

Comments received during the external review of the Second Order Draft (SOD) chapters and for the First Order Draft Summary for Policy Makers (SPM) of the IPBES assessment of the sustainable use of wild species.

The review period was from 15th April to 27th June 2021

| Nb | Reviewer | Chapter | (1- From | Pag | From | Line | To Page | (ε | To Line | (er | Comments / Feedback | Response |
|----|---------------------------|---------|----------|-----|------|------|---------|----|---------|-----|--|---|
| 1 | Belgium | 2 | 0 | 0 | | | | | | | More generally, the document misses some references to the Local Biodiversity Outlooks LBO-2 as an example of a different indigenous perspective much more axed on wild use than the technocratic language & perceptions in GBO-5. It might be included in the chapter 2, but maybe also in a more policy-related chapter. | Thank you for your comment. On topics of this nature there are hundreds of possible references, and coverage in the assessment cannot be exhaustive. Although the suggested references are reasonable options, they do not add any substantively different information than is already covered by the present references, and further inclusion of even more supporting references is not necessary. |
| 2 | Betley, Erin | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | | | | We note that the reviews in this chapter are described as systematic reviews. We recommend consultation with guidelines and assessment criteria for systematic reviews developed by the Collaboration for Environmental Evidence (CEE) as there are some reporting standards that apply to this chapter and could enhance the uptake of this valuable work. Below we list relevant resources and recommendations for reporting. CEE Guidelines and Standards - https://environmentalevidence.org/information-for-authors/ ROSES - Reporting Standards for Systematic Evidence | Thank you for your comment. The IPBES processes include well-developed and tested guidance on conducting literature searches and selecting appropriate citations. This Guidance and the standards they use are binding on all IPBES assessments, and were followed in Chapter 2 as well as the assessment as a whole. |
| 3 | Burgess, Neil | 2 | 0 | 0 | | | | | | | As a general comment, the chapter may have missed papers that look at local / community based monitoring of use and sustainability and how this might inform decision making at local to global scales. An example paper in a recent special issue of Bioscience being | Thank you for your comment. This chapter undoubtedly does not cite many relevant and well-prepared studies. Such a task would require thousands of citations, and is both beyond the capacity of any assessment team, and not necessary for a comprehensive and well supported treatment of all its subject matter. Although the suggested references are reasonable options, they do not add any substantively |
| 4 | Germany | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | | | | General comment: We realized that there are numerous editorial issues and we expect these to be addressed before the next | The reviewer is correct that thorough editorial review will be part of finalizing the chapter. The authors thank the reviewer for calling attention to places where such |
| 5 | Germany | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | | | | General comment: Please provide confidence levels to give an indication about the scientific evidence base for important | The authors thank the reviewer for this reminder. The editorial processes in place for finalization of the Chapters includes a specific check to ensure IPBES Confidence |
| 6 | Guimaraes, Ellen | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | | | | General: Please add the literature reviews into a data management report specifying how and when these literature | The authors thank the review for this reminder. All Chapter 2 authors have now been taken through the IPBES process for storing the results of all Literatures in a data |
| 7 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 0 | 0 | | | | | | | Citations below with weblinks (URL) are given in the comments. Copies (pdf) of citations not readily accessible on-line may be | Noted with thanks. All authors have been alerted to that additional references and links, and will use them as needed in their work. Take into account, however, the |
| 8 | Singh, Baljinder | 2 | 0 | 0 | | | | | | | I did not see any information on forest fires & the risks to public health from such sources of air pollution. | Thank you for this comment. Forest fires and public health risks do not directly relate to the conceptualization of sustainable use, so this comment is beyond the scope of |
| 9 | Stenseke, Marie | 2 | 0 | | | | | | | | A very valuable chapter, a clear structure and thoroughly worked out | The authors thank the reviewer for the positive evaluation, and hope the final version of the Chapter continues to maintain such standards. |
| 10 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | | | | Overall, the chapter would be improved by a graphic/visual abstract that shows how all the various | Thank you for your comment. The executive summary has been substantially revised, with efforts to shorten it. However, efforts at developing a graphical display of the |
| 11 | United States of | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | | | | It would be helpful to organize the executive summary similar to how the key messages are formatted in the SPM. | Thank you for your comment. A valuable suggestion and the substantially revised and reorganized Executive Summary tries to follow this suggestion. |
| 12 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | | | | | GENERAL COMMENTS: Chapter 2 is not using the CF perspective. | Thank you for your comment. With regard to the naming of the types of uses, there were indeed differences among Chapters in the names used for the types of uses. |
| 13 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 1 | | | | | | | | Text could be greatly reduced by omitting telling us what the report will cover and just say what its findings are. It reads like | Thank you for your comment. The final Executive Summary presents exactly what the Chapter has contributed to the Conceptualization of sustainable use. The reviewer may |
| 14 | Koskela, Jarkko | 2 | 1 | 35 | 1 | 36 | | | | | Replace "sustainable timber harvesting" with "sustainable wood harvesting". | Thank you for this comment. The assessment has decided to use "logging" as the name for the practice based on the definition of FAO. Thus, we changed the phrase to |
| 15 | Kosse, Rachel | 2 | 1 | 36 | 1 | 36 | | | | | What is "sustainable viewing"? The term is not in the glossary and unfamiliar to me. | Thank you for this comment, indeed the adopted term in our glossary is 'wildlife watching', hence 'viewing' has been replaced with 'watching' throughout the chapter. |
| 16 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 1 | 36 | 1 | 36 | | | | | maybe clarify that "sustainable viewing" is about wildlife? | Thank you for this comment, indeed the adopted term in our glossary is 'wildlife watching', hence 'viewing' has been replaced with 'watching' throughout the chapter. |
| 17 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 1 | 9 | 9 | 1 | | | | | It is not explained well in the report why the timeline from the 1980s to 2010. | Thank you for your comment. The section of Chapter 2 presenting the History of Conceptualizations of sustainable use explains why the selected range of years was |

| | | | | | | | | |
|----|---------------------------|---|---|-----|---|-----|--|---|
| 18 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 2 | 52 | 2 | 65 | The "uptake of new ideas spreads across practices more swiftly that in earlier times" is discussed here as a consequence of the | Thank you for your comment. Although the sentence immediately preceding the phrase "more swiftly" does address primarily dialogue in the expert community, the |
| 19 | de Jager, Riaan | 2 | 2 | 72 | 2 | 77 | (Is Ref made to legal hunting / as bird nests are raided and thousands of nestlings harvested for food<15g per bird)Hunting | Thank you for your comment. This level of detail about current activities is the subject matter of Chapter 1 and 3, but not of Chapter 2. It has been passed on to the other |
| 20 | Diaz, Sandra | 2 | 2 | | | | General: this chapter represents a commendable effort to organize the different conceptualizations to sustainable use of | The authors thank the reviewer for the comment, and made every effort to ensure the final draft is even better than the draft viewed in this cycle. |
| 21 | Diaz, Sandra | 2 | 2 | | | | The executive summary is too long (11 pages) and too dense, resulting in people not fully appreciating the value of this | Thank you for your comment. The authors have succeeded in reducing the Executive summary by over a quarter, and giving it a more standardized structure. |
| 22 | Germany | 2 | 2 | 64 | 2 | 64 | 'than' instead of 'that' | Thank you, this was corrected. |
| 23 | Kosse, Rachel | 2 | 2 | 64 | 2 | 64 | "that" should be "than" | Thank you, this was corrected. |
| 24 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 2 | 76 | 2 | 76 | Why is sustainability capitalized here? | Thank you for your comment. This was corrected. |
| 25 | United States of | 2 | 2 | 55 | 2 | 57 | Sentence unclear. What does "the various ecological aspects of the practice" mean? What are more restricted conceptualizations | Thank you for your comment. The text was edited to make clear the distinction is between discussing how well a few previously acknowledged aspects of "sustainable |
| 26 | Aust, Patrick | 2 | 3 | 86 | | | It would be nice to see a subsection on colonial and post colonial dimensions of sustainable use in indigenous people and local | Thank you for this suggestion. We have included references in section 2.2.4 to colonisation processes and how these together with many other multifaceted |
| 27 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 3 | 86 | 3 | 104 | So far, the text does not reflect the struggle between preserving both indigenous practices and sustainable use of wild species, | Thank you for this suggested change. We have included some aspects about the dynamism and continuity of customary management systems and the pressures |
| 28 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 3 | 112 | 4 | 128 | Above the text says that sustainability was once considered to mean avoiding overharvesting and negative direct or indirect | Thank you for your comment. These ideas are covered under the broad Principle "Minimize ecological impacts". This is explained in the chapter text, but we realize |
| 29 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 3 | 112 | 4 | 128 | The text above states that sustainability was once considered to mean avoiding overharvesting and negative direct or indirect | Thank you for your comment. These ideas are covered under the broad Principle "Minimize ecological impacts". This is explained in the chapter text, but we realize this |
| 30 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 3 | 112 | 4 | 128 | Why do none of these principles mention the importance of reliable scientific data or the importance of preventing or | Thank you for your comment. The bullets reflect what standards were commonly found in the literature being reviewed. Specific points on harvested populations, and |
| 31 | Stenseke, Marie | 2 | 3 | 92 | 3 | 92 | Is it really possible to make such a generalization? | Thank you for your comment. The basis for this generalization in the Executive Summary is contained in the body of the Chapter, and as a synthesis finding, cannot be |
| 32 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 3 | 80 | 3 | 80 | this is an incomplete clause: "but vigorous debate among experts of where the correct answer lies" | Thank you for your comment. The clause has been edited slightly to improve readability. |
| 33 | United States of | 2 | 3 | 79 | 3 | 80 | Sentence unclear. What factors are being referred to? And the correct answer to what? Does this mean that there is no | Thank you for your comment. The sentence is very explicit - and correct - that there is debate about where a correct answer should lie. It intentionally avoids any implication |
| 34 | United States of | 2 | 3 | 106 | 3 | 112 | Use of "principles", "themes", "categories", and "concepts" is confusing. Suggest rewording to something like "Across all | Edited as suggested by the reviewer |
| 35 | Virnanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 3 | 87 | 3 | 87 | see the comment above | Edited as suggested by the reviewer |
| 36 | Aust, Patrick | 2 | 4 | 149 | 4 | 153 | Ideas less represented include proactively identifying ways in which sustainable use can be used to address global challenges | Thank you for your comment. The topics suggested by the reviewer are indeed topics that could be considered in broadening the conceptualization of sustainable use, and |
| 37 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 4 | 143 | 4 | 143 | Why only "western" in science? I do understand that the classical thought used to divide into two different bodies of knowledge or | Thank you for your comment. The phrase to be used for "scientific knowledge" generally has been discussed in depth for the entire assessment. The phrasing in the |
| 38 | Harrington, Alexandr | 2 | 4 | 134 | 4 | 134 | Add "and" between ";" and "minimize" | Word added as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 39 | Harrington, Alexandr | 2 | 4 | 144 | 4 | 144 | Add "and" between ";" and "the fair" | Thank you for your comment. Fair and equitable sharing was not the last phrase in the string. The necessary "and" is present just before the final phrase in the sequence. |
| 40 | Harrington, Alexandr | 2 | 4 | 134 | 4 | 134 | Add "and" between ";" and "minimize" | Word added as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 42 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 4 | 63 | 4 | 64 | Not clear what this sentence means; Does "developments" mean advancement? If so in which aspects? Pls.clarify | Thank you for your comment. "Developments" was intentionally used to be generic and include changes in any direction, and be non-judgemental with regard to whether |
| 43 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 4 | 64 | 4 | 70 | This section needs to be rewritten - it is too complex and academic to understand. what is the definition of small scale use? Also | Thank you for your comment. Hopefully the effort at shortening the Executive Summary and opening sections have improved clarity as well. Although the reviewer |
| 44 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 4 | 78 | 4 | 87 | this section is not well connected ; I think local, IPLC, and macro contexts needs to be laid out clearly before throwing rambling | Thank you for your comment. The contexts and scales are laid out fully in Chapter 1, and used consistently in the rest of the assessment - including Chapter 2. Hopefully |

| | | | | | | | | |
|----|--------------------|---|---|-----|---|-----|---|--|
| 45 | United States of | 2 | 4 | 125 | 4 | 128 | How is raising understanding and awareness different from capacity building? | Thank you for your comment. There are many parts of the world with both understanding and awareness of the challenges of sustainability, but the local |
| 46 | United States of | 2 | 4 | 130 | 4 | 131 | Didn't these principles come from reviewing global and regional policy documents already? Suggest adding definitions of what | Thank you for your comment. No single definition of "standards and policy documents" was used, because across the practices and among regions, what would be included |
| 47 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 4 | 128 | 4 | 128 | Suggest additional point: "Respect for the aspirations and rights of all peoples to access humankinds innovations and | Thank you for your comment. This is a reasonable consideration as a finding of the assessment as a whole. However, this part of the second chapter of th assessment is |
| 48 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 5 | 36 | 5 | 36 | Sentence incomplete. "Sustainable viewing?" Animals, flora, landscapes? | Thank you for this comment, indeed the adopted term in our glossary is 'wildlife watching', hence 'viewing' has been replaced with 'watching' throughout the chapter. |
| 49 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 5 | 34 | 6 | 51 | I suggest adding briefly (a sentence or two) about what extent these concepts were applied and their success (or not). For | Thank you for your comment. The entire section states clearly in the section heading that it refers only to developments in the academic literature. Material on what was |
| 50 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 5 | 190 | | 191 | Nice finding here. | Thank you for your comment, this is appreciated by the authors. |
| 51 | Germany | 2 | 5 | 194 | 6 | 197 | Please provide confidence levels to give an indication about the scientific evidence base for all important findings of this chapter. | Thank you for your comment. The suggestion was noted and processed for producing the final draft to ensure that confidence terms will be used consistently. |
| 52 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 5 | 90 | 5 | 90 | rephrase; sustainable use also has economic, and physiological aspects that are missing? | Thank you for your comment, however we could not find what the reviewer was referring so there were no corrections possible. |
| 53 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 5 | 118 | 5 | 124 | local, national, regional and global trade is the major driver for unsustainable extraction and use of wild species and there are at | Thank you for your comment. The authors believe that the collection of proposed Principles in the list includes the core concepts and principles of the Agreements |
| 54 | United States | 2 | 5 | 155 | 5 | 222 | This section is quite wordy and can be condensed. As an example, the sentence can be deleted, with text focusing on the | Thank you for your comment. Efforts to shorten the chapter as a whole have attempted to address the concerns with this specific section as well, with many |
| 55 | United States | 2 | 5 | 163 | 5 | 164 | "is impressive" is subjective. Suggest "Almost all principles except...have been adopted widely across all organizations and | Text was edited as suggested by reviewer. |
