the greatest benefit".	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	10	344	10	344	Chou et al., 2002:	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	10	344	10	344	Chou et al instead of long list in intext citation	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	10	345	10	345	Selig and Spalding, 2002	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	11	345	11	355	Please indicate, how many (and which) of the ten marine biodiversity hotspots are located in the Asia Pacific region.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	11	358	11	358	Remove italic and use full stop before comma eg. et al., also remove extra brackets	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	11	366	11	366	et al., should not be italic and put always full stop plus comma after et al when inside the brackets in whole text	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	11	368	11	369	It might be helpful to include examples of "human impacts" since not all might be perfectly obvious.	Thank you. The term is no longer used in the revised text.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	11	369	11	369	Chou et al instead of long list in intext citation	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	11	369	11	370	Chou et al., 2002	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	11	372	11	372	But these areas are massively impacted by climate change now so the assessment might need to be adjusted.	Thank you. The text has been considered in balance with the rest of the assessment.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	11	380	11	385	More emphasis is needed on the "ridge to reef" connection especially as for those who inhabit such areas, their use of the natural resources found in near coastal and marine ecosystems both are part of their territory. Coastal fishing villages in south and south-east Asia for example have skills both in nearshore (or artisanal) fishing as well as saline rice cultivation. Both kinds of skills and the knowledge systems they rest upon serve the community without there being necessarily being a distinction between them.	This section is about biological richness. We do not think it is appropriate to talk about management in there. It fits more to the next section on social ecological systems.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	11	382	11	383	Please provide an example for these conservation and management interventions.	Due to limitation of space and delimitation of scope with chapter 6, this could not be taken on board.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	12	392	12	392	I can't find this reference (Bryant et al 1998) in the reference list. It will likely be outdated given the massive coral bleaching event witnessed in 2016. There are lots of references not in the list.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Hesong Wang	Chapter 1	12	398	12	398	Farmland or plains should be added here.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	12	416	12	416	Please name the two global biodiversity hotspots.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	12	417	12	417	et al.,	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 1	13	425	13	428	Two characteristic forest types of SE Asia (Borneo), which are both diverse and host endemism, are not included in the list. These are peat swamp forests and heath forests. Please include these in your list. (See e.g. "Wikramanayake, Eric D.; Dinerstein, Eric; Loucks, Colby J., et al. (2002): Terrestrial Ecoregions of the Indo-Pacific: a Conservation Assessment. Island Press, Washington, DC" and "Proctor, J. (1999): Heath forests and acid soils. Botanical Journal of Scotland, Volume 51, Issue 1, pages 1-14".) See also p. 19, line 634, Table 1.7 (please include the two forest types there as well).	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	13	425	13	432	Suggesting delete the two para. Forest, Coral reef and mangrove do not fall into one category with those mentioned-above from the perspective of geography. So may add information for the plains in the AR.	Disagree with deletion. These are important, will separate mangrove and sea grass.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	13	429	13	432	coral-reef' has been stated in line 349-366. it's not necessary to list here again.	Thank you. The text has been deleted.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	13	434	13	434	typesetting problem	Thank you. The text has been revised.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 1	13	434	14	441	There should be data sets/maps to support description of mangroves and sea grass-alga beds, and needs narrative for major river systems	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	13	440	13	441	what is Gulf of <b>Ob</b>	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	13	440	14	table 1.5	The table on river systems excludes the Ganga-Yamuna-Brahmaputra river basins which are notable in the entire Asia-Pacific not only for the volumetric throughput of water, but also for their propensity to flood and most important for the vast populations they harbour.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	14	440	14	441	Indus river's Chinese name is Shiquanhe. It flows through China, India and Pakistan into the Arabian Sea.	We have used the global name.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	14	444	14	444	impacts on or of drivers of change?	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	14	444	14	444	Maybe this should rather read "impacts of drivers of change", not "on drivers of change"? Please also provide examples for 'anthropogenic drivers'.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	14	448	14	448	El Niño/La Niña (ENSO) events - ENSO needs expanding, Southern Oscillation.	Thank you. The text has been replaced.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	14	450	14	454	Please include "... acidification of the ocean, <b>amongst others</b> ...". A closed list may lead to discussions to include further aspects which have not been included.	Yes, but only if the impact is of catastrophic nature. We refer to (UNEP, 2014) to provide catastrophic nature.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	14	452	14	453	Think about 'loss of agricultural diversity' and 'sea level rise' are impacts or reasons?	Thank you. We discuss the factor causing negative synergies.
