

| ID | Reviewer Name | Country of residence | Affiliation | Government Representative | Chapter | From Page (start) | From Line (Start) | To Page (End) | To Line (End) | Comment | Answer |
|----|-----------------|----------------------|--|---------------------------|---------|-------------------|-------------------|---------------|---------------|---|---|
| 9 | Margot Hurlbert | Canada | Johnson Shoyama Graduate School of Public Policy, University of Regina, Regina, Sk, Canada | No | Ch. 6 | 8. | 222 | 8 | 225 | Policies include agro-environmental targeted outcome based payments Reed et al. 2014. Improving the link between payments and the provision of ecosystem services in agri-environment schemes Ecosystem. Serv ; | noted with thanks - we will give due consideration to this suggestion |
| 10 | Margot Hurlbert | Canada | School of Public Policy, University of Regina, Regina, Sk, Canada | No | Ch. 6 | 8. | 222 | 8 | 225 | Policies that include people in establishing PES Sorice et al. 2018 Scaling participatin in payments for ecosystem services PLoS One | Thanks for the suggestion. |
| 11 | Margot Hurlbert | Canada | Johnson Shoyama Graduate School of Public Policy, University of Regina, Regina, Sk, Canada | No | Ch. 6 | 17. | 520 | 18 | 560 | Peltier (2018) An Application of Two-Eyed Seeing: Indigenous Research Methods in Intl. J. Qualitative Methods 17:1-12. 21. Hurlbert, M, Gupta, J. 2015. "The Split Ladder of Participation: A diagnostic, strategic, and evaluation tool to assess when participation is necessary" Environmental Science and Policy. 50, pp. 100-113. (Case studies in Canada, Chile and Argentina) | Thank you for the reference suggestion |
| 12 | Margot Hurlbert | Canada | Johnson Shoyama Graduate School of Public Policy, University of Regina, Regina, Sk, Canada | No | Ch. 6 | 19. | 596 | 20 | 614 | Creating a socially just environment means more than mere recognition of principles such as duty to consult by courts of law. Real recognition of Indigenous values and livelihoods that transcant 'public interest' is required. Check: Hurlbert, M., Rayner, J. 2018. Reconciling power, relations, and processes: the role of recognition in the achievement of energy justice for indigenous people. Applied Energy. 228: 1320-1327. | Thank you, it will be considered appropriately |
| 68 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | General | | | | This is much more practical and less theoretical than the other chapter key messages. | Thank you for your comment. |
| 69 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 14 | | 16 | I understand the arguments, but I would argue this is overstated – in an ideal world with no resource constraints (human and financial) it would be great to conduct such comprehensive assessments but we do not live in an ideal world – developed countries do not and cannot conduct such studies, so the challenge for developing countries is even more profound. Also there are major knowledge and data gaps that preclude such analyses. | Thanks for this comment, now the KM is based on robust evidence. |
| 70 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 28 | | 28 | It is critical to develop such messages that are practical and prgmatic | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 71 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 29 | | 31 | Again – critical to develop some key messages that are pragmatic and practical | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 72 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 32 | | 42 | This is an important message – particularly regarding the development of processes | Thank you. |
| 73 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 43 | | 53 | Good message but this cannot be accomplished for all decisions from local to national, let alone regional and global | Thank you, we have made it more nuanced. |
| 74 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | United Kingdom | 54 | | 60 | Self-evident but probably needs to be said | Thank you. |
| 75 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 66 | | 69 | Focus on awareness raising as a save target - What does this mean? | Thank you, we have rearticulated this message based on reviewed evidence. |
| 76 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 66 | | 69 | This conclusion is very disturbing – you are saying that you cannot show that capacity development has influenced real-life decision-making – why should governments invest time and money then? | Thank you, we rearticulated this message. |
| 77 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 70 | | 74 | This finding is worrisome – however, show local examples at least – but none at larger spatial scales is troubling | Thank you, we have added more robust evidence to support this. |
| 78 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | United Kingdom | 79 | | 79 | Delete 'several' | Thank you. |
| 79 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 84 | | 88 | There are also significant knowledge and data gaps that preclude the evaluation of economic (especially non-market) values. Also I would say at the end 'all stakeholders' | Thank you, the message has been detailed based on evidence. |
| 80 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 89 | | 94 | Agree | Thanks. |
| 81 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 95 | | 99 | Obvious but how do we make progress – we cannot have the complete baby so what are the key incremental steps | Thank you, specifics have been added based on evidence |
| 82 | Bob Watson | United Kingdom | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | 100 | | 103 | Obvious – combine with previous bullet | Thank you, we combined. |

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|----------------------|----------------|---|----|-------|----|------|----|------|--|--|
| 156 | Kris Wyckhuys | Vietnam | Chrysalis consulting | No | Ch. 6 | 59 | 1587 | 59 | 1588 | In addition to restoring / revitalizing ILK, it's essential to also 'complement' ILK (or fill existing agro-ecological knowledge gaps). Work by Bentley et al. has shown how farmers' knowledge of many types of invertebrates (except for large, culturally-important species) & their related ecological functions is exceptionally thin. Indigenous people may never have had a sound knowledge of biological pest control e.g., pest-killing parasitic wasps, pathogens or predatory beetles & might possess a highly deficient understanding of ways to conserve/enhance their populations in the field. | thank you for your suggestion. we shall incorporate appropriately |
| 166 | Michael Bordt | Canada | None (Member of SEEA EEA Technical Expert Committee and Editorial Board) | No | Ch. 6 | 36 | 942 | 36 | 951 | This would be an opportunity to mention the extensive capacity building activities related to the SEEA. The UN and other agencies have developed a set of training modules. The most comprehensive list is at http://communities.unescap.org/environment-statistics . The implementation approach is quite structured and begins with countries completing a diagnostic, based on the Diagnostic Tool. UN Statistics Division and the regional commissions have supported many country missions to conduct training and technical assistance on national priority SEEA components. One principle is that the capacity building engage a range of stakeholders, including statistical offices, other government departments and non-governmental organizations. Note that capacity building does not only cover valuation, but the range of SEEA Central Framework and Ecosystems components. | Thank you. we shall reflect appropriately |
| 188 | Ryo Kohsaka | Japan | Nagoya University Graduate School of Environmental Studies Dep. of Social and Human Environment | No | Ch. 6 | 17 | 506 | 17 | 509 | For the private sector decision making, I would like to highlight the case from City of Nagoya which was also cited by the TEEB study. The scheme gave an incentive for loan borrows when they declare biodiversity related proactive actions. Kindly refer to the following reference; Economics and the convention on biodiversity: financial incentives for encouraging biodiversity in Nagoya Book Chapter Urban biodiversity and design, 593-607 | Thank you, it will be considered appropriately |
| 251 | Miles Richardson | United Kingdom | University of Derby, Nature Connectedness Research Group | No | Ch. 6 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | chapters, e.g. Kellert and Abson and the concept of harmony with nature. Intentions cover the underpinning values and goals of the system that shape the emergent direction and provide the deepest leverage point. In this context, policy and organisation goals should acknowledge the failing relationship with nature (inadequate nature connectedness) and commit to fostering a closer and sustainable relationship between people and the rest of the natural world. Given Abson et al. (2017) assertions that "psychological connection with nature needs to coupled with institutional structures" for a good life, the psychological construct of nature connectedness provides a target measurable at population scale (Richardson et al., 2019). The pathways to nature connectedness (Lumber et al. 2017) highlight the types of relationship to foster, and the types of relationship to moderate. Case studies show how a strategic plan and intention to improve nature connectedness and apply the pathways to nature connectedness feeds through to design of activities and spaces (green and urban infrastructure), thereby shortening feedback loops. Regarding social structures, incentives such as arts funding can be applied to celebrate our connections with the natural world. Public policy can open spaces to promote nature-connectedness, giving people the opportunity to develop the 5 types of relationship with nature highlighted by Lumber et al - which relates to the The Rio Declaration (1992) Principle 1 "Human beings are ... entitled to a ... life in harmony with nature" (United Nations, 1992a). There is potential to shorten feedback loops for to promote positive relationships (Lumber et al, 2017) and help moderate the more destructive relationships of utility and dominion through information flows between resource use and control of nature, people and impact on local wildlife can be strengthened. A | Thank you, we shall reflect appropriately |
| 254 | Miles Richardson | United Kingdom | University of Derby, Nature Connectedness Research Group | No | Ch. 6 | 10 | 314 | 11 | 315 | "Connecting is related to issues of identity and place, to spiritual relationships and community wellbeing. (...) Connecting is about establishing good relations" (Smith, 2012)." Construct of nature connectedness describes this well, provides measures and pathways to achieve it based on 5 of Kellerts 9 values. | Thank you. we shall reflect the issues appropriately |
| 345 | Margarita N. Lavidés | United States | Earth Law Center/Samdhana Institute/Independent | No | Ch. 6 | 3 | 75 | 3 | 78 | For the question: Is there any initiative on diverse values that already incorporated the ILK in their values assessment concept/practice, materials from Global Landscapes Forum might help (https://www.globallandscapesforum.org/) | Thank you for the suggestion, ILK initiatives have been included in the systematic search. |

