

**Comment form for 2<sup>nd</sup> Review Phase of the Deliverable 2b) Regional and subregional assessments of biodiversity and ecosystem services for Africa, Chapter 1 'Setting the scene'**

**Review Editor:** Betsy Beymer-Farris  
**Institute:** University of Kentucky  
**Address:** 849 Patterson Office Tower, Lexington KY 40506-0027  
**Email address:** [bbeymer-farris@uky.edu](mailto:bbeymer-farris@uky.edu)

**Review Editor:** Phil René Oyono (Cameroon)  
**Institute:** Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa (CODESRIA)  
**Address:** BP 3304, CP 18524, Dakar, Senegal  
**Email address:** [philreneoyono@yahoo.fr](mailto:philreneoyono@yahoo.fr)

**Reviewers:**

Brian Mac Sharry (BMS)  
CSIR BES  
Diane Douglas (DD)  
Edson Gandiwa (EG)  
George Atisa (GA)  
Harald Pauli (HP)  
Ignela Sahondra Randriantsizafy (ISR)  
Jessica Thorn (JT)  
Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)  
Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)

Moha Haddouch (MH)  
Neil Burgess (NB)  
Ngozi Stewart (NS)  
Patrick Ken Kalonde (PKK)  
Rien E. van Wijk (REW)  
Sandra Diaz (SD)  
Sebsebe Demissew (SD)  
Stuart Butchart (SB)  
Susan Ringrose (SR)  
Thomas Brooks (TB)

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
2	South Africa (SA)	3	50	64	2208	There is some inconsistency throughout the chapter between the use of the term nature's contributions to people (NCP) and nature's benefits to people (NBP). Suggest ensuring consistent use on NCP, which seems to be the predominant term in the document and is preferable because "contributions" can include both "services" and "benefits" (which are sometimes seen as distinct)	We agreed on the modification of the term nature's contributions to people (NCP) instead of nature's benefits to people (NBP) and changes made to the SOD. Most occurrences were changed or qualified as beneficial contributions.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
3	CSIR BES	3	51	3	51	I think we need to start with a sentence highlighting the richness of biodiversity in Africa and that biodiversity in Africa is under a lot of pressure while governments have been taking measures to control and reverse the loss. More that in any other region, people depend directly on biodiversity for their livelihoods. We can consider a very suitable text from IPBES document (See below).We can also use the following text from the key messages submitted before the write shop: "Africa has abundant biodiversity, arable land, and richly diversified ecosystems, which are essential building blocks of sustainable development. Africa is, however, grossly underutilizing its natural resources at a time when they continue to be lost and degraded through a combination of human-induced and policy factors." I note that this text was used in section 1.3 below. Or we can use key messages 1 and 2 from chapter 3: "Africa has rich and varied biological resources forming the continent's natural wealth on which its social and economic systems are based. Most, if not all, terrestrial ecosystems in Africa have already experienced are experiencing major biodiversity losses in the past 30 years which has reduced their	We are not agreed to add a sentence highlighting the richness of biodiversity in Africa and that biodiversity in Africa as there is a complete section explaining in details all aspects of biodiversity in Africa (see section 1-3). Part of the standard IPBES text used.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>resilience and increased poverty. The prospect is that this trend will continue in the future". Please inform Chapter 3 if you use their key messages here</p> <p>Also, this text from IPBES document can be considered and adapted as needed:  Africa is characterized by great biodiversity and varied ecosystems, ranging from desert environments to tropical rainforests, Afro-alpine areas and marine habitats. There is also enormous human diversity, with upwards of 1,500 language and cultural groups, representing a rich heritage and a wealth of indigenous and local knowledge stemming from the longest history of human-environment interactions. These interactions are also most acute in the African region, where people are heavily dependent on biodiversity and ecosystem services. The nature of these interactions will drive the degradation of biodiversity and ecosystem services if they are not refocused to harness nature's benefits to people more efficiently, at the same time ensuring the sustainability and resilience of biodiversity and ecosystems. The thematic priorities referred to in section I (A) highlight both the unique biocultural heritage of the region and the critical role that biodiversity</p>	

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						and ecosystem services play in improving livelihoods within the context of demographic change (population growth, gender relations and urbanization), economic growth and poverty reduction. The assessment should focus on the links between biodiversity, ecosystem functions and nature's benefits to people, paying particular attention to questions of equity, social relationships, spirituality and cultural identity/diversity. In addition, the assessment should consider the relationship between trade agreements and foreign investments, biodiversity and ecosystem services. The assessment should consider which policy and institutional drivers are internal to the region, as opposed to external drivers with internal impacts". (See section C. 'Rationale' in Annex IV of decision IPBES-3/3 part III; document IPBES/3/18 - Scoping for a regional assessment of biodiversity and ecosystem services for Africa (deliverable 2 (b)))	
4	Patrick Ken Kalonde	3	52	3	54	It cannot always be reasonable. Why?	What is the comment here? We do not understand what is needed .
5	Patrick Ken Kalonde (PKK)	3	57	3	59	What is Millennium Ecosystem Assessment of the IPCC? What was its scope of	Changes made and some text added.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						operation? What was achieved under it remains issues to be desired	
6	CSIR BES	3	63	3	64	<p>Reference to the IPBES decisions could be good here: Decision IPBES-3/1, part III approved the undertaking of four regional and sub-regional assessments for Africa, the Americas, Asia and the Pacific, and Europe and Central Asia, in accordance with:</p> <p>the procedures for the preparation of deliverables (Annex to decision IPBES-3/3; in IPBES/3/18 p79-105);</p> <p>the generic scoping report for regional and sub-regional assessments of biodiversity and ecosystem services (IPBES/3/18 p 34-41; Annex 1 to this document), which provides a generic chapter outline, a timetable and a cost estimate for the 4 regional assessments ; and</p> <p>the scoping reports for each one of the 4 regional assessments (IPBES/3/18 p42-63; Annex 2 to this document), which provide additional info pertaining to each region, to complement the generic scoping report.</p>	OK, and reference to the decision was added

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
7	CSIR BES	3	64	3	64	<p>Because this is the same as for the other regional assessment, we can say “The goal of regional assessments is etc.”</p> <p>1. However, it can be better we use the more official languages i.e. from the IPBES document (see Annex III of decision IPBES-3/3 part III; document IPBES/3/18) by extracting from: “The overall scope of the regional and subregional assessments is to assess the status and trends regarding biodiversity, ecosystem functions and ecosystem services and their interlinkages, the impact of biodiversity, ecosystem functions and ecosystem services and threats to them on good quality of life and the effectiveness of responses, including the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011–2020 and its Aichi Biodiversity Targets and the national biodiversity strategies and action plans developed under the Convention on Biological Diversity. The assessments will address terrestrial, freshwater, coastal and marine biodiversity, ecosystem functions and ecosystem services.</p> <p>2. The objective of the regional and subregional assessment processes is to strengthen the science-policy interface on biodiversity, ecosystem functions and ecosystem services at the regional and</p>	OK, we add a paragraph on the aim of the regional and sub-regional assessments under the IPBES.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>subregional levels. The assessments will analyse the state of knowledge on past, present and future interactions between people and nature, including by highlighting potential tipping points, feedbacks and trade-offs.”</p>	



Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
8	CSIR BES	3	67	3	67	replace related with relevant -a term used in scoping document. Please delete: as all the regional assessment because here we only want to raise policy questions for Africa. And the questions we list should be very relevant and specific to Africa	OK, done
9	CSIR BES	3	70	3	72	Proposed text (more concrete and clearly relevant to Chapter 2 content): How do biodiversity components (i.e. plants, animals, microorganisms and the ecosystems of which they are part) and ecosystem functions and services contribute to the economy, livelihoods, food security, and the good quality of life of the people in the different subregions of Africa, including their contribution to food, water, energy, health and livelihood security as well as the people social relationships, their spirituality and cultural identities in the region ; and what are the interdependences among them, bearing in mind the equity issues (Chapter 2)? In other words, what are nature's contributions to the people, their values, their geographical differences, their status as well as their current and projected trends, and the impact of their changes on the good quality of life of the people in Africa	For brevity sake we prefer the original (short) text with a similar meaning but some text was added.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
10	CSIR BES	3	73	3	75	Proposed text is: What are the status, trends and potential future dynamics of biodiversity components (i.e. plants, animals, microorganisms and the ecosystems of which they are part) that affect nature's contribution to people in the different regions of Africa , ecosystem functions and services that affect their contribution to the economy, livelihoods and wellbeing in the region? (Chapter 3)	OK, we replace the existing question with the proposed one that related to chapter 3. Some text added.
11	CSIR BES	3	76	3	77	Thanks for adding this bullet so that we have a question for each chapter from chap 2 to 6. proposed text to be fully in line with what we have in chapter 5: What are, for Africa, the various paths towards the 2030 sustainable development goals, the 2050 vision of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity, the African Union 2063 Agenda and other related objectives adopted at the regional and subregional levels, taking into account the scenarios and the dynamics of the interactions between society and nature (i.e. future dynamics of biodiversity components, their drivers and nature's contribution to people)?	For brevity sake we prefer the original (short) text with a similar meaning but some text added.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
12	CSIR BES	3	80	3	81	Proposed text is: What are the different policy ideas and possible options for decision makers at the regional and subregional levels in response to the scenarios, and their effectiveness as well as the environment that will ensure success of these options	OK, we replace the existing question with the proposed one. Some text added.
13	CSIR BES	3	82	3	84	Proposed text:• What are the different policy ideas and possible options for decision makers at the regional and subregional levels in response to the scenario s, actual impacts of, and potential pathways for policies and interventions on the contribution of biodiversity, ecosystem functions and services to the sustainability of the economy, livelihoods, food security and good quality of life in the region? The way I see things is we can have a list of scenarios developed for Africa and list/describe possible policy options that will help Africa reach the SDG and other goals in particular good quality of life for each African. Options have to take into account what is in (ii) a,b, c. Their effectiveness needs to be assessed etc.	OK, we replace the existing question with the proposed one.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
14	George Atisa (GA)	3	85	3	85	There should be an additional question relating to role of government, for example - To what extent are bureaucratic and political institutions involved in advancing public policies to improve the quantity and quality of biological resources alongside other national priorities?	We don't agree as the new questions cover most of the topics and scope of the assessment. This question is not an added value to the report.
15	CSIR BES	3	86	3	94	We need to have in this sentence an addition of measures taken to reduce/halt biodiversity loss, and increase NCPs.	OK, added and done.
16	Patrick Ken Kalonde (PKK)	3	86	3	94	Include examples on the interactions between humans and biodiversity	We think it is covered within the paragraph and there is no need to refer to it again.
17	Thomas Brooks (TB)	3	89	3	89	A useful reference for this sentence could be Moore et al. (2002) The distribution of cultural and biological diversity in Africa. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 269: 1645–1653.	Reference added
18	Thomas Brooks (TB)	3	92	3	94	A useful reference for this sentence could be Balmford et al. (2001) Conservation conflicts across Africa. Science 291: 2616–2619.	Reference added
19	CSIR BES	3	94	4	95	Section 1.1: Introduction – 1st paragraph, suggest replace 'present for Assessment' with 'Africa regional assessment'.	OK, done and replaced.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
20	CSIR BES	4	100	4	100	This is covered in the first paras above. Regarding purpose, we can also consider what is in IPBES documents: “The assessment will identify key priorities that will help policymakers to develop policy solutions to meet the specific needs of the Africa region as a whole, as well as the five subregions and their national constituents. The knowledge produced in the assessment, as well as its policy recommendations, will help African Governments and institutions to develop strategies to meet the sustainability and conservation goals set out in the Aichi Biodiversity Targets and the sustainable development goals that will come into force [adopted] in 2015”, [the AU 2063 Agenda etc.]. (see section D. ‘Utility’ in Annex IV of decision IPBES-3/3 part III; document IPBES/3/18 - Scoping for a regional assessment of biodiversity and ecosystem services for Africa (deliverable 2 (b)))	OK, done and added.
21	CSIR BES	4	107	4	108	Section 1.1.1 – replace ‘involve a literature review’ with ‘include a literature review’	OK, done and replaced.
22	CSIR BES	4	116	4	117	Can we include health? Delete "but not limited" since no African country made a request for such assessment officially/formally	OK, done and replaced.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
23	George Atisa (GA)	4	120	4	121	It would be good to look at institutions also, for example - Assessment of democratic institutional capacity to lead and bring about desired conservation outcomes	OK, done and added.
24	CSIR BES	4	126	4	126	"other objectives" which ones?	OK, we replace the "other objectives" with "in addition"
25	CSIR BES	4	127	4	127	"degree of autonomy "I do not understand what is meant by autonomy and why that is important	OK, we replace "autonomy" with capacity
26	CSIR BES	4	128	4	129	"on how this affects the development of effective responses "This part of the sentence depends on what?	OK, we rephrase the sentence to be more clear
27	CSIR BES	4	129	4	130	Delete this sentence if health is now mentioned as part of the nexus	We keep the sentence as the health is discussed separately within the chapter
28	CSIR BES	4	129	5	137	We have to use the standard text on the conceptual framework from the Secretariat, including the text on the Main Elements of the IPBES Conceptual Framework.	Don't agree. It is not necessary to write more details here about the IPBES Framework as it is discussed in details within the different publications under the IPBES programme. In addition this framework will be discussed in details within the global assessment.
29	CSIR BES	4	130	4	134	A paragraph with " The IPBES Conceptual Framework" from the sentence beginning with "To address this .....can be formed.? Please use here, including the Figure and long caption. Just have nature's	OK, done.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						contribution to people instead of nature's benefits in the figure	
30	Edson Gandiwa (EG)	4	131	5		Need to add more details on Fig. 1.1 and also details on arrows. As it is no much details are provided. Also, what pictures are referred to?	OK, the explanation of the figure inserted as requested by reviewers.