Hesong Wang	Chapter 1	14	456	14	456	Some drought events should be added here.	Thank you. Droughts are covered in appendix table.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	14	456	14	456	Selected instead of selection of	Thank you. The text has been replaced.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	14	456	14	table 1.6	Table 1.6 on catastrophic events needs to include the effects of heavy rainfall in Uttarakhand (2013), Pakistan (2010 and 2014) and north Himalayan India (2014), North-East India (Assam, 2013)	Thank you. We are using the major one for each category.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	14	457	14	458	correct the citation to correct format, a&b and also add comma before year	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	14	460	14	460	names please of five countries	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 1	14	460	14	464	Perhaps it should refer to the fact that all the major rivers referred here originates from the Himalayas which provided the abundant freshwater	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	14	464	14	464	Luo et al., 2015 add comma before 2015 and no italic	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	15	466	15	466	a , b, then c. C must not come before a or b and so on	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	15	468	15	483	1.1.2.6 Invasive Alien Species' need not to be list as an item. It can be a problem in analysis.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	15	468	15	484	It may be necessary to generally describe the issues associated with other key drivers in AP but invasive alien species.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	15	472	15	472	Intext citation as CBD 20., instead of webpage address	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	15	474	15	474	comma after IPBES but no comma after UNEF uniformity in whole document	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Pifu CONG	Chapter 1	15	476	15	476	AIS in "many plants and animals have been due to AIS" should be IAS.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	15	476	15	476	IAS instead of AIS	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	15	480	15	480	need to add comma before year in citation	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	15	485	16	512	On Demographic, cultural, knowledge and economic diversity. There is an over-emphasis on economics. The text states "political instability, weak governance, and lack of infrastructure, lower productivity and incidents of extreme poverty" which are quite subjective and tends to reflect a Northern view of Southern socio-political systems.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Santosh Kumar Mishra	Chapter 1	15	485	17	574	<p>Before start of 1.1.3 Approach and Methodology of the Assessment (page 17, line 575), add following box:</p> <p><b>Box 1.3: Indigenous People and Local Communities</b>  Indigenous peoples and local communities have an important role in the management of biodiversity. The value of indigenous knowledge (IK) is becoming recognized by scientists, managers, and policy-makers, and is an evolving subject of national and international law. Scientists are often skeptical of the value of IK unless it has been recast in scientific terms, and may lump IK with superstition, irrationalism, and tribalism. Scientists' arguments for preserving IK tend to emphasize intellectual and economic benefits to non-native societies by providing leads to drug discovery and raw materials for biotechnology and agricultural innovation.</p> <p>Indigenous people themselves have repeatedly claimed that they have fundamental rights to IK because it is necessary to their cultural survival, and this principle is increasingly being recognized in international law. These rights include many nonmaterial and material values bundled into "traditional resource rights". When benefits are gained outside indigenous communities, they are entitled to have control over the process and to benefit from the use of their knowledge and traditions.</p> <p>IK is also becoming recognized as a form of rational and reliable knowledge developed through generations of intimate contact by native peoples with their lands that has equal status with scientific knowledge. While indigenous peoples have sometimes caused extinctions and degraded environments, they have often persisted for millennia in their territories by using detailed adaptive knowledge. They have in many cases increased local biodiversity in widespread "eco-cultural" landscapes, and have developed the majority of the global diversity in domesticated plants and animals. Their ways of conceptualizing and acting in the environment are expressions of how to invest the world with meaning and self-fulfillment that provide alternatives to the dominant consumptive values of Western societies. (<a href="https://www.cbd.int/doc/articles/2002-/A-00108.pdf">https://www.cbd.int/doc/articles/2002-/A-00108.pdf</a>, Accessed on June 10, 2016)</p> <p><b>Annotations:</b> I find the information given in the above Box 1.3 (Indigenous People and Local Communities) relevant, as local participation is important in biodiversity management and forest conservation. Indigenous people have been responsible of their lands and resources for thousands of years. Relying on traditional knowledge and sustainable resource management practices, indigenous cultures have survived and thrived in all corners of the world. International treaties have recognized the close and traditional dependence of many indigenous and local communities on biological resources.