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|-------------------------------|----------------|--|----|-------|-----|------|----|------|---|---|
| 346 | Margarita N. Lavides | United States | Earth Law Center/Samdhana Institute/Independent | No | Ch. 6 | 8 | 236 | 9 | 261 | Also consider literature from areas drawing on experiences from the contexts of ILK, how intra- or inter- generational capacities are being built beyond the traditional concept of 'capacity development' and plural values. | Thank you, ILK approaches to capacity development have been added. |
| 347 | Margarita N. Lavides | United States | Earth Law Center/Samdhana Institute/Independent | No | Ch. 6 | 9 | 271 | 9 | 274 | In view of the asymmetry of power in decision making arena, there should be emphasis on 'strengthening of the weak actors' as part of the whole 'capacity development process.' | Thank you. we shall reflect appropriately |
| 369 | Droz Layna | Japan | School of Global Environmental Studies | No | Ch. 6 | 40. | 1158 | 40 | 1160 | Unclear, what are Tengó et al. six tasks? Only five aspects appear in the parenthesis. | we have explained now |
| 421 | Rob Hendriks | Netherlands | Member of Capacity Building Task Force until recently | No | Ch. 6 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 109 | In chapter six, the concept of capacity development is introduced in addition to capacity building. Since the term capacity building is used in the scoping document (as well as in many other contexts within IPBES), it would make sense to specifically introduce the alternative/additional use of 'capacity development' in a specific key message before using it in other key messages. Furthermore I would suggest to use 'capacity building' unless the alternative term is specifically necessary to indicate an alternative concept. | Thank you, it has been harmonized. |
| 422 | Rob Hendriks | Netherlands | Member of Capacity Building Task Force until recently | No | Ch. 6 | 27 | 779 | 32 | 951 | In a section on existing capacity building/development initiatives in any IPBES assessment , I would expect at least a reference to the existing IPBES capacity building rolling plan. Furthermore it may even be considered to structure the overview in section 6.5.2 according to the structure of the rolling plan, or indicate why a different structure is deemed more appropriate. | Thank you. we shall reflect appropriately |
| 438 | Syed H. Raza | Malaysia | Media Project on Conservation Environment & Nature MPCEN | No | Ch. 6 | | 295 | | 321 | Capacity development can be transformed into ILK & values according to the societal needs. Anthropology, behaviour studies can be used to transfer knowledge & build capacity of IPLC. | Thank you for the suggestion. |
| 495 | Henry Mcghe | United Kingdom | Individual | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | could also benefit from something about the range of non-state actors as potential agents for capacity building, and how to advance SDG target on policy coherence for sustainable development | Thank you, this has been addressed during redrafting of the chapter. |
| 512 | Dolores Amelia Arreguín Prado | Mexico | Latin America Youth Biodiversity Network Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Who's training/qualifying who?, Who determines the priorities when the information sources are limited? | We addressed these questions through criteria in the systematic search. |
| 513 | Dolores Amelia Arreguín Prado | Mexico | Latin America Youth Biodiversity Network Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Case study about capacities, Global Youth Biodiversity Network (south to south) and the Global Youth Biodiversity Network Mexico (south to north) | We have already included these. |
| 538 | Juan Manuel Frausto | Mexico | Fondo Mexicano para la Conservación de la | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | I suggest to incorporate the competency based learning approach into the capacity development framework. | We have now considered various educational approaches. |
| 539 | Juan Manuel Frausto | Mexico | Fondo Mexicano para la Conservación de la | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Consider the self-management into the capacity development framework. | We do not understand the comment. |
| 566 | Raquel Jiménez Acosta | Mexico | Reforestamos Mexico A.C. | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | To have in mind that implications and conclusions from this assessment will be extremely relevant for the post 2020 Global Agenda. | Thank you. |
| 567 | Raquel Jiménez Acosta | Mexico | Reforestamos Mexico A.C. | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | How much are the external factors and/or obstacles influencing capacity development? | Thank you, we have incorporated this during the revision. |
| 580 | Sofía Treviño Heres | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | It is very important not to fall into generalizations (eg all natural areas managed by indigenous groups are well preserved and have high biodiversity index) and consider particular contexts. There is a heterogeneity in terms of values and governance systems, and traditional practices may not always be sustainable. Showcase successful examples highlighting the role that each context plays in allowing transformative changes. | Thank you, we have now put emphasis on context specific options. |
| 581 | Sofía Treviño Heres | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Put into perspective the visions of "success" and "happiness", and individual short-term benefits vs. long-term collective benefits. How can today's society value biodiversity to ensure long-term collective benefits and take over this view. | To Chapter 2? thank you for the comment, we shall incorporate the notion of collective benefits |
| 595 | Mónica V. Alegre González | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Make a review of the ways to overcome obstacles in the cases identified as successful. | Thank you, Specifics have been detailed. |
| 596 | Mónica V. Alegre González | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | To check the concepts of gaps and needs so the administrative issues can be identified or acknowledge within these concepts. | thank you. we shall check and include |
| 618 | Jasmin Hundorf | Mexico | Coordinator bei Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | How to chose who will be trained to replicate or use the capacities (under a constant governmental change)? Check out the ValuES (http://www.aboutvalues.net)- GIZ lessons learnt, TEEB Geneva, WAVES. | Thank you. we shall check the initiative |
| 629 | Lucía O. Almeida Leñero | Mexico | Ecology and Natural Resources Department, | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Develop on how create capacities for all educational levels | Thank you. we shall check |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|------------------------------|--------|---|----|-------|--|--|--|--|--|
| 633 | Georgina Cabrera | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | BIOFIN is an initiative of PNUD which analyzes the financial gap to sustain biodiversity actions. | Thank you, Financial policies/ initiatives have been detailed. |
| 634 | Georgina Cabrera | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Make the productive sectors of CBD COP 13 and 14 more visible | Thank you, this is being captured through the grand challenges and thematic policy targets |
| 635 | Georgina Cabrera | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Include success stories of the sixth CBD report as part of the capacities that exist | Thank you. we shall check the evidence |
| 636 | Georgina Cabrera | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Make the mining, health and infrastructure sectors more visible with case studies | Thank you, Policy sectors have been detailed as per assessment criteria. |
| 644 | Rafael Calderon Contreras | Mexico | Licenciatura en Estudios Socioterritoriales, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Unidad | No | Ch. 6 | | | | The notion of capabilities comes from Amartya Sen in the context of poverty and development and is a colonial vision | we aim to use accepted concepts from divergent sources |
| 645 | Rafael Calderon Contreras | Mexico | Licenciatura en Estudios Socioterritoriales, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Unidad | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Skills are a new concept, as is the case with the resilience of socio-ecological systems. | Noted |
| 646 | Rafael Calderon Contreras | Mexico | Licenciatura en Estudios Socioterritoriales, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Unidad | No | Ch. 6 | | | | The transformation must be analyzed from the inside not imposed | Thank you for the comment. |
| 647 | Rafael Calderon Contreras | Mexico | Licenciatura en Estudios Socioterritoriales, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Unidad | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Values and anti-values of dis-services that bring harm to people are missing | This is out of the scope of Chapter 6, yet is discussed within the assessment. |
| 648 | Rafael Calderon Contreras | Mexico | Licenciatura en Estudios Socioterritoriales, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Unidad | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Consider as contributing author a Therese Lindahl del Stockholm Resilience Centre | Thank you, |
| 649 | Rafael Calderon Contreras | Mexico | Licenciatura en Estudios Socioterritoriales, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Unidad | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Take into account the different capacities coming from different approaches (eg. Amartya Sen) and socio-ecological thinking (Resilience) | Thank you. |
| 650 | Rafael Calderon Contreras | Mexico | Licenciatura en Estudios Socioterritoriales, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Unidad | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Search for much more creative alternatives (ie according NY law no one should live more than 10 minutes from a park. This allows to build new parks and make them more diverse) Deep socio-ecological transformation | Thank you. we shall do so |
| 651 | Rafael Calderon Contreras | Mexico | Licenciatura en Estudios Socioterritoriales, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Unidad | No | Ch. 6 | | | | It is necessary to show radical change initiatives and how they were operationalized and how they were achieved | thank you. we shall check |
| 657 | Ricardo Iván Cruz Cano | Mexico | FESI Igg, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Is there a process-building relationship in capacity building from motivational to governance? | We shall articulate this more coherently |