| 56 | United States | 2 | 5 | 176 | 5 | 180 | Sentence unclear, rephrase. Also, as this is an executive summary, mention what the Addis Ababa Principles are. | Thank you for your comment. The sentence has been reorganized to improve clarity, making the issue of competencies explicit. |
| 57 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 5 | 89 | 5 | 90 | "sustainable use of wild species is increasingly understood as a dynamic, social-ecological process, with sociocultural cultural | Text was edited as suggested by reviewer. |
| 58 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 5 | 89 | 5 | 90 | Big scale fisheries don't have a distinctive sociocultural cultural aspects of sustainable use | Thank you for your comment. Large scale fisheries may not have the same types of socio-cultural aspects as do small-scale fisheries, but there are social and cultural |
| 59 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 5 | 104 | 5 | 116 | Animal welfare aspects? | Thank you for your comment. These aspects do not appear in the Principles extracted from the Agreements and standards reviewed, and are not included for that reason. |
| 60 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 6 | 196 | 6 | 202 | Since we are talking about "more than half" (line 197) and "fewer than half" (line 200), I suppose the difference is not significant. | Thank you for your comment. The "less than half" and "more thahalf" were intended to simply indicate the relative degree of uptake of the various Principles. It is highlighting |
| 61 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 6 | 224 | 6 | 234 | Please define "sensitivity" and "specificity". | Thank you for your comment. The changes to the two following sentences provide the necessary explanation without adding definitions of two terms that are well-established |
| 62 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 6 | 235 | 7 | 236 | This sentence is confusing, please simplify. | Thank you for your comment. The sentence was reordered so the meaning is easier to follow, and the meaning of "sensitivity" is explained. |
| 63 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 6 | 204 | | 209 | Another good quantified statement but the sentence runs on for 6 lines. Too long. | Thank you for your comment. The sentence was divided into three shorter sentences, addressing the concern of the reviewer. |
| 64 | Germany | 2 | 6 | 215 | 6 | 222 | The conclusions in the SPM_FOD are much more explicit than in this paragraph. Quote from SPM_FOD p191529ff: "(C.1.1) [...] In | Thank you for your comment. Although the comment does quote the FOD correctly, the phrase quoted was one that had to be revised because when more evidence was |
| 65 | Germany | 2 | 6 | 226 | 6 | 229 | Please consider either citing Figure SPM.3 (p8, I215) or moving or copying the figure and its conclusions into this chapter below in order to improve context and emphasize the conclusion. | Thank you for your comment. The figure is not cited in Chapter 2, although at a slightly different place because of reorganizaiotns within the Chapter. |
| 66 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 6 | 154 | 6 | 158 | I think national scale is also important to local scale as the policy and legal framework are issued by the national government | Thank you for your comment. Each of the scales was considered of potential importance to some clients of this assessment. For that reason almost equal text is |
| 67 | Orenster n, Ronald | 2 | 6 | 197 | 6 | 202 | These general statements are not useful. What is meant by 'more than half' or 'less than half'? Was the split 51/49, 99/1 or | Thank you for your comment. The general statements are useful for communicating the specific messages intended for this section. The "more than half" and "less that |
| 68 | Orenster n, Ronald | 2 | 6 | 226 | 6 | 228 | Again, this may reflect practical differences among countries. Use of wild species may be a relative non-issue or of limited | Thank you for your comment. The authors agree with this comment, and again use the thinking behind comments of this nature as reasons for keep the statements fairly |
| 69 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 6 | 199 | 6 | 200 | tense change mid-sentence from "seek" to "committed" | Thank you for your comment. The tense now consistent. |
| 70 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 6 | 215 | 6 | 215 | missing a verb - "is" seen? | Thank you for your comment, the sentence was corrected. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|----|---------------------------|---|----|-----|----|-----|--|--|
| 71 | United States of | 2 | 6 | 204 | 6 | 209 | Sentence long and difficult to follow. | Thank you for your comment. The sentence was divided into three shorter sentences, addressing the concern of the reviewer. |
| 72 | United States of | 2 | 6 | 230 | 6 | 234 | Meaning here is unclear. The indicators are more sensitive to what? Does this just mean that indicators tend to lump practices | Thank you for your comment. Further text was added to highlight the implication of this low specificity of some indicators. |
| 73 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 6 | 173 | 6 | 173 | "flow of ecosystem services". Question: Is not preferable to use the IPBES CF terms? As NCP instead of flow of the ecosystem | Text was edited as suggested by reviewer. |
| 74 | Anissimo ff, Michael | 2 | 7 | 236 | 7 | 256 | It would be great to incorporate a table with the indicators used in indigenous peoples and locales communities. Or a table | Thank you for this suggestion. We had wanted to do this, but were able to find few papers that compared indigenous versus government indicators for a given context so |
| 75 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 7 | 251 | 7 | 252 | "... indicators - are sparse" | Thank you for your comment. This was corrected. |
| 76 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 7 | 253 | 7 | 256 | This sentence is long and some punctuation is missing, please correct. In addition, again, I do not agree with the distinction of | Thank you for your comment. The missing comma has been added, and the agreed phrasings for knowledge systems has been used. |
| 77 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 7 | 274 | 8 | 278 | Weak concluding paragraph. This is common knowledge and could be stated without any report. | The authors thank the reviewer for the comment. However, no edits were made to this concluding sentence. It may be common knowledge, as the reviewer states, that the |
| 78 | Kosse, Rachel | 2 | 7 | 251 | 7 | 252 | The second dash for the parenthetical is missing, it should be after indicators. | Thank you for your comment. This was corrected. |
| 79 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 7 | 197 | 7 | 199 | will this question be answered later, if yes it is good as IPLCs or ILK have different yet important understanding of sustainable use | No revision necessary, because the Chapter does address the issue in a manner very consistent with the expressed hope of the reviewer. |
| 80 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 7 | 247 | 7 | 247 | missing a verb - "are" important? | Thank you for your comment. This was corrected. |
| 81 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 7 | 189 | 7 | 191 | I find it very interesting to find a gender perspective | The authors thank the reviewer for the comment. The entire assessment strives to include a gender perspective in its considerations of sustainable use |
| 82 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 8 | | | | 7 pages far too long for a summary. It should be cut to one page. | Thank you for your comment, the Executive Summary has been reduced substantially, but quite a bit more than a single page is needed to summarize the main key findings |
| 83 | Germany | 2 | 8 | 277 | 8 | 278 | This reads like an unfinished conclusion. You may add at the end of the line "... but a wide range of approaches that are science, | Thank you for your comment. An additional line was added to make more explicit the most significant implication of this finding, although it is not the conclusion suggested |
| 84 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 8 | 228 | 8 | 236 | Here, should not the focus be on ILK and practices rather than on IPLCs? Monitoring of what? The context is sustainable use so | Thank you for your comment. The paragraph highlighted in this comment is summarizing the state of present activity. Two full paragraphs that follow deal directly |
| 85 | Germany | 2 | 9 | 282 | 9 | 282 | With regard to chapter '1.3.1 Unpacking the definition of wild species' please add a short sentence like: "The chapter follows | Thank you for your comment, it was addressed by Chapter 1. |
| 86 | Kosse, Rachel | 2 | 9 | 312 | 9 | 312 | Delete "in" it is repeated | Thank you for your comment. Duplicate word was removed. |
| 87 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 9 | 317 | 9 | 317 | see the comment above, here maybe thinking would be better word | Thank you for your comment. Although the "comment above" is unclear, there is no obvious place in the specified range of text where the addition or substitution "thinking" would be clear and add new concepts. |
| 88 | Kosse, Rachel | 2 | 10 | 337 | 10 | 337 | "is" should be "are" because the subject is plural, "accounts" | Thank you for this comment. The sentence is corrected in the last revision of the chapter. |
| 89 | Mahoney, Shane | 2 | 10 | 345 | 10 | 345 | This historical capture is a highly valuable contribution, in its own right, to conversations on sustainable use and the authors are to be congratulated for addressing the issue in this context. It serves to remind us that the concept is not a reaction to alternative conservation views, nor a construct derived from | Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter's authors. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|---------------------------|---|----|-----|----|-----|--|---|
| 90 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 10 | 295 | 13 | 436 | The historical description is very interesting and complete, but it refers exclusively to the global north in its own territory. Little is said about colonial extractivisms. Many ideas about sustainability also circulated in southern academic environments in the 1980s. Some references to these environments could be | Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors. Thank you also for your suggestion. The colonial extractivisms are referred to in the introduction. We cannot add additional text to the chapter due to length restrictions. |
| 91 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 10 | 331 | 10 | 331 | maybe sustainable "engagement" is better word than "use". Species are not only used but engaged with in diverse ways as they are animated. -> to change the ctext throughout thinking of this aspect that challenges the Western thinking, and is at the core of the report. | Thank you for your comment. The reviewer raises an interesting point, but the Chapter - and the full assessment, are written to be consistent with the Terms of Reference specified by the IPBES Plenary, and are not open to changes of this nature. However, the assessment does explicitly note that not all uses are consumptive uses, and includes "wildlife watching" as one of the five practices considered. This should |
| 92 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 10 | 320 | | | Replace with: " traditional livelihoods, although changing and adapting with new technologies, have remained closely tied to nature," | Thank you for your comment. This section of the Chapter is specifically about the history and evolution of the conceptualization of sustainable use. Later sections of this Chapter, and parts of most of the other Chapters, do devote substantial attention to how contemporary members and cultures of indigenous people and local communities have been affected by, and in some cases adopted aspects of, modern technologies. But for this part of the Chapter, the proposed additional phrases would |
| 93 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 10 | 350 | 10 | 350 | The survival and well-being of people has always depended on | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 94 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 10 | 351 | 10 | 351 | Start new sentence with "Individual considerations | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 95 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 10 | 345 | 14 | 481 | Two points within this section. 1. a fundamental issue linked to the development of the concept of "sustainability" is recognising there is influence over the "future". Many Indigenous cultures adapted to what the future brought, be it flood, famine, drought, fire, seasonal abundance, seasonal scarcity etc. But as the need | Thank you for making these points. They do not seem to require changes to the text and are topics treated extensively throughout the assessment as a whole. |
| 96 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 11 | 338 | 11 | 339 | Here the rapid expansion of Railway network and the wood slippers required to construct the tract also fuelled the need for sustainable extraction and supply of high quality timber (hard wood tropical species) | Thank you for making this point. It does not seem to require changes to the text. |
| 97 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 11 | 356 | 11 | 356 | Replace "concerned" with "uses by individuals for their needs and benefit" | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 98 | Germany | 2 | 12 | 424 | 12 | 424 | In this context it could be mentioned that John Muir can be seen as a proponent of a religious-conservative ideology, while Gifford Pinchot, in contrast to Muir, represents a more use-oriented path. See https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John_Muir#Legacy . | Thank you for this suggestion. We have chosen not to include it in the text, as it does not seem to add significant meaning to the section. |
| 99 | Germany | 2 | 12 | 429 | 12 | 430 | It could be mentiond that Rachel Carson had to step beyond the scientific system to get attention for her opposition to DDT by combining scientific knowledge and poetic writing (https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Rachel_Carson) Please rephrase: ..."attention after publications such as scientist | Thank you for this suggestion. We have chosen not to include it in the text, as it does not seem to add significant meaning to the section. |
| 100 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 12 | 381 | 12 | 383 | I think you should also mention the seminal work of Aldo Leopold - ecologist, forester and a nature conserve action advocate; He was instrumental in developing modern environmental ethics and movement of wilderness conservation. In particular his publication: A Sand Country Almanac is worth mentioning here. | Thank you for this suggested change. We have included it in the new version. |
| 101 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 12 | 401 | 12 | 412 | I know it is covered in detail later but the context of describing UN sponsored initiatives may require that you mention the first definition of Sustainable Development that was provided by the Brundtland Report | Thank you for this suggested change. We have not included the specific suggestion, but have altered the content to accomodate this point. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|-------------------|---|----|-----|-----|-----|--|---|
| 102 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 13 | 464 | 13 | 464 | Please provide a quick definition for sustainable development. | Thank you for this suggested change. We have not included the specific suggestion, but have altered the content to accommodate this point. |
| 103 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 13 | 420 | 13 | 420 | The same reference is cited multiple times; this narrows the source and diversity of knowledge on the topics | Thanks for this suggested change. We have included it in the new version. |
| 104 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 13 | 438 | 15 | 548 | The text referring to the historical question of sustainable use in international agreements is very didactic and clear. It would be interesting to explore if there are conceptual overlaps, or differences in the different definitions or if they all converge on certain concepts | Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors. Thank you also for making this point. Much of the rest of this chapter and the assessment as a whole do explore the suggestion made by the reviewer. . |
| 105 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 13 | 475 | 13 | 476 | Part of the reason for this definition difficulty is the process of dealing with the technical challenges of sustaining uses, but also the often highly diverse potential impacts (positive and negative), which are often context-specific, within the one definition. For crocodiles this has been overcome by separating them: use of | Thank you for making this point. It does not seem to require changes to the text. |
| 106 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 13 | 475 | 13 | 476 | An agreed definition of what constitutes "conservation", as it applies to biodiversity, and the goals of sustainable use, is equally elusive and the cause of much confusion. This specific issue is discussed in Chapter 1 of Webb (2014) and Webb | Thank you for making this point. It does not seem to require changes to the text. |
| 107 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 14 | 480 | 14 | 481 | Beside the "yes/no economic growth", please add the idea of the balance between sustainable use and loss/gain of economic growth (i.e. to introduce "quantity" and "intensity" as modulators of the dynamic conceptualization of sustainability). | Thank you for this suggested change. We have included it in the new version. |
| 108 | Fraenkel, Amy | 2 | 14 | 16 | 482 | 601 | The Convention on Migratory Species is noticeably absent from this summary of sustainable use of wild species and should be added. | Thanks for this suggested change. We have included it in the new version. |
| 109 | Kosse, Rachel | 2 | 14 | 496 | 14 | 497 | "United Nations Environment Program" Program should be written as Programme or it can be written as UNEP because it is in the list of acronyms and the first mention was spelled in full in chapter 1. This is repeated on line 512, page 15. Also "(WWF; now simply WWF)" does not make sense. Should it just read "(WWF)"? | Thanks for this suggested change. We have included it in the new version. |