31	Sandra Diaz (SD)	4	131	5	137	<p>IPBES has developed a conceptual framework (shown figure) to summarize the components of the system comprised of people and nature, and the relationships between them. It provides common terminology for use across IPBES assessments. Integrative but explicit conceptual frameworks are particularly useful tools in fields requiring interdisciplinary collaboration. They help to make sense of complexity by clarifying and focusing thinking about relationships, and supporting communication across disciplines and knowledge systems and between knowledge and policy. [Updated Figure 1.1]. The grey boxes and their connecting grey arrows denote the elements of nature and society that are the main focus of IPBES. In each of the boxes, the headlines in black are inclusive categories that should be relevant to all stakeholders involved in IPBES and embrace the categories of science (in green) and comparable or similar categories according to other knowledge systems (in blue). The categories mentioned in green or blue are illustrative, see for more examples Diaz et al, 2015. Solid grey arrows denote influence between elements; the dotted grey arrows denote links that are acknowledged as important, but are not the main focus of IPBES. Interactions between the elements</p> <p>OK, the caption of the figure expanded as requested by reviewers. This is too much text already published. We need to shorten the chapter. What we did is to make the caption more self-explanatory so that readers understand it better.</p>
----	------------------	---	-----	---	-----	---



						<p>change over time (horizontal broad red arrow) and occur at various spatial scales (vertical broad red arrow). The vertical lines on the right indicate that the scope of IPBES assessments will be at the supranational (from subregional to global) scale, but that they will build on properties and relationships often assessed at finer (national and subnational) scales. The line indicating level of resolution does not extend all the way up to the global level because, for the types of relationship explored by IPBES, the spatially heterogeneous nature of biodiversity is important, so IPBES assessments will be most useful if they retain finer resolution. This figure is a simplified version of that adopted by the second session of the Plenary of IPBES (UNEP, 2014) and modified by the fifth session of the Plenary (UNEP, 2017). A more complete description of all elements and linkages in the CF, together with examples, are given in Diaz et al, 2015.</p>	
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
32	Sandra Diaz (SD)	4	131	5	137	<p>The Main Elements of the IPBES Conceptual Framework :</p> <p>Nature: the natural world with an emphasis on the diversity of living organisms and their interactions among each other and with their environment.</p> <p>Anthropogenic assets refer to knowledge, technology, work, financial assets, built infrastructure, etc. that, together with nature, are essential in the co-production of nature’s contributions to people.</p> <p>Nature’s contributions to people (NCP)) are all the contributions of nature, both positive and negative, to the quality of life of humans as individuals and societies. (See also section on “Nature’s Contributions to People”, below).</p> <p>Drivers of change refer to all those external factors that affect nature, and, consequently, affect the supply of NCP. The conceptual framework includes drivers of change as two of its main elements: institutions and governance systems and other indirect drivers and direct drivers (both natural, such as earthquakes and volcanic eruptions; and anthropogenic,</p>	Not in agreement. This is too much text already published. We need to shorten the chapter. What we did is to make the caption more self-explanatory so that readers understand it better.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>such as habitat conversion and chemical pollution).</p> <p>Institutions and governance systems and at least some other indirect drivers are the root causes of the direct anthropogenic drivers that affect nature. They include systems of access to land, legislative arrangements, international regimes such as agreements for the protection of endangered species, and economic policies.</p> <p>Direct drivers, both natural and anthropogenic, affect nature directly. Direct anthropogenic drivers are those that flow from human institutions and governance systems and other indirect drivers. They include positive and negative effects, such as habitat conversion, human-caused climate change, and species introductions. Direct natural drivers can directly affect anthropogenic assets and quality of life (e.g. a volcanic eruption can destroy roads and cause human deaths), but these impacts are not the main focus of IPBES.</p> <p>Good quality of life is the achievement of a fulfilled human life. It is a highly values-based and context-dependent element</p>	

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>comprising multiple factors such as access to food, water, health, education, security, and cultural identity, material prosperity, spiritual satisfaction, and freedom of choice. A society's achievement of good quality of life and the vision of what this entails directly influences institutions and governance systems and other indirect drivers and, through them, all other elements in the Conceptual Framework. Good quality of life, also indirectly shapes, via institutions, the ways in which individuals and groups relate to nature. Likewise, institutions and governance systems can influence a society's value system and perception of what constitutes quality of life. IPBES does not address this aspect of the conceptual framework in the assessments, but actions that Governments and societies may choose to take based on the findings of the IPBES assessments often require addressing this pathway wisely.</p>	
33	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	5	136	5	137	Figure 1.1 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution	The figures have all been redrawn.
34	South Africa (SA)	5	136	7	186	The way ecosystem services have been categorised as regulating, material and non-material is a useful evolution	Thank you. No action.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
35	CSIR BES	5	138	7	185	Please use the standard text only. Reference can also be made to IPBES/5/INF/24. A lot of text can be used as caption to the figure. Please also keep in mind that something is being prepared to take ILK into consideration	OK, done. We are not using standard text ONLY. The standard text is not STANDARD, it is a proposed framework. We are using that along with other sources.
36	Thomas Brooks (TB)	5	142	5	145	Very wise to include the definition of biodiversity here - important to retain	OK, well-noted. No action
37	CSIR BES	6	154	6	157	Table 1.1: A typology of ecosystem services and their ecological characteristics' This Table can be considered in chapter 2. Here it is just too general. In fact, its content is contained in the standard text on NCP that we are supposed to use. The table itself is from 2005!	We are not using standard text ONLY. The standard text is not STANDARD, it is a proposed framework. We are using that along with other sources.
38	South Africa (SA)	6	154	6	157	Table 1.1: It may be more useful to use the typology of ecosystem services from the Common International Classification of Ecosystem Services (CICEv4.4)( <a href="https://cices.eu/">https://cices.eu/</a> )	We are not using standard text ONLY. The standard text is not STANDARD, it is a proposed framework. We are using that along with other sources.
39	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	7	181	7	185	Figure 1.2 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution + missing source	The figures have all been redrawn.
40	Edson GandiwaG)	7	183	7		Fig. 1.2 Could you make the Figure more visible and also add source	The figures have all been redrawn.
41	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	7	183	7	185	Figure1.2: the source/ authority of the figure should be stated or the title of the figure be removed	The figures have all been redrawn.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
42	CSIR BES	8	187	8	210	Should have a section “Opportunities of Africa and obstacles towards sustainable development”. The section can include this subsection 1.1.3. Definitely we need a map of Africa showing the 5 subregions, a map of climate/vegetation, a map of poverty etc. Most text could be captions under the maps. In the text It will be very useful for communication to have sub headings in italics to specify the elements we describe e.g., hotspots, fragile ecosystems, climate change resilient areas, protected areas (+ national parks). Global importance should also include areas for migratory species. Rather than having a subsection that is incomplete (you can even check with chapter 3 CLAs), we can remain at a general level saying e.g., Biodiversity in Africa consists of unique (e.g., xxx), rare etc. One can use Annex I to the CBD as a checklist for what is important at the ecosystem, species and genetic levels. Surely hotspots, climate change resilient areas, Congo Basin forest (second largest in the World), biosphere reserves, wetlands of international importance/Ramsar, coral reefs, seamounts, species threatened by trade, migratory species, medicinal plants, genetic resources for food and agriculture etc. should be mentioned without going	New graphic and textbox created.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						into detailed descriptions (to be left for Chap 3). There are maps of hotspots in Africa. Better than box 1.1. There are maps showing the ecoregions in Africa. Some maps can be superimposed. What can be said about the other subregions? Should we understand that they are not among areas with high biodiversity? How about West Africa? Good to indicate species under threats because of trade and overexploitation etc. In fact what we have here seems to say that everywhere we have some unique or range of biodiversity	
43	Sebebe Demissew (SD)	8	187	8	221	I believe one has to define or show what biodiversity hotspots are? These are not defined by only the number of endemic or unique species, but also the level of destruction. This is not reflected in this subchapter	This paragraph was rephrased.
44	CSIR BES	8	188	8	204	Section 1.1.3 – replace ‘many biodiversity hotspots’ with ‘a number of biodiversity hotspots’ NB here – cross refer to Chapter 3, specifically section 3.3 In the sentence to follow, presumably ‘Lakes’ shouldn’t be capitalized.	This paragraph was rephrased.
45	Patrick Ken Kalonde (PKK)	8	188	8	203	I would love if it we would have also mentioned under this section that other endemic species include Chambo and Mbuna in Lake Malawi.	This paragraph was rephrased.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
46	Thomas Brooks (TB)	8	188	8	188	Add citation to the key reference on biodiversity hotspots, Mittermeier et al. (2004) Hotspots: Revisited. CEMEX, Mexico. Also Lines 200-204 and Lines 206-210 below.	OK, done.
47	Ngozi Stewart (NS)	8	190			I think there has been a fundamental omission of West Africa here	This paragraph was rephrased.
48	South Africa (SA)	8	190	8	190	Are arid- and semi-arid grasslands and savannas of Africa included as they contribute a lot of food security?	This paragraph was rephrased.
49	Moha Haddouch (MH)	8	198	8	200	On the other hand, there are 75 United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization Man and Biosphere Reserves (UNESCO MAB) in 28 Sub-African countries	OK, done.
50	Harald Pauli (HP)	8	206	8	206	suggest to change: 'The northern margin of Africa is part of the Mediterranean Basin biodiversity hot spot, ...'	OK, done.
51	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	8	206	8	208	the source (or reference ) should be cited	OK, done.



Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
52	Harald Pauli	8	207	8	209	please revise: '...regions, covering 2.3 million square kilometres and is home of ~ 25000 plant species, including ~ 12500 endemic species (Médail and Quézel 1997).' (the species number of 25000 does not refer to the forest alone, but to the entire region) Reference: Médail F, Quézel P 1997. Hot-spots analysis for conservation of plant biodiversity in the Mediterranean Basin. Annals of Missouri Botanical Garden 84: 112-127.	OK, done.
53	Ngozi Stewart (NS)	8	210			The statistics must have changed a lot since 1999.	Other references added.
54	CSIR BES	8	211	8	221	Section 1.1.4. Links between BES and human wellbeing in Africa' should be covered in the caption under the figure "Conceptual Framework (line 137)." Suggestion: move this section there (caption under CF) or delete	Section 1.1.4 revised
55	CSIR BES	9	222	9	223	Are the critical sites mentioned in the box also considered as hotspots? I do not think so. Then check heading of box	New box 1.1 added with 1 figure and 3 references : (Rodríguez et al., 2015), (Holland, Darwall, & Smith, 2012), (UNEP-CBD, 2013)
56	CSIR BES	9	223	9	223	Box 1.1 – I'd actually recommend not using the term 'high biodiversity hotspots'. Is there a better term? Perhaps just 'biodiversity hotspots'? cross refer to Chapter 3, and make sure facts and figures are aligned.	New box 1.1 added with 1 figure and 3 references : (Rodríguez et al., 2015), (Holland, Darwall, & Smith, 2012), (UNEP-CBD, 2013)

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
57	CSIR BES	9	223	9	223	Box 1.1 'Examples of high biodiversity hotspots in Africa' (page 8) is best in chapter 3. Chapter 1 should not go to this detail	New box 1.1 added with 1 figure and 3 references : (Rodríguez et al., 2015), (Holland, Darwall, & Smith, 2012), (UNEP-CBD, 2013)
58	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	9	223	9	223	Box 1.1 "Millions of prey birds..." => "Millions of birds of prey, other soaring migrants and songbirds migrate through..."	New box 1.1 added with 1 figure and 3 references : (Rodríguez et al., 2015), (Holland, Darwall, & Smith, 2012), (UNEP-CBD, 2013)
59	Sebsebe Demissew (SD)	9	223	9	223	In Box 1.1: Examples of high biodiversity hotspots in Africa need to include the Uniqueness of the Afralpine areas (the AFRican Alps) ca over 3000 m harbouring unique plant species not found anywhere else? The giant lobelias in Ethiopia and the giant Dendrosenecio in Africa. Also the unique Fynbos in the Cape	New box 1.1 added with 1 figure and 3 references : (Rodríguez et al., 2015), (Holland, Darwall, & Smith, 2012), (UNEP-CBD, 2013)
60	Thomas Brooks (TB)	9	223	9	223	I like Box 1.1 (and especially the final paragraph on Important Bird Areas), but it is confusing to have it labelled as about "hotspots", because the term is used both specifically (as per Mittermeier et al. 2004, previous page) and generically (as here). Better to replace "hotspots" in the title here with simply "areas".	New box 1.1 added with 1 figure and 3 references : (Rodríguez et al., 2015), (Holland, Darwall, & Smith, 2012), (UNEP-CBD, 2013)

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
61	CSIR BES	9	224	9	235	<p>Is this section about potential users of AfRA? The word benefit is probably not the best here. REMINDER: In Methodology section, we have to say if we are building on that assessment in any way. Not clear how the sentence from line 225 to 226 is a result of what was said in the previous sentence. It could be useful to refer to/link with the AU Agenda 2063, NEPAD, Great Green Wall Initiative, Congo Basin Initiative, climate change initiative, Abidjan Convention etc. All these regional and subregional initiatives need the background information that AfRA will assemble and the scenarios as well as the governance and policy options that we discuss in chapters 5 and 6. This para has to be redone. We focus on regional and subregional levels. Information at the national, local/site level is given as examples AMCEN, ECOWAS, SADC etc. may find interest. We can consider the following text from IPBES document: "The assessment will identify key priorities that will help policymakers to develop policy solutions to meet the specific needs of the Africa region as a whole, as well as the five subregions and their national constituents. The knowledge produced in the assessment, as well as its policy</p>	OK, done.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>recommendations, will help African Governments and institutions to develop strategies to meet the sustainability and conservation goals set out in the Aichi Biodiversity Targets and the sustainable development goals that will come into force in 2015. The assessment report will also be of interest to the institutions involved in intra-African trade policies, biodiversity and ecosystem services and conservation policy and development such as the African Union, the African Ministerial Conference on the Environment, the Intergovernmental Authority on Development in Eastern Africa, the Central Africa Forest Commission, the Southern African Development Community and the Economic Community of West African States. The knowledge and recommendations produced in this assessment will also be important sources of information for other stakeholders, including the private sector, concerned with the state of biodiversity in Africa and its sustainable future. Interested civil society organizations, such as non-governmental organizations, the media and individuals, may also find the document a useful source of information</p>	

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						linking Africa’s biodiversity and ecosystem services to human well-being”. (see section D. ‘Utility’ in Annex IV of decision IPBES-3/3 part III; document IPBES/3/18 - Scoping for a regional assessment of biodiversity and ecosystem services for Africa (deliverable 2 (b))). Also, we need to add the standard text from IPBES Secretariat on “Categories of users of the assessment”	
62	Sebsebe Demissew (SD)	9	224	9		Under the subsection Who will benefit from this assessment? The assessment is indicated to benefit policy makers. If this is to be realized, there is a need to have some specific examples from the 4-5 subregions of Africa in order to benefit policy makers from all subregions.	There is no need to add examples here as this topic will be discussed in chapter 5 and putting examples that will not explored in chapter 5 may lead to some confusion with users of the assessment. We prefer to keep it as it is.
63	CSIR BES	9	225	9	235	In Section 1.1.5 – add ‘The’ to the first sentence. In the sentence below – ‘Ecosystems and their services are benefits to people’ – can we rewrite this? Perhaps ‘...comprise benefits to people’	We think this will not valid as the benefits discussed earlier in the previous sections and we prefer not to repeat things again.
64	Edson Gandiwa (EG)	9	226		226	Add reference for the MEA	OK, done.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
65	Harald Pauli	9	Box 1.1	9	Box 1.1	While Mt Kilimanjaro and Mt Kenya are volcanoes, the Rwenzori range resulted from an uplift of crystalline rocks from the surrounding plateau during the formation of the western (Albertine) branch of the Great Rift Valley.' (Rwenzori, however, is not really more ancient than the others.) Besides Mount Nimba, with only 1750m the highest in West Africa, Mount Cameroon should be mentioned here, with 4040m the highest in (western) Central Africa.	New box 1.1 added with 1 figure and 3 references : (Rodríguez et al., 2015), (Holland, Darwall, & Smith, 2012), (UNEP-CBD, 2013)
66	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	9	Box 1.1	9		the whole box is confusing, authors should give country names of where the examples are taken, the paragraphs should be reorganised as a bullet list to facilitate understanding. Too long.	New box 1.1 added with 1 figure and 3 references : (Rodríguez et al., 2015), (Holland, Darwall, & Smith, 2012), (UNEP-CBD, 2013)
67	Ignela Sahondra Randriantsizaf y (ISR)	9	Box 1.1: 223	9	223	"These three mountains all support permanent glaciers; although these will only remain a few more decades because of global warming." : -1- Perhaps, it's preferably to specify that nothing is even sure, but this is a global tendency	New box 1.1 added with 1 figure and 3 references : (Rodríguez et al., 2015), (Holland, Darwall, & Smith, 2012), (UNEP-CBD, 2013)

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
68	CSIR BES	10	238	17	443	Section 1.2 Methodology' should become section 1.3. It is better we first present the key features about Africa in a section 1.2 right after the introduction and talk about methodology after that. In my view, even the description of the conceptual framework should come after section 1.2 on Africa, bearing in mind that introduction is just a short introduction without going into substantive details. What is to be said about Africa comes later in the current draft. We can move that here. For me, the ideal structure of Chapter 1 should be (as presented in the IPBES outline of chapter 1): 1. About Africa, 2. Conceptual framework and the framework for the science-policy interface. 3. Policy-relevant questions. 4. Methodologies and approaches and 5. Relevant stakeholders i.e. who will benefit from the assessment, for which we have a standard text ('Categories of users of the assessment')	We discussed the structure several times and have agreed on the present structure. It has been already reviewed. We believe it is an appropriate structure that was already approved.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
69	CSIR BES	10	238	17	443	Under "Methodology", we also need to briefly refer to selection of authors and efforts to have geographical, gender and expertise balance; efforts to make sure we have ILK experts involved; inclusion of experts/authors from Land degradation and IAS to ensure their input in the regional assessment and in the thematic assessment. In describing the process (just brief description), we need to refer to the meetings we had (FAM, SAM, Golden Gates, TAM). Methodology will describe the sources of information with reference to IPBES policy (available, published; effort to have ILK. We should not forget the standard text on "Treatment of ILK in IPBES Assessments"); our decision to focus on subregions, list of units of analysis under each subregion; coverage of all biological levels i.e. ecosystem, species and genetic levels. We need to see what to say about indicators (line 272-293). I am not sure we used any list of indicators systematically. We just used what was available. I am therefore not sure we should have a section on indicators.	There will be an appendix of authors on the report.



Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
70	CSIR BES	10	267	11	271	Correct "African" to Africa. We need to be consistent. I do not understand how sources precluded human appreciation. We can have a section where we summarize the whole process from recruitment of authors, and listing meetings held including reviews. I believe the sentence which starts with "to ensure uniqueness....should be deleted not unless you can provide a brief explanation n how that was ensured.	Issue discussed during the TAM in Addis Ababa. Reviewer comment No 70 suggested to move this paragraph to a separate section but we don't know where it should go.
71	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	10	Box 1.2	10		last word: replicable should be replicability	OK, done.
72	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	11	270	11	270	explain in a footnote what CLA and LA acronyms stand for, since it is the first time they are used in this chapter	OK, done.
73	South Africa (SA)	11	272	12	293	81 indicators of change in biodiversity and ecosystem services are proposed for IPBES assessments. It would be useful to have as much alignment as possible between these indicators and the SDG indicators, especially those for goals 14 and 15	This is standard text! No change made.
74	CSIR BES	11	273	11	288	You have to indicate the chapters in the diagram to be in line with the text you have : "Figure 1.3 highlights the chapters etc." I did not check what is listed. Letters are too small	Figure removed.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
75	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	11	275	11	275	add reference to the Aichi Targets (COP10 decision or other), since some readers might not know them and give meaning of SDG since it is the 1st time this acronym is used in the Chapter	Added reference to the mid-term assessment of CBD: Secretariat of the Convention on Biological Diversity. (2014). Global Biodiversity Outlook 4. A mid-term assessment of progress towards the implementation of the Strategic Plan for Biodiversity 2011-2020. Montréal, Canada: CBD. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.cbd.int/gbo/gbo4/publication/gbo4-en-hr.pdf">https://www.cbd.int/gbo/gbo4/publication/gbo4-en-hr.pdf</a>
76	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	11	280	11	281	Examples of indicator limitations in assessing non- material benefits of nature to people and in quality of life is important. Examples should be cited to better illustrate this notion.	This figure is no longer in the chapter.
77	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	12	291	12	291	final figure 1.3 should be bigger (take a whole page),it is hardly possible to read the text	This figure is no longer in the chapter.
78	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	12	291	12	293	Figure 1.3 needs a more clear layout with reference to respective chapters, unclear now	This figure is no longer in the chapter.
79	Stuart Butchart (SB)	12	291			Add the Red List Index to the box for Nature in Figure 1.3	This figure is no longer in the chapter.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
80	Thomas Brooks (TB)	12	291	12	291	Figure 1.3 is missing the Red List Index (should be in the box for "Nature"). The indicator has a strong scientific basis ( <a href="http://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0000140">http://journals.plos.org/plosone/article?id=10.1371/journal.pone.0000140</a> ), as well as policy alignment given that it is used to track progress towards SDGs Target 15.5 and Aichi Target 11 ( <a href="https://www.bipindicators.net/indicators/red-list-index">https://www.bipindicators.net/indicators/red-list-index</a> ). It is an IPBES "core" indicator ( <a href="http://www.ipbes.net/sites/default/files/downloads/pdf/ipbes-5-inf-5.pdf">http://www.ipbes.net/sites/default/files/downloads/pdf/ipbes-5-inf-5.pdf</a> , p10) and included in Chapter 1, Table S4 (Page 74, Line 2611). Data for this indicator, disaggregated to the Africa region and its subregions, were published in <a href="https://www.nature.com/articles/sdata20167">https://www.nature.com/articles/sdata20167</a> .	This figure is no longer in the chapter.
81	Thomas Brooks (TB)	12	291	12	291	It is very good to see the indicator of protected area coverage of key biodiversity areas incorporated into Fig 1.3 (in the IGID box) - important to retain	This figure is no longer in the chapter.
82	CSIR BES	12	294	14	336	Discussion of scenario in chapter 1 is not relevant. We should leave that to chapter 5. But if you really want to add to chapter 1, please use standard text in full. Same for indicators. Similarly, I believe that the following standard texts could fit better chapter 2: "Nature's benefits to people"	Text shortened and modified.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						and "IPBES treatment of values and valuation"	
83	CSIR BES	12	297	12	297	Remember to change NBP to NCP throughout the whole chapter	OK, done
84	CSIR BES	12	305	13	309	As we have a standard text from the Secretariat, check again to see if the additional information here is indispensable. In my view, we can delete, just to keep things short	We disagree. We want to keep both the « standard » IPBES view and indicate that there are alternative views.
85	CSIR BES	12	305	12	305	Please add "governance "to be in line with chapter 6 content	OK, done
86	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	13	310	13	311	"a diversity of" => "a number of"	OK, done
87	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	13	317	13	319	Figure 1.4 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution	Graphic redrawn
88	CSIR BES	13	318	13	319	If you want to use this, please adapt it to the new IPBES nomenclature, and provide a good explanatory caption	We disagree. We want to keep both the « standard » IPBES view and indicate that there are alternative views. A better caption is needed however by Luis
89	CSIR BES	13	321	14	336	This text belongs to chapter 4 in climate change section.	Removed bullet points and shorten
90	Thomas Brooks (TB)	13	325	13	326	Good use of Pimm et al. (1995) and Pimm et al. (2014) citations - important to retain	No action
91	Thomas Brooks (TB)	13	326	13	328	Good use of Hole et al. (2009) citation - important to retain. However, also add to the end of the sentence the most important finding of this study "...but nearly all IBAs are projected to remain	IBAs also treated elsewhere in the chapter incl a box in Ch4 for drivers.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						their importance even under climate change"	
92	CSIR BES	14	337	14	363	In section '1.2.4. IPBES terrestrial and aquatic units of analysis', good we used the standard text. But better to use a table listing all the units of analysis in one column and in the other column indicate the units we find in Africa. If we want to be complete, we can list the subregions where the units are found in that second column.	There is a table in Ch1 but the rest is dealt with in Ch3.
93	South Africa (SA)	14	337	14	363	There is a disjunction between Chapter1) 1.2.4 "units of assessment" and the assessments in Chapter 3. The unit of assessment identified in chapter 1 are not referred to in chapter 3, but should be.	Ch3 was restructured.
94	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	14	339	14	339	no one agreed perfect system' should be 'no one agreed perfect system'	OK, done
95	Sebsebe Demissew (SD)	14	347	14	363	Is there any reference to "IPBES terrestrial and aquatic units of analysis"?	No
96	CSIR BES	14	364	14	364	Suggest delete. Everything you need to say about gaps is in the next para. Maybe Box 1.3 can be referred to but I do not see its importance unless you want to point out subregions or units of analysis or biodiversity components with most/adequate or limited data,	OK, this will be considered in rephrasing