| 658 | Ricardo Iván Cruz Cano | Mexico | FESI Igg, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Can this capacity development be evaluated in a socio-ecological context? How are they valued? How to know if there is progress in these? | we shall articulate this more coherently |
| 667 | Adriana Carolina Flores Díaz | Mexico | CENTRUS, Universidad Iberoamericana | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Review of successful cases is needed: Participation in different sociocultural contexts is very different. Conflict and deterioration may be associated with the entry of a religion that is changing values | Thank you, We have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 668 | Adriana Carolina Flores Díaz | Mexico | CENTRUS, Universidad Iberoamericana | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Chapter 5 has ideas of democracy that are not shared between countries and that are not articulated in Ch 6 | ok. we shall streamline |
| 670 | Jaime González Barrera | Mexico | CONANP | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Show how to analyze values and anti-values and the role they play in decision making | noted |
| 671 | Jaime González Barrera | Mexico | CONANP | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Self-determination of peoples is a concept that is not so western and does not take into account different cultural contexts | noted |
| 672 | Jaime González Barrera | Mexico | CONANP | No | Ch. 6 | | | | It is possible to identify groups and actors that were successful in developing capacities to share their experiences and lessons learned | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 673 | Jaime González Barrera | Mexico | CONANP | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Information on capacity development can be obtained at BIOMAR, SMARTFISH | Thank you. |
| 674 | Jaime González Barrera | Mexico | CONANP | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Authors can ask CONANP regional coordinators to share key information | Thank you, |

| | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----|----------------------|--------|--|----|-------|--|--|--|---|---|
| 676 | Melanie Kolb | Mexico | Geography Institute, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | SEEA will take more relevance regarding ecosystem accountability. The objective of this programs, will be to make visible the values of biodiversity and its incorporation to public policies (including ecosystem services). It is fundamental to think about the impacts of. this initiative in different countries with different contexts. This is a monetary assessment that will make visible the contribution to the natural capital economy. | thank you. incorporated |
| 677 | Melanie Kolb | Mexico | Geography Institute, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | The chapter requires inviting authors in the sociopolitical context | Thank you, noted |
| 678 | Melanie Kolb | Mexico | Geography Institute, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Invite UNSD as Contributing Authors: Alessandra Afreri (UN), Rene Figueroa (INGEI) | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 679 | Melanie Kolb | Mexico | Geography Institute, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Derive implications of succesfull study cases and suggest strategies to repeat at relevant levels | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 680 | Melanie Kolb | Mexico | Geography Institute, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Provide concrete proposals about how the information exchange between different actors should be done. | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 681 | Melanie Kolb | Mexico | Geography Institute, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Discuss the value of Bottom up and Top Down approaches, it has to come from both sides. | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 682 | Melanie Kolb | Mexico | Geography Institute, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Success stories are not enough. You have to link them with mechanisms to scale them and link them with specific strategies | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 693 | Patricia Koleff | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | it is important to add the topic of communication strategies to generate changes in different sectors, places and generate a comprehension about succesfull study cases. (eg Currently there is an excellent communication startegy reagarding plastics). We need to improve our understanding about the impact o communication (e.g climate change) | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 702 | Diana López Higareda | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | The premise is that the transformation starts from the values, it is necessary to say that specific values are required for transformation and highlight which are linked to the different capacities | Thank you. noted and will be incorporated |
| 703 | Diana López Higareda | Mexico | CONABIO | No | Ch. 6 | | | | The transformation is not only capabilities, but also the necessary mechanisms to operationalize it. | Thank you. noted and will be incorporated |
| 709 | María Azahara Mesa | Mexico | Sustainability Sciences Department, Colegio de la Frontera Sur, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | It is the most important chapter and yet it is the smallest one, it is necessary to strengthen it, we invest too much in concepts and the operationalization part falls short. | Thank you. we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 710 | María Azahara Mesa | Mexico | Sustainability Sciences Department, Colegio de la Frontera Sur, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Look at SEEA-EEA it can be present as a tool to generate suggestion for monitoring and inputs | Noted, incorporated |
| 711 | María Azahara Mesa | Mexico | Sustainability Sciences Department, Colegio de la Frontera Sur, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | The assessment has the politic relevance, but the important questions are to think how it will permeate the design, planning and operationalisation. | Thank you, we have endeavoured towards this in the SOD |
| 712 | María Azahara Mesa | Mexico | Sustainability Sciences Department, Colegio de la Frontera Sur, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Previous assessments have done similar efforts yet have remained shallow, how does this evaluation will differ from that with achieving a bigger impact in the decision making? | Thank you for your observation |
| 713 | María Azahara Mesa | Mexico | Sustainability Sciences Department, Colegio de la Frontera Sur, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Policies are designed in a language that is clearly not spoken by those who are being "incorporated" into them. | Thank you for your comment. we have endeavoured to articulate better |
| 714 | María Azahara Mesa | Mexico | Sustainability Sciences Department, Colegio de la Frontera Sur, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | The local language has profound implications. Local values are based on the spoken mother tongue. How to change this? | noted. also chapter 2 |
| 756 | Octavio Tolentino | Mexico | CONANP | No | Ch. 6 | | | | The assumption is that a change can be made but you have to know to what extent there is a change in policies and behavior. The information does not change the actions linearly. Environmental education is based on simplistic assumptions of the transformation of knowledge. Does the UN want to change the world in a real way or does it only meet the agenda? The decisions are being taken only from the economic forum. | Thank you, noted. We have endeavoured to be inclusive and to provide a more holistic view on education. |
| 757 | Octavio Tolentino | Mexico | CONANP | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Understanding is important but it is not the only thing for decision making. It is necessary to work on scales that include the individual and the decision-making bodies. The individual has an impact but it is necessary to make their differential impacts visible. It is essential to identify key actors or individuals and the impact they can have. It is necessary to generate operationalization beyond the conceptual to concrete actions. | Thank you, at several points of our assessment we addressed the key actors who can induce change. |
| 758 | Octavio Tolentino | Mexico | CONANP | No | Ch. 6 | | | | It is important to consider that pragmatism leads us only to make economic decisions. | Thank you, noted. |
| 761 | Ana Cristina Tovalin | Mexico | Exteriores, | No | Ch. 6 | | | | Climate change is already perceived as an economic risk. | Thank you, these already have been detailed. |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|------------------------------------|---------|--|-----|-------|----|---------|------|----|--|--|---------------------------------------|
| 769 | Tania Alhelí Cruz Mejía | Mexico | Academic Workshop IIES Morelia, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Is it expected from the policy makers to develop capacities in each of the six dimensions? | In the section on capacity gaps and capacity development we explained who are the key actors of capacity development. | |
| 780 | Eduardo García Frapolli | Mexico | Ecological Economy Laboratory, IIES, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | The information sources for this chapter are not clear, I think it could end with a very mainstream idea of capacity building/development. | Thank you for this warning. From the FOD to the SOD the whole chapter has been redrafted and now it builds on a much wider literature. | |
| 781 | Eduardo García Frapolli | Mexico | Ecological Economy Laboratory, IIES, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | It seems as if the differences between policy makers and stakeholders are not clear. | Thank you for this notice. In the introduction of Ch6 we provide a detailed description of our stakeholder typology. | |
| 782 | Eduardo García Frapolli | Mexico | Ecological Economy Laboratory, IIES, UNAM | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | It is not clear what multiple values operationalisation means in the political context. | Thank you, noted. We used the SDGs to structure our guidance on how multiple values of nature can be operationalized in different contexts. | |
| 789 | Jaritz García García | Mexico | Academic Workshop IIES Morelia, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Capacity development is very important for decision makers since they have to think in a multicultural world, but is there an objective audience, who to prepare? Because it may be possible that someone taking decisions is not even aware of the assessment. | Thank you for this observation - we agree with it, and we suggest that capacity development should be context-specific and targeted to the key actors (i.e. to avoid that assessments are not taken up because of lack of awareness) | |