| 110 | Mahoney, Shane | 2 | 14 | 482 | 14 | 482 | Once again, the authors provide a highly valuable tracing of the channels through which the sustainable use concept has sailed. | Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors. |
| 111 | Mahoney, Shane | 2 | 14 | 491 | 14 | 491 | It is worth noting that the term "wise use" was the term utilized during the revolutionary founding of conservation in the United States (and Canada) in the early twentieth century. | Thank you for making this point. It does not seem to require changes to the text. |
| 112 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 14 | 488 | 14 | 492 | See comment 11 above. CITES was specifically drafted to protect species from overexploitation - in modern terms, to ensure that international trade in wildlife was not conducted unsustainably. It was not designed to promote use - merely to prevent use from becoming overuse. Although some of its | Thank you for making this point. It does not seem to require changes to the text. |
| 113 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 14 | 500 | 14 | 500 | Again, reference should be made to the World Charter for Nature (see comment 18 above). Though nearly forgotten today, this was adopted overwhelmingly by the UN General Assembly in 1982 and has never, to my knowledge, been repealed or | Thank you for this suggested change. We have included it in the new version. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|--------------------|---|----|-----|----|-----|---|---|
| 114 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 14 | 506 | 14 | 506 | See p13 475-476. One of the most profound outputs of "Our Common Future" and the concept of sustainable development was the clear focus on the essential need to consider the future ramifications of resources uses being undertaken today. Up to that time, resource users were often opportunistically mining | Thank you for making this point. It does not seem to require changes to the text. |
| 115 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 15 | 552 | 15 | 557 | This text overstates the intention of Resolution Conf. 8.3. It should be borne in mind that this resolution was adopted as a limited compromise after the rejection of a number of draft resolutions proposed by Zimbabwe and other Southern African | Thank you for this suggested change. We have adjusted the wording, and included the suggested references, in the new version. |
| 116 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 16 | 631 | 16 | 633 | Considering the number of international instruments involved, the legal interpretation of terms relating to sustainability and sustainable use should also have been looked at, which should have meant searching journals dealing with international law. I have cited two such references in my previous comment. | The reviewer makes an important point, but it seems more appropriate to consider in Chapters 3 and 4, where evidence of actions taken or not taken under the various Agreements are reviewed. In a chapter on conceptualizations of sustainable use, we are able to review whether particular concepts are present or absent in the various agreements, but not how those agreements are then interpreted when applied in the |
| 117 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 16 | 559 | 16 | 559 | Why Practices in upper letter? | Thank you for your comment. Capitalization of "practice" is introduced in Chapter 1, as a method to differentiate when the word is being used in its colloquial sense, and when it is being used to refer to one or more of the specific practices used in this assessment |
| 118 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 16 | 573 | 16 | 574 | "review papers published in front-rank journals or chapters in key books". Does this mean then that 100% of the data is published in weog countries? There is nothing from anywhere else on the planet? | Thank you for bringing this up. Based on IPBES protocol, we carried out our literature review using English language sources. This is a limitation, and we explicitly mention this now |
| 119 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 16 | 580 | 16 | 580 | the six Practices must be presented before they are quoted | Thank you for your comment. The practices are introduced and delineated in Chapter 1, and then used consistently throughout the assessment. |
| 120 | Aust, Patrick | 2 | 17 | 630 | 17 | 631 | Need to make it clear if ranching systems are included or not. For example, crocodile farming involves closed cycle farms and ranching which is dependent on the wild harvest of eggs. | Thank you for your comment. The scope of "wild species" is explained in Chapter 1 and the Glossary, and is used consistently throughout the assessment. Wild species for this assessment does not include aquaculture facilities, game ranches etc. |
| 121 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 17 | 624 | 17 | 624 | A reference to papers continuing to be cited after being discredited is Banobi et al. 2011. | Thank you for this reference, we have added it. |
| 122 | Finnish Government | 2 | 18 | 672 | 22 | 803 | For the literature review there could also be taken into account thoroughly valid Regulations in the Norther European side, e.g. in Finland: https://mmm.fi/en/fisheries The key objective of the Finnish Fishing Act is to regulate fishing | Thank you for your comment. The chapter team did not have the capacity to review all legislation at the national level, and did not have criteria for selecting "representative" countries. Other Chapters in the assessment review specific cases such as the one proposed here. However, in terms of "conceptualization" the regional level is |
| 123 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 19 | 704 | 19 | 704 | With crocodilians it was found that assumptions and generalisations about their ecological value were not well-grounded in science, and not a sound basis for making management decisions (Somaweera et al 2020). For example, when the biomass of saltwater crocodiles was reduced by about | Thank you for your comment. This is valuable evidence on effectiveness of decisions, and the case history has been referred to Chapters 3 and 4. But the comment highlights shortcomings in application of a specific conceptualization, and not a distinct conceptualization in itself. Consequently it need not be added to Chapter 2. |
| 124 | White, Michael | 2 | 19 | 709 | 19 | 709 | add sea turtles (over 40 years of data) | Thank you for your comment. The phrase "other marine taxa with long life expectancies and low productivity" includes marine turtles, and avoids the need to add all the diverse types of species with those properties. |
| 125 | Biondo, Monica V. | 2 | 22 | 804 | 22 | 804 | Although the marine ornamental fishery is a century old and worth 1.5 billion US\$, it is often forgotten. It has to be taken into consideration that an estimated 40 million specimens of coral reef fishes are extracted each year from tropical coral reef | The reviewer makes a valuable point, but it is about shortcomings in the application of specific conceptualizations of sustainable use (that is failing to include information on fisheries intended for a particular market), and not a distinct conceptualization of sustainable use. Consequently it is more relevant for Chapters 3 and 4 and has been |
| 126 | Sigouin, Amanda | 2 | 22 | 834 | 25 | 838 | Perhaps would be clearer if consistent terms are used for the 4 traditional aspects of sustainable use in fisheries in the text to match table 2.2 and provide descriptions of each after in | The authors thank the reviewer for this helpful suggestion, which was implemented throughout the section as suggested. |
| 127 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 22 | 838 | 22 | 842 | subsidies have to do with power, we can ask why they are sustained if they are harmful | The reviewer makes a point very relevant to subsidies, but it concerns the drivers of subsidies, not their role in conceptualizations of sustainability. The subject of this comment is addressed directly in Chapter 4. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|-------------------|---|----|------|----|------|--|---|
| 128 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 22 | 856 | 22 | 856 | the social stature or status? | Thank you for your comment. The text changes as suggested. |
| 129 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 22 | 1083 | 28 | 1089 | Are there any negative hunting consequences or are only virtues in relation to population management? | Thank you for your comment. For the major sections of the Chapter that address components of sustainable use, there is a Subsection specially on hunting. Potential for negative as well as positive consequences of each use, including hunting are covered thoroughly in the various subsections on hunting. |
| 130 | Biondo, Monica V. | 2 | 23 | 837 | 23 | 837 | 1975 to 2019 were found using Web of Science and Google scholar. Of 284 peer-reviewed publications found on Web of Science, only 33 exclusively addressed the trade in marine ornamental fishes (Systematic review: M.V. Biondo, R.P. Burki "new papers about" | The reviewer makes a valuable point, but it is about shortcomings in the application of specific conceptualizations of sustainable use (that is failing to include information on fisheries intended for a particular market), and not a distinct conceptualization of sustainable use. Consequently it is more relevant for Chapters 3 and 4 and has been |
| 131 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 23 | 842 | 23 | 843 | | Thank you for your comment. The sentence was revised to avoid this potential ambiguity of phrasing. |
| 132 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 24 | 932 | 24 | 932 | Gathering alone does not capture the practice of wild collection, extraction, harvesting - both legal and illegal, and other form of collection; I feel Gathering and Collection even though are not synonymous but both are used to convey the same thing; so may be Gathering and Harvesting could be used? | Thank you, this is a comment to be addressed in Chapter 1, and been called to the attention of those authors. Chapter 2 will remain consistent with the classification introduced in Chapter 1 |
| 133 | White, Michael | 2 | 24 | 916 | 24 | 918 | Climate change is an intrinsic factor _ boats burn diesel | Thank you for your comment. Although the authors may agree with the point being made by the reviewer, the text reports how climate change is being treated in the literature, and in the recent literature on fisheries sustainability, it is still being treated primarily as an extrinsic factor. It is for later Chapters to present evidence of what |
| 134 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 25 | 952 | 25 | 952 | I think sustainable harvesting might give better and larger literature covering both gathering and collections as well as extraction; there is also Tapping of saps from Rubber Plants and | Thank you, this is a comment to be addressed in Chapter 1, and been called to the attention of those authors. Chapter 2 will remain consistent with the classification introduced in Chapter 1 |
| 135 | White, Michael | 2 | 25 | 927 | 25 | 941 | Cook Islands Marae Moana Act 2017 declares entire EEZ to be a multi-use marine park that allows industrial fishing and potentially deep sea mining: MPAs of 50 nautical miles around each island prohibit industrial activity ~ subsistence fishing | The authors thank the reviewer for the comment. However, Chapter 2 does not discuss the many individual cases of specific types of policies and measures. Rather, it extracts and presents the conceptualizations that emerge from the suites of case histories, and this specific case fits well within the the range of levels of protection and |
| 136 | Aust, Patrick | 2 | 26 | 960 | | | Table after line 960. Do ecological papers capture the rise of fisheries pollution (e.g., plastic fishing equipment, micro-plastics, bycatch from gost nets) as a source of discourse in academia? | Thank you for your comment. The papers being reviewed for this section do address bycatches and entanglements in lost fishing gear, and the generic concerns about habitat loss. However, pollution is being considered out of scope for the entire |
| 137 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 26 | 980 | 26 | 980 | Please consult Cohen, J. E., Williams, H. N., Strong, Y. E., & Fisher, H. C. E. (2020). Non-detriment findings for international trade in wild orchids from developing countries; A case study for Broughtonia sanguinea in Jamaica. Journal for Nature Conservation, 56, 125840 | Thank you for this reference. Since we followed a specific methodology for our systematic review, we are not able to include it in the results. |
| 138 | Sigouin, Amanda | 2 | 26 | 960 | 26 | 961 | In table 2.2 perhaps label the top four categories with something like " traditional aspects of sustainable use in fisheries" so it is more clear what that axis is; also might be helpful to describe what a paper scored in the same traditional aspect / factor | Thank you for your comment. This suggest about better labeling to row and column heading will be implemented. The other requested information is already present in the figure caption. |
| 139 | Stenseke, Marie | 2 | 26 | 970 | 26 | 973 | The selection of journals means a significant limitation. It would be good to add some comments on the consequences of this limitation, eg. not examining any journal in anthropology or rural studies | Thank you for this comment. Actually J of Ethnobiology is an anthropology journal (most authors are anthropologists), which is why we included it. Also many of the articles in Ecology and Society are written by anthropologists. So although there are clear limitations to using a small subsample, we feel that aspect was captured at least |
| 140 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 27 | 980 | | | The Results lack synthesis and make tedious reading; they just say what this and that study did. Details could be summarised in a table or graphic. The text would better focus on assessment of these studies. The key messages if any are not clear. | Thank you for your comment. The text attempted to present the diversity of streams of thinking emerging in the 20-teens, rather than select a subset of streams and present them as the key messages. In light of the increasing diversity of pathways emerging in these literature reviews, the important messages about conceptualization are the diversity of lines being explored in the literature. It is for the later chapters to review |
| 141 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 27 | 987 | 31 | 987 | "ranching" - Suggest change to 'cattle ranching' or 'domestic livestock ranching'. The term ranching is used widely in the wild harvest and subsequent raising in captivity of eggs and juveniles of reptiles e.g. crocodilians and is a recognized and defined term in CITES and IUCN useage. This form of use is widely practiced | "I Thank you for your comment. 'livestock' was added to the sentence and should address the concen. |
| 142 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 27 | 987 | | | We were advised by IPBES staff that use categories for vertebrates spending part of their life cycle in fresh water and part on land (e.g. frogs, turtles, crocodilians) should be included in the Terrestrial Harvest section and so i will provide more detailed comment and references there. See for general background on crocodilians: Page 1, P. 1997, Biological basis | Thank you for pointing this out. We have run additional searches of our subset of journals and years, including the terms frog, turtle and crocodil". This generated an additional 12 papers, of which 1 addressed the issue of sustainability of harvest, and is included now. We have revised the text to reflect this now. We are unable to add in additional papers that are not part of the systematic review. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|----------------------|---|----|------|----|------|---|--|
| 143 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 27 | 1027 | 27 | 1042 | This section needs considerable improvement in terms of the depth of review of literature; Researchers in Indian sub-continent especially India have done vast amount of work on sustainable gathering/collection, processing and using of medicinal and aromatic plants. The review seems to have created a bias by Co production needs to be dealt in a much more holistic and broader manner; To me, it is much broader that described, Co-production includes co-management, joint management, collaborative management and community | Thank you for your comment. The conceptualization chapter follows the IPBES guidance on literature review, and does indeed end up emphasising literature from Western Europe and Others Group sources. However, for the assessment as a whole, - and for selecting case histories in all chapters including 2, effort were made to ensure balanced global coverage of regions. This broad review of important case |
| 144 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 27 | 1044 | 27 | 1047 | Co production needs to be dealt in a much more holistic and broader manner; To me, it is much broader that described, Co-production includes co-management, joint management, collaborative management and community | Thank you for this comment. The idea of co-management and community management is mentioned pre-2010 and so we do not repeat it here. However, we have added the term co-management in that section now to be clear. In addition, we have added text to explain that what is new post 2010, is the idea of co-production of knowledge, rather than integration of knowledge for comanagement and other |
| 145 | Muir, Giulia | 2 | 27 | 973 | 27 | 273 | While less common in "northern" literature, many in "south" adhere to FAO's 1999 term "non-wood", might consider adding this term | Thank you. We reran our search including this term but it did not turn up additional articles within the subsample of journals. |
| 146 | Muir, Giulia | 2 | 27 | 973 | 27 | 1016 | see comment above, might also be useful to look at statistical definitions especially if the definitional exercise here is meant to be applied in practice for improving data: "the collection of wild growing | Thank you for this suggestion. Chapter 1 addresses definitions and so we did not address here. |