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
97	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	14	368	14	368	to set as priorities for addressing them should read 'to set as priorities for addressing them'	Done
98	Patrick Ken Kalonde (PKK)	14	379	15	384	I would really like to see if the funding mechanism for IPBES research becomes more friendly especially to African youth. The youth are always side-lines in such research programs though that it is believed that they are creative and innovative.	I think we can leave this to Emma, Jo and the TSU as there are several youth volunteers help the IPBES in developing its assessments.
99	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	15	384	15	384	Box 1.3 missing	Box 1.3 deleted
100	Sebsebe Demissew (SD)	15	384	14	385	Box 1.3: Determinants of Completeness of Biodiversity Data [source: IPBES Deliverable 2a after Meyer et al., 2015] need to be finalized	Box 1.3 deleted
101	CSIR BES	15	386	15	403	Rather than describing '1.2.6 Addressing uncertainties', it is more useful to use here the standard text on 'Confidence terms' because we shall be using these terms. A heading like " Assigning confidence terms/levels will suffice.	
102	Patrick Ken Kalonde (PKK)	15	387	15	395	It also have to be recognized under this section that most of the parts of Africa does not have the human capacity to compute possible future scenarios. This section has first to present how this challenge will be addressed, otherwise this will remain to be impractical.	To be considered but with more appropriate justification than "lack of human capacity" - Rephrasing of sections 1.2.5 and 1.2.6

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
103	CSIR BES	16	405	17	443	Section '1.2.7 Stakeholder linkages' should be replaced with the standard text on "Categories of users of the assessment." The discussion on stakeholders is certainly interesting but of limited relevance in chapter 1. Please note that when we present the 'Categories of users of the assessment', we have to add AU and the subregional organizations such as SADC, ECOWAS; we also need to mention the AfDB, COMIFAC, OSS, CGIAR centres, international and intergovernmental ONG (IUCN, WWF, GBIF etc.)	Standard text is in box 1.5. Other elements of the comment will be addressed (but 1-users and stakeholders are different categories, and 2- having a list is dangerous because we may miss something and it will not be readable)
104	Sebsebe Demissew (SD)	16	413	16		Under Box 1.4: Examples of blueprints. Please indicate the SDG's are 2015-2030 . Don't we have an end date? Please also indicate the Nile Basin Initiative document that have included about 9 countries in NE,E Africa and Egypt?	Disagreement from many Ch1 authors.
105	CSIR BES	16	439	16	441	Do not think other chapters gave "due consideration to stakeholder identification, analysis, linkages, mapping and engagement". Please confirm with the other chapters CLAs if needed. Consequently, Box 1.5 may not be needed.	Disagreement from many Ch1 authors.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
106	CSIR BES	17	444	17	444	This should be, as indicated in chapter outline in the IPBES scoping document, Regional and subregional aspects of priority thematic challenges. Important to list the priority challenges, most of which are described briefly in IPBES scoping document for regional assessments. Then describe them together with the ones we identified specific for Africa, one by one by highlighting the African and subregional aspects. NB: Some of the issues described in the present draft	The question of structure was raised and addressed previously with TSU and Ccs who indicated that it was fine to use the current structure. Besides other reviewers have raised this as an issue. And any change in structure would affect other comments.
107	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	17	456	17	456	I do not understand the meaning of 'incomes below %1 a day'	It is a typo. Changed to \$1 a day
108	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	17	456	17	456	"... population with incomes below (1%) a day NOT (%1) a day.	It is a typo. Changed to \$1 a day
109	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	17	456	17	456	"%1" => "1%"	It is a typo. Changed to \$1 a day
110	CSIR BES	18	461	18	508	When reference is made to achievement of Aichi Biodiversity targets, we need to take into account that the report referred to did not take into account the latest information from governments in the fifth national reports and NBSAPs.	we added a new paragraph from the UNEP mid-term review published recently after countries submitted their 5th national reports. The reference was also added to the reference list.



Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
111	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	18	462	18	464	I fully disagree with the following sentence: 'Africa is, however, grossly underutilizing its natural resources...'. It is not true. There is no reference to support this affirmation, thus it should be removed.	We disagree with the reviewer a reference is given: Batisani gave a reference: Mulwa, Richard; and Mariara, Jane. 2016. Natural resource curse in Africa: Dutch Disease and institutional explanations. AGRODEP Working Paper 0029. Washington, D.C.: International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI). <a href="http://ebrary.ifpri.org/cdm/ref/collection/p15738coll2/id/">http://ebrary.ifpri.org/cdm/ref/collection/p15738coll2/id/</a>
112	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	18	464	18	469	There is a reference error - I believe text should refer here to 'UNEP-WCMC (2016) The State of Biodiversity in Africa: A mid-term review of progress towards the Aichi Biodiversity Targets' and not to the version of 2010. The Aichi targets were set in October 2010 at COP10, in Nagoya, Japan. You can not assess progress made before the targets have even been set...	Added a new paragraph from the UNEP mid-term review published recently after countries submitted their 5th national reports. The reference was also added to the reference list.
113	George Atisa (GA)	18	474	18	474	I feel that this sentence needs to be completed - BES and Policies will mutually affect each other in such a process in a way that ensures the creation of more benefits and fewer losses to more Africans now and across generations.	Rephrased
114	CSIR BES	18	480	18	480	"Important differences "It is important to describe these differences and possibly explain why these differences	Yes. but with few words, considering length.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
115	CSIR BES	18	486	18	486	<p>These is what is said about thematic priorities in the IPBES document:  The African assessment will focus on thematic priorities [chapter 1 should mention these thematic priorities and also add any others that are important in Africa e.g.. civil conflicts/migrations/refugees; land tenure; equity; social relationship, spirituality, cultural identity], including: the food-energy-water-livelihood nexus [we should add health to the nexus]; land degradation; catchment to coast; sustainable use and conservation; and invasive species [alien invasive species will be described in details in chapter 4] [chapter 1 has to describe all these thematic priorities to inform why they are priorities at the regional level and add subregional aspects]. The assessment will also include the following cross-cutting themes to be addressed, as appropriate, as part of the thematic priorities listed above: trade agreements and foreign investment; and environmental health and zoonotic diseases [Also chapter 1 has to describe all these cross-cutting themes to inform why they are important at the regional level and at the subregional level].  [...] The thematic priorities [referred to in section I.A] highlight both the unique</p>	<p>The review comment vindicates the relevance of the chapter as it currently stands. All the points mentioned are already there. A small note on trade agreements and foreign investment decisions will be added in relation to sovereignty (raised by reviewer) and also BES. The reviewer's conclusion that "The description as it was done in the current draft is a bit complicated. and may not deliver well the messages that chapter 1 is to deliver to set the scene" does not reflect the key fact that chap 1 is actually addressing all the thematic concerns. It is difficult to see how to act on this conclusion, which may denote some a bias.</p>

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>biocultural heritage of the region and the critical role that biodiversity and ecosystem services play in improving livelihoods within the context of demographic change (population growth, gender relations and urbanization), economic growth and poverty reduction [It will thus be useful to have paragraphs and existing maps to describe these points while describing the thematic priorities and cross-cutting themes]. The assessment should focus on the links between biodiversity, ecosystem functions and nature's benefits to people [chapters 2 and 3 will have sections on these points], paying particular attention to questions of equity, social relationships, spirituality and cultural identity/diversity [chapter 1 should describe the questions of equity, social relationships, spirituality and cultural identity/diversity bcs they are not covered in details in the other chapters]. In addition, the impact of investment decisions on inequalities in terms of rights of access and use of nature's benefits and the impacts of such inequalities on human well-being, social relationships, spirituality and cultural identity need to be highlighted [chapter 1 should do this]. It is also important for the assessment to identify the impact of trade and trade agreements</p>	

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>on regional sovereignty and how these can impact biodiversity and ecosystem services. [chapter 4 should cover this among the drivers and measures takes to check biodiversity loss] The assessment should consider which policy and institutional drivers are internal to the region, as opposed to external drivers with internal impacts [chapters 1 and mainly 4 should cover this].</p> <p>Please, see highlighted in green in this comment box what chapter 1 should cover as recommended/suggested in the IPBES document. The description as it was done in the current draft is a bit complicated. and may not deliver well the messages that chapter 1 is to deliver to set the scene.</p>	
116	CSIR BES	18	491	18	491	<p>What about the other cross-cutting themes in IPBES scoping document: trade agreements and foreign investment; and environmental health and zoonotic diseases?</p>	<p>Those are already in framework (fig 1.5). Trade and health are explicit and other dimensions are embedded in the variables and the chapter as a whole. E.g. investment is always investment in something = food, health, population, water, energy, etc.</p>