| 790 | Jaritz García García | Mexico | Academic Workshop IIES Morelia, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Is the chapter considerint the particular needs of regions or is it making a general synthesis of al needs without targeting regions? It would be helpful to specify by region | Thank you, the chapter mainly provides a general overview, but where data was available, region-specific information is also provided. | |
| 791 | Jaritz García García | Mexico | Academic Workshop IIES Morelia, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Is the operational guide aimed at decision makers or is it for everyone to use? | The guidance targets several types of stakeholders according to our stakeholder typology described in the introduction. | |
| 801 | Oscar Armando Ugartechea Salmerón | Mexico | Academic Workshop IIES Morelia, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Will the operational guide focus to a certain scale or scales? Is there a focus on the actors the guide will be developed for? | Thank you, these aspects have been detailed in the SOD. | |
| 806 | Andrea Velásquez | Mexico | Academic Workshop IIES Morelia, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | This chapter seems extremely relevant to me. From my point of view, it raises the minimum capacities required to carry out any management of natural resources. I also consider that this chapter has great potential to raise awareness for collective action. | Thank you! | |
| 810 | Ernesto Alonso Villalvazo Figueroa | Mexico | Academic Workshop IIES Morelia, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | As an operational part, most of the capacity building is carried out through NGOs, I believe that it would be necessary to document specific cases where governments help with capacity building as well. | Thank you for the suggestion. We have included some examples on capacity building and will develop those further for the final version. | |
| 1026 | Steven Broekx - VITO | Belgium | HILDE EGGERMONT - Belgian National Focus Point - collated comments BELGIUM | No | Ch. 6 | | general | | | I understand that a first orther draft can contain a lot of gaps, but this has too less body to actually see a gap. This is emptyness and not ready for an external review. | Thank you for your comment. We hope to provide more valuable content in the SOD. | |
| 1027 | Steven Broekx - VITO | Belgium | HILDE EGGERMONT - Belgian National Focus Point - collated comments BELGIUM | No | Ch. 6 | | general | | | I have to admit i didn't learn anything. I don't know what the target audience is, except maybe die-hard scientists who like to see classifications and lists. I often read long introductions without actual content, intrudctions stopping in the emptyness. I think it would be wise to show it to someone who can make some sense of this, but for sure you will not find this person in policy circles. | Thank you for your comment. We redrafted the whole chapter, added new sections and fleshed out the content. We also specified the target audience in our stakeholder typology in the introduction. | |
| 1028 | Steven Broekx - VITO | Belgium | HILDE EGGERMONT - Belgian National Focus Point - collated comments BELGIUM | No | Ch. 6 | | general | | | Tekstueel weinig op te merken, buiten een paar onvolledige stukken. | Thank you for your comment. We redrafted the whole chapter, added new sections and fleshed out the content. We also specified the target audience in our stakeholder typology in the introduction. | |
| 1039 | Tomas Declercq UNEP | Belgium | HILDE EGGERMONT - Belgian National Focus Point - collated comments BELGIUM | No | Ch. 6 | 68 | | | | Table row 4 TEEB: Values: Econ I would add biophysical as a minimum. If you include the TEEB initiative implementation phase, you would need to include the same list as under 'ValuES' initiative. | Thank you, more details have been added to the assessment. | |
| 1040 | Harshit Pant | India | N/A | Yes | Ch. 6 | 2 | | 2 | | The capacity development could also be focused on region specific needs of the targated communities so that these programs can be beneficial for these communities in the long run. | Thank you. Whenever it was possible, we provided region-specific information. | |
| 1041 | Harshit Pant | India | N/A | Yes | Ch. 6 | 3 | | 3 | 79 | some regional level initiatives such as NMSHE (National mission for sustaining the Himalayan Ecosystem) which are undergoing i.e in India, are actively working towards understanding, documanting and validating the uses of IKS in form of practice packages and various practitioners. | Thank you for this suggestion. We included some sub-global initiatives in our assessment. | |
| 1042 | Harshit Pant | India | N/A | Yes | Ch. 6 | 39 | | 1105 | 39 | 1105 | Mindfulness could be invloved for ease of mutual learning | Thank you, noted. |
| 1043 | Harshit Pant | India | N/A | Yes | Ch. 6 | 39 | | 1112 | 39 | 1112 | good facilitators who can act as moderators for various communities | Thank you, noted. |
| 1044 | Harshit Pant | India | N/A | Yes | Ch. 6 | 39 | | 1116 | 39 | 1116 | communication products which can be easily utilised by other dependent communities | Thank you, noted. |
| 1199 | Meredith Root-Bernstein | Chile | France; INRA AgroParisTech, Paris, France; Institute of Ecology and Biodiveristy, Santiago, Chile; Center for Applied Ecology and Sustainability | No | Ch. 6 | 96 | | | 99 | | Kate Crawford | Thank you, noted. |
| 1259 | Isimemen Osemwegie | Nigeria | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 1 | | 5 | 1 | 5 | I would suggest to remove "and influence the outcome" for clarity of key message 1 | Thank you, key messages were revised. |
| 1260 | Isimemen Osemwegie | Nigeria | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 2 | | 60 | 2 | 60 | I would recommend to change "outside" to "external" | Thank you, the text was revised. |

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|--------------------------|------------|---|----|-------|----|----|----|-----|--|---|
| 1261 | Isimemen Osemwegie | Nigeria | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 29 | | 29 | 856 | I would recommend to include the WABES initiative, www.wabes.net as an example: "The West African Biodiversity & Ecosystem Services - WABES is an example of a regional initiative that provides higher education training on plural values and also provides a networking platform for multi-stakeholders in the West African region". | Thank you, noted. |
| 1262 | Isimemen Osemwegie | Nigeria | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 68 | | | 71 | to include WABES as a capacity building initiative in the table under Annex 6.3 with the following information; "WABES (West African Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services); column 1) NP, Prog 2) Hc, Econ, SoC, Biop 3) ExPVal 4) Yes 5) Af 6) ImpNat, BenRight 7) Mainst, CapStg, PolAdvoc, StkEng 8) Reg 9) Comm, NGO, NatG, Bus, SciAcad, Don 10) Motiv, Bridg, SocNet, Analyt 11) GMT, Adv, Web, DbR 12) WorkTrain, Netw, CoP, Meet 13) NGO, NatG, SciAcad 14) Don: International Climate Initiative (IKI), German Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation, and Nuclear Safety (BMU). | Thank you for the detailed information, noted. |
| 1323 | Citlalli López Binnqüist | Mexico | Workshop IPBES - Veracruz, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | It is important that the document ends with something more practical or operational. It would be better to name more "strengthen" of capacities and not the term used on the text. / Why not consider colectiveness as a term and a working method. | Thank you, based on our literature review we stucked to the term capacity development instead of strenghtening for terminological reasons. |
| 1324 | Miguel Escalona | Mexico | Workshop IPBES - Veracruz, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | How can we build the capacities in colective terms through participation? / How can local experiences can contribute to the global experiences? | Thank you. Cross-scale interactions and the role of collective actions are incorporated in our assessment. |
| 1325 | Patricia Gerez Fernández | Mexico | Workshop IPBES - Veracruz, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Some words need to be re-consider. (i.e "Development" or "creation" of capacities) / There is a gap between scientific knowledge and local communities. / Education has to be considered too. | Thank you. Terms have been elaborated in the SOD and a subsection on education has been added. |
| 1326 | Ricardo Contreras | Mexico | Workshop IPBES - Veracruz, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | How can we generate public policy spaces that rule in an international scale? | Thank you for this question. The operational guide aim to provide some principles which help to create such public spaces. |
| 1328 | Elisa Peresbarbosa Rojas | Mexico | Workshop IPBES - Veracruz, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Does the document consider, not only the aspect of conctruction of knowledge, but making it accesible for people? | Thank you, yes, we consider capacity development a broad concept which also include the accessibility of knowledge. |
| 1329 | Simoneta Negrete | Mexico | Workshop IPBES - Veracruz, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | The chain needs to me completed. The information is out there, but the next step is to use the information and transform them into values in order to act in certain ways. The interaction of knowledge-values-habits needs to be present in the discussion of "capacities development". | Thank you, the section on capacity development has been detailed. |
| 1330 | Araceli Aguilar Meléndez | Mexico | Workshop IPBES - Veracruz, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Could it be considered to include the term of "other knowledge/values" and "other knowledge/values" in order not to center everything on the academia? / Could it be included the importance and value of "oral history"? | Thank you for this suggestion, we paid attention to emphasise the importance of diverse knowledges. |
| 1332 | Luis Pacheco Cobos | Mexico | Workshop IPBES - Veracruz, Mexico | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | In what time-scale of effective ation are you considering the actions of the chapter? / How much evidence or specific experiences are there about the sustainable use of resources? | Thank you. Section 6.2 assess actions which are already available and in use, while section 6.3 assess options which need a longer timeframe to fully implement. Evidence on the sustainable use of resources was not the core focus of our assessment but have been reviewed in the IPBES Global Assessment chapter 6. |