| 147 | Muir, Giulia | 2 | 27 | 996 | 27 | 1007 | I would also include Wiersum's facinating work on "rewilding" and biological, environmental, and cultural dimensions of "de-domestication" : https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10745-017-9949-7 ; https://library.wur.nl/WebQuery/wurpubs/527270 | Thank you for referring us to this article. Unfortunately we are not able to include it here since it doesn't address the factors that may lead to sustainable use. |
| 148 | Harrington, Alexandr | 2 | 28 | 1014 | 28 | 1014 | Indent at the beginning of the paragraph | Thank you for your comment, this was corrected. |
| 150 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 28 | 1101 | 28 | 1101 | may be better to mention eco-tourism or nature based tourism; is it tourism diversity or another approach to fund mobilisation for conservation of rare, threatened and vulnerable species? For example Trophy Hunting of Marco polo sheep in Pakistan is done to raise revenue for both supporting conservation and | Thank you for your comment however it is not very clear what is meant. Ecotourism and/or nature-based tourism are mentioned as a mechanism to fund conservation throughout chapter (i.e. in the context of economic sustainability of wildlife watching and hunting). |
| 151 | Stenseke, Marie | 2 | 28 | 1 | | | This is an overarching, why NCP could be used instead of 'ecosystem services', in accordance with agreed language and definitions in IPBES | Thank you for your comment. In Chapter 2 we are repoting on findings from reviewing literature on conceptualizations of sustainable use. Many of the papers reviewed use the term "ecosystem services" rather than Natures Contributions to People, and to reflect the content of those papers accurately it is necessary to use the terminology in the papers. |
| 152 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 29 | 1067 | 29 | 1070 | Poorly developed. | Thank you for your comment. We have expanded this section to describe in more detail the ideas on coproduction that emerged from our literature search. We are |
| 153 | Finnish Government | 2 | 29 | 1073 | 34 | 1260 | This contains good coverage of publications on issues arising from hunting, especially in southern countries, but remarkably | Thank you for your comment. The reviewer is thanked for the additional source. However, it does not fit vthe search parameters used for the assessment, and a check |
| 154 | Griffin, Cy | 2 | 29 | 1079 | 29 | 1079 | Also a general remark. It appears that trophy hunting is too often used as an example to inform the reader. Here ..recreational | The reviewer comments are noted, a seperation has been made between recreation and trophy hunting better refered to as sport hunting because of the motive for |
| 155 | Hull, Amanda | 2 | 29 | 1073 | 29 | 1073 | This discussion should include more evidence regarding effective regulation of hunting and hunting's contributions to | The reviewer is thanked for the comment, the effective regulation of hunting in the case of American states has been highlighted. |
| 156 | Hull, Amanda | 2 | 29 | 1079 | 29 | 1079 | It should be made much clearer for the reader that trophy hunting is but one sort of recreational hunting that involves a very tiny | Thank you. The context of trophy hunting here has been clarified as a form of sport "sport hunting" which slightly differs from recreational hunting where motivation is just |
| 157 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 29 | 1072 | | | " focus on hunting". This unexplained and apparently arbitrary focus causes the whole review to overlook important modes of | Thank you for your comment. The reviewer concerns are noted and more illustrations of hunting conceptualisation has been provided. |
| 158 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 29 | 1073 | | | Without a defintion or explanation of 'hunting' the direct commercial harvest of terrestrial vertebrates seems not to be | Thank you for your comment. The definition of hunting has been provided. |
| 159 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 29 | 1073 | | | For an historic pre 2010 account examples with numerous refereed citations see Freese C. 1998. Wild Species as | Thank you. The references were updated. |
| 160 | Stenseke, Marie | 2 | 29 | 1049 | | | spell out SES | Thank you for your comment. It was noted and adressed accordingly. |
| 161 | Judith Vutivi | 2 | 29 | 1074 | 2 | 1079 | include other reons for hunting - for trade of animal derivatives for making jewelry and sometimes for medicinal purposes. The | Thank you. Reviewer comments have been incoperated in the section highlighting the various forms of hunting and motives. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|-----------------------|---|----|------|----|------|--|---|
| 162 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 29 | 1079 | 29 | 1079 | "or combinations of all three". Rarely totally driven by one or the other motivation. | Thank you for your comment. The suggestion was noted and included. |
| 163 | Aebischer, Nicholas | 2 | 30 | 1086 | 30 | 1086 | The earliest reference quoted here is from 2003, but the idea of wildlife use as a tool for biodiversity conservation was expressed | Thank you. The comment was noted and the highlighted reference was visited and cited. |
| 164 | Anissimoff, Michael | 2 | 30 | 1115 | 30 | 1118 | Notice: It depends on the species. For example: the sex selective harvesting in the polar bear populations is an important | Thank you for your comment, this was addressed. |
| 165 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 30 | 1097 | 30 | 1184 | Hunting as a management tool is context and species specific but overall was also a heated debate pre-2010. However the text | Thank you. The reviewer's concerns were noted and addressed in text accordingly by highlighting the negative impacts of trophy hunting. |
| 166 | Guillema in, Matthieu | 2 | 30 | 1089 | 30 | 1090 | Not entirely true: fierce debate occurred for instance in North America in the 1970s-1980s about whether waterfowl hunting | Thank you for your comment. The negative impacts of hunting are highlighted in some sections of the discussion. |
| 167 | Guillema in, Matthieu | 2 | 30 | 1116 | | | "male individuals" not "male species" | Thank you for your comment, this was addressed. |
| 169 | Hull, Amanda | 2 | 30 | 1114 | 30 | 1115 | The statement in line 1114 is important but could be made clearer. | Thank you for your comment. The reviewer's concerns are noted and the statement was elaborated accordingly. |
| 170 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 30 | 1086 | 30 | 1088 | This concept was also developed in association with the harvest of crocodylians. beginning with direct hunting of alligators in USA | Thank you, the reviewer's comments were been noted and insights have been added to elaborate the point in this section. |
| 171 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 30 | 1091 | | | This concept was articulated many decades prior to Ostrum 2009 and might be more accurately ascribed to Leopold, A. 1949 | Thank you for your comment. It is noted, but the proposed citation could not be used as this review has been based primarily on review papers and limited in time span. |
| 172 | Mahoney, Shane | 2 | 30 | 1089 | 30 | 1102 | Overall, and especially in comparison with the fisheries section, this conceptualization section for hunting is rather weak and | Thank you for your comment. The reviewer comment has been noted, the conceptualization section has been improved by looking at hunting narratives in |
| 173 | Morgan, David (CITES) | 2 | 30 | 1099 | 30 | 1102 | Reference could be made here to CITES Resolution Conf. 17.9, which recognizes that well-managed and sustainable trophy | Thank you for your comment. The suggestion has been noted and incorporated in the section accordingly. |
| 174 | Stewart, Davyth | 2 | 30 | 1103 | 30 | 1118 | This section of the report makes reference to the theoretical claim that hunting could target post reproductive animals and | Thank you for your comment. While there are concerns on whether hunted animals are no longer productive, the cited literature here is based on the basic life cycles of |
| 175 | Trocchi, Valter | 2 | 30 | 1103 | 30 | 1118 | According to Perco (2020) the core of the matter of compatibility (coexistence) between hunting and conservation must be tackled | Thank you. The discussions highlighted in the comment here are drawn from articles outside the timeframe for recommended literature for this sub-section of the review. |
| 176 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 30 | 1090 | 30 | 1090 | Insert "by the time of colonisation" were viewed. With Australian freshwater crocodiles (<i>Crocodylus johnstoni</i>) "wariness" and | Thank you. Comment is noted and yes, this highlight behaviour change of hunted animals which is also highlighted in text. |
| 177 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 30 | 1116 | 30 | 1116 | This is a common assumption, but has it been demonstrated? If so should quote references or state that it is "often assumed". | Thank you for your comment, this was addressed. |
| 178 | White, Michael | 2 | 30 | 1116 | 30 | 1116 | replace 'species' with specimens | Thank you. The change has been made on this section and the context has been clarified. |
| 179 | Bliss, Cebuan | 2 | 31 | 1154 | 32 | 1162 | Other relevant hunting reference (pre-2010): Scruton, R. (2002). Ethics and welfare: the case of hunting. <i>Philosophy</i> , 77(4), | Thank you. The references have been noted. |
| 180 | Hull, Amanda | 2 | 31 | 1133 | 31 | 1133 | Consider including some reference to governance in the context of CBNRM. | Thanks for this suggestion, a few references were added. |
| 181 | Mahoney, Shane | 2 | 31 | 1128 | 31 | 1132 | Again, the absence of reference to all but trophy hunting in the African context | Thank you for your comment. References of hunting in other parts of the world has been added in response to the reviewer's comment. |
| 182 | Trocchi, Valter | 2 | 31 | 1154 | 32 | 1162 | It is written that "Since 2010, previously established hunting conservation values have been deeply contested". This seems to | Thanks for the insight. The section has been revised to capture this long standing debate on hunting. |
| 183 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 31 | 1131 | 31 | 1130 | A serious constraint for conventional agricultural "production" in remote areas is freight to markets. Tourism and trophy hunting | Thanks for this insight which has been effected. |
| 184 | White, Michael | 2 | 31 | 1130 | 31 | 1132 | Kwa-Zulu-Natal national park used this approach | The highlight has been noted with thanks. |
| 185 | Aust, Patrick | 2 | 32 | 1176 | | | debates about the role of zoonotic disease risk in hunting, trade and sustainability | Thank you. The issue of zoonotic diseases has been incorporated in the review. |
| 186 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 32 | 1184 | 33 | 1209 | Despite describing a balanced set of positive vs negative examples or outcomes of hunting, the paragraph finishes with the | Thank you for your comment. The raised comment is noted with thanks and the issue has been added to the section in order to maintain the balance between the pros and |
| 187 | Guillema in, Matthieu | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | For birds, the feather industry of the late XIXth and early XXth centuries (for hat fashion) has been devastating in many parts of | Thank you for your comment. This insight is quite appreciated and has been included in the review to highlight the impacts of hunting on various species. |
| 189 | Hull, Amanda | 2 | 32 | 1158 | 32 | 1161 | This also relates, importantly, to CBNRM. | Thank you for your comment, this was addressed. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|-------------------|---|----|------|----|------|--|--|
| 190 | Hull, Amanda | 2 | 32 | 1185 | 32 | 1185 | This statement should be qualified. Consider "some ecosystems". The citation speaks to a specific circumstance in | Thank you for your comment, the suggestion has been addressed. |
| 191 | Hull, Amanda | 2 | 32 | 1186 | 32 | 1187 | This is a very broad statement. It might be modified to "Hunting was often presented as one of the major contributors to animal | Thank you for your comment, the suggestion has been addressed. |
| 192 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1163 | 32 | 1182 | This section is unbalanced and biased. It gives a highly selected and biased account suggesting that hunting inevitably or even | Thank you for your comment. The reviewer's comments are noted, but the benefits of hunting have been fairly discussed in the review with some reviewers having also |
| 193 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | The contention that hunting is responsible for population decline in crocodilians is attributed to two citations completely ignoring | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 194 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | Sustained hunting of crocodilians in USA-a recent summary-Joanen, T. 2014 The development of the Louisiana alligator | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 195 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | Sustained hunting of crocodilians in Australia-historical review see Webb 2015 at https://iucnuli.org/wp- | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 196 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | Sustained hunting of crocodilians in Venezuela- Thorbjarbarson T. and A. Velasco 1999. Economic incentives for management of | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 197 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | Sustained hunting of crocodilians in Bolivia- http://aquaticcommons.org/2568/1/Ross%2C_J_2002_English.pdf | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 198 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | Sustained hunting of crocodilians in Brazil- Local Community Involvement as a Basis for Sustainable Crocodilian Management | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 199 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | Sustained hunting of crocodilians in Argentina -Larriera, A. 2011. Ranching the broad-snouted cayman (Caiman latirostris) in | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 200 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | Sustained hunting of crocodilians in Zimbabwe- Hutton J and Child G 1989. Crocodile management in Zimbabwe Pp 62-79 In | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 201 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | Sustained hunting of crocodilians in Papua New Guinea- Solmu G., R. Sine, E. Langlet and J. Nundima 2014. The ecological | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 202 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 32 | 1190 | 32 | 1192 | Sustained hunting of crocodilians in Mexico- https://unctad.org/system/files/official- | Thank you for your comment. The comments raised here are noted, but the issue of population decline as a result of hunting may be taken here in the context of the study |
| 203 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 32 | 1171 | 32 | 1173 | This point needs to be elaborated. Quotas are often driven by politics, desire to control predators (rather than conserve them), | The reviewer's comments have been noted, and the point has been elaborated in light of the raised comment. |
| 204 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 32 | 1171 | 32 | 1173 | This point needs to be elaborated. Quotas are often driven by politics, desire to control predators (rather than conserve them), | The reviewer's comments have been noted, and the point has been elaborated in light of the raised comment. |
| 205 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 32 | 1193 | 33 | 1195 | For more recent studies on the effect of defaunation through hunting on tropical forest ecosystems please consult Sreekar, R., | Thank you for your comment. The given references here are beyond the stipulated dates for literature for this sub-section, hence, these couldn't be incorporated here. |
| 206 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1170 | 32 | 1170 | Given one of the highest rates of vertebrate extinctions is amphibians (IUCN 2021), perhaps important not to imply this is | Thank you for your comment. The issue of extinction versus population decline brought here is difficult to separate and address in another way as the later ultimately |
| 207 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1179 | 32 | 1179 | No connection is known between global trade in crocodilian skins adversely affecting conservation of other wildlife species | Thank you for your comment however it is unclear and the context raised here does not apply to the highlighted line. |
| 208 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1184 | 32 | 1184 | The harvesting of wildlife species, through hunting, can have positive, negative or neutral impacts on the functioning and | Thank you for your comment. The raised concern about impact of hunting on crocodilian species has been addressed where mention is made that the issue of |
| 209 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1186 | 32 | 1186 | Not sure "was presented" and "was argued" (line 1187) are clear. Are these theoretical predictions or sound examples throughout | Thank you for your comment, the suggestion has been addressed. |
| 210 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1184 | 33 | 1209 | A report I just became aware of (https://news.stanford.edu/pr/2013/pr-fire-aborigines-wildlife- | Thank you for your comment, this was addressed. |
| 211 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1184 | 33 | 1209 | 1. The traditional practice of Indigenous people living and hunting "on-country" involved burning the spinifex, which allows | Thank you. The insight is well noted. It is similar to the one highlighted in the review on benefits of hunting to non-target species. |
| 212 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1184 | 33 | 1209 | 2. The traditional hunting of the larger varanid lizards, which have increased in abundance in hunted/burned areas, appears to | Noted and thanks for the insight. |