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
117	CSIR BES	18	493	18	493	Also to population growth, trade, foreign investment etc.	Those are already in framework (fig 1.5). Trade and health are explicit and other dimensions are embedded in the variables and the chapter as a whole. E.g. investment is always investment in something = food, health, population, water, energy, etc.
118	CSIR BES	19	467	469	19	This does not explain the slow progress for all targets. NB: At this time i.e. before 2020, we cannot talk about 'governments having been unable to reach the Aichi B targets'	Paragraph changed.
119	CSIR BES	19	510	19	510	Please add to this caption more text to explain what you want to show, the linkages you want to highlight. What is the meaning of the arrows? While the figure looks nice, one cannot understand immediately the meaning. Also ensure the numbers in the figure correspond with what is in the text	OK, done.
120	CSIR BES	19	510	19	519	The caption needs to include something on IAS and habitat degradation and restoration. One can always wonder why climate change is not linked directly to health, poverty; why there is no mention of overharvesting, illegal collection of resources, land grabbing, industrialisation, pollution and technology, which are also important drivers. The meaning of having 'food, water and energy' in the middle,	Yes added to text in caption. But you cannot put everything in a figure.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						with no apparent link to anything, should be explained. The meaning of the arrows?	
121	CSIR BES	19	516	19	516	Do not think so. You may wish to check with those chapters CLAs	They are treated through the assessment. Rephrased.
122	CSIR BES	19	520	19	520	In figure 1.5, you added "and social justice"	Social justice is part of governance. Detailed caption developed.
123	CSIR BES	19	520	20	569	Section 1.3.1 – The second paragraph needs a good edit. One or two of the sentences don't quite make sense. The same comment holds for the 3rd and 4th paragraphs.	Section 1.3.1 was modified in depth
124	Ngozi Stewart	20	534		535	This is statement about women producing up to 80% of basic food stuff for household consumption is correct but should have a more recent authority (citation) attached to it. For example, UNDP working paper on Food Production and Consumption Trends in Sub-Saharan Africa: Prospects for the Transformation of the Agricultural Sector. WP 2012-011. February 2012. OR more recently, 'Drivers of Household Food Availability in Sub-Saharan Africa Based on Big Data from Small Farms' by Romain Frelat, Santiago Lopez-Ridaura, Ken E. Giller, Mario Herrero, Sabine Douxchamps, Agnes Andersson Djurfeldt, Olaf Erenstein, Ben Henderson, Menale Kassie, Birthe K. Paul, Cyrille Rigolot, Randall S. Ritzema,	Section 1.3.1 was modified in depth

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						Daniel Rodriguez, Piet J. A. van Asten, Mark T. van Wijk Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2016 Jan 12; 113(2): 458–463.	
125	CSIR BES	20	553	20	559	Not sure this quote is important. One can just use the sentence “To incorporate gender fully[...] is not to 'add women' but rather to redefine biodiversity in broader, more inclusive and even fluid terms (Rocheleau, 1995)” However this remark should come at the end of this section because the other paras are inviting to recognize women	Section 1.3.1 was modified in depth
126	CSIR BES	20	561	20	561	Replace "better " with more	Section 1.3.1 was modified in depth
127	CSIR BES	20	570	22	630	Section 1.3.2 – I know there is some standard text here; but could we shorten the other sections? Even just by a few sentences?	We left the standard text as it is and we cut some of the other paragraphs particularly those giving the same meaning in other parts throughout the text.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
128	CSIR BES	20	570	22	630	Suggest we delete this section '1.3.2 Indigenous and Local Knowledge (ILK)' including the Box. Secretariat gave a standard text we should use under methodology. The general discussion we have in current 1.3.2. is interesting but not suitable in chapter 1, which should remain focused on setting the scene. The secretariat's text gives just enough for chapter 1. If needed, we can make reference to the meeting we had at UNESCO where ILK experts were guided on the type of information we needed in the assessment. After that workshop, ILK experts gathered information and published. This is the kind of information we can add to the secretariat's text. If maintained, this section should be made more specific to Africa and the subregional aspects	We only deleted the box since it repeat what has been said in the text and the examples given were addressed in other parts of the chapter.
129	CSIR BES	21	579	21	581	Please move this to Methodologies	We left these lines in the same place as we think it better to keep them here.
130	CSIR BES	21	586	21	586	Also CBD Article 8j	No action
131	CSIR BES	21	590	21	590	What does "it" stand for?	We explained the word "it" in the text
132	CSIR BES	21	591	21	592	My suggestion is to keep only the most recent references when we have lists of references, unless a not-recent reference is critical. This will also reduce the length of	We kept one reference and deleted the rest from the referencing list



Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						the list of references, bearing in mind that an assessment is not a literature review	
133	CSIR BES	21	598	21	598	Better use reference to the CBD: UNEP, 1992 not ( <a href="https://www.cbd.int/traditional/">https://www.cbd.int/traditional/</a> )	OK suggested reference used
134	CSIR BES	21	607	22	621	Suggest we delete this generality	OK paragraph deleted
135	CSIR BES	21	621	21	621	Not sure this box is needed in this chapter on setting the scene.	OK box 1.6 deleted
136	CSIR BES	22	629	22	629	"influenced" by whom or what?	We added few more works to explain the sentence.
137	CSIR BES	22	631	25	693	Section '1.3.3. Climate change' belongs to chapter 4. In chapter 1 there are just key point we can mention: Africa is the most vulnerable while being the least emitter of GHG. Negative impacts are already felt by people, in agriculture, drought, shrinking of Lake Chad etc. Governments are very conscious and have started many adaptation programmes and projects, reduced deforestation (including by joining REDD+) and low C projects (energy, agriculture etc.), AMCEN African Strategy on CC, African countries INDC (intended nationally determined contributions), green and blue economy, Agenda 2063 etc. Please see (google) "FACT SHEET: CLIMATE CHANGE IN AFRICA - WHAT IS AT STAKE? Excerpts from IPCC reports, the Convention, & BAP Compiled by AMCEN	The sub-section is Africa specific and already focuses on key issues. Figures are pertinent and help setting the scene. We are keeping it but are using the AMCEN climate reference as well.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						Secretariat" for very useful projections in the face of CC, on many aspects (agriculture, population, economy in Africa). Information in these fact sheets can be used in both Chapters 1	
138	Sebsebe Demissew (SD)	23	645	23	645	In a recent study on coffee in Ethiopia ( Moat et al. 2017), it is shown that the current coffee growing areas will not be able to grow Coffee shrubs by the end of the century according to various scenarios on climate change (with an increase d temperature and less rainfall)	We can not add very specific and local examples. We are sticking to regional considerations in this section.
139	CSIR BES	23	661	23	661	Suggest we delete this "may" because adverse effects are being observed already	« may » removed on line 661
140	CSIR BES	23	665	23	665	why not "climate change impacts are"	Agreed, phrase is changed.
141	CSIR BES	23	667	23	667	Check this sentence again	Done
142	CSIR BES	23	673	23	673	Did we find such strategies? If yes, please refer to them , to the chapter where they are.	Done
143	CSIR BES	24	689	25	693	For the figures from CDKN, we probably need to check on permissions.	Done
144	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	24	689	24	691	Figure 1.6 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution	Done
145	CSIR BES	24	690	24	691	Best in chapter 4,not here. Delete	Graphic retained
146	CSIR BES	25	692	25	692	Fig 1.7 Again, this is best in Chapter 4 and should be modified to show central Africa. Madagascar is part of East Africa and adjacent islands	Graphic retained

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
147	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	25	692	25	693	Figure 1.7 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution	Done
148	CSIR BES	25	694	25	707	Section '1.3.4. Agriculture, natural resources and the food-water-energy nexus' should have been about the food-water-energy-livelihood security and health security. Agriculture, marine and freshwater fisheries should be discussed under food. In addition, we need to add hunting/bush meat and food collected in forest and savannas, including some insects and neglected and underutilized food. Agriculture will also be considered under water/irrigation; forest and mountains for water sources, and underground water. Population growth, urbanization, climate change are additional topics that can be included in the discussion of the nexus.	Yes. Section reorganized consequently. Title changed as "food, water and energy nexus, with fisheries and al. Included. Insects and bush meat not addressed (yet?). Security recast in a more central way. Water and sanitation included. Section restructured with nexus first, followed by water and energy. Recommend regrouping into (1) transversal issues (gender, ILK, CC); (2) Nexus; (3) (Response to) Biophysical threats (IS & LD); (4) Tenure, governance and security; (5) Sustainable use, trade and green=blue economy. The whole chapter could/should be divided in two parts (I) Introductory material; (II) Africa BES challenges
149	Patrick Ken Kalonde (PKK)	25	753	25	782	In this section I would love if we equally expound on existence of disputed boundaries for example the Malawi-Tanzania border dispute. Such issues are usually approached from a political point of view. This document could rather provide guidance in as far as management of disputed water bodies should operate to protect natural ecosystems.	Yes. Done.
150	CSIR BES	26	694	26	707	Combine this with text in the Box	Textbox eliminated

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
151	CSIR BES	26	697	26	697	We are in 2017! Ht is latest data?	Yes! Bring in latest data, about 1.2 B
152	CSIR BES	26	703	26	703	can we add health?	Health is dealt with in subsection 1.3.7, with population and poverty
153	CSIR BES	26	709	27	772	A lot of information in this section. What is not very clear is the message we want to convey. We can probably organize/address the issue in the context of water security and water importance for/role in food , energy, health and livelihood securities. We need to cover well both quality (clean) and quantity. Access; water governance. The subregional aspects should also be better organized. We need to link to MDG an SDG. Reference should be made to the Africa Water Vision 2025. Water and Sanitation for Africa, as a Pan-African intergovernmental agency.	OK. Redone and enriched with complementary info and references, incl. AWW25 and SDGs
154	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	26	722	26	722	use of 'we' should be avoided, use 'one'	all text redone
155	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	26	box	26	box	text box useless, it should not fall under para on water and it is too vague. To be removed	Box deleted
156	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	27	753	27	753	I want to belief the Africa regional assessment is not primarily based on existing policies related to water management alone. If my belief is valid; I feel this statement in line 753 should be re-structured to contain a phrase: "this Africa regional assessment will involve addressing	Yes. All text on water modified

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						existing policies... of different sub-regions, we will also take into account..."	
157	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	27	755	27	758	an example is needed to better illustrate now the Boko Haram terrorist movement has affected the inter-relationship among Africa countries of the region. Climatic impacts caused from the activities of the Boko Haram terrorist movement on integrated water profiles and other services of the ecosystems should be further discussed and established.	Yes, refugee crisis and other Boko Haram impacts mentioned
158	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	27	776	27	776	Rephrase the sentence in proper English	Done
159	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	28	791	28	791	should not the sentence be 'Non renewable sources of energy are replaceable' instead of 'Renewable sources of energy are replaceable...'	No that would change the meaning. We changed 'replaceable' with a better term and inversed the sentence to make it direct: "This types of energy sources are renewed within a lifetime through natural processes comprising..."
160	CSIR BES	28	830	28	835	Caption under Fig 1.8 is insufficient. It is very general. Figures need to speak to the readers and be about Africa. Exception should be the conceptual framework	Figure redrawn.
161	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	28	830	28	835	CO <sub>2</sub> on the ordinate axis is misspelled: the 2 is a subscript and not a superscript	Figure redrawn.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
162	George Atisa (GA)	29	849	29	851	Rather than ask the question - why not provide very specific recommendations for African governments: 1. Bazerman et al. (2002) quoting from Joseph Stiglitz talks of making wise trade-offs where policy changes should be able to create more benefits and less losses in society. 2. Focus first on the desired results and then on the goals.	Yes. But the question only introduces the following para, which look at a few options.
163	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	29	850	29	851	no need to use full text for SDGs - use only acronym	OK
164	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	30	891	30	891	change per cent to %	OK
165	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	31	958	32	1018	No mentioning of international fishery cooperations that are emptying Africa's rich offshore fishing grounds and depleting livelihoods of many	Mentioned.
166	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	32	999	32	999	explain what RCR8 stands for	OK
167	Edson Gandiwa (EG)	32	1016			Table 1.2 Consider adding the full figures in the Table rather than in brackets for the thousand	Rejected.
168	CSIR BES	33	1050	36	1152	Section 1.3.5 – Do check against the invasive species elements in Chapter 3. They also need to cross refer to you	OK