| 1385 | Javier Cabello | Spain | Dept. Biology and Geology, Program in Applied Sciences to the Environment, Andalusian Center for the Evaluation and Monitoring of Global Change (CAESCG), University of Almería | No | Ch. 6 | 11 | | 12 | 390 | Working in a transboundary experience (Spain-Morocco) on the Alboran Sea management, we found that there several key factors that contribute to the operationalization of social learning (SL) to enhance the impact of ecosystem service approach on policy and society. These factors were: 1) generation trust and shared understanding between actors, 2) facilitation of knowledge exchanges, 3) the promotion of a democratic participation, and 4) the co-production of practical outcomes. We consider it is important to give guidance for the operationalization of SL processes. This is, not only provide the concept, but also to guide the way to implement it. This is particularly important in the case of operationalization of the nature contributions to people. Usually we think that all the actors understand in the same way the ecosystem services conceptual framework. However, differences in culture, political tradition, religion, scientific development, economical level, etc, hamper to have a shared vision of the framework. Reference: Rodríguez-López, M.D., Cabello, J., Castro, H. & Rodríguez, J. 2019. Social learning for facilitatin the dialogue and understanding in the ecosystem service approach: lessons from a cors-border experience in the Alboran Sea. Susatinability (in press) | Thank you for the suggestion, noted. |
| 1390 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 1 | 11 | 1 | 12 | Which particular values framing is it referred to here? Deotolngical, ethical values? | Thank you. Ch6 uses the values terminology from the preceding chapters (specifically Ch2) of the values assessment |

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|-----------------------|------------|--|----|-------|----|------|----|------|---|---|
| 1391 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 2 | 55 | 1 | 55 | In the extended version of this chapter, if not, ODA should be included amongst external actors as they also frame policies that condition financial assistance related to Capacity Development | Thank you, noted. |
| 1392 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 2 | 59 | 2 | | among the steps and conditions, "effective decentralization" should be included as the process is a keystone for Sustainable Development in the frame of dialogue from Local to Governmental level | Thank you, noted. Cross-scale interaction is incorporated in the chapter. |
| 1393 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 5 | 113 | 5 | 113 | The words "just and sustainable future" refer to the concept of environmental justice that has two inter-related dimensions grounded at both the local and governmental level. On the local level it pertains to social groups while at the governmental level it pertains to the policy makers' vocabulary. Thus, this concept embodies environmental justice and sustainability for speaking of sustainable development. What has to be sustained? by whom? and for whom? | Thank you, these concepts have been detailed and Ch5 and relevant parts of Ch6 have also been redrafted. |
| 1395 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | If not developed in the section introducing concepts it has therefore to be clarified to show how environmental justice and sustainability are now mixed or merged into "just sustainability" and that "just and sustainable future" is not only a "political opportunity". | Thank you, noted. |
| 1396 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 8 | 210 | 8 | 214 | The value of nature introduced into National Accounts also matters for typologies in decision-making although this process still remains difficult to implement by the Developing Countries. | Noted, thank you. |
| 1397 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 8 | 223 | 8 | 225 | amongst options, is the analytic:deliberative decision-making process for environmental restoration or preservation decisions. It involves multiple stakeholders (risk assessment, multiattributive utility analysis for each stakeholder) | Thank you, we include now a wider range of available options |
| 1398 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 9 | 245 | 9 | 248 | See the works of Annick De Witt that shed light on a very new vision of the contributions and interlinkages between environment, people, psychology and cognitive skills. | Thank you for the suggestion, noted. |
| 1399 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 9 | 278 | 9 | 278 | About the stakeholders; activists matter for dialogue | Thank you, we modified our initial stakeholder typology, activists are understood within the broader category of civil society. |
| 1400 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 10 | 290 | 10 | 291 | Regarding specific knowledge, the word "reunification" is arising to translate how expert and endogenous knowledge are put together for defining a common, accessible and clear language | Thank you for the suggestion, noted. |
| 1401 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 10 | 307 | 11 | 316 | See the works of Annick De Witt | Thank you. |
| 1402 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 15 | 437 | 15 | 461 | Question raised from this paragraph; Who sets the parameters as distribution is at the same time context and type of equity dependent? | Sorry, but question not clear. |
| 1403 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 22 | 668 | 22 | 676 | The mainstreaming of values of nature into real life decisions is also related to a lack of skilled people particularly in the Developing Countries. The difficulty for harmonizing National Accounts with the united Nations Systems is one of examples. There is a need of training to be considered. | Thank you, noted. |
| 1404 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 32 | 952 | 32 | 952 | In this title, why not to speak of Capacity Development as Capacity Building is part of CD in its broaden and current acception? | Thank you, terminology has been changed, now we use capacity development throughout the chapter |
| 1405 | Charley Granvorka | Martinique | N/A | No | Ch. 6 | 33 | | 34 | | In the area of Analytical dimension of capacity regarding work to be done at the University level. It is said that "University curricula as a strategy has not been assessed anywhere. Here I want to refer to an attempt that has been initiated between the Association of the Caribbean States, the University of the West Indies (Trinidad and Tobago) and the Université des Antilles et de la Guyane that I worked on. It was about to implement a curricula specialized in Environment, common to both of the University with students exchanges and a common diploma delivered by these Universities. The idea was also to include the Dominican Republic in the program. | Thank you for providing this example. |
| 1439 | Neville H McClenaghan | Ireland | Galway-Mayo Institute of Technology (GMIT) | No | Ch. 6 | 37 | 1067 | 37 | 1067 | Before getting into the text there may be merit in having a diagram to set the scene of what is to come? | Thank you, now more visuals are incorporated in the chapter |
| 1440 | Neville H McClenaghan | Ireland | Galway-Mayo Institute of Technology (GMIT) | No | Ch. 6 | 41 | 1183 | 41 | 1183 | This really needs to lead into a Conclusions section to wrap it all up? | Thank you, the whole chapter has been restructured |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|---|-----------|--|----|-------|----|--|--|--|------|-----|---|--|---|
| | | | | | | 10 | | | | 10 | 294 | Comments are already linked to this chapter and section about power from chapter 5 [The power and agency classification is not obviously integrated after or through the values discussion and how it might influence dominant values. Chapter 6 pg 10, line 286-294 integrates the influence of power relations on how knowledge systems influence capacity development for incorporation of multiple values. How the assessment seeks to address discursive power and perhaps institutional power through improved understanding of values and how they influence institutional priority as a section as well as a paragraph in the conclusion could be useful. This might include reference to consideration included in chapter 6.] | | |
| 1459 | Melissa Vogt | Australia | UNSW, Australia | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | 286 | | | Thank you for the suggestion. This section has been rewritten. | |
| 1460 | Melissa Vogt | Australia | UNSW, Australia | No | Ch. 6 | 14 | | | | 391 | 15 | 435 | The comments already linked to this chapter and section from chapter 5 could be considered in this section, perhaps it could be used to more thoroughly bring together the points about types of power for example, and how they can be considered within power, equity and governance. [The power and agency classification is not obviously integrated after or through the values discussion and how it might influence dominant values. Chapter 6 pg 10, line 286-294 integrates the influence of power relations on how knowledge systems influence capacity development for incorporation of multiple values. How the assessment seeks to address discursive power and perhaps institutional power through improved understanding of values and how they influence institutional priority as a section as well as a paragraph in the conclusion could be useful. This might include reference to consideration included in chapter 6.] | Thank you, this section has been rewritten. |
| 1461 | Melissa Vogt | Australia | UNSW, Australia | No | Ch. 6 | 32 | | | | 965 | 35 | 966 | Table 6.1 Refer to relevant chapters and perhaps pages/section for each dimension of capability. | Thank you for the suggestion, the table has been redrafted. |
| 1462 | Melissa Vogt | Australia | UNSW, Australia | No | Ch. 6 | 37 | | | | 1068 | 38 | 1073 | Specific reference to landscape, land use; biome context etc.. examples available from chapter 3&4 in 'Sustainability certification schemes for the agricultural and natural resource sectors: outcomes for society and the environment.' Could be included in the first dot point - landscape/land use context. | Thank you, certification schemes are included among the assessed policy options. |
| 1463 | Melissa Vogt | Australia | UNSW, Australia | No | Ch. 6 | 38 | | | | 1089 | 38 | 1099 | Ensuring appropriate and representative information is sought, available and in process of being available is relevant to the previous point, and could also be relevant to pg 40, line 1132-1144: reflect, learn, sustain. While ensuring inclusion of relevant and representative stakeholders might imply this - it is not specific enough to ensure up to date and/or accurate and representative understandings across stakeholders. | Thank you, noted. This section has been redrafted. |
| 1478 | The Swedish delegation of the IPBES Values Assessment | Sweden | Swedish delegation | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | | | | Will chapter 6 provide an overview of all research or policy gaps and needs for the whole assessment? Attendees thought this would be important to help fine tune national policy and research plans. | Yes, chapter 6 will draw on gaps identified across the different chapters of the assessment |
| 1482 | The Swedish delegation of the IPBES Values Assessment | Sweden | Swedish delegation | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | | | | Some audiences might expect a "guideline" in terms of what values may lead to what futures and how to address this in policy making. | Thank you, Ch 6 will have a matrix of options for different stakeholders |