| 213 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1184 | 33 | 1209 | 3. The role of hunting, using traditional methods, including the breaking of all the leg bones of the dead lizard, as a traditional | Thank you for your comment. The cultural connections between hunters and wildlife has been discussed. |
| 214 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1184 | 33 | 1209 | 4. If they stop visiting these areas and hunting in traditional ways, so biodiversity will be reduced, and the abundance of | Thank you for your comment. The cultural connections between hunters and wildlife has been discussed. |
| 215 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 32 | 1184 | 33 | 1209 | 5. A serious commitment to enhancing conservation on lands occupied by Indigenous people, as outlined in Chapter 1, | Thank you. Agreed and this has been highlighted on cultural linkages of hunting and communities. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|-----------------------|---|----|------|----|------|---|---|
| 216 | Aebischer, Nicholas | 2 | 33 | 1205 | 33 | 1207 | "Restrictive hunting regulations was credited with contributing to the stability and increase in survival rates of mallard duck | Thank you. Addition has been made in line with the suggestion. |
| 217 | Aust, Patrick | 2 | 33 | 1209 | | | The 'hunting' of crocodilian eggs has been attributed for the successful conservation of several crocodilian speices, including | This contribution is appreciated. It has been raised before and incorporated. |
| 218 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 33 | 1197 | 33 | 1199 | In what way? | Thank you. This has been addressed by looking at how selection of safer zones alter breeding, roosting or wintering sites in birds. |
| 219 | Griffin, Cy | 2 | 33 | 1195 | 33 | 1209 | The comment above on chapter 1 page 30 is dealt with here in chapter 2 page 33, and elsewhere in chapter 2 | Thanks. The comment has been addressed accordingly. |
| 220 | Guillema in, Matthieu | 2 | 33 | 1223 | 33 | 1225 | any reference for this very strong statement? I am not saying that coastal hunting of birds is not an issue, but international | Thank you for your comment. The reference has been provided. |
| 221 | Guillema in, Matthieu | 2 | 33 | 1223 | 33 | 1225 | any reference for this very strong statement? I am not saying that coastal hunting of birds is not an issue, but international | Thank you for your comment. The reference has been provided. |
| 222 | Mahoney, Shane | 2 | 33 | 1207 | 33 | 1207 | While the reference to duck hunting is valid, hunting within the North American (and others) has led to many species' rescues. | Thank you for your comment. It is acknowledged and has been also raised before and a reference has been added that appreciate the role of hunting in goose populations in |
| 223 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 33 | 1203 | 33 | 1205 | The paper cited does not support this statement. Instead, Stenseth & Dunlop (2009) showed that hunting places unnatural | Thank you for your comment. The citation has been replaced accordingly. |
| 224 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 33 | 1209 | 33 | 1209 | Add text: However, poorly managed hunting continued to pose a serious threat across numerous ecosystems, especially where | Thank you. This has been raised by another reviewer and the section has been so ammended to include that view. |
| 225 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 33 | 1203 | 33 | 1205 | The paper cited does not support this statement. Instead, Stenseth & Dunlop (2009) showed that hunting places unnatural | Thank you for your comment. The reference has been replaced. |
| 226 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 33 | 1209 | 33 | 1209 | Add text: However, poorly managed hunting continued to pose a serious threat across numerous ecosystems, especially where | Thank you for your comment, this has already been adressed. |
| 227 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 33 | 1213 | 33 | 1213 | The ability to accurately predict sustainable yields, in the absence of testing, is compromised by the number of variables | Thank you for your comment however it is not clear as it appears to not be contradicting the original sense in the highlighted section and so no change has been |
| 228 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 33 | 1215 | 33 | 1215 | as indicating unsustainable levels. If not corrected, and continuous declines occur due to hunting offtake, the sustainable | Thank you for your comment. This has been addressed in the text accordingly. |
| 229 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 33 | 1219 | 33 | 1210 | Hunting quotas, likewise, cannot be set at sustainable levels based on theory alone, even if a lot of data exist. All will be | Thank you. This has been addressed. |
| 230 | Griffin, Cy | 2 | 34 | 1093 | 34 | 1097 | Reference in addition to (Casaer et al. 2006), noting that some waterbird and ungulate populations in Europe and North-America | Thank you for your comment, the reference has been added. |
| 231 | Hull, Amanda | 2 | 34 | 1235 | 34 | 1235 | It is important for the reader to understand that unsustainable bushmeat hunting to procure wild meat for human consumption | Thank you for this comment, the insight has been added. |
| 232 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 34 | 1234 | | | Again unjustified negative interpretation with highly biased citation selection suggesting there are no adequate monitoring | Thank you for your comment. The citations brought forward here falls outside the time frame for this sub-section of the review and so the comment raised couldn't be |
| 233 | Mahoney, Shane | 2 | 34 | 1234 | 34 | 1234 | Again, there is a very large vacancy with respect to the insights derived from research focusing on hunted species and hunting. | The reviewer comment is noted with thanks. The importance of insights derived from research and monitoring of hunts has been highlighted. |
| 234 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 34 | 1267 | 35 | 1275 | I'm concerned with the methodology used for the literature. First, restricting the literature search to only these nine journals | Thank you for your comments and literature suggestions. Some of the papers which you recommended are included in the analysis, as well a few other publications from |
| 236 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 36 | 1318 | 36 | 1319 | How did the authors divided and classified the groups? Note: I am not sure if lines 1367-1381 were the emergent | Thank you for your interest. The analyzed papers were classified in two manners. The first classification is based on representation of features (and groups of features) |
| 237 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 36 | 1323 | | | Pie charts? Apart from these being a waste of space the legend does nto explain what the scores are. | Thank you for the suggestion. This material was transformed it into a table. |
| 238 | Sigouin, Amanda | 2 | 36 | 1332 | 36 | 1333 | In table 2.3, Could make clear in the caption that the table shows the features in order of prevalence; might make more sense to | Thank you for the suggestion. The suggestion was adopted. |
| 239 | Sigouin, Amanda | 2 | 36 | 1332 | 36 | 1333 | 98% of the papers covered "Populations used directly and intentionally, whether harvested in whole or part"; seems all | Thank you for your suggestion. The additional text was included in the section of the Chapter. |
| 240 | Jones, Victoria | 2 | 37 | 1218 | 37 | 1225 | Perhaps this is not the correct place to mention it but it would be useful to mention the potential for bag limits/ quotas set at | Thank you for your suggestions. These are important issues, but are the subject matter of Chapters 3 and 4, where they are addressed in depth. These |
| 241 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 37 | 1402 | 37 | 1403 | I feel that the feature "Equity and Justice or Fair and Equitable Sharing of Benefits" should also be included and literature | Thank you for this suggestions. Although the topic you recommended is important, it was not identified in analyzed papers. It does not mean that it should be neglected, |
| 242 | Griffin, Cy | 2 | 39 | 1352 | 39 | 1352 | Additional reference: UNEP Guidance - Madsen et al. 2015. Guidelines on Sustainable Harvest of Migratory Waterbirds. | Thank you for the suggestion, it has been inserted. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|----------------------|---|----|------|----|------|--|---|
| 243 | Kosse, Rachel | 2 | 39 | 1365 | 39 | 1379 | I think the definitions of the groupings would make more sense before the pie chart to give it context. | Thank you for the suggestion. It has been changed. |
| 244 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 39 | 1387 | 39 | 1387 | Please consult Ripple, W. J., Abernethy, K., Betts, M. G., Chapron, G., Dirzo, R., Galetti, M., Levi, T., Lindsey, P. A., | Thank you for the literature suggestions. Instead, the analysis included Ripple et al., 2015. Collapse of the world's largest herbivores. Regarding the other reference, it |
| 245 | Trocchi, Valter | 2 | 39 | 1387 | 40 | 1393 | In reality, hunting is also a growth driver of species populations subject to hunting, as confirmed by Figure 3.51 (CH3, page 193, | Thank you for these examples. The systematic literature review did not capture these cases, possibly because its focus was on how hunting of wild species is |
| 246 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 39 | 1373 | 39 | 1373 | There are Governmental advantages in a species having commercial value. The ability to allocate resources for | Thank you for your comment. It is very relevant to Chapter 4 on Drivers and 5 and 6 on Scenarios and Policy options, and has been made available to those chapters. |
| 247 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 39 | 1380 | 39 | 1380 | For crocodiles, incentives for people to tolerate them is fundamental. As with other predators and crop raiders there are | Thank you for your comment. It will be provided to subsequent chapters, but does not directly address how sustainable hunting is conceptualized; rather it focuses on |
| 248 | Griffin, Cy | 2 | 40 | 1414 | 40 | 1425 | Meat obtained from hunting in Europe is of considerable importance although not strictly for subsistence - "The | Thank you for this comment. It is relevant to Chapter 3, since it provides insight into the current state of sustainable use at the global level, and has been passed to that |
| 249 | Guimaraes, Ellen | 2 | 40 | 1317 | 40 | 1322 | Please, also describe how the groups were defined in the coding | Thank you for the suggestion. All the requested material can be found in the Annex on Methodology. |
| 250 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 40 | 1422 | 40 | 1433 | For a contrary view see Cooney, R., C. Freese, H. Dublin, D. Roe, D. Mallon, M., Knight, R. Emslie, M. Pani, V. Booth, S. | Thank you for the literature suggestion. Although trophy hunting may have a positive role in wildlife management and conservation. However, the aim of this chapter was to |
| 251 | Mahoney, Shane | 2 | 40 | 1424 | 40 | 1425 | Wild meat hunting for subsistence is certainly distinct in its rationale and practice, but it should be noted that wild meat | Thank you for your comment. It supports the points already made in this Chapter, regarding the sustainability of hunting. It also emphasizes a particular use of products |
| 252 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 40 | 1399 | 40 | 1401 | I suggest expanding the literature search to include additional terms and journals to provide a more balanced view. For | Thank you for your comments and literature suggestions. Some of the papers which you recommended are included in the analysis, as well as a few other publications from |
| 253 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 40 | 1409 | 40 | 1413 | Including additional journal and search terms would provide a more balanced view here. There are many papers that raise | Thank you for your comments and literature suggestions. Some of the papers which you recommended are included in the analysis, as well as a few other publications from |
| 256 | Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 40 | 1414 | 40 | 1425 | Could you also take the points from the article Álvaro Fernández-Llamazares & Pirjo Kristiina Virtanen 2020. Game masters and | Thank you for your comment. It was passed to the authors working on the section of Chapter 2 that looks in detail at the perspectives of indigenous people and local |
| 257 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 40 | 1422 | 40 | 1422 | Placing a market value on wild species is interpreted as negative, unsustainable and a risk to conservation by some | Thank you for the reference. |
| 258 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 40 | 1424 | 40 | 1424 | replace "whereas" with "with" | Thank you for the suggestion, it has been changed accordingly. |
| 259 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 40 | 1425 | 40 | 1425 | if accept above ... delete "are" here. | Thank you for the suggestion, it has been changed accordingly. |
| 260 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 41 | 1448 | | | Detailed analysis of trade issues and examples with numerous referenced citations see The Trade in Wildlife, regulation for | Thank you for the literature suggestion. Trade is an important driver related to hunting. And this comment has been passed to Chapter 4. |
| 261 | Miketa, Madison | 2 | 41 | 1439 | 41 | 1441 | There is a significant amount of literature excluded from this review that highlights the complexities of lethal management for | Thank you for your comments and literature suggestions. Some of the papers which you recommended are included in the analysis, as well as a few other publications from |
| 263 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 41 | 1604 | 41 | 1604 | The numbering of the "hunting" points does not follow the criteria of the chapter. | Thank you for your comment. The final formatting of the entire assessment will be arranged by co-chairs and the secretariat. Regarding the other part of the comment, |
| 264 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 41 | 1440 | 41 | 1440 | large herbivores need to be mentioned | Thank you, it has been changed. |
| 265 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 42 | 1478 | 42 | 1485 | Despite having only few reviews on the costs of hunting, the authors did mention some important ones before. Interestingly, | Thank you for the suggestion. It has been added. |
| 266 | Guillemain, Matthieu | 2 | 42 | 1479 | | | It is important to be explicit here: not only the costs to the individual hunter (licence, ammunition) but also the costs to | Thank you for the suggestion, it has been mentioned. |
| 267 | Guillemain, Matthieu | 2 | 42 | 1479 | | | It is important to be explicit here: not only the costs to the individual hunter (licence, ammunition) but also the costs to | Thank you for the suggestion, it has been mentioned. |
| 268 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 42 | 1486 | 47 | 1678 | Timber extraction-Not reviewed- no expertise | Thank you for the note. |
| 269 | Mahoney, Shane | 2 | 42 | 1485 | 42 | 1485 | While comparisons between sections of this chapter cannot be taken too far, it is noteworthy that considerations of climate | Thank you for your comment. With regard to how climate change is addressed, in the literature review, for fisheries the impacts of climate change on ocean dynamics have |
| 270 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 42 | 1478 | 42 | 1485 | There is also the issue of commercial hunters/poachers reducing the numbers of animals hunted by local/subsistence hunters, so | Thank you for your comment. These dynamics are important, but are the subject matter of Chapters 3 and 5, and will be addressed there. |
| 271 | Shono, Kenichi | 2 | 42 | | 44 | | There is a detailed description of the various understandings and evolution in thinking of what sustainable timber harvesting means, | Thank you for this comment. We revised the introductory section of 2.2.3.5, stating that our aim is not to define sustainable logging as a novel concept but to describe its |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|---------------------------|---|----|------|----|------|---|---|
| 272 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 42 | 1466 | 42 | 1466 | Market value and profitability | Thank you for your comment, it was addressed. |
| 273 | White, Michael | 2 | 42 | 1480 | 42 | 1485 | Very important | The reviewer is thanked for his comment, Not revisions required. |
| 274 | Koskela, Jarkko | 2 | 43 | 1497 | | | Replace "timber harvesting" with "wood harvesting" here and throughout this chapter. | Thank you for this comment. The assessment has decided to use "logging" as the name for the practice based on the definition of FAO. Please refer to Chapter 1 for |
| 275 | Koskela, Jarkko | 2 | 44 | 1538 | | | Relace "sustainable timber harvesting" with "sustainable forest management". | Thank you for this comment. We consider logging as a subcomponent of forest management, and we explored the dimensions of sustainable logging under the |
| 276 | Butchart, Stuart | 2 | 45 | 916 | | | I'm not sure where it belongs in this section, but surely it ought to mention somewhere the most comprehensive indicator available | Thank you for your comment. This is an important point, but it deals with drivers of change in status, and with effectiveness of measures to prevent declines in |
| 277 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 45 | 1599 | | | what is the value in counting what how many papers studied this or that? All papers are not equal. I think the approach here is | Thank you for this comment. Showing the frequency of topics can draw a rough picture of the overall discussion in the field or at least among the reviewed articles. |
| 278 | Shin, Thant | 2 | 46 | 1621 | 46 | 1624 | There should be some possible ways and solutions for sustainable timber production such as elephant logging or cable | Thank you for the comment. As suggested, there are multiple ways to lower soil impacts, but our systematic review did not detect the suggested topics. Unfortunately, |
| 279 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 47 | 1678 | 54 | 1937 | Having wildlife tourism as my own topic of research, I do think that this section is well structured and comprehensive, despite | Thank you for this comment. No revisions required. |