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
169	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	33	1051	33	1054	chapter wrongly written, gives the impression that introduction of species is only intentional, while most are accidental. Delete the sentence and start with explanation on means by which species are introduced and do not make it sound like introducing species is a good thing. This is not accurate.	Disagree. Most species have been introduced intentionally, few have been introduced accidentally. Introducing beneficial species which are not invasive is a good thing? The exception is alien species in the marine environment which are not usually intentionally introduced.
170	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	33	1055	33	1056	This sentence 'The impact of invasive species in Africa has not been given adequate attention' is contradicted by the sentence starting on line 1062 'Invasive alien species have an extremely harmful impact on African biodiversity'. Rephrase or explain better...	Disagree. First sentence indicates that more attention needs to be given to the issue. Second sentence emphasises that invasive species have negative impact on biodiversity.
171	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	33	1057	33	1057	citation should be 'Article 8(h)'	Agreed. Should include the brackets.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
172	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	33	1057	33	1057	rephrase the sentence 'despite several international initiatives' because the examples given between the brackets are not all 'initiatives', the Aichi Targets for instance. Article 8(h) of the CBD is not an initiative either... It is the text of a UN Convention.	Agree to reword although the setting of targets by these conventions could be considered as "initiatives" to encourage parties to address the issue of invasive species. The impact of invasive species in Africa has not been given adequate attention (Boy and Witt, 2013), and despite commitment to several international agreements and targets (such as: Aichi Target 9, Article 8(h) of Convention of Biological Diversity, International Plant Protection Convention, Ballast Water Convention), little or no progress has been achieved to reverse the negative trends in invasive alien species (UNEP, 2012; Tittensor et al., 2014).
173	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	35	1091	35	1091	Figure1.9: title of the figure (Direct and indirect impacts of pests and the benefits of their control) should be moved directly underneath the figure itself.	Layout issue. The figures have all been redrawn
174	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	35	1101	35	1116	very good chapter! Well written, clear and informative.	Thank you



Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
175	Sebsebe Demissew (SD)	35	1132	35		Indicate the negative consequence of <i>Prosopis juliflora</i> ? It outcompetes the indigenous flora and does not allow free movement for cattle.	Agreed. Will add sentence. "The advantages and negative impacts of introduced <i>Prosopis</i> have been explored. The negative impacts include: impenetrable thickets along water courses, invasion of pastureland, "harmful effect of thorns" and reduction of growth of indigenous plants (Mwangi & Swallow (2005) and Maundu et. al. (2011))."
176	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	36	1138	36	1152	good chapter.	Thanks!
177	CSIR BES	36	1153	39	1210	Section 1.3.6 – 1st sentence, can we change the wording here? Last paragraph – check against chapters 3 and 4. Paragraph above mentioned degradation – check against Chapter 4	Done
178	South Africa (SA)	36	1153	39	1210	The section on degradation is weak compared to the excellent IPBES Land Degradation and Restoration Assessment IPBES Second order draft. Specifically chapter 3 and 4, but of the LDRA Should be used to populate this section	Did not wish to expand since there is an LDR assessment too.
179	Thomas Brooks (TB)	36	1154	36	1154	Delete "western" - scientific concepts are used around the world	Done

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
180	Thomas Brooks (TB)	36	1157	36	1158	I don't understand "these practices as parts of the natural functioning of ecosystems, and" - if this is referring to anthropogenic land degradation and restoration, this makes no sense. Recommend deleting.	Edit. It means that some concepts in (Western) science see people as separate or 'threats' to ecosystem, while many indigenous communities see themselves as integral parts of the natural and supernatural world.
181	CSIR BES	37	1158	37	1188	The last sentence before the graphic – I would omit	Retained
182	CSIR BES	38	1190	38	1191	Figure 1.10: Delete the numbers, and superimpose the subregions to help readers to see where endangered terrestrial ecoregions are in the respective subregions. Complete caption. Areas of overlap or intersection': Caption should be expanded for clarity.	Done
183	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	38	1190	39	1196	figures 1.10 and 1.11 are very relevant	Thanks!
184	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	38	1190	38	1192	Figure 1.10 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution	Done
185	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	39	1194	39	1196	Figure 1.11 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution	Done
186	CSIR BES	39	1211	49	1583	In section 1.3.7 on Population, poverty and health, it is useful to present a graph of trend in population and projection to 2050 and 2100 (e.g., <a href="http://www.ifpma.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/regional-population-projections-centered-legend.png">http://www.ifpma.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/regional-population-projections-centered-legend.png</a> ).	Graphic created

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
187	Marie-Lucie Susini (MLS)	39	1211	49	1584	section 1.3.7. Population, poverty and health very well written, congratulation to the authors	Thanks!
188	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	40	1218	40	1218	Figure 1.12 needs to be created, missing	Done
189	George Atisa (GA)	40	1242	40	1244	This is another comment for the solutions - Bazerman et al., using the theory from the psychology of flawed decision-making, explains that many of the errors people make are as a result of the difficulties they have in making and understanding trade-offs. Wise trade-offs can expand resources available to an entire society. Citation; Bazerman M.H., Baron J. & Shonk K. (2002). You Cant Enlarge the Pie. Basic Books.	Suggest that this is a point which is considered in Chapter 6 and not here
190	South Africa (SA)	40	1256	40	1256	Should it not be Mutanga, et al, 2012?	No. We must follow the APA6 rules for citations. Not changed
191	Brian Mac Sharry (BMS)	41	1274	41	1274	Map (Figure 1.13) future (2025) does not show South Sudan	Done
192	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	41	1283	41	1283	Figure 1.14 needs to be created, missing	Done
193	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	41	1300	41	1300	Note in text, to be addressed/removed	Done
194	Brian Mac Sharry (BMS)	42	1310	42	1310	Map Figure 1.15 (dated 2012) Does not show South Sudan which became an independent country in 2011	Done
195	CSIR BES	42	1311	42	1311	Fig 1.15 should show the whole Africa including North and Southern Africa	Done

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
196	Marie-Lucie Susini	42	1311	42	1313	Figure 1.15: not relevant to provide-the map twice. Only one bigger map (whole page) should be provided.	Done
197	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	42	1311	42	1313	Figure 1.15 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution	Done
198	South Africa	42	1311	42	1311	Southern Africa is cut off in Figure 1.15. Urbanisation is very high in this region. In fact the 50:50 rate of urbanisation vs rural was already exceeded in 2002 - more urbanisation.	Done
199	CSIR BES	43	1334	46	1446	Section 1.3.7.4 on poverty – cross refer to relevant Chapter 4 sections.	Done
200	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	43	1340	43	1341	maybe a reduction in people living of under 2 dollars per day, but also a marked increase in the costs of living, so comparing apples with pears to me	DONE - THE FIGURES TAKE THIS INTO ACCOUNT. For evidence please see <a href="http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/poverty/brief/global-poverty-line-faq">http://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/poverty/brief/global-poverty-line-faq</a>
201	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	44	1368	44	1368	Remove "[source]" or you clearly cite your reference	Done
202	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	44	1368	44	1368	Source missing for figure 1.16	Done
203	South Africa (SA)	44	1368	44	1368	Not sure when and who calculated these figures about poverty, but I am sure they are not 0-10% in southern Africa! Please get up-to-date data from regions	Actual value in the source document is 10.3 % which was rounded to 10. No change made
204	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	44	1374	44	1374	Note in text, to be addressed/removed	Note in text removed. Wrong reference corrected.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
205	CSIR BES	50	1631	50	1632	Fig 1.17 'Structure and bundles of governance norms and principles': Please add caption. What is the meaning of "Governing includes economy"? Is this graph useful to chapter 6? If not, it may be good to delete.	Caption changed
206	CSIR BES	50	1631	50	1632	Figure 1.17 be omitted, or moved to Chapter 6? It's a great figure – but we need an eye to cross referencing and coordination between chapters.	Rejected.
207	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	50	1631	50	1632	Figure 1.17 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution	Done
208	South Africa (SA)	51	1664	51	1664	Old reference and not sure what this reference means? Murombedzi, 2003 - Adams, 2003?? Get up-to-date data please.	
209	Thomas Brooks (TB)	51	1664	51	1664	Maybe not appropriate to cite unpublished manuscripts?	
210	CSIR BES	51	1666	52	1701	Could rather cross reference to Chapter 6 in terms of decentralization and avoid adding more boxes	Several cross-references added along the text
211	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	51	1680	51	1680	There is an omission: "... started in countries like Mali, Niger and Burkina (Faso) in the ..."	Seems OK, don't understand the issue
212	CSIR BES	52	1703	54	1761	Protected Areas (Pas)– just check sections on PAs in Chapters 3 and 6. Then shorten it and cross refer – There are key message on PAs in the SPM.	Several cross-references added along the text

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
213	Thomas Brooks (TB)	53	1707	53	1709	I agree with this interpretation of the importance of the Fifth WPC - retain	Retained
214	CSIR BES	53	1724	53	1724	Fig 1.18 'Protected areas by governance types and biome in SSA' is only in SSA. It is good to have something that includes North Africa. Data exist and UNEP-WCMC/WDPA and IUCN can give a full map of Africa with PAs and their governance.	The figures have all been redrawn
215	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	53	1724	53	1725	Figure 1.18 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution	The figures have all been redrawn
216	Brian Mac Sharry (BMS)	53	1725	53	1725	Add Source of Protected areas on map as UNEP-WCMC and IUCN (2015) Protected Planet: The World Database on Protected Areas (WDPA)[On-line], [2015], Cambridge, UK: UNEP-WCMC and IUCN. Available at: <a href="http://www.protectedplanet.net">www.protectedplanet.net</a>	Since the figure is directly taken from Belle et al. (2015) it is the only source needed. Other sources will be quoted when the figure will be redrawn (see comment #214)
217	CSIR BES	53	1725	53	1725	Figure has no title or caption!	The figures have all been redrawn
218	Edson Gandiwa(EG)	53	1725			Consider updating Fig 1.18 to ensure that most protected areas are included. The WCMC has most of the updated maps	The figures have all been redrawn
219	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	54	1734	54	1735	Figure 1.19 needs to be reproduced in a higher resolution and refer to Belle et al. (not Bell et al.)	Belle is correct
220	Edson Gandiwa (EG)	54	1744		1744	Add reference to the statement	Reference added : Langholz & Krug (2004)
221	CSIR BES	55	1763	56	1839	Section 1.3.8.2 – Check with Chapter 6? I think there's some repetition here. Fine to cross refer, just check that you align, and I	Several cross-references added along the text

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						think you could make this section shorter, and simply cross refer to Chapter 6.	
222	Edson Gandiwa (EG)	56	1813		1813	Ensure proper citation of the reference	Done
223	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	57	1874	57	1876	June, 2016 is about 11 months ago. The official G7 progress reports has been published. Therefore citations should be properly quoted instead	Text changed. Reference added
224	South Africa (SA)	57	1875	57	1875	The G7 published report was in 2016. Why still say: "will publish the first official progress reports in June 2016"?	Text changed. Reference added
225	Michael Olusegun Ogundele (MOO)	58	1893	58	1897	useful example(s) of Africa regions where women are known to lose their rights to own a landed property after divorce or during widowhood should be cited. Examples are important to establish facts	This section was restructured.
226	Thomas Brooks (TB)	59	1974	59	1974	A useful citation for this sentence might be Hanson et al. (2009) Warfare in biodiversity hotspots. Conservation Biology 23: 578–587.	Chose not to use it.
227	Edson Gandiwa (EG)	59				Attend the box on the page and add caption	Box created.
228	South Africa (SA)	60	2000	60	2000	Please correct: In a 2012 paper (Adano & Daudi, 2012), to Adano & Daudi, (2012).....	Reference corrected
229	Moha Haddouch (MH)	61	2089	61	2090	Services accounted for more than 70% of the growth of Morocco, Tunisia, South Africa and Egypt	Comment not clear. Not addressed

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
230	CSIR BES	63	2126	64	2208	In last section 1.3.9, there is a need to cover equally blue + green economy and refer to AU on these issues. Island States, in particular Mauritius should be mentioned when referring to blue economy	The section addresses both blue and green economy. AU was added.
231	Edson Gandiwa (EG)	63		83		Ensure consistency in referencing, some have DOI other don't, i.e., journal articles	DOI not available for all.
232	Sebsebe Demissew (SD)	26-27	709	26 - 27		Under "Water in Africa' and "under Energy in Africa", include the huge hydropower potential in some parts of eastern Africa. Ethiopia in the next two years would build 6000 MW, part of which will be sold to Kenya, Djibouti and the Sudan increasing regional cooperation.	
233	Ngozi Stewart (NS)	9 box 1.1				In my opinion, the examples of biodiversity hotspots in Africa should be spread across regions. That is, one example from each region of the continent.	It is not a matter of opinion, hotspots exist or not in a given region. No action taken.



Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
234	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	Bearing in mind that Chapter 1 is just setting the scene, this chapter has to be shortened and just set the scene. In my views, we just need to present Africa, the distinct characteristics of the 5 subregions (mainly based on climatic factors and vegetation), the diversity of its ecosystems based on the units of analysis, an overview of the richness of its nature or species as well as genetic resources. Bearing in mind the challenges we face (food, water, energy, health, livelihood security, land degradation and restoration, invasive alien species, and sustainable management of biodiversity complicated by climate change, fast growing population, limited technology, unsuitable governance; security in general/conflicts, identity etc.), we need to highlight opportunities from economic evolution in the last decades, availability of arable land, potential in regional and global trade, potential in industrialization, and political will in the continent expressed in key documents Agenda 2063, NEPAD, 2016 Lome Charter etc.; and give some idea about the role of this assessment in the path towards sustainable development/poverty reduction/improved quality of life for all. Additional sections in the chapter will	Text was largely modified

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						cover the IPBES conceptual framework and methodology (for which we have a number of standard texts from IPBES Secretariat to integrate) and who can benefit from the assessment. We need to leave out of this chapter things that are covered (in depth) in the other chapters. Let us make chapter 1, an introduction to the assessment that will give the readers the elements they need to have in mind to understand the assessment and understand it in the framework of big pictures (Agenda 2063 and NEPAD, and SDG). There are many interesting things in the text we have, but many things can be a distraction and can discourage the reader.	
235	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	Chapter 1 ends rather abruptly! Could there be some bridging text?	Text was largely modified
236	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	In general, in all the chapters, we have to flesh out all the captions to Figures and make sure that everything we want people to see in the Figure is said in the caption. So, for each Figure, let us have the title of the Figure followed by explanations. People should be able to understand Figures without having to go to the core text. See in the (Sheet 1) what was described under the Figure of the conceptual framework, as an example.	The figures have all been redrawn

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
237	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	<p>Introduction to all the chapters should be short. Introductions are only meant to introduce the chapter and not discuss substantive issues. Substantive matters should be in the core of the chapters. Intros are just to tell us what is in the chapters and why; to link with the other chapters, and then say something about the main sections in the chapters. Please use the IPBES outlines of each chapter as basis for the introduction. In my view, intro to Chapter 4 (minus 2 or 3 paragraphs) is an example of what could be an appropriate introduction. The IPBES Conceptual Framework (CF). In the central panel, delimited in grey, boxes and arrows denote the elements of nature and society that are at the main focus of the Platform. In each of the boxes, the headlines in black are inclusive categories that should be intelligible and relevant to all stakeholders involved in IPBES and embrace the categories of western science (in green) and equivalent or similar categories according to other knowledge systems (in blue). The blue and green categories mentioned here are illustrative, not exhaustive, and are further explained in the main text. Solid arrows in the main panel denote influence between elements;</p>	Several text changes were done

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						<p>the dotted arrows denote links that are acknowledged as important, but are not the main focus of the Platform. Links indicated by numbered arrow are described in the main text (section on Linkages among the elements, and Box 2). The anthropocentric values of nature are embedded in the nature, nature's benefits to people and good quality of life boxes, and in the arrows connecting them. The intrinsic values of nature (represented by a blue oval at the bottom of the nature box) are independent from human experience and thus do not participate in these arrows (see Values section in main text for detailed explanation). The thick coloured arrows below and to the right of the central panel indicate that the interactions between the elements change over time (horizontal bottom arrow) and occur at various scales in space (vertical arrow). The vertical lines to the right of the spatial scale arrow indicate that, although IPBES assessments will be at the supranational-subregional to global-geographical scales (scope), they will in part build on properties and relationships acting at finer — national and subnational-scales (resolution, in the sense of minimum discernible unit). The resolution line does</p>	

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						not extend all the way to the global level because, due to the heterogeneous and spatially aggregated nature of biodiversity, even the broadest global assessments will be most useful if they retain finer resolution.	
238	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	It is critical to have maps of Africa with the subregions (and maybe with countries and names); map of subregions and superimpose main units of analysis i.e. forests, deserts, savannas, grasslands etc.; map of Africa with regional organizations (see page 26 in Atlas-NEPAD "A NEW EMERGING RURAL WORLD: An Overview of Rural Change in Africa". In this document, there is also a figure with urban population on page 20)	The figures have all been redrawn.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
239	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	<p>It is important to have in mind chapter 1 outline from the scoping document:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>I. About Africa/Context</li> <li>II. Conceptual framework and the framework for the science-policy interface</li> <li>III. Policy-relevant questions</li> <li>IV. Methodologies and approaches</li> <li>V. Relevant stakeholders</li> </ul> <p>If we keep to this, we shall satisfy the request of Governments/IPBES and have a very focussed chapter.</p> <p>Under “About Africa”, we need to provide information relating to SWOT (this is my advice) regarding achievement of sustainable development goals and thus achievement of good quality of life and, as indicated in the chapter outline, regional and subregional aspects of priority thematic challenges.</p> <p>When we want to go in details that should be in the chapters e.g. chapter 3, we can never be complete and we should remain at the level of generalities.</p> <p>Chapter 1 and section 3.1 and 2.4.1 in GEO-6 Regional Assessment for Africa should inspire us and give some information we can quote</p>	Several text changes were done
240	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	It may also be useful to give a Table listing global, regional and subregional	Should we really duplicate chap. 4? No action taken

Comment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						agreements signed by African countries. Such a map is in Chapter 4.	
241	CSIR BES	General	General	General	General	Thus, we need to present, among other things, Agenda 2063 and a few other key documents that governments adopted to guide the future of Africa, and SDG	Several text changes were done.
242	Rien E. van Wijk (REW)	GENERAL				Except for box 1.1, there is no mentioning of the migration of animals, e.g. birds, that have a vast influence on the continent's biodiversity, changes in biomass, availability of food and occurrence of pests etc. I think this deserves more attention, also in this more general introductory chapter 1	There are mentions to it in lines 321 and following (in the SOD submitted) but we may add more ?
243	Neil Burgess (NB)	p18	464			The report uses the 'State of Biodiversity in Africa report from 2010. UNEP-WCMC did a thorough update report in 2016 which is available online <a href="https://wedocs.unep.org/bitstream/handle/20.500.11822/9944/Biodiversity_Review_AFRICA.pdf?sequence=1&amp;isAllowed=y">https://wedocs.unep.org/bitstream/handle/20.500.11822/9944/Biodiversity_Review_AFRICA.pdf?sequence=1&amp;isAllowed=y</a>	The 2010 report is used in the introduction to recall past existing documents. In the text itself the version quoted is UNEP, 2016.
244	Neil Burgess (NB)	p53	1705	p53	53	For the PA stats for Africa I would tend to use the UNEP-WCMC protected planet report 2016 <a href="https://wdpa.s3.amazonaws.com/Protected_Planet_Reports/2445%20Global%20Protected%20Planet%202016_WEB.pdf">https://wdpa.s3.amazonaws.com/Protected_Planet_Reports/2445%20Global%20Protected%20Planet%202016_WEB.pdf</a> . The Belle 2015 report does give useful statistics on the governance of these areas though so I would keep that figure and section	When a peer reviewed paper exists our choice was to use it rather than reports.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
245	Neil Burgess (NB)	p55	1750	p55	1761	For review of community approaches to conservation in Africa see Roe et al. 2009 IIED report which is referenced later in this assessment	Chose not to expand on this due to length issues.
246	Neil Burgess (NB)	p57	1846	p57	1876	This is a mass of acronyms and needs simplifying	Several text changes were done
247	Neil Burgess (NB)	p6	155	Table 1.1:		This is a somewhat old typology of ecosystem services and links to ecology. There are other more recent reviews that maybe should be considered here. For example by Joachim Maes and associates within Europe. There is a wide choice of schemes and maybe whatever is chosen needs to be justified against the other alternatives.	A table from Chaudhary et al. (2015) was provided.
248	Neil Burgess (NB)	p61	1.3.8.4			This whole section is rather weak and could do with further work to bolster it	Several text changes were done.
249	Neil Burgess (NB)	p8	187	p.8	204	This is poor and there are other references - for example the WWF ecoregions book by Burgess et al. 2004 for land ( <a href="http://www.easternarc.or.tz/groups/webcontent/documents/pdf/Ecoregions_Book.pdf">http://www.easternarc.or.tz/groups/webcontent/documents/pdf/Ecoregions_Book.pdf</a> ) and Thieme et al. 2005 for freshwater ( <a href="http://www.easternarc.or.tz/groups/webcontent/documents/pdf/WWF%20-%20Freshwater%20ecoregions_Part1.pdf">http://www.easternarc.or.tz/groups/webcontent/documents/pdf/WWF%20-%20Freshwater%20ecoregions_Part1.pdf</a> ) and	



Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
						%20Freshwater-appendices.pdf). The Linder et al. 2014 paper is a good source, but not the only relevant one.	
250	Neil Burgess (NB)	p9	225	p9	235	There have been past biodiversity assessments of Africa that might be relevant here. Burgess et al. 2004 (see above web link). Thieme et al. 2005 (see above web link). UNEP GEO6 2016 Africa regional report (UNEP website; <a href="http://www.unep.org/media/docs/assessments/GEO_6_regional_assessment_for_africa_print_finallow_res.pdf">http://www.unep.org/media/docs/assessments/GEO_6_regional_assessment_for_africa_print_finallow_res.pdf</a> ). UNEP GBO4 regional report 2016 on Aichi Targets (	GEO 6 is quoted in 1.3.6. Several text changes were done.
251	Neil Burgess (NB)	p9	Box 1.1			This is mixing biodiversity hotspots as recognised in books and papers led by staff of Conservation International with various other considerations of biodiversity. It's a rather non-standard treatment of this issue. Personally I would tend to go back to using this paper <a href="http://www.extinction-workshop.psu.edu/pubs/brooks.pdf">http://www.extinction-workshop.psu.edu/pubs/brooks.pdf</a> and then maybe adding in some aspects from <a href="https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1691086/pdf/12204124.pdf?a_aid=3598aabf">https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1691086/pdf/12204124.pdf?a_aid=3598aabf</a> and <a href="https://www.uvm.edu/giee/pubpdfs/Burgess_2006_Biological_Conservation.pdf">https://www.uvm.edu/giee/pubpdfs/Burgess_2006_Biological_Conservation.pdf</a>	The second reference suggested is cited in fig. 1.10 and line 1173