</p>	We are adhering to the IPBES guide regarding indigenous and local community elements.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	15	490	15	490	probably donot need webaddress, as reference is already put in the text.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	15	494	15	494	4.3 billion people <sup>6</sup>	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Yasushi Hibi	Chapter 1	15	498	15	502	In additioni to the 'size' of the economy of APR, reference shall be made to the rapid growth of the economy in the region as it is not just the size but the velocity of economic activities that may affect BES. There also should be some reference to drivers (especially anthropogenic) to BES loss. It may provide good frame to understand economic/social activities and nature, if a standardized data/graphs on changes in natural capital (e.g. forest or coral reef cover vs per capita GDP vs population growth vs. greenhouse gas emission...)	Thank you. Chapter 4 is addressing this topic.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	16	512	16	512	Earlier there was Fig. and now Figure inside brackets need uniformity.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	16	513	16	514	Where is figure 1.4?	Thank you. The text has been revised.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	16	522	16	523	I think, shifting cultivation = slash and burn, so we don't need to write shifting cultivation, and slash and burn	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	16	527	16	528	When saying "poorest" what is meant is monetary poverty	Thank you. Poverty line of \$1.90/day has been specified.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	16	534	16	538	I think this misses the point. In Australia, for instance, it is more the historical legacy including people being moved off the land. This is then underscored by poor education and lack of cash resources including large unemployment rates. The problem now is lack of empowerment not necessarily a lack of access to BES. There are groups who now have good access to BES but remain in poverty. Partly this is because the ES are not part of a market that can earn them a living.	Here access means access to resource, credit, capacity building and management and use rights.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	16	538	16	538	Agrawal et al., 2008 uniform format if more than two authors	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	16	539	16	539	It might be helpful to (also) refer to the IPBES-document defining the use of 'ILK' withing IPBES (see IPBES/2/INF/1/Add.1) when defining 'ILK' in this assessment in order to ensure an exact identical definition throughout all IPBES-assessments.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	16	539	16	box 1.2	use proper citation style	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	17	548	17	551	Don't forget that on the other side of the world in PNG highlands crops were grown at the same early time which together with the topography and biodiversity lead to one of the richest diversity of language groups in the world.	Sorry but the request was not clear. We have revised the original sentence.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	17	548	17	551	Indus River Valley is referred to be scholarship in more recent decades as the Indus-Saraswati civilisation because of its various locations in north-western India, hence not only Indus river	Thank you. We will use the internationally accepted term.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	17	548	17	573	suggesting to delete or shorten this para.	Thank you. The text has been shortened.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	17	549	17	549	comma after name and before year uniform format	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	17	551	17	551	Thaman 2009 & 2014	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	17	559	17	560	integrated and/or synergised with modern science can lead to becoming misinformed about the ILKS or diluting/simplifying its basis	A two way-integration is meant (ILK with MS and vice versa).
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	17	568	17	568	et al.,	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Li Qingfeng	Chapter 1	17	575	19	638	also some repetition with contents of other chapters, and in doubt the methodology is employed by the other chapters. In particular, with a section later on (1.4 Guiding Principles and Overall Methodology", this section seems unnecessary, and is suggested to remove this section from this Chapter.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	17	580	17	581	Economic system should also be considered	Thank you. We use bio-physical and socio-economic.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	17	584	17	584	References cited are not in the reference list. This is common and all citations will need to be checked. I have not gone through the check all reference.	Thank you. This has been updated.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	18	591	18	592	Our approach focusing on ecosystem sturcture may be further described and explained for the Assessment	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	18	594	18	595	Ladle et al., 2013 uniform format	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	18	599	18	599	2005 superscript 10	Thank you. This has been transferred to the reference list.