| 280 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 47 | 1811 | 53 | 2089 | Very interesting this point of wildlife watching | The reviewer is thanked for his comment, No revisions required. |
| 281 | Costa, Raquel | 2 | 48 | 1707 | 49 | 1727 | It is tricky, because while the authors do need a protocol to select wildlife tourism-related papers, it is also the case that | Thank for this comment. It is certainly true that wildlife watching and tourism as an interdisciplinary subject of academic research are scattered throughout various |
| 282 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 48 | 1704 | 48 | 1704 | One generalisation about the role tourism plays in many remote areas, is that they are difficult enterprises to sustain, due to the | Thank you, a comment regarding volatility of tourism has been added. |
| 283 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 51 | 1826 | 51 | 1836 | How are the local communities here? I guess this refers to commercial fisherman etc? This should be made clear. And | Thank you for this comment. As Chapter 1 introduces, "local communities" can be engaged in any of the practices, not solely fishing, and may be pursuing either or both |
| 284 | Bliss, Cebuan | 2 | 52 | 1843 | 52 | 1848 | Other references: Carpenter, S., & Konisky, D. M. (2019). The killing of Cecil the lion as an impetus for policy change. Oryx, | Thank you for this comment. It is indeed a good reference on the role of the media in influencing perceptions on sustainable use. It has been provided to the cross-chapter |
| 285 | Bliss, Cebuan | 2 | 52 | 1876 | 53 | 1891 | Hiller, C., & MacMillan, D. C. (2021). How worldview and personal values can shape conservation conflict – the case of | Thank you for this comment. It is indeed a good reference on the role of the media in influencing perceptions on sustainable use. It has been provided to the cross-chapter |
| 286 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 53 | 2090 | 53 | 2090 | A good presentation is made of the relationship between IPLC knowledge and the sustainable use of wildlife. | the review is thanked for the comment. No revision is required. |
| 287 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 54 | 2112 | 54 | 2116 | Asia that has 75% of the IPs does not have any expert submissions? I know may we you did not get any volunteer but | Thanks for this suggested change. We have included perspectives from China and India in the section. |
| 288 | Cardoso, Betina | 2 | 56 | 2005 | 56 | | In 2.2.4. Diversity of indigenous and local worldviews and perceptions. To add in the line 2005, before the reference of | Thank you for your comment. As these references are examples to support a point already made, and not crucial to our critical evaluation, we have chosen not to include |
| 289 | Germany | 2 | 56 | 1998 | 56 | 1998 | Please enter the rating "(well established)" as indicated in SPM A.3.1 | Thank you for your comment. In the finalization of the Chapter and full assessment, care was taken to ensure the IPBES confidence terms have been added in all |
| 290 | Perez Gil, Ramon | 2 | 56 | 2000 | 57 | 2001 | IN section 2.2.4 Even though it is indicated as part of the text, there is no true worldview or perspective coming from Central | Thank you for this suggestion. We have extended contributions to this section and now includes perspectives from Mexico and Bolivia. |
| 291 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 56 | 2048 | 56 | 2050 | the sentence start with "for example", implying the Baniwa case will illustrate eroded privileged relationships but the case (and | Thanks for this suggested change. We have changed the text as suggested in the new version. |
| 292 | Suzuki, Kirie | 2 | 56 | 2001 | 56 | 2015 | 2.2.4 "worldviews of indigenous people and local communities" | The authors thank the reviewer for the comment. As Chapter 1 explains, throughout the full assessment, when information and perspectives of Indigenous People and |
| 293 | Suzuki, Kirie | 2 | 56 | 2001 | 56 | 2015 | 2.2.4 "worldviews of indigenous people and local communities" | Thank you for your comment. The focus of the assessment is on sustainable use and while non use and animal welfare are aspects increasingly being incorporated into |
| 294 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 56 | 2000 | 56 | 2000 | Please rethink of the use of "worldview", as embeds very Western idea as stated earlier. | Thank you for this suggestion. The term "worldview" is widely used in IPBES and IPBES-derived literature. We have opted to continue to use it in some parts of the text |
| 295 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 56 | 2020 | 56 | 2020 | Revise Pirjo Kristiina Virtanen (Lowland South America) | Thanks for this suggested edit. We have adopted it. |
| 296 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 57 | 2058 | 57 | 2058 | revise Brazilian | Thanks for this suggested edit. We have adopted it. |
| 297 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 57 | 2059 | 57 | 2059 | Revised The wild harvest of palm tree products (e.g., edible protein rich fruits and and other natural materials - such as | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|---------------------------|---|----|------|----|------|--|---|
| 298 | Virranen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 57 | 2061 | 57 | 2063 | Revise: Several palm species are also spiritually significant, and they are often regarded as guardians of other forest resources... | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 299 | Virranen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 57 | 2065 | 57 | 2066 | Revise: Among the Arawakan-speaking Apurinā and Manchineri in the Purus River Basin (Brazil), various species of palms are | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 300 | Virranen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 57 | 2068 | 57 | 2069 | Many of these species appear in their origin stories and some species even... | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 301 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 58 | 2306 | 58 | 2317 | This summary 65is grossly unrepresentative; you have missed the rich literature from India where AYUSH (Ayurveda, unani, | Thanks for this suggested change. We have included perspectives on a diversity of worldviews from China and India in this section. Aspects related to Ayuverda and |
| 302 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 58 | 2108 | 58 | 2108 | should it be "issues"? (missing an "s" | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 303 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 58 | 2318 | 58 | 2318 | Well presented this point | Thank you for your comment. The positive feedback is greatly appreciated by the chapter authors. |
| 304 | Stenseke, Marie | 2 | 59 | 2135 | | | Please translate the chant into English, so that it communicates to the wider audience | Thank you for your comment. As the expanded version of this chant does not have a published English language translation available, adding a new translation and |
| 305 | Germany | 2 | 61 | 2215 | 61 | 2215 | Please enter the rating "(well established)" as indicated in SPM A.3.2 and SPM A.4.1 | Thank you for your comment. In the finalization of the Chapter and full assessment, care was taken to ensure the IPBES confidence terms have been added in all |
| 306 | Virranen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 61 | 2206 | 57 | 2206 | revise: Indigenous and local socio-ecological systems, including their associated sustainable.. | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 307 | Virranen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | 61 | 2211 | 61 | 2211 | revise: the importance of overall well-being, social networks of sharing, ceremonial and ritual practices, and local ecological | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 308 | Biondo, Monica V | 2 | 62 | 2280 | 69 | 2281 | Marine Aquarium Council: Some attempts have been made to increase transparency in the marine ornamental fish industry. | Thank you for this reference. Since we are focusing only on active schemes, we are unable to include. |
| 309 | Germany | 2 | 63 | 2234 | 63 | 2234 | 'state' instead of 'states' | Thank you for your comment, this was corrected. |
| 310 | Guimaraes, Ellen | 2 | 63 | 2135 | 63 | 2135 | Please, follow the citation of ILK data | Thank you for this comment. We have clarified in the text that the citation refers to the seminal work of the Native Hawaiian scholar David Malo. |
| 311 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 63 | 2232 | 63 | 2232 | sustainable use (consumptive or non-consumptive) of an area is conservation. SU is inextricably linked to conservation, because | Thank you for your comment. The text was modified to replace "lead to" to say "be a central part of" to make the relationship more intrinsic. |
| 312 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 63 | 2232 | 63 | 2232 | There also seems to be a need here to briefly explain the link between 1. the extent of use, 2. the likelihood of population | Thank you for your comment. This explanatory narrative of the ways that different levels of use affect population status and productivity is more appropriate for chapter |
| 313 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 64 | 2277 | | | This table is most useful and example of how to summarise other sections. | The authors thanks hte reviewer for his comment, and will explore a similar approach to displaying results in other parts of the Chapter. |
| 314 | Germany | 2 | 64 | 2243 | 64 | 2243 | Please enter the rating "(well established)" as indicated in SPM A.3.3 | Thank you for your comment. The confidence term was entered in the paragraph above the table, The table and paragraph of narrative below it are presenting a |
| 315 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 64 | 2243 | 63 | 2243 | This principle is strongly embedded within conservation practices for commercially valuable crocodylian species (Hutton et al. | The authors thank the reviewer for the additional refernce, but the paragraph is about the contents of binding international agreements, and not about illustrative cases |
| 316 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 65 | 2417 | 65 | 2422 | Health especially primary health should be added as another broad categories | Thank you for your comment. Health was not an explicit part of the Agreements that were reviewed, and there is no obvious way to conjecture how "health" would have |
| 317 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 66 | 2456 | 66 | 2456 | Figure 2.3 is not clear | Thank you for your comment. Further explanatory text is added to figure caption, and better links to text in the immediately preceeding chapter have been added. |
| 318 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 67 | 2482 | 67 | 2485 | the BUS, ENGO, IGO and IPLC perspectives are very interesting in this comparative presentation | The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comment. |
| 319 | Ebora, Juan B. | 2 | 69 | 2000 | 65 | 2215 | It may be better if a discussion on Asian perspectives on the global marine environment is included. This I believe will be | Thank you for your comment. It is not clear where in this long portion of cited text the additional illustration is needed. The range of intensities of uses of living marine |
| 320 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 69 | 2581 | 69 | 2581 | test of scoring for Policy Analysis, is an interesting approach | The authors thank the reviewer for the positive comment. |
| 321 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 69 | 2622 | 69 | 2622 | any idea why you have such a low rate of provision of Policy documents? | Thank you for your comment. The authors wanted a balance of coverage of the three types of sources, to have all sources be global, and to have all sources be familiar to |
| 322 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 70 | 2311 | 70 | 2311 | This is the only mention of the precautionary principle in the entire chapter. Why was this principle not further explored and | The comment makes a valid point and all authors have been encouraged to keep the application of precaution in mind while preparing their texts. However Chapters 5 and |
| 323 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 71 | 2336 | | | Good figure but should be rotated 90 degrees so axes labels easy to read. | Thank you, we have rotated the figure. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|--------------------|---|----|------|----|------|--|---|
| 324 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 71 | 2683 | 71 | 2686 | I suggest to include Primary health or traditional medicine as a separate category as WHO itself agrees that between 70-80% of "are" or "can be adequately captured" | Thank you for your comment. The primary practices to be considered in the sustainable use assessment was discussed in depth by the IPBES MEP and Bureau, |
| 325 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 71 | 2341 | 71 | 2341 | | Thank you for your comment. The text says it is the "extent to which ideas" that are captured in the policies, and that is the correct phrasing. To say the "could be |
| 326 | Orenster n, Ronald | 2 | 72 | 2356 | 72 | 2357 | For transparency the full list of candidate organizations approached, including those not selected, should be provided. | Thank you for your comment. Given how extremely low the overall response rate was, the authors ended up taking a different strategy for identification of the agencies |
| 327 | Ebora, Juan B. | 2 | 73 | 2297 | 74 | 2333 | While the the agreements and standards are of international scale, discussion on global scale governance is somewhat amiss. | Thank you for your comment. Chapter 2 is not reviewing governance and governance processes in their own right. It is reviewing conceptualizations of sustainable use, and |
| 328 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 73 | 2416 | 73 | 2416 | Specific uses of individual wild species, tailored to a specific social, economic and biological context, that may be unique | Thank you for your comment. The proposed addition by the reviewer helps to qualify these documents in an important contct, and was taken in the revision |
| 329 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 73 | 2417 | 73 | 2417 | Replace "also takes" with "is increasingly obligated to seek guidance ..." | Thank you for your comment. The proposed addition by the reviewer helps to qualify these documents in an important contct, and was taken into account. |
| 330 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 74 | | | | is this place for "analysis" or should the report be "assessment" of already peer reviewed analyses? | Thank you for your comment, this overview of policy documents was not available in the peer reviewed literature. The tabulation of information from variety of sources is a |
| 331 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 75 | 2809 | 75 | 2822 | I suggest to include national and local perspectives and the uptake categories will be different in my view; Since sustainable | Thank you for your comment. The suggestion of the reviewer is noted and the authors agree that it would be valuable. However a comparable tabulation and summary at |
| 332 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 77 | | | 85 | Nice synthesis figures, another thing to keep. | The authors thank the review for the positive comment. |
| 333 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 78 | 2581 | 78 | 2581 | Dealing with many issues (waste management, work conditions, minimum wages, health, safety, gender equality) in some | Thank you for your comment. The authors agree that there are many reasons why specific activities might not be addressed by activity-specific policies. Considering the |
| 334 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 79 | 3027 | 79 | 3027 | Perhaps it is also European approach. This is a bias that the chapter has. | Thank you for your comment. The sampling of IPBES regions has no geographic bias, so the intent of this comment is unclear and cannot be addressed. |
| 335 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 80 | 2668 | 80 | 2672 | "Foster socio-economic benefits" in this context seems to downplay its critical importance. Suggest "provide" (see line | Thank you for your comment. The additional verb has been added to the phrase, but the initial tabulation of results is not changed, because the authors included both |
| 336 | Diaz, Sandra | 2 | 81 | 2551 | | | Figure 2.3 needs a more unpacked legend to allow readers make full use of it. | Thank you for your comment. The legends of all figures, including 2.3 have been expanded to make the final verions of hte figures more readily interpreted. |
| 337 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 82 | 2746 | 82 | 2747 | It may be true that FACE is the largest participatory hunter organization, but it seems ineffecient to overlook other large | Thank you for your comment. The capacity of the team of authros was insufficient to cover all relevant organizations in each category of use. Because the intent of the |
| 338 | Orenster n, Ronald | 2 | 82 | 2725 | 82 | 2725 | Other regional instruments that could have been examined include the SPAW Protocol and Agreements under the | Thank you for your comment. The intent of the this section of the Chapter is specifically to look at conceptualizations in the user communcities and groups |
| 339 | Germany | 2 | 84 | 2828 | 84 | 2828 | Please enter the rating "(well established)" as indicated in SPM A.3.4 | Thank you for your comment, his was taken into account. |
| 340 | Griffin, Cy | 2 | 85 | 2834 | 86 | 2835 | FACE produced a brochure on the European Charter on Hunting and Biodiversity, but the offical document was produced by the | The reviewer is thanked for the comment and the correct date is now used in the document. |
| 341 | Griffin, Cy | 2 | 85 | 2834 | 86 | 2835 | typo - FACE Biodiversity Manifesto (not manifest) (http://www.biodiversitymanifesto.com/) | The reviewer is thanked for the comment and the correct citation is now used in the assessment. |
| 342 | Griffin, Cy | 2 | 85 | 28 | 86 | 2835 | Correct that FACE has developed policy work on IAS, and help draft and implemented the Council of Europe's Bern Convention | The reviewer is thanked for the supportive comment. No revision necessary in the assessment. |