| 1530 | Finnish National IPBES panel (Finland) | Finland | Finnish national IPBES panel (Luontopaneeli) | No | Ch. 6 | 1 | | | | 13 | 1 | 22 | Incorporation of multiple values into policy and decision making is often a time and resource consuming effort. This time and resources have opportunity costs - they could be used to other worthy purposes e.g. alleviate hunger. Maybe the purposefulness of the level of value incorporation into decision making should be discussed somewhere. This also applies to whose values count - the more inclusive, the more effort. | This comment is out of the scope of Chapter 6. |
| 1531 | Finnish National IPBES panel (Finland) | Finland | Finnish national IPBES panel (Luontopaneeli) | No | Ch. 6 | 2 | | | | 54 | 2 | 60 | This is a good aim but could be broader. The same should apply to any groups or individuals whose participation in decision making is impaired (women in some communities, less educated in most societies, rural dwellers in many societies being a minority, elderly citizen etc.). | Thank you. Noted and we shall highlight as appropriate |
| 1532 | Finnish National IPBES panel (Finland) | Finland | Finnish national IPBES panel (Luontopaneeli) | No | Ch. 6 | 11 | | | | 322 | 11 | 356 | The structure is very easy to read and clear, with all these 6.2.1-5. | Thank you |
| 1553 | Maria Carmen García Mateo | Spain | MCG Research Innovation Sustainability Architecture_Urban Planning | No | Ch. 6 | 29 | | | | 711 | 29 | | Fig6.2 I do consider that the stakeholders that are most appropriate to address capacity gaps; should be point in green or blue colour. It seems to me that the red colour is not appropriate. Furthermore, I think that SMEs stakeholder research and innovation oriented should be included in that figure also, because they are key in providing capacity gaps. | Thank you . we shall note your suggestions in the revisions and incorporate appropriately |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|---|----------|--|-------------------------------------|-------|----|--|-----|----|------|---|--|
| 1554 | Maria Carmen Garcia Mateo | Spain | MCG Research Innovation Sustainability Architecture_Urban Planning | No | Ch. 6 | 31 | | 769 | 31 | 778 | In the description of the capacity gaps hindering individual action on the multiple values of Nature the content are too general. Why not use more examples on the context approach; like the one you use nature therapies, green care : defining more deeply | Thank you. Noted and we shall highlight as appropriate |
| 1555 | Maria Carmen Garcia Mateo | Spain | MCG Research Innovation Sustainability Architecture_Urban Planning | No | Ch. 6 | 6 | | | 46 | 1183 | Overall I would suggest to mention or refer to Sustainable development goals or circular economy strategy policies in the overall manuscript tackling and reaching an holistic approach. | Thank you. Yes, we shall do so. |
| 1674 | Rosendo Ahue Coello (Tikuna People: Magütá); Gloria Erazo; Andrea Cárdenas. | Colombia | Organizacion Nacional Indígena de Colombia (Onic) | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | | Chapter 6 - Regarding the first guiding question: The predominance of economic view by leaving other sociocultural values off maintain the status quo. That situation needs to be questioned. The Onic in Colombia is making a diagnosis of governance capacities about biodiversity, genetic resources and traditional knowledge in order to establish what type of capacities must be either created or strenghtened. In line with this, we want to advance on protocols of biodiversity and natural resources like a governance tool for indigenous territories. | Thank you. Noted |
| 1679 | Rosendo Ahue Coello (Tikuna People: Magütá); Gloria Erazo; Andrea Cárdenas. | Colombia | Organizacion Nacional Indígena de Colombia (Onic) | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | | Chapter 6 - Guiding questions. We would like to suggest the following questions: How do we strengthen capacities for taking part on international forums? i.e., those forums related to biodiversity where important decisions take place. Furthermore, what abilities do we need to translate indigenous cosmovisions into changes in institutional norms or actions? | Thank you. Noted |
| 1680 | Rosendo Ahue Coello (Tikuna People: Magütá); Gloria Erazo; Andrea Cárdenas. | Colombia | Organizacion Nacional Indígena de Colombia (Onic) | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | | Chapter 6 - Expected results. We would like to highlight schemes of own education based on indigenous languages. Those languages are important vehicles for transmitting knowledge from generation to generation, and from individual to individual. It is important knowing values from the own perspective in order to fully integrate them not only in educative curricula but also in own schemes of health, justice, etc. Moreover, it would be suitable to promote schemes of own research based on indigenous-led forms in order to remember and transmit traditional knowledge. | Thank you. we shall incorporate ilk perspectives on education |
| 1694 | Marta Díaz | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | | It would be suggested a capacity building programme based on an integral view of ecosystems e.g., approaching ecosystems and their functions as a whole, by reducing the abundance of many studies which focus on specific species losing their connections with the entire ecosystem. | Thank you, yes we will be looking at biodiversity and ecosystems |
| 1706 | Marta Díaz | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | | Chapter 6 - It would be suggested to promote tools, instruments and capacities to analyse the integrity of territories in decisions. For instance, there are several laws aimed at protecting specific ecosystems (e.g., paramo ecosystems, wetlands, etc.), which ignore the integrity of landscapes and biomes. That fosters a fragmented view of territories. | Thank you. Noted |
| 1707 | Marta Díaz | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | | Chapter 6 - Capacity development key dimensions. It would be helpful to include a key dimension related to communication capacity. | Thank you. Noted |
| 1708 | Marta Díaz | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | | Chapter 6 - Social network capacity. This type of capacity is important because a lack of knowledge on values has produced an effect on the design of policies with a tendency to generalise landscapes. Some policies do not distinguish between rural and urban areas or between younger or older generations. Thus, their implementation has caused disruption of families with impact on local dynamics and, in turn, the conservation of territories. | Thank you. Noted. |
| 1709 | Marta Díaz | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | | Chapter 6 - Expected results. It is important to note that the operationalisation of the incorporation of multiple values in decision making can be strengthened by receiving feedback of situations occurring at the local level. For instance, the implementation of laws and norms related to the delimitation of protected areas is challenging because actions tend to be prioritised inside. What happens with communities living outside (and next to) protected areas? | Thank you. Noted. we will be looking at IPLC concerns |

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|----------------|----------|---|-------------------------------------|-------|----|--|--|--|--|---|
| 1726 | Felipe Guerra | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | Chapter 6 - Guiding questions. What is needed to shift the status quo of nature valuation into the next ten years? To answer that question, it would be also advisable to take into account the role of international conventions, treaties or agreements between countries. | thank you. noted |
| 1727 | Felipe Guerra | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | Chapter 6 - Capacity development key dimensions. - It would be helpful to empower civil society based on knowledge of values of nature. - In order to facilitate a dialogue between the environmental perspective and other sectors, it would be useful to promote capacity-building programmes with members of different sectors e.g., environment, official planning, government's economic policy, agriculture, etc. - It would be advisable to design programmes aimed at approaching generational relief especially on rural communities. - It would be useful to design educational programmes including subjects such as agroecology and agrobiodiversity at all levels of the educational system. | thank you. noted |
| 1732 | Viviana Moreno | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | How approach values of nature from the pererspective of education? | an analysis of education as a cross sectoral theme is being undertaken |
| 1737 | Viviana Moreno | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | Literature review. It would be interesting to analyse how local initiatives have contributed to the maintenance of values/benefits of nature. Local initiatives such as natural reserves of civil society, silvopastoral systems, organic production, sustainable entrepreneurship. Furthermore, it would be interesting analysing: Have those initiatives received support in terms of resources, training, market chains, etc.? | thank you. The chapter consider some cases and shows the extent to which plural values are incorporated at different levels |
| 1739 | Viviana Moreno | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | Chapter 6 - Capacity development key dimensions. How interests of local communities and civil society are taken into account for capacity development that promote plural values of nature? | thank you. The chapter considers dimensions of capacity development for different stakeholders and different contexts |
| 1746 | Dora Estrada | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | Chapter 6 - Expected results. Keeping records of results as well as improving their communication in order to make better decisions across levels from the global to the individual level. | Comment is unclear. records of results? |
| 1748 | Dora Estrada | Colombia | Parques Nacionales Naturales de Colombia (PNNC) | PNNC is part of the Colombian state | Ch. 6 | | | | | Chapter 6 - Expected results. It is advisable that the design and development of an operational guide take into account particularities occurring at local scales. For instance, the implementation of REDD+ forest carbon projects in the national parks. Given that many indigenous 'resguardos' (a 'resguardo' includes several indigenous communities) overlap with national parks, those communities who live inside the protected area face restrictions related to forest practices. In practical terms, the implementation of these projects seem to favour a contrast between the values of nature inside and outside the park. Therefore, the operationalization of the incorporation of multiple values in decision making is a pivotal subject that should be conducted not only inside protected areas but also in their buffer zones and surroundings. Furthermore, it is important to note the very slow speed at which national policies are being regulated on this matter. | thank you. Yes the chapter endeavours to delineate analysis along different stakeholder groups and governance context. |