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
252	Susan Ringrose (SR)		206			Clarity needed as to whether report intended to cover sub-Saharan Africa or the entire continent - and why?	Comment already addressed.
253	Jessica Thorn (JT)		277		277	Recommended references: OECD, Handbook on constructing composite indicators: Methodology and user guide. 2008, Paris, France: Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development Publications. And Muller, F. and B. Burkhard, The indicator side of ecosystem services. Ecosystem Services, 2012. 1: p. 26-30.	Reference "Muller & Burkhard, 2012" added to text and to the reference list.
254	Jessica Thorn (JT)		280		280	Suggest stating: Indicators are not are not independent of one another, and relationships between them are non-linear [80, 175].	Agreed. Sentence was added: "Indicators are not independent of one another, and relationships between them are non-linear" Reference?
255	Jessica Thorn (JT)		283		283	Recommend adding "stakeholders" and experts"	Agreed. The word "stakeholders and" was added.
256	Susan Ringrose (SR)		386			Lip service only paid to very important data/knowledge gaps - these issues needs to be brought out again towards the end of the chapter and suggestions made.	This section was expanded.
257	Susan Ringrose (SR)		1527			Fully state Libreville Declaration on Health and Environment in Africa, 2008	Updated to the full statement
258	Susan Ringrose (SR)		1607		1947	Issues of local governance are here dealt with in too much detail for an introductory summary and need to be summarised succinctly to be consistent with other parts of this chapter	Highlighted details have been proposed to chap 6. Trade will happen in a special session

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
259	Susan Ringrose (SR)		1648			For example: it is very misleading to refer to Africa as a region - when it is an extremely large and diverse continent without much real coherence or regionality.	The reviewer is not right. Africa is a "region" per international convention
260	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1649		1654	The word "unsophisticated " and "sophisticated" are quire value laden terms which one might consider revising.	Yes, but it describe colonial attitudes, to prepare for the following sentence
261	Susan Ringrose (SR)		1651			Need more examples of sophisticated pre-colonial societies such as the early Shona Great Zimbabwe and the Malian empires.	Brief references to empire/ states included
262	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1657			obliterated could be replaced with "devolved" or "removed"	Agreed. "obliterated" was replaced with "devolved"
263	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1668			francophone should be capitalized	Francophone was capitalised as suggested
264	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1672			Could the second approaches in the sentence be removed?	Agreed. Second "approaches" was removed from the sentence
265	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1684			Suggest removing "or so" after 20 years in the green box. Last sentence is not clear"	The words "or so" was removed. Last sentence changed to "In South Africa and Mozambique, the vast majority of catchment management agencies and water administration entities (CMAs) were not operational several years after the launch of their new water policies, resulting in non-functional water user associations in the water management schemes (Farolfi, 2010)."
266	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1687			"Conceptually and" is not clear	Rephrased

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
267	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1693			Decentralization should not be capitalized	Agreed. Capital D changed to d
268	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1725			Does this figure equate to the text about the current proportion of are under communal management of Protected Areas – discussed later the chapter?	The figures have all been redrawn. Figure relates to the previous paragraph (1715 - 1722) and the figure was referenced.
269	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1730		1731	Suggest rephrasing: “These restrictive policies had severe impacts on local people, including cases of forced displacements, and were a continuous source of tensions and conflicts around PAs.”	Sentence was changed as suggested.
270	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1737			Suggest rephrasing: “Beyond terrestrial biomes, such processes also occurred in marine environments”	Sentence was changed as suggested.
271	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1738			seventy = 70	seventy was changed to 70.
272	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1742			remove “or worse” – not objective	"or worse" was removed
273	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1750			Repetition	agreed. Repetitive sentence was deleted.
274	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1752			Suggest rephrasing: “Another constraint for governance is many African states have been quite reluctant to devolve the level of authority necessary for effective community governance of PAs”.	Agreed, sentence was clumsy and was replaced with the suggested.
275	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1783			Qualify who is referred to as “them”	Corrected

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
276	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1812			Add comma before “while”	Comma added
277	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1813			Referencing error	Reference style corrected
278	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1816			More explanation of the Kenya land Policy would be useful (e.g. 10% proportioned to local communities)	Chose not to expand on this due to length issues.
279	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1818			Suggest removing “information and land”	Agreed, removed.
280	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1820		1821	Italicize French words	Done, 4 words/sentences changed
281	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1822			Remove sometimes?	Agreed, the word "sometimes" was removed.
282	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1825			What is kebele level?	The word "ward "was added after kebele
283	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1832			Remove “or” before communities	The word "or" was removed
284	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1855			Why are some words capitalized and others not.	Those words not in capital were capitalised
285	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1857			“Knowledge and” could be removed – implicit in “lessons learnt”.	Agreed. "knowledge and" was deleted.
286	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1861		1876	This paragraph is slightly challenging to read with many acronyms and may be shortened	acronyms reduced and text shortened

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
287	Susan Ringrose (SR)		1861			Particularly dense area of unexplained abbreviations - all abbreviations need identifying in text.	Yes. NEPAD and CAADP are the only unexplained abbreviations and should be defined earlier in the chapter and not here. Both are AU programs: NEPAD: New Partnership for Africa's Development CAADP: Comprehensive Africa Agriculture Development Programme
288	Susan Ringrose (SR)		1882			Describe what Namati is and its modus operandi	Namati described but not its modus operandi for the sake of space
289	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1919			francophone should be capitalized?	Agreed. Francophone was capitalized
290	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1933			Suggest adding after "decision-making powers", supporting transparency, legitimacy and accountability in governance structure	Words added to the sentence as suggested.
291	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1934			Suggest removing "and " before "of their rights	The word "and "was removed.
292	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1935			Laws might be replaced with "legislation"?	Agreed, replaced laws with legislation
293	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1939			remove "has"	This refers to line 1739. "has" removed from this line. Amendment complete.
294	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1940			State driven should be "state-driven"	This refers to line 1740. Hyphen placed into "state-driven". Amendment complete.
295	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1943			Qualify "this" and suggest merging with the following sentence.	This and whole paragraph have been rewritten for more clarity. Policy debates about the legitimacy of

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
							<p>customary authorities continue, which are rarely engaged in official land administration except in a few countries, such as Sierra Leone, Ghana, Uganda and Cameroon, for instance (Hilhorst, 2010, Diaw and Njomkap, 1998). The literature indicates frequent reports of abuse or misappropriation of community benefits (Hilhorst, 2010). As with the case of women, however, it must be understood that not only are chiefs legitimate local actors that must participate in local governance but also that curbing abuses requires oversight, thus recognition, of the boundaries between authority and institutions (i.e. the underlying system of rules governing the tenure system). The confusion between the two has prevented this from properly occurring (Diaw, 2005). This is particularly significant at a time when, as documented by a vast amount of literature, customary system across the region are adapting in extremely varied and diverse ways to commodity markets and demographic changes (Buchanan-Smith et al., 2013, Diaw, 2005).</p>

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
296	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1963			Suggest adding "biodiversity" after ecosystem services.	Added word "biodiversity" to this sentence. Done in response to comment 296. Then removed biodiversity and rephrased the whole paragraph. "Allocation, distribution and access to ecosystems services, biodiversity and natural resources are at the heart of this hazardous combination."
297	Susan Ringrose (SR)		1964		1972	Connection between ecosystem services and conflict needs many more references and diagrammatic explanation. More concrete examples would be useful	More examples provided in the following paragraphs.
298	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1965		1969	Suggest rephrasing: They may constitute a direct cause of conflict, and yet they are entwined with the complex interactions of other factors, such as ethnic identity tensions, and historical, social, economic, legal and political factors operating at local, national and international levels (Onyige, 2011). This has broad tenure, governance and poverty implications.	Rephrased entirely



Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
299	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1969			Reference to what “these” refer to is slightly unclear. Consider removing “must” or rephrase this sentence. Perhaps more could be discussed relating to the critiques of Collier and Hoeffler’s (2000) model e.g. gaps in understanding governance and management of natural resources( Bensted, R. (2011) “A critique of Paul Collier's ‘greed and grievance’ thesis of civil war”. African Security Review Vol. 20, Iss. 3,2011) and the need to ascertain the motives of rebels (see Nathan, L. (2008) The causes of civil war: The false logic of Collier and Hoeffler. South African Review of Sociology Vol. 39 , Iss. 2.)	References included
300	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1979			Suggest removing “this includes” and change to “including”	Therefore, in discussing conflict and security in the context of BES governance, this analysis takes into account three critical levels that need to be differentiated: (i) causal dynamics in the rise of conflicts that can spill over into violence and armed confrontation; <b>including</b> climate change; (ii) the impact of conflicts on BES and socioeconomic conditions; (iii) the governance configurations needed to facilitate security and peace building.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
301	Jessica Thorn (JT)		2006			Suggest adding “financial and regulatory policies supporting the sedentarization of semi-nomadic populations”	Lines 2003 to 2008: ISS notes that spatial and temporal changes in rainfall patterns and frequent droughts make the survivability of African pastoralists in arid environments particularly difficult. This may be exacerbated by competition over access to pasture and water, livestock raiding and the widespread use of sophisticated firearms, causing clashes between herders and farmers in the Sahel, fighting in the Oromia and Ogaden regions of Ethiopia and violent conflicts in northern Nigeria, Sudan and Kenya.
302	Jessica Thorn (JT)		2036			Governance should not be capitalized.	Agreed and corrected in document.
303	Jessica Thorn (JT)		2039			Remove the full stop.	Agreed and corrected in document.
304	Jessica Thorn (JT)		2041			Suggest bring the phrase “if peace is to last” forward in the sentence.	Agreed and corrected in document.
305	Jessica Thorn (JT)		2046			Progressive instead of “good” initiatives? (value laden)	Have made change in document for now.
306	Jessica Thorn (JT)		2060			Remove “or” before rosewood	Agreed and corrected in document.
307	Jessica Thorn (JT)		2061			Suggest referencing Constanza et al 1997	Not included
308	Jessica Thorn (JT)		2063			Suggest removing “ climate” before emissions	Suggest amend to "greenhouse gas emissions". Change made in document.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
309	Susan Ringrose (SR)		1190 and 1194			These maps provide much useful information but are not supported (or referred to properly) in the text. It is important also to point out how they were made and their (local) limitations. Maps on other issues such as Land degradation, areas of conflicts/high refugee populations etc. need to be included and integrated into the text	The figures have all been redrawn
310	Jessica Thorn (JT)		1784-9		1789	Use uniform format when referencing countries such as OR e.g. (suggest (e.g. Ghana, Sierra Leone) to shorten the sentence)	Comment not clear. Does this refer to line numbers 1993-1994? No need to change this. Ignore comment. "In fact, land problems contributed to the eruption or exacerbation of conflicts in all the Mano River countries (Sierra Leone, Guinea, Liberia) as well as in Côte d'Ivoire."
311	Diane Douglas (DD)					Excellent introduction. Love the figures. I hope these will be available for download off the IPBES website after the documents are finalized and released.	Thank you! No Action.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
312	Susan Ringrose (SR)					<p>General: Chapter 1 much improved over previous version - but still very verbose with sections of excessive detail (see below). Would be useful to create a matrix-table showing all the conventions and declarations (say since 1990 or 2000) with ticks indicating how these have been received and or implemented in all (or most) of the African countries. Some details also omitted - for instance South Africa is one of the few countries currently undergoing environmental monitoring with community involvement (SAEON) which could be usefully adopted elsewhere in continent. Text wise, still great shortage of illustrative material - great need to improve on use of maps/infographics and make better use of those provided. Editorial needs still to ensure sentences are complete etc.</p>	Several text changes were done.

Com ment #	Reviewer Name	From Page (start)	From Line (start)	To Page (end)	To Line (end)	Comment	How Addressed?
313	Susan Ringrose (SR)					<p>Overall comment: Whole Africa Assessment needs much more co-ordination between chapters as there is excessive duplication and repetition. Authors should be given guidelines as to the level of detail required and what to include or exclude as currently the chapter content appears close to somewhat arbitrary with little overall co-ordination or effective editorial control. Also should be a properly crafted executive summary for each chapter. The overall assessment is in places incomprehensible (e.g. lists of species in tentative sentence format) partly because of the lack of spatial detail in the form of custom made maps and customised tables - suggest you obtain the services of a GIS professional to improve presentation of content. Importantly the co-ordinators need to a priori define say Africa as a continent (with or without the islands) and then define working ecological sub-regions which could be used uniformly in all (or most) of the chapters. These revised tables and maps should be integrated into the text wherever possible. The current rare (non-integrated) maps tend to be of low quality and in some cases are barely legible.</p>	Several text changes were done.