| 343 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 85 | 3240 | 85 | 3248 | once again, this summary will be different if your review covers all the important regions; Right now literature and perspectives | Thank you for your comment. The approach taken in the literature review follows the procedures identified by IPBES and approved by the MEP and Bureau. The regional |
| 344 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 88 | 3365 | 88 | 3365 | The Category "Fully Addressed" need to be better defined so that all experts examining regions are consistent in their marking; | Thank you for your comment. The lines in the preceding paragraph fully present the criteria of "fully addressed" as requiring "explicit comment of these networks and |
| 345 | White, Michael | 2 | 88 | 2873 | 88 | 2873 | Typo should be 'overarching' | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 346 | Diaz, Sandra | 2 | 89 | 2832 | | | Figure 2.4 needs a more unpacked legend to allow readers make full use of it. | Thank you for your comment. The capacity of the team of authros was insufficient to cover all relevant organizations in each category of use. Because the intent of the |
| 347 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 89 | 2925 | 89 | 2925 | "harvest rituals contained in the story emphasizes" - should be "emphasize" | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 348 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 89 | 2927 | 89 | 2927 | missing word: "and for the proper disposal the" should be "of the"? | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 349 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 89 | 2939 | 89 | 2939 | delete comma after regulation | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|-----------------------|---|-----|------|-----|------|---|--|
| 350 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 89 | 2942 | 89 | 2942 | check spelling of example | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 351 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 89 | 2944 | 89 | 2944 | delete comma after community | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 352 | White, Michael | 2 | 89 | 2927 | 89 | 2927 | Typo should be 'deity' | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 353 | White, Michael | 2 | 89 | 2928 | 29 | 2928 | Typo should be 'harvest' | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 354 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 90 | 3439 | 90 | 3440 | once again, what this "fully addressed" really translates into should be also mentioned | Thank you for your comment. The lines in the preceding paragraph fully present the criteria of "fully addressed" as requiring "explicit comment of these networks and |
| 355 | Muir, Giulia | 2 | 90 | 2965 | 90 | 2965 | May be beyond the scope of this exercise, however it would be worth looking through national laws and regulations at a sectoral | Thank you for your comment. The authors agree such a review would be informative, and hope the approach taken here may be picked up by the research community and |
| 356 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 90 | 2959 | 90 | 2959 | missing space between comma and sanctions | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 357 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 90 | 2959 | 90 | 2959 | insert space | Thank you for this suggested edit, we have change it in the new version. |
| 358 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 90 | 2961 | 90 | 2961 | "The existence of these customs and norms are fundamental to conceptualising sustainable use, and require individual programs | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 359 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 90 | 2972 | 90 | 2972 | Replace "among" with "within and between". In countries such as Australia there is a huge gulf between urban and rural population | Thank you for your comment. The authors appreciate the suggestion of the review, which is valuable in the context provided, and has been added. |
| 360 | Harrington, Alexander | 2 | 91 | 3017 | 91 | 3017 | Might be an idea to add something about the prospects for the post-2020 CBD agenda, even if this is speculative at the | Thank you for your comment. The Global Biodiversity Framework was not available at the cutoff date for information that could be considered in this assessment. Moreover |
| 361 | Harrington, Alexander | 2 | 91 | 3028 | 91 | 3028 | Strike the) after "developmet" | The editorial correction suggested by the reviewer has been undertaken. |
| 364 | China | 2 | 92 | 2885 | 92 | 2889 | Delete "For example, the consequences of felling a tree in a culturally protected forests range across five villages in | Thank you for your comment. Since the reference is relevant for our review and the comment does not provide a valid reason to remove this sentence we decided to keep |
| 365 | Harrington, Alexander | 2 | 95 | 3100 | 95 | 3100 | Capitalize Small Island Developing States | The editorial correction suggested by the reviewer has been undertaken. |
| 367 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 95 | 3599 | 95 | 3610 | Agree that the Education theme is well covered in the NBSAP but in achieving sustainable use education needs to be | Thank you for your comment. The observation of the reviewer is correct. However, Chapter 2 deals exclusively with the conceptualization of sustainable use. Chapters 3 |
| 368 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 95 | 3107 | 95 | 3109 | Important. This is a critically important reality in Australia, New Zealand and perhaps many countries (see comments on line | Thank you for your comment. This is important and was addressed in the assessment in various places when talking about IPLCs rights. |
| 369 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 100 | 3762 | 100 | 3762 | What methods and tools are needed to assess, measure and enhance sustainable use? For this question it would be important | Thank you for your comment, we feel that is was addressed in the last version of the assessment. |
| 370 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 102 | 3323 | 102 | 3323 | Should there be a statement like: "Specific traditional knowledge about wildlife and its uses by Indigenous people, including | Thank you for this comment on the relation between language diversity and the sustainable use practices. These aspects are comprehensively covered in Chapter 4 |
| 371 | Harrington, Alexander | 2 | 105 | 3458 | 105 | 3458 | Change "was" to "were" | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 372 | Harrington, Alexander | 2 | 105 | 3459 | 105 | 3459 | Suggest changing "replicate" to another word | Thank you for your comment. The editorial suggestion of the reviewer has been implemented, and improved the messaging of that section of text. |
| 373 | Harrington, Alexander | 2 | 105 | 3455 | 105 | 3455 | Strike "However" and begin sentence with "The commitments" | Thank you for your comment. "However" was changed to "nevertheless" to make clearer the transition of thinking from the preceeding sentence to this one. |
| 377 | Cardoso, Betina | 2 | 106 | 3501 | 109 | 3581 | In 2.3.1.1. Context and Literature review of Criteria used in Indicator selection. These articles are suggested for review | Thank you for the suggested references. We did not use them because we felt that the point using similar literature. |
| 378 | Harrington, Alexander | 2 | 106 | 3475 | 106 | 3475 | Change "like" to "likely" | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 380 | Harrington, Alexander | 2 | 106 | 3490 | 106 | 3490 | Change to "First," | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 381 | Vilá, Bibiana | 2 | 107 | 4046 | 107 | 4051 | Both figures are not clear | Thank you for your comment. If this refers to Fig 2.6 and 2.6, we have improved their clarity now. |
| 382 | Madhav Karki | 2 | 109 | 4105 | 109 | 4115 | In my views, current assessment of indicators lack proper understanding of the fundamentals; It seems to be that authors | Thank you for your comment, we feel that is was addressed in the last version of the assessment. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|-------------------|---|--------------------------|------|------|------|---|---|
| 383 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 110 | 3610 | 110 | 3611 | Delete "were properties"?: Many of the types of properties proposed for use in selecting suites of indicators were properties should be explicitly | Thank you for your comment. An editorial correction has been made to address this concern, although it was not exactly as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 384 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 110 | 3613 | 110 | 3613 | | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 385 | Germany | 2 | 111 | 3652 | 111 | 3652 | Please add a reference to chapter 1.6 and Figure SPM.3: "...as part of the overview of indicators as they relate to the | Thank you for your comment. The reference to Chapter 1 section 1.6 has been added. In general it is the SPM that refers to the chapters, and not vice versa, so that change |
| 386 | Betley, Erin | 2 | 116 | 3853 | 116 | 3853 | Sterling et al. 2017 should be 2017b | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 387 | Burgess, Neil | 2 | 116 | | | | For relevant scientific work that is in press in Journals but also in pre-prints see index based on Living Planet Index here | Thank you for your comment. The entire assessment follows the protocol for literature approved by IPBES. It only allows consideration of preprints of articles in exceptional |
| 388 | Burgess, Neil | 2 | 116 | | 126 | | As a general comment the approach of locating indicators of sustainable use using a literature review will miss the policy | Thank you for your comment. The later chapters of this assessment go more deeply into the indicators used operationally in evaluating sustainable use in many contexts. |
| 389 | Germany | 2 | 116 | 3842 | 116 | 3843 | Please rephrase: "Criteria and indicators translate scientific concepts of sustainability into factors that can then be measured | Thank you for your comment. The text has been edited to avoid the term "philosophical" in this context. However the specific suggestion of "scientific " was not |
| 390 | James, P. Ross | 2 | 117 | 3898 | 117 | 3900 | The reported absence of indicators for hunting is entirely due to the selection of hunting as representative of all terrestrial | The selection of practices used in the full assessment was agreed by the IPBES MEP and Bureau. For all uses, including hunting, it will be the case that as one moves from |
| 391 | Bronao, Monica V | 2 | 119 | 3515 | 119 | 3515 | The trade in marine ornamental fishes started in the 1930s in Sri Lanka and expanded gradually during the 1950s as air cargo | The reviewer is thanked for the additional references. However they are relevant to the implementation of approaches to keeping uses sustainable, but not to the |
| 392 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 119 | | | | tables are better than pie charts (See many criticisms of them online). Colours make categories hard to differentiate here too. | Thank you for this suggestion. Although pie charts have their limitations, given the number of categories we are presenting, we feel that tables would also be hard to |
| 393 | Orenstein, Ronald | 2 | 120 | 3978 | 120 | 3878 | Reference could be made to birding codes of ethics; see the America Birding Association code at https://www.aba.org/wp- | The reviewer is thanked for the comment. However, for Chapter 2 on conceptualizations, there was a desire to work at the global scale whenever possible. |
| 394 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | 120 | 3969 | 120 | 3969 | USDA 2011 not in lit cited | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 395 | Guimaraes, Ellen | 2 | 122 | 3930 | 122 | 3933 | Figure 2.6. Please, use color blind friendly colors | Thank you, we have revised Fig 2.6. |
| 396 | Singh, Baljinder | 2 | 122 | 4034 | 122 | 4036 | "In other words, the theory and practice of ecolabeling and certification in tourism have not yet met (Bučar et al., 2019)." | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 397 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | 122 | 4050 | 122 | 4060 | Two good examples of where "monitoring through harvesting" is the only practical or scientific option available, are water | The reviewer is thanked for the references, which have been passed on to the later chapters where implementation of the conceptualizations are addressed. |
| 398 | Guimaraes, Ellen | 2 | 123 | 3933 | 123 | 3936 | Figure 2.6. Please, use color blind friendly colors | Thank you, we have revised Fig 2.6. |
| 399 | Betley, Erin | 2 | 128 | 4168 | 128 | 4172 | the acronym IPLC is not used elsewhere in the document, so either should be written out in caption, or acronym spelled out in | Thank you. We no longer are using acronyms |
| 400 | Costello, Mark | 2 | 128 | | | | Fig 2.9 is unclear. Acronym is not explained either. It should be omitted or replaced. | Thank you for pointing this out. We have now removed Fig 2.9. |
| 401 | Germany | 2 | 128 | 4169 | 128 | 4172 | Please consider presenting and discussing Figure 2.9 in-depth in this chapter and skipping it in SPM.5. l618p22 (cross-referenced | Thank you. We have removed this figure from the SPM and the chapter, given other comments on it |
| 402 | Stenseke, Marie | 2 | 128 | 4170 | | | Please reconsider the term 'western science'. It could be replaced with simply science. 'Western science' is a somewhat | Thank you for your comment. The change has been made as suggested by the reviewer, both here and throughout the assessment |
| 403 | Guimaraes, Ellen | 2 | 132 | 4170 | 132 | 4170 | Figure 2.9. Please provide the license to the figure (should be CC-0 or CC-BY) | Thank you for your comment. We have removed this figure. |
| 404 | Betley, Erin | 2 | 153 | 5117 | 153 | 5117 | Oxford English dictionary citation incomplete | Thank you for your comment, we feel that it was addressed in the last version of the assessment. |
| 405 | Vernes, Cristiano | 2 | 3504 | | 3553 | | It is becoming increasingly important the role played by intra-species genetic diversity for allowing all species to cope with the | The reviewer is thanked for the information. However, the CBD Global Biodiversity Framework, and material produced for it have occurred after the cut-off date for |
| 406 | Vernes, Cristiano | 2 | 4727 | | 4734 | | Here this reference could be added: -Sean Hoban, Michael Bruford, Josephine D'Urban Jackson, Margarida Lopes- | The reviewer is thanked for the information. However, the CBD Global Biodiversity Framework, and material produced for it have occurred after the cut-off date for |
| 407 | Jaramillo, Lorena | 2 | 163 (Ref) | 5499 | 163 | 5499 | Kindly, change Biotrade to BioTrade, with B & T in CAPs | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 408 | Jaramillo, Lorena | 2 | 66 (2.2.6.2.; Table 2.5) | 66 | | 2280 | Kindly change the word of Principals with Principles, for the BioTrade Principles and Criteria. -> suggested text under the | Thank you for your comment, this was corrected. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|---------------------------|---|------------|---------|---------|---------|--|---|
| 409 | Alvarez, Venecia | 2 | General | | | | I want to know if it is possible to include in the revised literature of that document, specifically on the fisheries issue, the | Thank you for your comment. This comment deals more with the relative priority given to different aspects of sustainable and unsustainable practices, than with the |
| 410 | Costello, Mark | 2 | General | | | | the slapping of confidential across every page makes reading more difficult and is not necessary (papers being reviewed by | Thank you for your comment. The practice is one adopted by IPBES and is not unique to this assessment. The word will not be used and therefore not an inconvenience |
| 411 | Costello, Mark | 2 | General | | | | Time did not allow a detailed critique but I found the chapter far too verbose and academic (speaking as an academic!) in writing | The comment by the reviewer is appreciated. Efforts have been made throughout the text to simplify sentence structure and vocabulary and tighten the wording, while |
| 412 | Madhav Karki | 2 | General | | | | I compliment the authors for their good work so far. However, the chapter still needs improvement in term of its breadth and depth - | Thank you for your comment. The sections presenting knowledge and perspectives of indigenous people and local communities has been substantially expanded, with |
| 413 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | General | | | | Title Page: Add Kristiina to Pirjo Kristiina Virtanen | The name of the Contributing author has been corrected, as requested by the reviewer. |
| 414 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | General | | | | Table of comments: Post 2010 titles do not make much sense. I recommend in the text itself the timeline are expressed, but with | The authors thank the reviewer for the comments. Although the differences in literature of conceptualizations of sustainable use may have changed little over the past decade |
| 415 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | General | | | | Table of comments: Think of wording (worldview) in the Chapters 2.2.4 worldview embeds very Western idea of the | Thank you for your comment. The term "worldview" is used in the name of Section 2.2.4, as supported by the reviewer, and the term is used more widely throughout the |
| 416 | Virtanen, Pirjo Kristiina | 2 | General | General | General | General | this chapter has a lot of outdated information: post-2010 and pre-2010, especially considering how much impactful the Covid-19 | Thank you for your comment. The assessment has tried to use the best information available on the themes that it addresses, while respecting the cutoff date of 2020, as |
| 418 | Webb, Grahame | 2 | References | | | | ABS (2021) Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander population, 2016. | The review is thanked for the comment. However, it is an illustrative case of a more general point already made in the chapter and therefore does not require additional |