| 1804 | Tomas Declercq | Belgium | UNEP, but comments in personal capacity | No | Ch. 6 | 68 | | | | Table row 4 TEEB: Values: Econ I would add biophysical as a minimum. If you include the TEEB initiative implementation phase, you would need to include the same list as under 'ValueS' initiative. | thank you. we have expanded the list of initiatives to address. |

| | | | | | | whole chapter6 | | | | | | |
|------|-------------------|---------------|------------------------------------|----|-------|-------------------|-----|-----|-----|--|---|--|
| 1835 | Francois Sarrazin | France | Sorbonne University | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | | As for chapter 5, it might be relevant to considerin chpater 6 the Life Framework developed in chapter 2. | thank you . noted |
| 1922 | Amanda Sigouin | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 3 | 78 | 3 | 78 | | We suggest the following paper detailing a case study that ostensibly tried to take Maasai values into account, it might be useful for IPBES to have on radar as they seek examples of initiatives that tried to do this. Dolrenry, S., Hazzah, L. & Frank, L.G. (2016). Conservation and monitoring of a persecuted African lion population by Maasai warriors. Conservation Biology, 30, 467-475. | thank you. |
| 1923 | Amanda Sigouin | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 7 | 185 | 7 | 186 | | It lists as a key strategic issues of Process Design that deserve capacity development and recognition in policy making, "joint framing and mobilising knowledges among these stakeholders, use of multiple-evidence base approaches to validate knowledges." While we know what the authors mean here, we think it might be helpful to clarify that knowledge is validated within the context of its own knowledge system. | thank you. noted |
| 1924 | Amanda Sigouin | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | | In multiple places chapter 6 broadly discusses the idea of capacity development evaluation, but we think it is important to more explicit that this is a key part of the capacity development process that should be incorporated into plans. | thank you. noted |
| 1925 | Amanda Sigouin | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 7 | 203 | 7 | 207 | | Additional potential search terms: participatory learning; learning network; transformative learning; experiential learning; institutional development; organizational development | Thank you, noted |
| 1927 | Amanda Sigouin | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 6 | 152 | 6 | 169 | | The set up for the 6 dimensions in these two paragraphs was a bit confusing. The first paragraph discusses that identifying and synthsizing information onto key dimensions of capacity development "will be" done. Then the following paragraph goes right into what those dimensions are. If the work discussed in the first paragraph has already been done then should be more clear about that. | thank you. noted |
| 1928 | Erin Betley | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 6 | 161 | 6 | 169 | | Where did these dimensions come from? How do they relate to the literature searches proposed? More explanation / detail needs to be shared here. | Thank you, we will provide specific details as appropriate |
| 1929 | Erin Betley | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 23 | 707 | 24 | 712 | | We don't fully understand Figs 6.1 and 6.2 - what data are they based on? What are the units on the on y axis? What is the methodology to calculate this data? What are the data sources? We also don't necessarily agree with where the scoring is for for the IPLC and youth categories on Fig 6.2. | these figures have been changed |
| 1930 | Eleanor Sterling | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | | General comment for chapter 6. We were looking for organizational capacity development of communities and not just individuals; there could be greater focus/emphasis on the organizational level. | Noted. thank you. |
| 1931 | Eleanor Sterling | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 65 | NA | 65 | NA | | Under Goals/objectives coding, stakeholder engagement overlaps with awareness raising | Noted. thank you. |
| 1932 | Eleanor Sterling | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 65 | NA | 65 | NA | | Under Target stakeholders, K-12 educators is missing from list | we shall include stakeholders appropriately |
| 1933 | Eleanor Sterling | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 66 | NA | 66 | NA | | Under Tools, organizational development is missing from list, considering broadening coding to include this? | thank you. we shall include appropriately |
| 1934 | Eleanor Sterling | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 71 | n/a | 71 | n/a | | Initiative missing from this list: Network of Conservation Educators and Practitioners (Center for Biodiversity and Conservation at the American Museum of Natural History) | thank you. noted |

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|------------------|----------------|------------------------------------|----|-------|----|---------------|----|---------|--|--|
| 1935 | Eleanor Sterling | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | NA | NA | NA | NA | We wanted to point out two papers that might be generally helpful for this work: Sterling, E.J., Betley, E., Sigouin, A., Gomez, A., Toomey, A., Cullman, G. et al. (2017). Assessing the evidence for stakeholder engagement in biodiversity conservation. Biological conservation, 209, 159-171. AND Betley, E., A. Sigouin, E.J. Sterling, F. Arengo, N. Gazit, and A.L. Porzecanski. 2018. Best practices for stakeholder engagement in biodiversity programming. U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID) Resource Guide. USAID Bureau for Economic Growth, Education, and the Environment - Office of Forestry and Biodiversity. Washington, DC. https://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PA00T9XH.pdf | Thank you. |
| 1936 | Amanda Sigouin | Unites States | American Museum of Natural History | No | Ch. 6 | 8 | 236 | 9 | 244 | We appreciate the definition of capacity development laid out in this paragraph that includes describing CD as an interactive, social process. | thank you |
| 1943 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | General comments: Do we eally have to use the word Operationalisation? The paper by Boerema on the effectiveness of ES assessments has not been utilised. | Thank you, we will go by the assessment mandate |
| 1944 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 9 | | | 244 | However, we do not | thank you |
| 1945 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 247 | A very difficult sentence to follow | Thank you, we will improve comprehensiveness |
| 1946 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 265 | A very difficult sentence to follow | thank you. we will improve comprehensiveness |
| 1947 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 10 | | | 287 | that enables the agency | thank you. |
| 1948 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 11 | | | 345 | Starting a sentence with a conjunction (Also) is not good English grammar | thank you. noted |
| 1949 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 12 | | | 360 | Here there should be somethig about "reflective practice" | Thank you, this has been detailed. |
| 1950 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 16 | | | 470 | clumsy English sentence | Thank you, it will be amended appropriately |
| 1951 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 475 | importance of paying attention | Thank you, it will be amended appropriately |
| 1952 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 22 | | | 688 | Ref. Boerema | thankyou. |
| 1953 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 677 | All one sentence and almost impossible to read! | thank you. we will improve comprehensiveness |
| 1954 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 23 | | | 695 | global Local and global processes clash at the national scale and this is | thank you. we will improve comprehensiveness |
| 1955 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 705 | and are able | thank you. |
| 1956 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | Figure 6.1 72 | | | I hope the fijal figure is more larger than these! | yes final figures will be high resolution |
| 1957 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 25 | | | 749 | awareness of the | thank you |
| 1958 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 754 | infrastructure i.e. via ecosystem services classifications and accounting (allowing | Thank you, |
| 1959 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 817 | while putting little | thank you |
| 1960 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 29 | | | 864 | goals as informing | thank you |
| 1961 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | 30 | | | 883 | discuss the holistic | thank you |
| 1962 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 886 | Initiatives, mostly in the form of projects, that play roles as knowledge management platforms | thank you |
| 1963 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 895 | Health focus on the trade-offseconomic loss as | thank you |
| 1964 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 32 | What are new dam mines? | we will revise appropriately |
| 1965 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 35 986 | Rodela et al. | we will revise appropriately |
| 1966 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 37 1052 | of multiple viaues | thank you |
| 1967 | Alan Feest | United Kingdom | University of Bristol/ecosulis | No | Ch. 6 | | | | 38 1079 | Have them at placemeaning what? | thank you. we will improve comprehensiveness |
| 2149 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | why capacity development, and not capacity building? | Thank you for the comment. we are using prevalent UN terminology |
| 2150 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | the chapter speaks a lot about gaps. This should be transformed into text on opportunities for decision-making and action. | Thank you. A section on policy options has been added |
| 2151 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | The chapter does not take up the oppourtunies for decision-making and action, which had been identified in the global and other assessments (including taking up the tables with opportunities in the global, pollination, land degradation ad some regional assessments). With taking up I mean that the chapter should explain how such opportunities for decision-making/action could become more efficient based on the new findings of the values assessment. | to chapter 4 |
| 2152 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | The chapter title is very wordy and nominalised, simplify | Thank you, noted and revised appropriately |