Peter Buchanan	Chapter 1	18	618	18	622	The 1992 CBD definition of ES is remiss in omitting most members of the second largest kingdom of multicellular life - the Fungal Kingdom. Only unicellular fungi such as yeasts, along with bacteria and microscopic animals and plants, are covered by the term "microorganism". In fact, the fungi include the largest known living organism - the wood decay fungus <i>Armillaria solidipes</i> (= <i>A. ostoyae</i> ) as documented in Oregon, USA. I suggest that the need for expansion of the CBD definition be noted, with inclusion of the missing Fungi.	Thank you. The text has been revised following updates made in IPBES definitions.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 1	18	625	18	626	Table 1.7, SES also includes Wetlands, rainforests	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	18	627	18	628	Binder et al., 2013	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	18	632	18	632	(Turner et al., 2003a; Scholz, 2003	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Ludwig Kammesheidt, IB	Chapter 1	19	634	19	634	Please provide explanations for the Social Ecological Systems listed in Table 1.7 if these are not self-explaining (e.g. Satoyama-Satoumi).	Thank you. The text has been revised. Table 1.7 has been moved below compared to the original document. Both CSES and satoyama-satoumi are now explained before this table.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	19	634	19	634	Agricultural system is in fact considered in economic terms. Suggesting using social-economic-natural system.	Here it is as a modified agro-ecological or agro biodiversity system.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	19	634	19	table 1.7	Table 1.7 misses Australia's Indigenous land management practices including the so-called "fire-stick farming" which should go under Agro-Biodiversity etc.	We do not believe Table 1.7 is the right place for this, as it includes a broad classification and not individual practices. The specific system is mentioned now in Section 1.1.3.1
Noim Uddin	Chapter 1	19	641	19	642	Regional assessment section should include regional agreements rather than focusing on international agreements. International Agreements should be incorporated in global assessment section	Thank you. We have added a section on regional agreements (Section 1.4.3) and Box 1.4.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	19	641	19	643	A much more thorough treatment of this summary is presented in Chapter 2 of Land Degradation. That Chapter presents a very good critique. This section does not do the same job.	Thank you. The text has been revised using the IPBES approved classification system
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	19	641	24	873	what is the purpose of the part ? A historic overview should be very short.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Noim Uddin	Chapter 1	20	646	20	box 1.2	Box 1.2 Milestones should be elaborated based on the scope of the Chapter	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	20	655	20	655	comma after name and before yea	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	20	667	20	667	Delete the term " action"	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	21	745	21	745	no italic for et al.,	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	22	767	22	767	; between two refernces	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	22	775	22	776	Repetition of the term Environment Agreement, so remove the term once, and Slightly modify as Multilateral Environmental Agreement (MEA), Instead of Multilateral Environment Agreement (MEA)	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Peter Buchanan	Chapter 1	22	775	22	789	I suggest that consideration be given to inclusion in this section, or in a related section, of the Global Tonomy Initiative (GTI) - as an important CBD-related agreement although not legally binding.	Due to limitation of space and delimitation of scope with other chapters this could not be taken on board.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	22	775	22	789	Suggest that para 1.2.3 be dropped	Thank you. The text has been extensively revised and consolidated.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	22	780	22	780	Slightly modify as Multilateral Environmental Agreement (MEA), Instead of Multilateral Environment Agreement (MEA)	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	22	789	22	789	add more information	Thank you. The text has been revised.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	23	803	23	803	space before (	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	23	footnote 12	23	footnote 12	what is article 202	Article 202 is explained exactly in that sentence. The word "article 202" is now omitted to avoid confusion.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	23	footnote 13	23	footnote 13	A 10 years	Thank you. The text has been removed.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	24	833	24	833	Zhao et al.,	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	24	835	24	836	Nakashima et al., 2012 remove all abbreviations	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	24	841	24	841	comma before year	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	24	845	24	846	single format and correct one is et al., not italic it is now universal truth	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	24	855	24	857	demanding use of a universal standard may not be the case. IPBES and regional assessments are keen on diversity but any standardisation will contradict this	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	25	875	25	877	This section and 1.3.2 need a lot of work. Seems hastily put together.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	25	881	25	885	This is a very awkward sentence. Should be broken into two or more sentences. This is a common issue throughout the document.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	25	881	25	893	This para may be placed on the beginning and combine with previous part relevant to this purpose.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	25	895	27	973	Section 1.3.2. and 1.3.3 are repetitions of earlier sections	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	25	906	25	906	Please provide examples for 'direct impacts and underlying threats'.	Due to limitation of space and delimitation of scope with other chapters this could not be taken on board.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	25	909	25	909	et al.,	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	25	913	26	937	This part seems not talking about rational. Here needs more evidences about rational.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	26	919	26	919	Please include "... of cultural, ecological <b>and economic</b> importance, ...".	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	26	943	26	950	Urbanisation is not only the population increases in mega cities (or very large metros of 5 million and above). It is also the connecting between and agglomerating of urbanising small settlements that cease to follow agriculture and cultivation activities as their primary economic activities and which choose activities (therefore jobs and consumption) that flow from the economic direction given by policy which is national or regional.	Thank you. We use urban landscape view in describing urban biodiversity and ecosystem degradation.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	26	957	26	957	Please include an example for "contextualized inclusive knowledge".	Thank you. This has been revised to use a standardised text across IPBES assessments.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	26	962	26	970	font looks small	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	27	975	26	1009	Section 1.3.4 is long-winded and would be better as dot points.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	27	977	27	982	The target audience is not only governments of IPBES but also state/regional/provincial governments.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	27	977	27	986	AiIB may also be target audience	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	27	991	27	991	et al.,	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	27	1006	27	1006	(UN, 2013).	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	28	1017	28	1017	Diaz et al., 2015 a & b if two separate reference	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	28	1033	28	1033	Fikret and Folke, 1998 remove F	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	28	1033	28	1033	Remove second name here (Berkes)	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	28	1036	28	1036	Belair et al.,	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	28	1037	28	1037	et al.,	Thank you. The text has been revised.