| 419 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1028 | | 1038 | I am aware that the journal Forest Ecology and Management was not screened in your pre 2010 assessment (yet post 2010 | Thank you for this reference. We did not include the year 2010 in "post 2010", hence this reference was not included in the literature review. However, the concept is |
| 420 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1039 | | 1047 | As a whole, I found this section conceptually unclear as written. | Thank you for your comment. This section, addressing sustainable use and ecosystem services in the context of gathering, has been shortened and revised |
| 421 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1040 | | 1041 | Unclear sentence as written. The effects of gathering, or simply "gathering in the context of provision of (other) ecosystem | Thank you for your comment. This section, addressing sustainable use and ecosystem services in the context of gathering, has been shortened and revised |
| 422 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1052 | | 1055 | See e.g., as a supporting reference: Guariguata, M. R., Cronkleton, P., Duchelle, A. E., Zuidema, P. A. 2017. Revisiting | The reviewer is thanked for the additional reference. However, the current references in the text fully document the points being made, and it is not possible to include all |
| 423 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1546 | | 1548 | Already in the 1950s, the prominent American forester Frank Wadsworth laid out the issue of multifunctional forestry in | Thank you for this comment. We revised section 2.2.3.5.1 (pre-2010 conceptualization) to explain how the concept of forest function and multiple- |
| 424 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1550 | | 1550 | More recent papers on this issue by Arild Angelsen et al. should be mentioned. E.g., | Thank you for this comment. We acknowledge that recent papers on this topic, including the one suggested, are available. However, since we evaluated the pre- |
| 425 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1574 | | 1574 | Although perhaps not part of the search term protocol applied, the issue of (selective) timber harvesting (at least in the tropics) | Thank you for this comment. We do not have enough space to explore how issues regarding selective logging affected the overall conceptualization in detail. However, |
| 426 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1616 | | 1616 | May want to cite Guariguata et al. 2010 as mentioned above. | Thank you for this comment. We agree that the suggested article is of relevance to this topic. However, since we already have several papers supporting the statement, |
| 427 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1634 | | 1635 | I tend to disagree. Adaptive management as a specific practice is much connected for enhancing resilience to external shocks as | Thank you for the comment. We decided to delete the sentence as it contains statements not directly supported by the reviewed literature. |
| 428 | Guariguata, Manuel | 2 | | 1649 | | 1651 | Unclear and somewhat inaccurate. The emergence of REDD basically turned "sustainable forest management" into "results- | Thank you for this comment. We revised the entire section, including the title, to improve the content. We did not use the suggested articles as we would then need to |
| 429 | James, P. Ross | 2 | | 113 | | 128 | 16 'principles' lack mention of need to provide economic feedback to support SU management costs- reference- Ross and | Thank you for your comment. This Principle and others do occur in the academic literature. However, as the Chapter clearly specifies, the list presented here come |
| 430 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 76 | | 76 | 76. "seeking" | The grammatical correction was made, as suggested by the reviewer |
| 431 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 80 | | 80 | 80. "...experts concerns where..." | Thank you for your comment. A grammatical change was made consistent with an earlier comment, although not exactly the one suggested here, it addresses the |
| 432 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 123 | | 128 | 123 "Fostering", also 125 "Providing", also 128 "Raising" | Thank you for your comment. The list of principles uses the active present tense rather than the gerund for all verbs and is maintained for consistency |
| 433 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 130 | | 130 | 130. Delete "policy" | Thank you for your comment. "policy" was retained in this sentence, because some certification standards do require compliance with policies adopted by legitimate |
| 434 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 144 | | 144 | 144. "distrusting benefits fairly and equitably" | Thank you for your comment however it was not taken into account. Principles do not require "distrusting" the sharing of benefits. |
| 435 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 184 | | 184 | 184. "Uptake by nations Has been particularly high." | Thank you for your comment. This was edited to shorten phrasing, although an even shorter option was used. |

| | | | | | | | |
|-----|-----------------|---|--|------|------|---|---|
| 436 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 209 | 209 | 209. Singular "commitment" | Thank you for your comment. The verb was changed to be plural to correspond to the plural noun, because there have been many commitments in various governance |
| 437 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 265 | 265 | 265. "... of sustainability that ..." | The grammatical error has been corrected as suggested by the reviewer |
| 438 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 312 | 312 | 312. Delete "in" | Thank you for your comment. The correction has been made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 439 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 337 | 337 | 337. Singular "account" | The grammatical error was corrected as suggested by the reviewer |
| 440 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 802 | 802 | 802. "throughout the conference..." | The text has been corrected as suggested by the reviewer |
| 441 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1018 | 1018 | 1018 should similar sub-headings be used for the preceding section on fisheries? | Thank you for your comment. Initially it was intended that the same subheading would be used for each of the five practices in Section 2.2.3.2.x. However when the |
| 442 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1049 | 1049 | 1049. "Social ES" followed by "SES" if the acronym is used again. | Thank you, we have removed all acronyms now. |
| 443 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2073 | 2073 | 2073 Section 2.2.3.4.1, on hunting prior to 2010 (to line 1260), contains good coverage of publications on issues arising from | The reviewer is thanked for their comment, a similar comment has been noted and the section has been updated accordingly |
| 444 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1206 | 1206 | 1206. "... regulations and large-scale habitat restoration by hunters was credited ..." | Thank you for your comment. This insight has been incorporated in the section. |
| 445 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1211 | 1211 | 1211. 1214. "Although declining trends in hunting yield over time were frequently associated with habitat degradation, they were | Thank you for your comment. The suggestion has been noted and addressed in the section accordingly. |
| 446 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1222 | 1222 | 1222. "...towards most cases of overharvesting of..." (as written, the implication is that most of the species are overharvested, | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 447 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1233 | 1233 | 1233 "... small game when the conservation status of these species was thought threatened by overharvesting." | The editorial correction was made as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 448 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1308 | 1308 | 1308. The total of 222 papers is greater than 15 (1287)+22(1295)+55(1299)+27(1306). Within that total, how | Thank you for your comment. 54 papers were selected from 9 selected journals; 41 journals from Web of Science literature review (15 in the first search; 22 in the second |
| 449 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1408 | 1408 | 1408. "on the environment." | The reviewer is thanked for the comment, and the suggestion was taken up in the revision. |
| 450 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1415 | 1415 | 1415. Reduce ambiguity by moving comma, to read: "of sustainable hunting, or unsustainable hunting which threatens..." | Thank you for your comment. The editorial correction was made in the revision. |
| 451 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1488 | 1488 | 1488. Plural in "...whole trees or..." | Thank you for the suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 452 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1634 | 1634 | 1634. Singular "discussion" | Thank you for the comment. The sentence was removed during revision based on another comment. |
| 453 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1772 | 1772 | 1772. "... in terms of impact management..." | The grammatical error was corrected in the text, as suggested by the reviewer |
| 454 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 1841 | 1841 | 1841. "...adopt more sustainable behaviours in general" | Thank you for your comment, the improvement was made in the text, although the exact phrasing in the comment was not used due to space constraints. |
| 455 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2197 | 2197 | 2197. Plural "systems" | Thanks for this suggested edit. We have changed it in the new version. |
| 456 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2227 | 2227 | 2227. In the Table, the date of AAPG adoption by CBD is 2004 (Decision VII.12). | The date has been corrected as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 457 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2332 | 2332 | 2332. Plural "do" | The verb has been changed to correspond to a plural noun, as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 458 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2508 | 2508 | 2508. Spelling "coordinating"; "lead author and lead author"? | The typographical error has been corrected in the document, as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 459 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2541 | 2541 | 2541. "present in all of the policy documents"? | The grammatical errors were corrected in the text, as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 460 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2609 | 2609 | 2609. "scores" | The grammatical error was corrected in the text, as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 461 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2706 | 2706 | 2706. "not just extend" | The grammatical error was corrected in the text, as suggested by the reviewer. |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-----|-----------------|---|--|------|--|------|---|--|
| 462 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2789 | | 2789 | 2789. Plural "organisations" | The plural noun has been used, as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 463 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2797 | | 2797 | 2797. Comma after "principles" | Thank you for your comment, the comma was added at the proper place, to allow the sentence to be read as intended by the authors. |
| 464 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2804 | | 2804 | 2804. "... other patterns..." | Grammatical improvements to the sentence clarified the intended meaning of the text and address the concern of the reviewer. |
| 465 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2815 | | 2815 | 2815. "can be" or "is"? | Thank you for your comment. The less appropriate of the two verb choices was removed, making the meaning of the sentence clear. |
| 466 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2824 | | 2824 | 2824. "... would be highly ..." | The missing word has been added to the phrase, consistent with the suggestion of the reviewer |
| 467 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2835 | | 2835 | 2835. Delete "FACE" before "European Charter on Hunting..." (this is a Bern Convention document, albeit adopted as policy by ...) | Thank you for your comment, editor correction was made in the revision. |
| 468 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2886 | | 2886 | 2886. "...forest spread across..." | Thank you for your comment. The text was corrected by removing the "a" and leaving "forests" plural, because five different communities are being discussed, and each has |
| 469 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2915 | | 2915 | 2915. "... properly caring for ..." | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 470 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2917 | | 2917 | 2917. "... timing for access ... they inhabit, ..."? | Thanks for this suggested change of wording. It is an improvement and we have adopted it. |
| 471 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 2921 | | 2921 | 2921. Spelling "abundant" | Thanks for this suggested edit. We have changed it in the new version. |
| 472 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3059 | | 3059 | 3059. "reviewed" | The grammatical error has been corrected in the text, as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 473 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3289 | | 3289 | 3289. "outcomes"? | The noun was corrected to the plural , as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 474 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3374 | | 3374 | 3374. The extremely poor attention to removal of perverse incentives shown in Figure 2.5 does not stand out in the | Although the observation of the reviewer is important, it has to do with implementation and performance, and not with conceptualization. It has been passed on to Chapters 3 |
| 475 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3522 | | 3522 | 3522. "... demonstrated that using ..." | The missing word was added to the text, clarifying the meaning as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 477 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3611 | | 3611 | 3611. "... properties which would have ..."? | Thank you for your comment. text corrected as suggested by the reviewer |
| 478 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3621 | | 3621 | 3621. Indicators are important for assessing what needs most to be the political focus when seeking to reach agreements that | Thank you for your comment. The authors agree with the need for further work by the expert community, and this is being added as a knowledge gap in the appropriate |
| 479 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3625 | | 3625 | 3625. Replace "if" with "of" | The typographical error was corrected as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 480 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3658 | | 3658 | 3658. "... understanding of how ... practices may lead to ..." | The missing preposition was added to the sentence, as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 481 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3670 | | 3670 | 3670. "... potential sensitivity and actual sensitivity...?" | Thank you for your comment. The sentence was corrected although the suggestion of the reviewer was not used, because the error was actually a wrong word choice, not |
| 482 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3692 | | 3692 | 3692. Comma after fishing. | The correction was made to the text, as suggested at the reviewer. |
| 483 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3705 | | 3705 | 3705. "... scored by assuming ..." | Thank you for your comment. The noun was changed into a verb, making the meaning of the sentence clear. |
| 484 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3751 | | 3751 | 3751. "... was an inadequate basis ..." | Thank you for your comment. The sentence was revised as suggested by the reviewer, makign the meaning clearer. |
| 485 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3753 | | 3753 | 3753. "viewing" = "wildlife watching" both times? Also at line 3901. | Thank you, everything was corrected to 'wildlife watching'. |
| 486 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3762 | | 3762 | 3762. "C" = "G" in the following table | The typographical error was corrected as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 487 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3784 | | 3784 | 3784. "... to be reasonably..." | The missing verb was added as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 488 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3816 | | 3816 | 3816. "... a benefit to have indicators..." | The sentence was revised in two ways to address the concern highlighted by the reviewer. |

| | | | | | | | |
|-----|-------------------|---|--|------|------|---|---|
| 489 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3820 | 3820 | 3820. "... if accompanied by a ..." | The missing preposition has been added to the sentence as suggested by the reviewer. |
| 490 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3893 | 3893 | 3893. At the same time as the work on hunting indicators was being done, a pan-European study | Thank you for your comment. This is an interesting observation but the new publication comes after the cut-off date specified for these assessments in the IPBES |
| 491 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 3954 | 3954 | 3954. "... found only in an indicator set for XXXX.?" | Thank you for your comment. The indicator set was the Montreal Process, which covers boreal forests. However, we have chosen to not to highlight specific indicator |
| 492 | Kenward, Robert | 2 | | 4004 | 4004 | 4004. Singular "challenge" | Thank you for your comment. The plural was changed to singular as proposed by the reviewer. |
| 493 | Sterling, Eleanor | 2 | | 4159 | 4159 | Should this be "collaborations between xx and IPLCs" rather than "collaborations with indigenous people and local communities"? | Thank you for your comment. The intent of having experts collaborate with IPLCs is made explicit, to clarify the concern of the reviewer. |