| 2153 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | There is a lot of prescriptive language in the chapter (e.g. Key messages: ... Is required ...; ... Is a necessary starting poin..." | Thank you, we have revised appropriately |
| 2154 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | The key messages are not very policy relvant as they hardly convey oppourtunities of how the new information on values presented in this assessment can be employed to facilitate and improve decision-making. In contrast the key messages read largely academically | thank you. Key messages have been revised |
| 2155 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | 8 | 213 | | 8 213 | Why "Defining" and not simply "Approches..." | thank you. we have revisited the titles to streamline with text |

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|----------------------|----|------------|----|-------|----|---------|----|------|--|--|
| 2156 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | 131 | | | operationalisation and policy options (and options for other actors) are extremely welcome, but not yet reflected in the chapter. Similarly, informing and contributing to transformative change are highly important, but not yet reflected in the chapter. | thank you. these sections have been included. |
| 2157 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Mention capacity building somewhere and say how it relates to capacity development | Thank you, noted. |
| 2158 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | 5 | 135 | 6 | 165 | This is on capacity development in general, but not in the value context more specifically. | thank you. noted and being revised |
| 2159 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | 8 | 213 | 13 | 399 | Much of this text is on capacity development at large, not specifically related to values. | Thank you. We redrafted the whole chapter and added new section with a clearer focus on values. |
| 2160 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | 14 | 400 | 20 | 630 | Much of this text is very general, not specifically related to values. | Thank you, adjustments have been made appropriately. |
| 2161 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | 21 | 631 | 26 | 838 | Some of the subsections 6.4.x are very general and not specifically related to values, whereas others are | Thank you. This has been considered. |
| 2162 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | 27 | 839 | 35 | 1004 | Some of the subsections 6.x.x (and parts of the table) are very general and not specifically related to values, whereas others are | Thank you. The chapter has changed |
| 2163 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | 35 | 1005 | 43 | 1234 | Some of the subsections 6.7.x are very general and not specifically related to values | Thank you. The chapter has changed, linkages to values created |
| 2164 | Fischer, Markus | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | | | | Much of the chapter is on capacity development for various kinds of action, while I felt the scope should rather be how the new information on values, worldviews, conceptualisation can be used to improve the definition or implementation of decisions and actions | Thank you. The structure and content endeavours to address this view |
| 2290 | MEP & Bureau | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | | General | | | The chapter could strengthen the outcomes of other previous assessments by informing how the values assessment can help improve the implementation of policy options identified by previous assessments. | noted |
| 2454 | Julia Marton-Lefèvre | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 1 | 1 | 4 | 109 | This should be written in a much simpler manner and act as the Executive Summary for this paper | thank you. noted structure has changed |
| 2455 | Julia Marton-Lefèvre | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 4 | 110 | 7 | 207 | Narrow value framing is presented as mostly negative, while there are positive aspects and it is certainly better than no value framing at all. This Chapter could also use specific examples throughout, and should have a summary paragraph at the beginning | noted and analysis has taken this approach |
| 2456 | Julia Marton-Lefèvre | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 8 | 208 | 13 | 390 | It might help to introduce the term "capacity development" (as in French) to indicate that all stakeholders have capacity which needs simply to be enhanced. This approach is referred to in the Key messages part beginning in line 385. | thank you. noted |
| 2457 | Julia Marton-Lefèvre | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 14 | 391 | 20 | 616 | The most important point in this section (for me) is the effect of biodiversity loss on the world's poorest people. Capacity development here needs to include governments and this section should have some specific examples of how this can be done to urgently alleviate the negative situations faced by poor people. | Thank you, it will be considered appropriately. |
| 2458 | Julia Marton-Lefèvre | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 21 | 617 | 26 | 778 | The link between institutional and individual capacities should be explained more clearly, with specific examples given. How can individual actions be organized in such a way that more generalized, institutional actions follow and are maintained on the long term? | noted . we have endeavored to highlight stakeholder roles and responsibilities but improve and reflect appropriately |
| 2459 | Julia Marton-Lefèvre | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 27 | 779 | 32 | 951 | It is useful to present existing capacity building initiatives and those that bring about measurable and sustained change should get more attention. Thus this section's relevance to decision makers is crucial. | thank you. noted |
| 2460 | Julia Marton-Lefèvre | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 32 | 952 | 35 | 966 | the existence of relevant work in other agencies is well recognized in this section and should be useful in illustrating what works and what does not. | thank you. section on gaps have been included and reasons thereof. |
| 2461 | Julia Marton-Lefèvre | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 35 | 968 | 41 | 1183 | Operationalising capacity development will depend on the ability of values assessment efforts to cross disciplines both in formal and in informal capacity building settings. This section should provide examples as to how to accomplish this. The point made about tailoring efforts to fit specific contexts is very important. | thank you. we shall elaborate appropriately |
| 2462 | Mersudin Avdibegović | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | | | | | I enjoyed reading subchapter 6.3, particularly the text dealing with different dimensions of capacity development. Still, I am wondering how this may influence actors responsible for improvement of policymaking process based on new information on values obtained in this assessment? Please try and make this excellent but general text (probably written predominantly by social scientists) a bit closer to the context of nature values and NCP. | thank you. The chapter endeavours to reflect this dimension |
| 2463 | Mersudin Avdibegović | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 1 | 13 | 1 | 13 | Isn't the language: "...is a necessary starting condition..." too prescriptive? Particularly in the part of the chapter where key messages are presented. | thank you. The chapter has changed |

| | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|----------------------|----------------------|--|----|-------|----|-----|----|-----|---|--|
| 2464 | Mersudin Avdibegović | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 8 | 235 | 9 | 272 | It is all about general meaning of "capacity development" and little on capacities for nature valuation methodologies/approaches or capacities for policymaking reflecting the different types of conceptualization of nature and NCP. | thank you . A section on capacity dimensions on conceptualisation and valuation has been added |
| 2465 | Mersudin Avdibegović | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 9 | 273 | 11 | 330 | As power relations/dynamics are important in understanding participation capacities of different stakeholders, the importance of building capacities of individual states (more clearly: public authorities at national level) to include multiple values of nature at the policy level, should be acknowledged here. Although it depends on specific decision-making context, the role of state institutions is crucial in all countries when it comes to policy for incorporation of multiple values of nature and NCP into decision making process. In the context of environmental governance paradigm, the role of "state" is changed (towards facilitation of stakeholders' dialogue instead of command/regulative role) but still unavoidable. The "state" is simply irreplaceable and that's why the answer on the question "whose capacities", should certainly include "state", particularly in the less developed parts of the world. Yes, it is absolutely important to recognize IPLC and other marginalized stakeholders in the context of building capacities, but without solid capacities of state institutions, the discussion on multiple nature values hardly can be incorporated in decision making processes. | thank you we shown this orientation and we shall improve more appropriately |
| 2466 | Mersudin Avdibegović | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | ch. 6 | 26 | 786 | 26 | 796 | Following the previous comment, in the discussion of capacity gaps at institutional level, the state institutions cannot be neglected. They are directly responsible for cross-sectoral dialogue and actions, regional and international cooperation, development and application of policy instruments and law enforcement. As capacity gaps at institutions dealing with policy uptake of multiple nature values are present in many countries, this certainly should be recognized in the assessment dealing with global aspects of multiple values of Nature and NCP. | thank you we shall reflect appropriately |
| 2522 | Gorucu Ozden | NA | MEP/Bureau | No | Ch. 6 | 14 | 400 | 17 | 540 | The interlinkages between valuation of natural assets and global, national, regional and local development are not enough in the chapter. Necessity to add these interfaces to convince the decision makers and policy makers. | Thank you, we will consider them appropriately. |
| 2670 | Syed H. Raza | Malaysia | Media Project on Conservation Environment & Nature MPCEN | No | Ch. 6 | | 295 | | 321 | Capacity development can be transformed into ILK & values according to the societal needs. Anthropology, behaviour studies can be used to transfer knowledge & build capacity of IPLC. | thank you. noted |
| 2794 | Habiba Al Marashi | United Arab Emirates | Emirates Environmental Group | No | Ch. 6 | 7 | 203 | 7 | 203 | As was the case in Chapter 5, we shall follow the assessment guidelines | Thank you, noted. |