Reviewer Name	Chapter	From Page	From Line	To Page	To Line	Comment	Response
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	28	1048	28	1049	Diaz et al., 2015a&b	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	28	1051	28	1055	Principle 1 seems to be a component of Principle 1	The principles were agreed across the larger expert group
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	28	1052	28	1052	(Berkes & Folke, 1998, remove F	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	28	1055	28	1059	et al., add comma	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	28	1057	29	1065	The consideration of multiple value systems within this reg. assessment ist highly appreciated.	Thank you.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	28	1059	28	1059	Chan et al.,	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Penny van Oosterzee	Chapter 1	29	1067	29	1075	This seems to be another way of viewing Principle 4. I think the principles can be conflated.	The principles were agreed across the larger expert group
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	29	1070	29	1075	et al.,	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	29	1077	29	1099	This part seems not talking about principle. It should be as an path or aim.	The principles were agreed across the larger expert group
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	29	1083	29	1084	Diaz et al., 2015a&b	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	29	1109	29	1109	new page this topic	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Wang Changyong	Chapter 1	29	1109	33	1260	This Methodology may integrated with previously-emntioned methods	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	30	1133	30	1133	Please include"... , and social sciences <b>and humanities</b> ...".	Thank you. The text has been rephrased.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	30	1137	30	1139	et al.,	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Shankar Adhikari	Chapter 1	30	1163	30	1163	I think, its Bioersivity International instead of Biodiversity International	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	31	1188	31	1190	The reg. assessments will (also) provide important input to the IPBES global assessment. When deciding about (e.g.) "the sope of models and scenarios" and "the scale for which recommendations are being made", this aspect should be kept in mind (throughout the assessment).	Agreed.
Rahul Goswami	Chapter 1	32	1233	33	1262	On 'considerations for integrating knowledge'. When referring to 'experts' and 'users', usually, experts are not users and often 'users' are local experts. This section needs to better explain the ways in which recognition and integration of TK/ILK will be taken up by IPBES.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	32	1241	32	1241	Roux et al., 2006	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	33	1246	33	1247	et al.,	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	33	1255	33	1257	correct refence style and remove abbreviations for authors	We have followed IPBES guidance on formatting.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	33	1285	33	1287	Please include "... boxes and fluxes <b>of the IPBES conceptual framework</b> ..." if this is what is referred to. All in all, it is not quite clear what is meant by the whole sentence. Which descriptions? Where can they be found? Please clarify.	Thank you. This has been revised to use a standardised text across IPBES assessments.
Zhang Xiaoyun	Chapter 1	35	1353	36	1371	This part repeated with P7.	Thank you. The text has been revised.
Uta von Witsch	Chapter 1	36	1370	36	1370	Table 1.9 provides a very helpful overview. It should be further elaborated to optimize its informative value.	Thank you. Due to limitation of volume this has been moved to appendix.
Dr. Amanullah	Chapter 1	36	1373	42	1690	check all referees with text and use a single format in the whole book. there are many problems in this section. Also see the PDF file for few corrctions.	Thank you. The text has been revised.